



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2021

Eric Sandler, Chief Financial Officer  
San Francisco Public Utilities Commission  
525 Golden Gate Avenue  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Laura Busch, Budget Director

RE: Contracting for Security Services – FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Andrea Gremer, Operating Budget Manager

SFPUC Power Enterprise  
 298650 Power Enterprise  
 Security Services - Golden Gate site  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)  
 FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	1.0	\$ 2,525	\$ 3,031	\$ 65,908	\$ 79,121
Management Assistant	1842	0.05	\$ 3,223	\$ 3,870	\$ 4,207	\$ 5,050
-	-				-	-
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a	947	1,137	24,715	29,670
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		1.1				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 70,114	\$ 84,171
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 24,715	\$ 29,670

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	38344	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1842	44537	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 36,425	\$ 40,570

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Two-way radios (1 per shift/location)- One (1) needed.	\$ 200	\$ 200
Uniforms (600/year per person) - One (1) needed	\$ 600	\$ 600
	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ -	\$ -
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 800	\$ 800

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 132,055	\$ 155,212
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 73,787	\$ 108,950
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 58,268	\$ 46,262
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	44%	30%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2021-22 would be the second year these services are contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective FY 2021-22. Costs are represented as annual 12
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. Overtime of 20 hrs per pay period for for 7am-5:30pm daily security shifts

Wastewater Enterprise WWE  
 229281 WWE Maintenance, 292649 WWE Source Control, 229268 Admin SE Community Facility  
 Security Services  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)  
 FISCAL YEAR 2021-22

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard (1800 Oakdale/SECF)	8202	2.0	\$ 2,525	\$ 3,031	131,816	158,242
Security Guard As-Needed M-F (1800 Oakdale/SECF)	8202	0.5	2,525	3,031	32,954	39,560
Security Guard As-Needed Sa-Su (1800 Oakdale/SECF)	8202	0.7	2,525	3,031	46,135	55,385
Security Guard (750 Phelps/SEP)	8202	6.0	2,525	3,031	395,447	474,726
Security Guard As-Needed (750 Phelps/SEP)	8202	0.5	2,525	3,031	32,954	39,560
Security Guard - Saturday (750 Phelps/SEP)	8202	0.2	2,525	3,031	13,182	15,824
Security Guard (3500 Great Highway/OSP)	8202	5.0	2,525	3,031	329,539	395,605
Security Guard As-Needed (3500 Great Highway/OSP)	8202	0.5	2,525	3,031	32,954	39,560
Security Guard - Saturday (3500 Great Highway/OSP)	8202	0.2	2,525	3,031	13,182	15,824
Security Guard (1601 Griffith/Griffith Yard)	8202	4.0	2,525	3,031	263,631	316,484
Security Guard As-Needed (1601 Griffith/Griffith Yard)	8202	0.5	2,525	3,031	32,954	39,560
Administrator/Manager	0931	1.0	5,483	6,582	143,093	171,781
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			-	-
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			135,784	163,007
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
		<b>Total FTE</b>	<b>21.1</b>			
					<b>Total Salary Costs--&gt;</b>	
					<b>1,467,839</b>	<b>1,762,112</b>
					<b>Total of Other Compensation--&gt;</b>	
					<b>135,784</b>	<b>163,007</b>

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	76,687
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	19,172
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	26,841
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	230,062
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	19,172
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	7,669
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	191,718
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	19,172
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	7,669
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	153,375
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 \$ 38,344	19,172
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931 \$ 68,085	68,085
<b>Total Fringe Benefits</b>		<b>Low 751,569 High 838,792</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Two-way radios (1 per shift/location) - Four (4) needed.	\$ 2,504	\$ 2,504
Uniforms (\$600 per year per person) - Seventeen (17) needed.	\$ 10,200	\$ 10,200
<b>Total Capital &amp; Operating</b>	<b>\$ 12,704</b>	<b>\$ 12,704</b>

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 2,367,897	\$ 2,776,614
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 1,208,008	\$ 1,211,763
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<b>\$ 1,159,889</b>	<b>\$ 1,564,851</b>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	<b>49%</b>	<b>56%</b>

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2012 was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective December 28, 2019. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
5. 0931 Manager III will be needed fulltime to manage security program and supervise security personnel.