

File No. 121031

Committee Item No. 1

Board Item No. \_\_\_\_\_

## COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

### AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST

Committee: Public Safety Date 11/5/2012

Board of Supervisors Meeting Date \_\_\_\_\_

#### Cmte Board

- |                                     |                          |  |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Motion                                       |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Resolution                                   |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Ordinance                                    |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Legislative Digest                           |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Budget and Legislative Analyst Report        |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Legislative Analyst Report                   |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Youth Commission Report                      |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Introduction Form (for hearings)             |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Department/Agency Cover Letter and/or Report |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | MOU  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Grant Information Form                       |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Grant Budget                                 |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Subcontract Budget                           |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Contract/Agreement                           |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Form 126 – Ethics Commission                 |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Award Letter                                 |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Application                                  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Public Correspondence                        |

#### OTHER (Use back side if additional space is needed)

<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____

Completed by: Erica Dayrit Date 11/9/2012

Completed by: \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

An asterisked item represents the cover sheet to a document that exceeds 25 pages.  
The complete document can be found in the file.

1 [Metropolitan Transportation Commission - Strengthen Provisions of Personal Information of  
2 the Clipper Card Program]

3  
4 **Resolution urging the Metropolitan Transportation Commission and the State**  
5 **Legislature to strengthen the privacy provisions of personal information of the Clipper**  
6 **Card Program.**

7  
8 WHEREAS, The Clipper card is an electronic fare payment card for Bay Area public  
9 transit agencies that is operated by the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC); and

10 WHEREAS, As of December 2011, there are more than one million active Clipper  
11 cards; and

12 WHEREAS, The MTC tracks the transit history of Clipper card users and links it to  
13 users' personally identifiable information, such as their name, address, credit card number,  
14 and other contact information; and

15 WHEREAS, The Clipper Privacy Policy allows the MTC to maintain all personally  
16 identifiable information indefinitely for active Clipper accounts and for up to seven years after  
17 accounts are closed or terminated; and

18 WHEREAS, The Clipper Privacy Policy allows the MTC to share personally identifiable  
19 information with participating transit agencies, third-party contractors, and the Better Business  
20 Bureau; and

21 WHEREAS, Clipper cards store their users' entire transit history as unencrypted data;  
22 and

23 WHEREAS, By comparison, the ORCA card, which is used for public transit in the  
24 Puget Sound area, preserves only the ten most recent trip transactions for the card; and

1           WHEREAS, A recently designed smartphone application provides the ability to scan  
2 any Clipper card and obtain the card's stored transit usage history; and

3           WHEREAS, This smartphone application can be used without the Clipper card owner's  
4 permission or knowledge simply by placing the smartphone near the Clipper card; and

5           WHEREAS, This public availability of Clipper card users' transit history creates a  
6 potential public safety risk by exposing users' regular travel patterns; and

7           WHEREAS, This public availability of Clipper users' transit history potentially threatens  
8 the constitutional protections of anonymous speech and associational privacy by revealing  
9 users' transit usage near First Amendment activities; and

10           WHEREAS, The Clipper card uses the MIFARE DESFire microchip, which was  
11 discontinued as of December 31, 2011, and has been replaced by the MIFARE DESFire EV1  
12 that offers additional security enhancements; and

13           WHEREAS, NXP Semiconductor, the manufacturer of the MIFARE DESFire, has  
14 acknowledged that it contains a potential security vulnerability and recommends that  
15 customers migrate to the MIFARE DESFire EV1; and

16           WHEREAS, SB 1268, authored by State Senator Joe Simitian and signed into law on  
17 September 29, 2010, added Chapter 8 to Division 17 of the California Street and Highways  
18 Code to limit transportation agencies ability to use, store, and retain personally identifiable  
19 information obtained through electronic toll collection systems; and

20           WHEREAS, SB 1268 proscribes stricter limits on transportation agencies ability to  
21 retain personally identifiable information than Clipper's current privacy policy; now, therefore,  
22 be it

23           RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors urges the members of the California State  
24 Assembly and Senate from San Francisco to legislate safeguards for the usage of personally  
25 identifiable information by transit agencies; and, be it

1 FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors urges the evaluate the length of  
2 time for which users' users' transit usage history information must be retained for legal or  
3 operational purposes and to revise the Clipper Privacy Policy to purge such information after  
4 that time (but after no later than four years and six months, and to purge all personally  
5 identifiable information as soon as possible after accounts are closed or terminated; and, be it


6 FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors urges the MTC to revise the  
7 Clipper Privacy Policy to create stricter limits on the sharing of personally identifiable  
8 information with third parties and participating transit agencies; and, be it

9 FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors urges the MTC to explore the  
10 feasibility of minimizing the amount of data stored on Clipper cards, encrypting the data, or  
11 providing the ability for users to clear the transit data stored on their cards; and, be it

12 FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors asks the MTC to report on its  
13 plans to phase out the use of the MIFARE DESFire chip in Clipper cards; and, be it

14 FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors directs the Clerk of the Board  
15 to transmit copies of this resolution to the MTC and the members of the California State  
16 Legislature from San Francisco with a request to take all action necessary to achieve the  
17 objectives of this resolution.



**Re: Transfer 121031 from CONS to Public Safety**   
**Judson True** to: Jeremy Pollock  
Cc: Derek Evans, Linda Wong

11/05/2012 04:44 PM

Derek and Linda please transfer as requested thanks!

---

Judson True  
Office of Supervisor David Chiu  
City Hall, Room 264  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
415.554.7451 desk  
415.554.7454 fax

---

Jeremy Pollock

Hi Judson, Can you transfer this resolution from...

11/05/2012 04:42:45 PM

---

From: Jeremy Pollock/BOS/SFGOV  
To: Judson True/BOS/SFGOV@SFGOV  
Cc: Linda Wong/BOS/SFGOV@SFGOV, Derek Evans/BOS/SFGOV@SFGOV  
Date: 11/05/2012 04:42 PM  
Subject: Transfer 121031 from CONS to Public Safety

---

Hi Judson,

Can you transfer this resolution from CONS to the Public Safety committee?

**121031 [Metropolitan Transportation Commission - Strengthen Provisions of Personal Information of the Clipper Card Program]**

Thanks,  
Jeremy

---

Jeremy Pollock  
Legislative Aide  
Supervisor John Avalos  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
(415) 554-6975 telephone  
(415) 554-7910 direct  
(415) 554-6979 fax  
jeremy.pollock@sfgov.org