

CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

BUDGET AND LEGISLATIVE ANALYST

1390 Market Street, Suite 1150, San Francisco, CA 94102 (415) 552-9292
FAX (415) 252-0461

April 29, 2020

TO: Budget and Finance Committee

FROM: Budget and Legislative Analyst



SUBJECT: May 1, 2020 Special Budget and Finance Committee Meeting

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| Item | File | Page |
|-------------|---|-------------|
| 1 | 20-0373 Emergency Ordinance - Restroom and Hand Washing Facilities for Unsheltered People | 1 |

| | |
|---|---------------------------------|
| Item 1 Files 20-0373 | Department: Public Works |
| EXECUTIVE SUMMARY | |
| <p style="text-align: center;">Legislative Objectives</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The proposed emergency ordinance would require the City to increase bathroom and hand washing station access to achieve a ratio of one bathroom per 50 unsheltered persons within three weeks of the effective date of the ordinance. The City is to enter into service agreements with third parties to provide, staff and maintain the restrooms. Under the proposed emergency ordinance, these service contracts would not require Board of Supervisors approval even if they exceed the Charter established thresholds of a contract exceeding \$10 million in expenditures and having a term of ten years or more. Finally, the proposed ordinance would affirm the Planning Department’s determination that this project is exempt from environmental review under the California Environmental Quality Act. <p style="text-align: center;">Key Points</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The City currently has 62 public toilet sites (including handwashing facilities) with 136 toilets. This includes (a) 24 permanent Pit Stops operated by Public Work with 42 toilets in 13 neighborhoods throughout the City, with a mix of portable, and permanent JC Decaux facilities; (b) seven public restroom facilities with 57 toilets (32 of which are in Dolores Park) operated by the Recreation and Park Department; and (c) 31 new temporary sites with 37 toilets implemented by Public Works in April 2020 in response to the COVID-19 public health emergency. • The 55 Public Works and seven Recreation and Park Department sites (62 total) provide 136 toilets, which exceeds the ratio of 1:50 for the estimated 5,180 unsheltered individuals identified in the January 2019 Point in Time Count. However, only 41 toilets at 34 sites are currently available 24/7. <p style="text-align: center;">Fiscal Impact</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • While the City has sufficient day time public toilets to meet the 1:50 ratio of toilets for the unsheltered population, the City would need to add hours to existing sites to meet the 1:50 ratio during night time or some weekend hours. The estimated cost to increase hours for the 21 Public Works Pit Stop sites that are not currently open 24 hours/7 days per week is \$105,430 per week; through July 3, 2020 this would amount to a total of approximately \$948,867. <p style="text-align: center;">Recommendation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Approval of the proposed emergency ordinance is a policy matter for the Board of Supervisors. | |

MANDATE STATEMENT

City Charter Section 2.107 states that the Board of Supervisors may pass emergency ordinances on their first reading with a 2/3 affirmative vote. Emergency ordinances become effective upon approval by the Mayor, the expiration of the ten-day period for the Mayor to approve or veto, or the Board of Supervisors' override of the Mayor's veto. Emergency ordinances expire sixty days after their passage.

BACKGROUND

Health Crisis

To slow the spread of COVID-19, on March 3, 2020 the Department of Public Health issued social distancing recommendations, which states "the best way for all San Franciscans to reduce their risk of getting sick, as with seasonal colds or the flu, is to wash hands with soap and water for at least 20 seconds."

Pit Stop Program

The Department of Public Works' (Public Works) Pit Stop program provides safe and clean public restrooms, along with used-needle receptacles and dog waste stations. Pit Stops are located throughout San Francisco in locations chosen based on proximity to soup kitchens, walking survey of feces, Public Works street cleaner feedback, and 311 human waste requests. All Pit Stop facilities have running water, soap and hand towels. All Pit Stops are monitored by paid attendants who work to ensure the sites remain stocked, tidy and safe as part of their simultaneous participation in a workforce development program.¹

The Pit Stop program began in July 2014 as a six-month pilot with three portable toilets in the Tenderloin. Since then, it has expanded to 24 regular Pit Stop sites with 42 toilets in 13 neighborhoods throughout the City, with a mix of portable, and permanent JC Decaux facilities. Under regular circumstances only three Pit Stops are open 24 hours (the other have daytime hours of operation).

Temporary Expansion of Pit Stop Program

In response to the COVID-19 public health emergency, Public Works has deployed additional Pit Stops to be open and monitored 24-hours a day, seven days a week. These additional Pit Stops are temporary, "porta-potty" design, facilities. The Pit Stops were rolled out in two phases: Phase 1 began on April 7, 2020 with 15 new temporary Pit Stop sites with internal sinks. Portable restroom facilities are rented through a contract with United Site Services, and monitored by Urban Alchemy and Hunters Point Family staff.² Pit Stop monitors are to ensure social distancing

¹ Hunters Point Family runs the workforce development program that employs attendants. San Francisco Public Works entered into a grant agreement with Hunters Point Family, a 501c3 organization, following an RFP process, for \$515,000 for FY 2019-20.

² On April 7, 2020, Urban Alchemy entered into a new grant agreement with the City to staff these sites, for an amount that was amended on April 10, 2020 not to exceed \$1,514,835. Office of the Mayor, News Releases: "Mayor London Breed Announces Rollout of New Staffed Public Toilets and Hand-Washing Stations in High-Need

guidelines are followed and that handwashing stations and restrooms are sanitized, adequately stocked and used for their intended purpose. The contract expires July 3, 2020 unless terminated earlier by the City if the need no longer exists.

For Phase 2, Public Works added 14 new locations plus additional staffing at two existing locations at Zuckerberg San Francisco General Hospital and Trauma Center. On April 20, 2020 the City entered into a new contract with Hunters Point Family to staff these additional temporary Pit Stops, which consist of porta-potties with separate handwashing stations. The contract expires July 3, 2020 unless terminated earlier, for a maximum amount of \$1,177,135. The 16 locations provide 19 toilets and are to be open and staffed 24 hours a day, seven days a week.

Implementation Process

According to Mr. Jeremy Spitz, Policy and Government Affairs Manager at Public Works, launching the additional 31 temporary Pit Stop sites took approximately one month and required securing the additional accessible rental units, scouting appropriate locations, conducting community outreach, and soliciting vendors to staff the toilets.

DETAILS OF PROPOSED LEGISLATION

The proposed emergency ordinance would require the City to increase bathroom and hand washing station access to achieve a ratio of one bathroom per 50 unsheltered persons within three weeks of the effective date of the ordinance. The City is to enter into service agreements with third parties to provide, staff and maintain the restrooms. Under the proposed emergency ordinance, these service contracts would not require Board of Supervisors approval even if they exceed the Charter established thresholds of a contract exceeding \$10 million in expenditures and having a term of ten years or more. Finally, the proposed ordinance would affirm the Planning Department's determination that this project is exempt from environmental review under the California Environmental Quality Act.

Bathroom Requirement

The proposed ordinance's 1:50 ratio criteria is based on the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) Emergency Sanitation Standards. The standards advise the ratio of community toilets in the immediate, short term is 1 toilet for 50 persons.³

The most recent Point in Time Count conducted on January 24, 2019 found that there were 5,180 unsheltered persons in San Francisco.⁴ Based on that population estimate, the proposed ordinance would require 104 public bathrooms to be available. As shown in Table 1 below, the

Neighborhoods," April 7, 2020, <https://sfmayor.org/article/mayor-london-breed-announces-rollout-new-staffed-public-toilets-and-hand-washing-stations>

³ UNHCR Emergency Handbook: <https://emergency.unhcr.org/entry/33014/emergency-sanitation-standards>. "No latrine should be used by more than 50 persons during the first phase of an emergency. The count is made per drop-hole. Only latrines that are cleanable, guarantee privacy, and are structurally safe should be counted." The Handbook continues to advise that a medium-term minimum ratio is 1 per 20 people.

⁴ San Francisco Homeless Count and Survey Comprehensive Report 2019, http://hsh.sfgov.org/wp-content/uploads/2019HIRDReport_SanFrancisco_FinalDraft.pdf

City has 136 toilets currently available at 62 locations. Attachment 1 provides detail on each location and hours of operation.

Table 1: Total Public Bathroom Facilities as of May 1, 2020

| Facility | Locations | Toilets |
|---|------------------|----------------|
| Existing Pit Stops | 24 | 42 |
| Existing Park Stops ⁵ | 7 | 57 |
| Subtotal, Existing | 31 | 99 |
| Temporary Phase 1 Pit Stop (internal sink) | 15 | 18 |
| Temporary Phase 2 Pit Stop (external sink) | 16 | 19 |
| Subtotal, Temporary | 31 | 37 |
| Grand Total | 62 | 136 |

Source: Public Works

The number of units required by the proposed ordinance would go down as the City begins housing the unsheltered.⁶ The temporary bathrooms would be in use for as long as the emergency order is in place; the initial grant agreements extend staffing for temporary units until July 3, 2020.

The proposed emergency ordinance also requires that the facilities be cleaned in a manner that conforms to the Minimum Environmental Cleaning Standards for Businesses, Schools and SRO Settings published by the Department of Public Health.

FISCAL IMPACT

Table 2 below summarizes the costs of the 30 temporary Pit Stops that have been installed in Phase 1 launched on April 7, 2020, and Phase 2 launched on April 22, 2020.

⁵ The Park Stop Program provides public restrooms, toilets and handwashing stations, at seven San Francisco Parks and is run by the Recreation and Parks Department. These sites are open daily 8am-8pm and are staffed by attendants employed through Hunters Point Family.

⁶ As of April 23, 2020, approximately 800 individuals (other than first responders), many of whom may have been unsheltered, were housed in hotels.

Table 2: Total Costs for Temporary Pit Stops, through July 3, 2020

| | Monitoring Cost | Rental Cost | Total | Cost per Week |
|-------------|-----------------|-------------|-------------|---------------|
| Phase 1 | \$1,514,835 | \$110,403 | \$1,625,238 | \$130,766 |
| Phase 2 | 1,177,135 | 98,590 | 1,275,725 | 123,887 |
| Grand Total | \$2,691,970 | \$208,993 | \$2,900,963 | \$254,653 |

Source: BLA Analysis of Temporary Pit Stop fiscal data provided by Public Works. Costs include site staff and equipment rentals.

As shown above, the cost of deploying the 31 additional temporary Pit Stops is \$2.9 million through July 3, 2020. According to Public Works, the Department's budget included \$2,871,720 in FY 2019-20 to expand the Pit Stop program. The Department will use a portion of this funding and savings from elsewhere in the budget to fund the COVID-19 Pit Stop expansion; and will seek reimbursement from FEMA and CalOES for costs associated with the Pit Stop expansion.

No Public Works staffing and other City costs are included above.

Cost to Convert All Pit Stops to 24/7 Access

The City has sufficient day time public toilets to meet the 1:50 ratio of toilets for the unsheltered population but would need to add hours to existing sites to meet the 1:50 ratio during night time or some weekend hours. While the 31 temporary Pit Stop locations are open 24 hours/7 days per week, only three of Public Works other 24 Pit Stops and none of the Recreation and Park Department sites are open 24 hours/7 days per week.

The estimated cost to increase hours for the 21 Public Works Pit Stop sites that are not currently open 24 hours/7 days per week is \$105,430 per week; through July 3, 2020 this would amount to a total of approximately \$948,867.^{7,8}

RECOMMENDATION

Approval of the proposed emergency ordinance is a policy matter for the Board of Supervisors.

⁷ Budget and Legislative analysis of temporary Pit Stop fiscal data provided by Public Works. Currently the other 21 Pit Stops are open and staffed 1,224 hours per week cumulatively. 24/7 monitoring costs amount to approximately \$7,700 per site per week, depending on the facility model, equivalent to approximately \$46 per hour. According to this estimate, in order to convert all Public Works facilities to 24/7 service, Pit Stops would need to add 2,304 more hours per week of service across all locations.

⁸ Increasing hours at 21 existing Pit Stop locations would result in a nighttime ratio of 1:66. In order to reach the 1:50 ratio during night time hours, the City would need to consider extending hours at six Recreation and Park Department sites (other than Dolores Park), at an estimated cost of at least \$24,000 per week or approximately \$246,000 through July 3, 2020.

City-wide Restrooms

| Location | Type | Type | Toilets | Hours |
|---|-------------------|--|-------------------------|--|
| PitStop Locations | | | | |
| Mendell Plaza – Mon | Pit Stop | Mobile Trailer | 2 | Fri – 9am to 5pm |
| Market and Castro streets | Pit Stop | JCDecaux | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| Market and Church streets | Pit Stop | JCDecaux | 1 | Daily – 9am to 8pm |
| Grove and Larkin streets | Pit Stop | JCDecaux | 1 | Daily - 7am to 8pm |
| Embarcadero Plaza | Pit Stop | JCDecaux | 1 | Daily - 9am to 8pm |
| Haight and Buena Vista Ave West | Pit Stop | Mobile Trailer | 2 | Mon-Fri – 12pm to 7pm |
| Stanyan and Waller streets | Pit Stop | JCDecaux | 1 | Daily – 9am to 8pm |
| Myrtle and Larkin streets | Pit Stop | JCDecaux | 1 | Daily – 9am to 8pm |
| Hallidie Plaza | Pit Stop | JCDecaux | 1 | Daily – 7am to 8pm |
| U.N. Plaza | Pit Stop | JCDecaux | 1 | Daily – 9am to 8pm |
| 16th and Capp streets – Mon | Pit Stop | Mobile Trailer | 2 | Mon-Fri – 11am to 6pm |
| 16th and Mission streets | Pit Stop | JCDecaux | 1 | Daily – 9am to 8pm |
| 18th and Mission streets – Mon | Pit Stop | Mobile Trailer | 2 | Mon-Fri – 12:30pm to 7:30pm |
| 24th and Mission streets | Pit Stop | JCDecaux | 1 | Daily – 9am to 8pm |
| Washington Square at Union St. | Pit Stop | JCDecaux | 1 | Daily – 9am to 8pm |
| Great Highway near Beach Chalet | Pit Stop | Mobile Trailer | 2 | Mon-Fri – 12 noon to 7 pm |
| Judah and La Playa streets | Pit Stop | Rec Park | 8 | Daily – 9am to 4pm |
| 6th and Jessie streets | Pit Stop | Mobile Trailer | 2 | Open 24 hours |
| Victoria Manalo Draves Park | Pit Stop | Rec Park | 2 | Mon-Fri – 8am to 4pm; Sat-Sun – 9am to 5pm |
| 133 Golden Gate Ave. | Pit Stop | Mobile Trailer | 2 | Mon-Fri – 2pm to 9pm; Sat – 9am to 4pm |
| 101 Hyde St. | Pit Stop | Mobile Trailer | 2 | Mon-Fri – 1:30pm to 8:30pm; Sat – 9:30am to 4:30pm |
| Eddy St. and Jones St. | Pit Stop | JCDecaux | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 388 Ellis St. | Pit Stop | Mobile Trailer | 2 | Mon-Fri – 9am – 4pm; Saturday 9am to 4pm |
| Eddy St. and Larkin St. | Pit Stop | Mobile Trailer | 2 | Mon-Sat – 9:30am - 4:30pm |
| | | | Pit Stop Total | 42 |
| COVID Response | | | | |
| Willow between Polk and Larkin | COVID Response | Solar 2-stall restroom trailer; each stall with inside sink | 2 | Open 24 hours |
| 145 Leavenworth | COVID Response | Solar 2-stall restroom trailer; each stall with inside sink | 2 | Open 24 hours |
| 439 O'Farrell | COVID Response | Solar 2-stall restroom trailer; each stall with inside sink | 2 | Open 24 hours |
| 2111 Jennings | COVID Response | Portable restroom with inside sink | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 245 Bayshore | COVID Response | Portable restroom with inside sink | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 1133 Mission | COVID Response | Portable restroom with inside sink | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 1266-1270 Mission | COVID Response | Portable restroom with inside sink | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 251 Napoleon (across the street from 222 Napoleon) | COVID Response | Portable restroom with inside sink | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 23rd & Treat (by the park Parque Ninos Unidos) | COVID Response | Portable restroom with inside sink | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| Selby & McKinnon Intersection | COVID Response | Portable restroom with inside sink | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 344 14th Street (Stevenson/14th street) | COVID Response | Portable restroom with inside sink | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 1661 Fifteenth (15th) Street (15/Julian) | COVID Response | Portable restroom with inside sink | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 1100 Thomas Ave (Thomas/Griffith) | COVID Response | Portable restroom with inside sink | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 148 6th Street (6/Natoma) | COVID Response | Portable restroom with inside sink | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 1900 Evans Street (Selby/Evans) | COVID Response | Portable restroom with inside sink | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| Larch Street between Van Ness & Franklin | COVID Response | ADA compliant Portable Restroom; external ADA hand washing station | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| Willow Street between Van Ness & Franklin | COVID Response | ADA compliant Portable Restroom; external ADA hand washing station | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 1600 Haight Street | COVID Response | ADA compliant Portable Restroom; external ADA hand washing station | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| Market St. & 16th St. | COVID Response | ADA compliant Portable Restroom; external ADA hand washing station | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| Turk St & Taylor St | COVID Response | ADA compliant Portable Restroom; external ADA hand washing station | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 1550 Bryant St. | COVID Response | ADA compliant Portable Restroom; external ADA hand washing station | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 17th St. & Florida St. | COVID Response | ADA compliant Portable Restroom; external ADA hand washing station | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 15th St. & San Bruno Ave. | COVID Response | ADA compliant Portable Restroom; external ADA hand washing station | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 26th St. & Harrison St. (Park) | COVID Response | ADA compliant Portable Restroom; external ADA hand washing station | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| Cesar Chavez & Potrero Ave. (Park) | COVID Response | ADA compliant Portable Restroom; external ADA hand washing station | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 18th St. & Geary St. (in front of Alexandria Theatre) | COVID Response | ADA compliant Portable Restroom; external ADA hand washing station | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 48th St. & Fulton St. (behind Safeway) | COVID Response | ADA compliant Portable Restroom; external ADA hand washing station | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 24th Ave. and Balboa St. | COVID Response | ADA compliant Portable Restroom; external ADA hand washing station | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| 45 Hyde | COVID Response | ADA compliant Portable Restroom; external ADA hand washing station | 1 | Open 24 hours |
| SFGH Building 80/90 | COVID Response | Unit rented by DPH | 3 | Open 24 hours |
| SFGH Building 25 | COVID Response | Unit rented by DPH | 2 | Open 24 hours |
| | | | Pit Stop Total | 37 |
| Park Stop Program | | | | |
| Portsmouth Square Park | Park Stop Program | Rec Park | 8 | Daily – 8am to 8pm |
| Kimball Park | Park Stop Program | Rec Park | 3 | Daily – 8am to 8pm |
| Rolph Playground Picnic Area | Park Stop Program | Rec Park | 3 | Daily – 8am to 8pm |
| Dolores Park | Park Stop Program | Rec Park | 32 | Daily – 8am to 8pm |
| Bay View Park K.C. Jones Playground | Park Stop Program | Rec Park | 2 | Daily – 8am to 5:30pm |
| Jackson Park | Park Stop Program | Rec Park | 4 | Daily – 8am to 8pm |
| Alamo Square Park | Park Stop Program | Rec Park | 5 | Daily – 8am to 8pm |
| | | | Park Stop Total* | 57 |
| | | | GRAND TOTAL | 136 |

*Toilet counts for Park Stop locations provided by RecPark