



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

July 31, 2020

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Leo Levenson, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Parking Meter Payment Collection Services – FY 2020-21 & FY 2021-22

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2020-21 and 2021-22 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Timothy Manglicmot, Budget Manager

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager IV, MTA	9174	0.3	\$ 5,130	\$ 6,159	\$ 33,476	\$ 40,187
Manager III, MTA	9177	1.0	\$ 4,759	\$ 5,713	\$ 124,208	\$ 149,109
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824	1.0	\$ 4,422	\$ 5,309	\$ 115,425	\$ 138,565
Transit Revenue Supervisor	9118	4.0	\$ 3,560	\$ 4,274	\$ 371,689	\$ 446,206
Principal Fare Collections Receiver	9117	2.0	\$ 3,424	\$ 4,111	\$ 178,757	\$ 214,594
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116	10.0	\$ 2,721	\$ 3,266	\$ 710,071	\$ 852,426
Fare Collections Receiver	9110	13.0	\$ 2,351	\$ 2,822	\$ 797,601	\$ 957,505
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116	1.0	\$ 2,721	\$ 3,266	\$ 71,007	\$ 85,243
Fare Collections Receiver	9110	3.0	\$ 2,351	\$ 2,822	\$ 184,062	\$ 220,963
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			73,399	88,114
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			65,475	78,601
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		35.3				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 2,586,296	\$ 3,104,797
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 138,874	\$ 166,715

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9174 68,257
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9177 65,485
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1824 57,763
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9118 49,430
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9117 48,116
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9116 41,303
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9110 37,723
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9116 41,303
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9110 37,723
Total Fringe Benefits	
	Low High
	\$ 1,331,274 \$ 1,492,164

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Rent	\$ 86,780	\$ 86,780
Utilities	\$ 12,397	\$ 12,397
Uniform	\$ 24,108	\$ 24,108
Vehicles	\$ 96,000	\$ 96,000
Radios	\$ 1,065	\$ 1,065
Gas	\$ 7,868	\$ 7,868
Overhead (90% of salary and benefits)	\$ 3,525,813	\$ 4,137,265
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 3,754,032	\$ 4,365,484

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 7,810,476	\$ 9,129,161
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 4,241,774	\$ 4,252,918
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 3,568,703	\$ 4,876,243
% of Savings to City Cost	46%	53%

Comments/Assumptions:

- FY 1978 was the first year these services were contracted out.
- Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2020. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where
- Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- Holiday pay calculated at time and half for 11 holidays for 50% of the Fare collections staff.
- Premium pay calculated at 8.5% of salary at 1/3 of Fare Collection staff qualifying.
- Additional City Costs
 - Rent \$7,000/month with 3.31% CPI. Assumes \$2/Sq Ft /Mo for at least 3,300 Sqft
 - Utilities \$1,000/month with 3.31% CPI
 - Uniform \$933/staff for 25 staff with 3.31% CPI
 - Vehicles 12 vehicles at \$40,000 over 5 years
 - Radios \$3,092 for a 6-radio set, 4 sets with a 2-year lifespan
 - Gas 45MPG at \$3.57/gallon and 8,000 miles per year for 12 vehicles
- Overhead rate per SFMTA Indirect Cost Allocation Plan, costs of indirect services provided by central service divisions of the SFMTA, ratio between indirect and direct costs.

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager IV, MTA	9174	0.3	\$ 5,130	\$ 6,159	\$ 33,476	\$ 40,187
Manager III, MTA	9177	1.0	\$ 4,759	\$ 5,713	\$ 124,208	\$ 149,109
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824	1.0	\$ 4,422	\$ 5,309	\$ 115,425	\$ 138,565
Transit Revenue Supervisor	9118	4.0	\$ 3,560	\$ 4,274	\$ 371,689	\$ 446,206
Principal Fare Collections Receiver	9117	2.0	\$ 3,424	\$ 4,111	\$ 178,757	\$ 214,594
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116	10.0	\$ 2,721	\$ 3,266	\$ 710,071	\$ 852,426
Fare Collections Receiver	9110	13.0	\$ 2,351	\$ 2,822	\$ 797,601	\$ 957,505
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116	1.0	\$ 2,721	\$ 3,266	\$ 71,007	\$ 85,243
Fare Collections Receiver	9110	3.0	\$ 2,351	\$ 2,822	\$ 184,062	\$ 220,963
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			73,399	88,114
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			65,475	78,601
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE						
					\$ 2,586,296	\$ 3,104,797
					\$ 138,874	\$ 166,715

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9174	70,431	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9177	67,602	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1824	59,222	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9118	50,725	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9117	49,390	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9116	42,471	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9110	38,835	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9116	42,471	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9110	38,835	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 1,366,674	\$ 1,534,662

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Rent	\$ 89,471	\$ 89,471
Utilities	\$ 12,782	\$ 12,782
Uniform	\$ 24,855	\$ 24,855
Vehicles	\$ 96,000	\$ 96,000
Radios	\$ 1,098	\$ 1,098
Gas	\$ 8,112	\$ 8,112
Overhead (90% of salary and benefits)	\$ 3,557,673	\$ 4,175,513
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 3,789,991	\$ 4,407,830

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 7,881,835	\$ 9,214,005
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 4,317,464	\$ 4,328,706
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 3,564,371	\$ 4,885,299
% of Savings to City Cost	45%	53%

Comments/Assumptions:

- FY 1978 was the first year these services were contracted out.
- Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2020. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term
- Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- Holiday pay calculated at time and half for 11 holidays for 50% of the Fare collections staff.
- Premium pay calculated at 8.5% of salary at 1/3 of Fare Collection staff qualifying.
- Additional City Costs
 - Rent \$7,000/month with 3.1% CPI. Assumes \$2/Sq Ft /Mo for at least 3,300 Sqft
 - Utilities \$1,000/month with 3.1% CPI
 - Uniform \$933/staff for 25 staff with 3.1% CPI
 - Vehicles 12 vehicles at \$40,000 over 5 years
 - Radios \$3,092 for a 6-radio set, 4 sets with a 2-year lifespan
 - Gas 45MPG at \$3.57/gallon and 8,000 miles per year for 12 vehicles
- Overhead rate per SFMTA Indirect Cost Allocation Plan, costs of indirect services provided by central service divisions of the SFMTA, ratio between indirect and direct costs.