



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner
Controller
ChiaYu Ma
Deputy Controller

April 24, 2026

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for Citations & Permit Processing – FY 2026-27 & FY 2027-28

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2026-27 and Fiscal Year 2027-28 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Greg Wagner
Greg Wagner,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Citations & Permit Processing (24162)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
IS Engineer-Senior	1043_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 221,165	\$ 271,881
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 236,207	\$ 289,587
IS Business Analyst	1052_C_MTA	1.94	\$ 478,558	\$ 582,488
IS Programmer Analyst	1062_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 153,945	\$ 187,876
IS Programmer Analyst-Senior	1063_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 181,633	\$ 222,788
IS Programmer Analyst-Principal	1064_C_MTA	0.50	\$ 103,921	\$ 127,829
IS Project Director	1070_C_MTA	0.14	\$ 33,955	\$ 41,885
IT Operations Support Administrator III	1093_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 159,700	\$ 192,865
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 188,791	\$ 228,555
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	11.20	\$ 1,180,939	\$ 1,383,822
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	5.20	\$ 709,336	\$ 838,554
Senior Account Clerk	1632_C_MTA	3.10	\$ 390,082	\$ 459,482
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	9.30	\$ 1,295,849	\$ 1,531,894
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 179,944	\$ 213,876
Senior Management Assistant	1844_C_MTA	6.25	\$ 1,029,496	\$ 1,222,434
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	0.13	\$ 27,069	\$ 33,506
Senior Permit and Citation Clerk	9506_C_MTA	8.08	\$ 1,108,054	\$ 1,310,045
Principal Permit and Citation Clerk	9508_C_MTA	6.08	\$ 905,029	\$ 1,071,580
Sum:		58.92	\$ 8,583,673	\$ 10,210,345

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
Workstation	60	Price: \$3822; Useful Life: 5	\$ 45,864	\$ 45,864
Computers	60	Price: \$1596; Useful Life: 5	\$ 19,152	\$ 19,152
Tough Book Laptops	5	Price: \$3192; Useful Life: 5	\$ 3,192	\$ 3,192
Printers	35	Price: \$638; Useful Life: 5	\$ 4,466	\$ 4,466
Postage	0		\$ 380,752	\$ 380,752
Mobile License Recognition Camera Fees	0		\$ 25,482	\$ 25,482
Mis (handheld devices/accessories, data cards)	0		\$ 7,797	\$ 7,797
Handheld Devices	0		\$ 148,862	\$ 148,862
Tickets/Envelopes	0		\$ 38,350	\$ 38,350
MTA Overhead @ 66.9%	0	Overhead rate lowered from FY25-26.	\$ 5,742,477	\$ 6,830,721

Total Non-Personnel Costs: \$ 6,416,394 \$ 7,504,638

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 15,000,067 \$ 17,714,983

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 15,000,067	\$ 17,714,983
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 6,865,442	\$ 6,871,447
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$ 8,134,625	\$ 10,843,536
	% of Savings to City Cost	54.23%	61.21%

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Citations & Permit Processing (24162)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
IS Engineer-Senior	1043_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 232,886	\$ 285,796
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 248,663	\$ 304,565
IS Business Analyst	1052_C_MTA	1.94	\$ 504,533	\$ 613,383
IS Programmer Analyst	1062_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 162,397	\$ 197,881
IS Programmer Analyst-Senior	1063_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 191,435	\$ 234,470
IS Programmer Analyst-Principal	1064_C_MTA	0.50	\$ 109,460	\$ 134,461
IS Project Director	1070_C_MTA	0.14	\$ 35,746	\$ 44,041
IT Operations Support Administrator III	1093_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 168,426	\$ 202,900
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 198,931	\$ 240,514
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	11.20	\$ 1,248,695	\$ 1,460,655
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	5.20	\$ 748,618	\$ 883,753
Senior Account Clerk	1632_C_MTA	3.10	\$ 411,905	\$ 484,484
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	9.30	\$ 1,367,419	\$ 1,614,263
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 189,645	\$ 225,130
Senior Management Assistant	1844_C_MTA	6.25	\$ 1,085,295	\$ 1,287,072
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	0.13	\$ 28,550	\$ 35,281
Senior Permit and Citation Clerk	9506_C_MTA	8.08	\$ 1,169,290	\$ 1,380,532
Principal Permit and Citation Clerk	9508_C_MTA	6.08	\$ 954,625	\$ 1,128,801
	Sum:	58.92	\$ 9,056,519	\$ 10,757,982

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
Workstation	60	Price: \$3822; Useful Life: 5	\$ 45,864	\$ 45,864
Computers	60	Price: \$1596; Useful Life: 5	\$ 19,152	\$ 19,152
Tough Book Laptops	5	Price: \$3192; Useful Life: 5	\$ 3,192	\$ 3,192
Printers	35	Price: \$638; Useful Life: 5	\$ 4,466	\$ 4,466
Postage	0		\$ 393,317	\$ 393,317
Mobile License Recognition Camera Fees	0		\$ 26,323	\$ 26,323
Mis (handheld devices/accessories, data cards)	0		\$ 8,054	\$ 8,054
Handheld Devices	0		\$ 153,774	\$ 153,774
Tickets/Envelopes	0		\$ 39,615	\$ 39,615
MTA Overhead @ 66.9%	0	Overhead rate lowered from FY25-26.	\$ 6,058,811	\$ 7,197,090
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 6,752,568	\$ 7,890,847

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 15,809,087	\$ 18,648,829
----------------------------------	----------------------	----------------------

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 15,809,087	\$ 18,648,829
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 7,078,855	\$ 7,085,943
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 8,730,232	\$ 11,562,886
% of Savings to City Cost	55.22%	62.00%