



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner
Controller
ChiaYu Ma
Deputy Controller

April 24, 2026

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for Security Services – FY 2026-27 & FY 2027-28

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2026-27 and Fiscal Year 2027-28 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Greg Wagner
Greg Wagner,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency
 Security Services (24176)
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 108,600	\$ 149,817
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	16.00	\$ 2,182,573	\$ 2,580,168
Chief Clerk	1410_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 153,376	\$ 181,685
Security Guard	8202_C_MTA	100.20	\$ 10,228,510	\$ 14,078,335
Manager II, MTA	9172_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 203,692	\$ 251,712
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 32,490	\$ 40,036
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 43,081	\$ 53,089
Sum:		119.20	\$ 12,952,322	\$ 17,334,842

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
MTA Transit Overhead of 52.3% of salary + benefits	0		\$ 6,774,064	\$ 9,066,122
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 6,774,064	\$ 9,066,122

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 19,726,386 \$ 26,400,964

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 19,726,386	\$ 26,400,964
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 10,419,771	\$ 10,452,702
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 9,306,615	\$ 15,948,262
% of Savings to City Cost	47.18%	60.41%

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Security Services (24176)

aved: Just now | TIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 114,857	\$ 157,959
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	16.00	\$ 2,303,433	\$ 2,719,232
Chief Clerk	1410_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 161,754	\$ 191,358
Security Guard	8202_C_MTA	100.20	\$ 10,823,242	\$ 14,849,235
Manager II, MTA	9172_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 214,927	\$ 265,144
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 33,324	\$ 40,006
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 44,189	\$ 53,048
Sum:		119.20	\$ 13,695,726	\$ 18,275,982

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
MTA Transit Overhead of 52.3% of salary + benefits	0		\$ 7,162,865	\$ 9,558,339
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 7,162,865	\$ 9,558,339

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 20,858,591 \$ 27,834,321

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 20,858,591	\$ 27,834,321
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 10,766,400	\$ 10,800,836
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 10,092,191	\$ 17,033,485
% of Savings to City Cost	48.38%	61.20%