

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Towing (24172)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS				
Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 236,207	\$ 289,587
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 188,791	\$ 228,555
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	1.56	\$ 164,487	\$ 192,720
Account Clerk	1630_C_MTA	3.25	\$ 362,683	\$ 425,713
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	6.56	\$ 914,061	\$ 1,080,562
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 306,296	\$ 362,513
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 204,728	\$ 243,995
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 571,284	\$ 671,079
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 621,846	\$ 732,784
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 204,795	\$ 244,161
Senior Materials And Supplies Supervisor	1926_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 116,118	\$ 136,410
Storekeeper	1934_C_MTA	7.60	\$ 862,034	\$ 1,011,946
Senior Storekeeper	1936_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 357,937	\$ 421,507
Purchaser	1952_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 155,706	\$ 184,514
Cashier II	4321_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 230,041	\$ 270,094
Cashier III	4322_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 252,596	\$ 297,902
Truck Driver	7355_C_MTA	34.23	\$ 5,016,566	\$ 6,150,698
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	5.20	\$ 928,168	\$ 928,168
Security Guard	8202_C_MTA	11.39	\$ 1,162,699	\$ 1,600,322
Manager IV, MTA	9174_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 462,271	\$ 570,959
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 33,189	\$ 39,845
Sum:		96.79	\$ 13,352,503	\$ 16,084,034

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS				
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
Postage+supplies+uniforms	0		\$ 65,746	\$ 65,746
Specialized Software	0		\$ 365,801	\$ 365,801
Vehicles - tow trucks (7 year useful life)	0		\$ 890,950	\$ 890,950
Fuel (15-20 miles/day/truck, assume 20mi/gal at \$5-\$7/gallon)	0		\$ 84,950	\$ 101,981
Communications: ipad air \$672 + case \$31 + cellular data (\$207/year for 4 years) *32 drivers / useful life 4 years	0		\$ 7,280	\$ 7,280
Utilities	0		\$ 41,729	\$ 41,729

Lien Fees	0	\$	183,971	\$	183,971
Dolly equipment (2 year useful life)	0	\$	25,309	\$	25,309
Credit card fees	0	\$	77,275	\$	77,275
Overhead, at 66.9% applied to salaries and fringe benefits	0	\$	8,932,825	\$	10,760,219
		Total Non-Personnel Costs:	\$ 10,675,836	\$	12,520,261

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 24,028,339 \$ 28,604,295

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 24,028,339	\$ 28,604,295
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 17,933,273	\$ 18,020,848
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$ 6,095,066	\$ 10,583,447
	% of Savings to City Cost	25.37%	37.00%

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Towing (24172)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 248,663	\$ 304,565
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 198,931	\$ 240,514
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	1.56	\$ 173,924	\$ 203,448
Account Clerk	1630_C_MTA	3.25	\$ 383,315	\$ 449,235
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	6.56	\$ 964,545	\$ 1,138,662
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 323,097	\$ 381,886
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 215,634	\$ 256,697
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 603,673	\$ 708,033
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 656,692	\$ 772,713
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 215,704	\$ 256,873
Senior Materials And Supplies Supervisor	1926_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 122,687	\$ 143,907
Storekeeper	1934_C_MTA	7.60	\$ 910,962	\$ 1,067,731
Senior Storekeeper	1936_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 378,110	\$ 444,589
Purchaser	1952_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 164,234	\$ 194,360
Cashier II	4321_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 243,074	\$ 284,954
Cashier III	4322_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 266,722	\$ 314,100
Truck Driver	7355_C_MTA	34.23	\$ 5,297,773	\$ 6,483,794
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	5.20	\$ 978,467	\$ 978,467
Security Guard	8202_C_MTA	11.39	\$ 1,230,307	\$ 1,687,951

Manager IV, MTA	9174_C_MTA	2.00	\$	487,416	\$	601,239
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$	34,229	\$	41,091
Sum:		96.79	\$	14,098,159	\$	16,954,809

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
Postage+supplies+uniforms	0		\$ 67,967	\$ 67,967
Specialized Software	0		\$ 378,157	\$ 378,157
Vehicles - tow trucks (7 year useful life)	0		\$ 921,045	\$ 921,045
Fuel (15-20 miles/day/truck, assume 20mi/gal at \$5-\$7/gallon)	0		\$ 87,820	\$ 105,426
Communications: ipad air \$672 + case \$31 + cellular data (\$207/year for 4 years) *32 drivers / useful life 4 years	0		\$ 7,280	\$ 7,280
Utilities	0		\$ 43,139	\$ 43,139
Lien Fees	0		\$ 190,185	\$ 190,185
Dolly equipment (2 year useful life)	0		\$ 26,164	\$ 26,164
Credit card fees	0		\$ 79,825	\$ 79,825
Overhead, at 66.9% applied to salaries and fringe benefits	0		\$ 9,431,668	\$ 11,342,767
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 11,233,250	\$ 13,161,955

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 25,331,409	\$ 30,116,764
----------------------------------	----------------------	----------------------

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 25,331,409	\$ 30,116,764
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 18,534,055	\$ 18,625,640
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	<u>\$ 6,797,354</u>	<u>\$ 11,491,124</u>
% of Savings to City Cost	26.83%	38.16%