

File No. 260480

Committee Item No. 5

Board Item No. 39

## COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

### AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST

Committee: Budget and Appropriations Committee Date May 20, 2026

Board of Supervisors Meeting Date June 2, 2026

#### Cmte Board

- |                                     |                                     |                                              |
|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Motion                                       |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Resolution                                   |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Budget and Legislative Analyst Report        |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Youth Commission Report                      |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | Introduction Form                            |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | Department/Agency Cover Letter and/or Report |
- CON Certification Letter – AIR Security Services - 4/24/2026
  - CON Certification Letter – AIR Guest Services - 4/24/2026
  - CON Certification Letter – AIR Parking - 4/24/2026
  - CON Certification Letter – AIR Shuttle Services - 4/24/2026
  - CON Certification Letter – MTA Citations and Permit Processing 4/24/2026
  - CON Certification Letter – MTA Paratransit - 4/24/2026
  - CON Certification Letter – MTA Parking Meter Collections - 4/24/2026
  - CON Certification Letter – MTA Security Services - 4/24/2026
  - CON Certification Letter – MTA Tow Services - 4/24/2026
  - CON Certification Letter – MTA Shelter Cleaning - 4/24/2026
  - CON Certification Letter – PRT Janitorial Services - 4/24/2026
  - CON Certification Letter – PUC Security Services - 4/24/2026
  - MYR Submittal Letter with Trailing Legislation
  - MYR Memo 5/1/2026
- |                          |                          |                       |
|--------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | MOU                   |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Contract/Agreement    |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Public Correspondence |

**OTHER** (Use back side if additional space is needed)

<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____

Completed by: Brent Jalipa Date May 14, 2026

Completed by: Brent Jalipa Date May 28, 2026

1 [Proposition J Contract Certification Contracted-Out Department Services Previously Approved]

2

3 **Resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that department services**  
4 **previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than**  
5 **similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services:**  
6 **security, information and guest services, parking operations, shuttle bus services**  
7 **(Airport); citations, paratransit, parking meter collections, security, towing, transit**  
8 **shelter cleaning services (Municipal Transportation Agency); janitorial services**  
9 **(Port); and security services (Public Utilities Commission).**

10

11 WHEREAS, The Electorate of the City and County of San Francisco passed  
12 Proposition J in November 1976, allowing City and County Departments to contract with  
13 private companies for specific services that can be performed for a lower cost than similar  
14 work by City and County employees (Charter, Section 10.104.15); and,

15 WHEREAS, The City has previously approved outside contracts for the services  
16 listed below; and,

17 WHEREAS, The Controller has determined that a Purchaser's award of a contract for  
18 the services listed below to a private contractor will continue to achieve cost savings for the  
19 City; and,

20 WHEREAS, The City and County of San Francisco has a Charter obligation to enact a  
21 balanced budget each fiscal year; and,

22 WHEREAS, The Controller's certification, which confirms that said services can be  
23 performed at lower costs to the City and County by private contractor than by employees of  
24 the City and County, is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 260480,

25

1 which is hereby declared to be part of this resolution as if set forth fully herein; now,  
 2 therefore be it;

3 RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors hereby concurs with the Controller's  
 4 certification, and approves the Proposition J Resolution concerning the Purchaser's award  
 5 of a contract to a private contractor for the services listed below for the period of July 1,  
 6 2026 through June 30, 2027, and for the period of July 1, 2027 through June 30, 2028 for  
 7 the Airport, Municipal Transportation Agency, Port, and Public Utilities Commission.

8

9 Fiscal Year 2026-2027

10		City Cost	Contract Cost		
11	Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
12	<b>Airport (AIR)</b>				
13	Information and Guest Services	19,599,861	10,546,037	9,053,824	110.0
14	Security Services	12,919,687	5,680,147	7,239,540	57.0
15	Parking Operations	50,991,149	47,995,168	2,995,981	239.5
16	Shuttle Bus	28,221,486	22,879,113	5,342,373	146.0
17	<b>Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA)</b>				
18	Citations Processing	17,714,983	6,871,447	10,843,536	58.9
19	Towing Services	28,604,295	18,020,848	10,583,447	96.8
20	Paratransit Services	89,361,343	32,505,813	56,855,530	443.0
21	Parking Meter Services	7,292,727	4,852,530	2,440,197	24.3
22	Security Services	26,400,964	10,452,702	15,948,262	119.2
23	Transit Shelter Cleaning Services	4,218,090	927,621	3,290,469	18.7

24

25

1		City Cost	Contract Cost		
2	Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
3	Janitorial Services	1,148,901	714,535	434,366	8.0
4	Public Utilities Commission (PUC)				
5	Security Services	3,780,931	1,893,684	1,887,247	24.5
6					
7					
8					
9	Fiscal Year 2027-2028				
10					
11		City Cost	Contract Cost		
12	Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
13	Airport (AIR)				
14	Information and Guest Services	19,987,198	10,966,140	9,021,058	110.0
15	Security Services	13,422,709	5,904,657	7,518,052	57.0
16	Parking Operations	53,527,724	49,407,327	4,120,397	239.5
17	Shuttle Bus	29,002,898	23,749,391	5,253,507	146.0
18	Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA)				
19	Citations Processing	18,648,829	7,085,943	11,562,886	58.9
20	Towing Services	30,116,764	18,625,640	11,491,124	96.8
21	Paratransit Services	92,381,615	33,586,423	58,795,192	443.0
22	Parking Meter Services	7,673,890	5,014,627	2,659,263	24.3
23	Security Services	27,834,321	10,800,836	17,033,485	119.2
24	Transit Shelter Cleaning Services	4,442,551	959,062	3,483,489	18.7
25					

1		City Cost	Contract Cost		
2	Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
3	Port (PRT)				
4	Janitorial Services	1,206,903	818,129	388,774	8.0
5	Public Utilities Commission (PUC)				
6	Security Services	3,991,773	1,901,241	2,090,532	24.5
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14					
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
ChiaYu Ma  
Deputy Controller

April 24, 2026

Mike Nakornkhet, Airport Director  
San Francisco International Airport  
International Terminal, 5th Floor  
P.O. Box 8097  
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Denise Payton, Director of Budget & Capital Planning

RE: Contracting for General Aviation Security Services – FY 2026-27 & FY 2027-28

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2026-27 and Fiscal Year 2027-28 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Greg Wagner

Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations

AIR - Airport Commission  
 General Aviation Security Services (GASS) (24160)  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
**FISCAL YEAR 2026-27**

<b>PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS</b>				
Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
Manager I	0922_C	1.00	\$ 203,692	\$ 251,712
Security Guard	8202_C	48.00	\$ 4,899,885	\$ 6,744,112
Aviation Security Operations Supervisor	9220_C	8.00	\$ 1,460,705	\$ 1,738,251
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 274,509	\$ 329,541
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 130,095	\$ 156,176
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 2,927,304	\$ 3,512,331
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>57.00</b>	<b>\$ 9,896,190</b>	<b>\$ 12,732,123</b>

<b>ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS</b>				
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
Uniforms for each guard and officer	0		\$ 75,600	\$ 75,600
May include capital costs, materials & supplies, uniforms, technology, as is comparable to the contract components.	0		\$ 7,488	\$ 7,488
Duty Phone	0		\$ 8,976	\$ 8,976
Consumable cards (Mobile ETD Seekers.)	0		\$ 72,800	\$ 77,000
Technology (handheld detectors, mobiles, laptops, tablets)	0		\$ 18,500	\$ 18,500
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 183,364</b>	<b>\$ 187,564</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST** **\$ 10,079,554** **\$ 12,919,687**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 10,079,554	\$ 12,919,687
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 5,252,950	\$ 5,680,147
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	<b>\$ 4,826,604</b>	<b>\$ 7,239,540</b>
% of Savings to City Cost	47.89%	56.03%

AIR - Airport Commission  
 General Aviation Security Services (GASS) (24160)  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
 FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
Manager I	0922_C	1.00	\$ 214,927	\$ 265,144
Security Guard	8202_C	48.00	\$ 5,184,785	\$ 7,113,404
Aviation Security Operations Supervisor	9220_C	8.00	\$ 1,539,084	\$ 1,829,330
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 282,742	\$ 339,426
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 130,094	\$ 156,177
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 2,928,414	\$ 3,513,664
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>57.00</b>	<b>\$ 10,280,046</b>	<b>\$ 13,217,145</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
Uniforms for each guard and officer	0		\$ 75,600	\$ 75,600
May include capital costs, materials & supplies, uniforms, technology, as is comparable to the contract components.	0		\$ 7,488	\$ 7,488
Duty Phone	0		\$ 8,976	\$ 8,976
Consumable cards (Mobile ETD Seekers.)	0		\$ 76,500	\$ 95,000
Technology (handheld detectors, mobiles, laptops, tablets)	0		\$ 18,500	\$ 18,500
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 187,064</b>	<b>\$ 205,564</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST** **\$ 10,467,110** **\$ 13,422,709**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 10,467,110	\$ 13,422,709
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 5,446,675	\$ 5,904,657
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	<u>\$ 5,020,435</u>	<u>\$ 7,518,052</u>
% of Savings to City Cost	47.96%	56.01%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
ChiaYu Ma  
Deputy Controller

April 24, 2026

Mike Nakornkhet, Airport Director  
San Francisco International Airport  
International Terminal, 5th Floor  
P.O. Box 8097  
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Denise Payton, Director of Budget & Capital Planning

RE: Contracting for Airport Information and Guest Assistance Services – FY 2026-27 & FY 2027-28

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2026-27 and Fiscal Year 2027-28 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Greg Wagner  
Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations

AIR - Airport Commission

Airport Information and Guest Assistance Services (24157)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS				
Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
Customer Service Representative	1304_C	93.00	\$ 12,645,958	\$ 14,944,616
Customer Service Supervisor	1306_C	13.00	\$ 1,965,353	\$ 2,327,745
Senior Management Assistant	1844_C	4.00	\$ 658,879	\$ 782,359
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 598,755	\$ 718,791
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 245,741	\$ 590,016
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>110.00</b>	<b>\$ 16,114,686</b>	<b>\$ 19,363,527</b>

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS				
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
Office Equipment and Technical Support	0		\$ 42,800	\$ 42,800
Reward and Recognition	0		\$ 12,120	\$ 12,120
Uniform and Dry Cleaning	0		\$ 39,761	\$ 39,761
ADM Guest Support Supplies	0		\$ 7,500	\$ 7,500
Communication Devices and Licenses Fees	0		\$ 41,159	\$ 41,159
Other - Performance Bond	0		\$ 92,994	\$ 92,994
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 236,334</b>	<b>\$ 236,334</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 16,351,020 \$ 19,599,861**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 16,351,020	\$ 19,599,861
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 9,147,070	\$ 10,546,037
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$ 7,203,950	\$ 9,053,824
	% of Savings to City Cost	44.06%	46.19%

AIR - Airport Commission

Airport Information and Guest Assistance Services (24157)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS				
Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
Customer Service Representative	1304_C	93.00	\$ 13,346,480	\$ 15,750,319
Customer Service Supervisor	1306_C	13.00	\$ 2,072,875	\$ 2,451,843
Senior Management Assistant	1844_C	4.00	\$ 694,587	\$ 823,723
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 598,756	\$ 718,793
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>110.00</b>	<b>\$ 16,712,698</b>	<b>\$ 19,744,678</b>

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS				
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
Office Equipment and Technical Support	0		\$ 44,940	\$ 44,940
Reward and Recognition	0		\$ 12,120	\$ 12,120
Uniform and Dry Cleaning	0		\$ 41,749	\$ 41,749
ADM Guest Support Supplies	0		\$ 7,500	\$ 7,500
Communication Devices and Licenses Fees	0		\$ 43,217	\$ 43,217
Other - Performance Bond	0		\$ 92,994	\$ 92,994
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 242,520</b>	<b>\$ 242,520</b>

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	<b>\$ 17,200,960</b>	<b>\$ 19,987,198</b>
----------------------------------	----------------------	----------------------

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 17,200,960	\$ 19,987,198
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 9,502,127	\$ 10,966,140
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	<u>\$ 7,698,833</u>	<u>\$ 9,021,058</u>
% of Savings to City Cost	44.76%	45.13%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
ChiaYu Ma  
Deputy Controller

April 24, 2026

Mike Nakornkhet, Airport Director  
San Francisco International Airport  
International Terminal, 5th Floor  
P.O. Box 8097  
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Denise Payton, Director of Budget & Capital Planning

RE: Contracting for Airport Public and Employee Parking – FY 2026-27 & FY 2027-28

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2026-27 and Fiscal Year 2027-28 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Greg Wagner

Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations

AIR - Airport Commission

Airport Public and Employee Parking (24159)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS				
Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
Manager I	0922_C	1.00	\$ 203,692	\$ 251,712
Manager II	0923_C	3.00	\$ 649,616	\$ 803,285
Manager IV	0932_C	1.00	\$ 245,933	\$ 303,292
IS Business Analyst-Senior	1053_C	1.00	\$ 189,884	\$ 233,128
Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1222_C	1.00	\$ 139,339	\$ 164,719
Customer Service Agent	1324_C	20.00	\$ 2,719,561	\$ 3,213,896
Customer Service Agent Supervisor	1326_C	25.00	\$ 3,779,528	\$ 4,476,432
Clerk	1404_C	1.00	\$ 105,441	\$ 123,539
Senior Clerk	1406_C	5.00	\$ 543,004	\$ 749,085
Principal Clerk	1408_C	1.00	\$ 136,412	\$ 161,261
Accountant II	1652_C	1.00	\$ 153,147	\$ 181,256
Accountant IV	1657_C	1.00	\$ 204,728	\$ 243,995
Management Assistant	1842_C	2.50	\$ 366,395	\$ 433,422
Senior Management Assistant	1844_C	1.00	\$ 164,720	\$ 195,590
Custodian	2708_C	39.00	\$ 4,261,403	\$ 4,995,677
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716_C	3.00	\$ 353,845	\$ 416,319
Custodial Supervisor	2718_C	1.00	\$ 127,894	\$ 150,748
Cashier III	4322_C	46.00	\$ 5,809,731	\$ 6,851,783
Investigator, Tax Collector	4334_C	2.00	\$ 322,522	\$ 382,597
Collection Supervisor	4366_C	1.00	\$ 146,824	\$ 173,735
Chief Stationary Engineer	7205_C	1.00	\$ 235,760	\$ 235,760
Electronic Maintenance Technician	7318_C	1.50	\$ 299,979	\$ 355,946
Stationary Engineer	7334_C	2.00	\$ 383,612	\$ 383,612
Truck Driver	7355_C	15.50	\$ 2,271,597	\$ 2,785,155
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205_C	2.00	\$ 53,452	\$ 53,452
Building And Grounds Patrol Officer	8207_C	60.00	\$ 7,158,759	\$ 8,430,141
Sheriff's Lieutenant	8310_S	1.00	\$ 338,102	\$ 423,806
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 1,752,879	\$ 2,079,335
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 492,319	\$ 584,007
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 134,880	\$ 159,999
	Sum:	239.50	\$ 33,744,958	\$ 39,996,684

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
Operating Expenses	0		\$ 4,657,465	\$ 4,657,465
Credit Card Processing Fees and Services	0		\$ 5,589,000	\$ 5,589,000
Training	0		\$ 374,000	\$ 374,000
Parking/Billing Technology	0		\$ 374,000	\$ 374,000
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 10,994,465</b>	<b>\$ 10,994,465</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 44,739,423 \$ 50,991,149**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 44,739,423	\$ 50,991,149
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 43,014,598	\$ 47,995,168
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$ 1,724,825	\$ 2,995,981
	% of Savings to City Cost	3.86%	5.88%

AIR - Airport Commission

Airport Public and Employee Parking (24159)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
Manager I	0922_C	1.00	\$ 214,927	\$ 265,144
Manager II	0923_C	3.00	\$ 685,202	\$ 846,141
Manager IV	0932_C	1.00	\$ 259,224	\$ 319,288
IS Business Analyst-Senior	1053_C	1.00	\$ 200,087	\$ 245,309
Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1222_C	1.00	\$ 147,033	\$ 173,577
Customer Service Agent	1324_C	20.00	\$ 2,870,209	\$ 3,387,165
Customer Service Agent Supervisor	1326_C	25.00	\$ 3,986,301	\$ 4,715,084
Clerk	1404_C	1.00	\$ 111,489	\$ 130,415
Senior Clerk	1406_C	5.00	\$ 574,287	\$ 789,794
Principal Clerk	1408_C	1.00	\$ 143,964	\$ 169,951
Accountant II	1652_C	1.00	\$ 161,549	\$ 190,942
Accountant IV	1657_C	1.00	\$ 215,634	\$ 256,697
Management Assistant	1842_C	2.50	\$ 386,511	\$ 456,604
Senior Management Assistant	1844_C	1.00	\$ 173,647	\$ 205,931
Custodian	2708_C	39.00	\$ 4,504,575	\$ 5,272,464
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716_C	3.00	\$ 373,820	\$ 439,152

Custodial Supervisor	2718_C	1.00	\$	135,037	\$	158,936
Cashier III	4322_C	46.00	\$	6,134,658	\$	7,224,350
Investigator, Tax Collector	4334_C	2.00	\$	340,042	\$	402,865
Collection Supervisor	4366_C	1.00	\$	154,879	\$	183,024
Chief Stationary Engineer	7205_C	1.00	\$	248,185	\$	248,185
Electronic Maintenance Technician	7318_C	1.50	\$	316,250	\$	374,776
Stationary Engineer	7334_C	2.00	\$	404,231	\$	404,231
Truck Driver	7355_C	15.50	\$	2,398,932	\$	2,935,986
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205_C	2.00	\$	58,349	\$	58,349
Building And Grounds Patrol Officer	8207_C	60.00	\$	7,562,156	\$	8,891,757
Sheriff's Lieutenant	8310_S	1.00	\$	344,976	\$	431,896
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$	1,809,945	\$	2,147,027
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$	633,760	\$	751,792
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$	134,881	\$	160,000
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>239.50</b>	<b>\$</b>	<b>35,684,740</b>	<b>\$</b>	<b>42,236,832</b>

### ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
Operating Expenses	0		\$ 4,606,671	\$ 4,606,671
Credit Card Processing Fees and Services	0		\$ 5,936,221	\$ 5,936,221
Training	0		\$ 374,000	\$ 374,000
Parking/Billing Technology	0		\$ 374,000	\$ 374,000
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 11,290,892</b>	<b>\$ 11,290,892</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST** **\$ 46,975,632** **\$ 53,527,724**

### COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 46,975,632	\$ 53,527,724
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 44,281,354	\$ 49,407,327
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	<u>\$ 2,694,278</u>	<u>\$ 4,120,397</u>
% of Savings to City Cost	5.74%	7.70%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
ChiaYu Ma  
Deputy Controller

April 24, 2026

Mike Nakornkhet, Airport Director  
San Francisco International Airport  
International Terminal, 5th Floor  
P.O. Box 8097  
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Denise Payton, Director of Budget & Capital Planning

RE: Contracting for Airport Shuttle Bus Services – FY 2026-27 & FY 2027-28

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2026-27 and Fiscal Year 2027-28 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Greg Wagner

Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations

AIR - Airport Commission

Airport Shuttle Bus Services (24154)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C	8.00	\$ 1,427,954	\$ 1,427,954
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 401,885	\$ 482,455
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 605,563	\$ 726,967
	Sum:	8.00	\$ 2,435,402	\$ 2,637,376

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
9163 Transit Operator	124	FTEs	\$ 14,755,159	\$ 17,713,276
9139 Transit Supervisor	9	FTEs	\$ 1,484,339	\$ 1,781,919
9141 Transit Manager II	1	FTE	\$ 192,079	\$ 230,587
9140 Transit Manager I	2	FTEs	\$ 380,394	\$ 456,656
9102 Transit Car Cleaner	2	FTEs	\$ 235,366	\$ 282,552
Other direct operating costs	0		\$ 4,654,288	\$ 4,654,288
Overhead	0		\$ 464,832	\$ 464,832
		Total Non-Personnel Costs:	\$ 22,166,457	\$ 25,584,110

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST**

**\$ 24,601,859 \$ 28,221,486**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 24,601,859	\$ 28,221,486
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 22,874,935	\$ 22,879,113
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,726,924	\$ 5,342,373
% of Savings to City Cost	7.02%	18.93%

AIR - Airport Commission

Airport Shuttle Bus Services (24154)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C	8.00	\$ 1,505,337	\$ 1,505,337
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 401,885	\$ 482,456
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 605,564	\$ 726,969
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>8.00</b>	<b>\$ 2,512,786</b>	<b>\$ 2,714,762</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
9163 Transit Operator	124	FTEs	\$ 15,052,640	\$ 18,070,396
9139 Transit Supervisor	9	FTEs	\$ 1,602,296	\$ 1,923,525
9141 Transit Manager II	1	FTE	\$ 197,841	\$ 237,504
9140 Transit Manager I	2	FTEs	\$ 410,576	\$ 492,888
9102 Transit Car Cleaner	2	FTEs	\$ 254,127	\$ 305,074
Other direct operating costs	0		\$ 4,793,917	\$ 4,793,917
Overhead	0		\$ 464,832	\$ 464,832
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 22,776,229</b>	<b>\$ 26,288,136</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 25,289,015 \$ 29,002,898**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 25,289,015	\$ 29,002,898
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 23,745,022	\$ 23,749,391
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,543,993	\$ 5,253,507
% of Savings to City Cost	6.11%	18.11%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
ChiaYu Ma  
Deputy Controller

April 24, 2026

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transportation  
Municipal Transportation Agency  
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for Citations & Permit Processing – FY 2026-27 & FY 2027-28

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2026-27 and Fiscal Year 2027-28 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Greg Wagner  
Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Citations & Permit Processing (24162)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS				
Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
IS Engineer-Senior	1043_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 221,165	\$ 271,881
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 236,207	\$ 289,587
IS Business Analyst	1052_C_MTA	1.94	\$ 478,558	\$ 582,488
IS Programmer Analyst	1062_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 153,945	\$ 187,876
IS Programmer Analyst-Senior	1063_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 181,633	\$ 222,788
IS Programmer Analyst-Principal	1064_C_MTA	0.50	\$ 103,921	\$ 127,829
IS Project Director	1070_C_MTA	0.14	\$ 33,955	\$ 41,885
IT Operations Support Administrator III	1093_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 159,700	\$ 192,865
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 188,791	\$ 228,555
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	11.20	\$ 1,180,939	\$ 1,383,822
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	5.20	\$ 709,336	\$ 838,554
Senior Account Clerk	1632_C_MTA	3.10	\$ 390,082	\$ 459,482
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	9.30	\$ 1,295,849	\$ 1,531,894
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 179,944	\$ 213,876
Senior Management Assistant	1844_C_MTA	6.25	\$ 1,029,496	\$ 1,222,434
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	0.13	\$ 27,069	\$ 33,506
Senior Permit and Citation Clerk	9506_C_MTA	8.08	\$ 1,108,054	\$ 1,310,045
Principal Permit and Citation Clerk	9508_C_MTA	6.08	\$ 905,029	\$ 1,071,580
Sum:		58.92	\$ 8,583,673	\$ 10,210,345

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS				
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
Workstation	60	Price: \$3822; Useful Life: 5	\$ 45,864	\$ 45,864
Computers	60	Price: \$1596; Useful Life: 5	\$ 19,152	\$ 19,152
Tough Book Laptops	5	Price: \$3192; Useful Life: 5	\$ 3,192	\$ 3,192
Printers	35	Price: \$638; Useful Life: 5	\$ 4,466	\$ 4,466
Postage	0		\$ 380,752	\$ 380,752
Mobile License Recognition Camera Fees	0		\$ 25,482	\$ 25,482
Mis (handheld devices/accessories, data cards)	0		\$ 7,797	\$ 7,797
Handheld Devices	0		\$ 148,862	\$ 148,862
Tickets/Envelopes	0		\$ 38,350	\$ 38,350
MTA Overhead @ 66.9%	0	Overhead rate lowered from FY25-26.	\$ 5,742,477	\$ 6,830,721

Total Non-Personnel Costs: \$ 6,416,394 \$ 7,504,638

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 15,000,067 \$ 17,714,983**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>		<b>\$ 15,000,067</b>	<b>\$ 17,714,983</b>
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>		<b>\$ 6,865,442</b>	<b>\$ 6,871,447</b>
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>		<b>\$ 8,134,625</b>	<b>\$ 10,843,536</b>
	<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	<b>54.23%</b>	<b>61.21%</b>

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Citations & Permit Processing (24162)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
IS Engineer-Senior	1043_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 232,886	\$ 285,796
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 248,663	\$ 304,565
IS Business Analyst	1052_C_MTA	1.94	\$ 504,533	\$ 613,383
IS Programmer Analyst	1062_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 162,397	\$ 197,881
IS Programmer Analyst-Senior	1063_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 191,435	\$ 234,470
IS Programmer Analyst-Principal	1064_C_MTA	0.50	\$ 109,460	\$ 134,461
IS Project Director	1070_C_MTA	0.14	\$ 35,746	\$ 44,041
IT Operations Support Administrator III	1093_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 168,426	\$ 202,900
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 198,931	\$ 240,514
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	11.20	\$ 1,248,695	\$ 1,460,655
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	5.20	\$ 748,618	\$ 883,753
Senior Account Clerk	1632_C_MTA	3.10	\$ 411,905	\$ 484,484
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	9.30	\$ 1,367,419	\$ 1,614,263
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 189,645	\$ 225,130
Senior Management Assistant	1844_C_MTA	6.25	\$ 1,085,295	\$ 1,287,072
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	0.13	\$ 28,550	\$ 35,281
Senior Permit and Citation Clerk	9506_C_MTA	8.08	\$ 1,169,290	\$ 1,380,532
Principal Permit and Citation Clerk	9508_C_MTA	6.08	\$ 954,625	\$ 1,128,801
	<b>Sum:</b>	<b>58.92</b>	<b>\$ 9,056,519</b>	<b>\$ 10,757,982</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
Workstation	60	Price: \$3822; Useful Life: 5	\$ 45,864	\$ 45,864
Computers	60	Price: \$1596; Useful Life: 5	\$ 19,152	\$ 19,152
Tough Book Laptops	5	Price: \$3192; Useful Life: 5	\$ 3,192	\$ 3,192
Printers	35	Price: \$638; Useful Life: 5	\$ 4,466	\$ 4,466
Postage	0		\$ 393,317	\$ 393,317
Mobile License Recognition Camera Fees	0		\$ 26,323	\$ 26,323
Mis (handheld devices/accessories, data cards)	0		\$ 8,054	\$ 8,054
Handheld Devices	0		\$ 153,774	\$ 153,774
Tickets/Envelopes	0		\$ 39,615	\$ 39,615
MTA Overhead @ 66.9%	0	Overhead rate lowered from FY25-26.	\$ 6,058,811	\$ 7,197,090
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 6,752,568</b>	<b>\$ 7,890,847</b>

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	<b>\$ 15,809,087</b>	<b>\$ 18,648,829</b>
----------------------------------	----------------------	----------------------

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	<b>\$ 15,809,087</b>	<b>\$ 18,648,829</b>
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	<b>\$ 7,078,855</b>	<b>\$ 7,085,943</b>
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<b>\$ 8,730,232</b>	<b>\$ 11,562,886</b>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	<b>55.22%</b>	<b>62.00%</b>



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
ChiaYu Ma  
Deputy Controller

April 24, 2026

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transportation  
Municipal Transportation Agency  
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for Paratransit Services – FY 2026-27 & FY 2027-28

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2026-27 and Fiscal Year 2027-28 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Greg Wagner  
Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Paratransit (24163)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE		FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
IT Operations Support Administrator II	1092_C_MTA	2.00	\$	270,699	\$ 324,923
IT Operations Support Administrator V	1095_C_MTA	1.00	\$	201,349	\$ 244,260
Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1222_C_MTA	2.00	\$	278,678	\$ 329,440
Human Resources Analyst	1241_C_MTA	2.00	\$	290,653	\$ 407,423
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	7.00	\$	760,207	\$ 1,048,722
Executive Secretary I	1450_C_MTA	2.00	\$	272,823	\$ 322,522
Senior Account Clerk	1632_C_MTA	3.00	\$	377,498	\$ 444,660
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	4.00	\$	612,591	\$ 725,025
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.00	\$	204,728	\$ 243,995
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	21.00	\$	2,399,392	\$ 2,818,530
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	29.00	\$	3,606,704	\$ 4,250,162
Senior Parts Storekeeper	1931_C_MTA	1.00	\$	133,649	\$ 157,967
Custodian	2708_C_MTA	3.00	\$	327,800	\$ 384,283
Planner I	5277_C_MTA	1.00	\$	136,549	\$ 161,130
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	12.00	\$	2,141,931	\$ 2,141,931
Automotive Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382_C_MTA	2.00	\$	418,277	\$ 418,277
Automotive Service Worker	7410_C_MTA	8.00	\$	980,744	\$ 1,156,118
Transit Car Cleaner	9102_C_MTA	7.00	\$	838,911	\$ 987,010
Senior Transit Information Clerk	9124_C_MTA	5.00	\$	863,097	\$ 783,179
Transit Supervisor	9139_C_MTA	15.00	\$	2,499,686	\$ 2,956,745
Transit Manager I	9140_C_MTA	7.00	\$	1,340,349	\$ 1,591,557
Transit Operator	9163_C_MTA	299.00	\$	22,288,294	\$ 30,556,417
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	3.00	\$	649,616	\$ 803,285
Transportation Safety Specialist	9520_C_MTA	1.00	\$	200,325	\$ 238,132
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$	861,012	\$ 1,033,627
Premium Pay - Platform			\$	959,761	\$ 1,152,174
		<b>Sum:</b>		<b>\$ 43,715,323</b>	<b>\$ 55,681,494</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure		FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
Sedan, 4 door midsize	200	FY27: Unit Cost \$14,000, Replacement Years 4	\$	583,100	\$ 700,000

Van, Type A, lift equipped	49	FY27: Unit Cost \$38,315, Replacement Years 4	\$ 390,976	\$ 469,359
Van, Type B, lift equipped	64	FY27: Unit Cost \$41,772, Replacement Years 4	\$ 556,737	\$ 668,352
Minivans, ramp equipped	25	FY27: Unit Cost \$18,417, Replacement Years 4	\$ 95,884	\$ 115,106
2 way radios	338	FFY27: Unit Cost \$54.21, Replacement Years 4	\$ 3,816	\$ 4,581
Tablets	200	FY27: Unit Cost \$1000 Replacement Years 4	\$ 41,650	\$ 50,000
Fuel: (Est miles per gal is 5.1 at \$5.20 per gallon)	0		\$ 1,936,423	\$ 2,324,637
Parts (Est at \$2,467 per vehicle)	0		\$ 729,323	\$ 875,538
Computer Supplies, maintenance, hosting, "Trapeze" system	0		\$ 226,427	\$ 271,821
CabConnect	0		\$ 329,402	\$ 395,440
Claims Est.	0	3.9% of Total Salary	\$ 1,191,122	\$ 1,429,918
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$330/person/year Shoes \$275/year)	0		\$ 136,987	\$ 164,450
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$660/person/year)	0		\$ 7,697	\$ 9,240
Other Pay: 7382/7381/7410 (Uniform \$330/person/year Shoes \$275/year)	0		\$ 11,087	\$ 13,310
Other Pay: 9140 (Shoes \$165/person/year)	0		\$ 962	\$ 1,155
2905_C Human Services Agency Senior Eligibility Worker	4		\$ 550,394	\$ 621,481
2907_C Eligibility Worker Supervisor	1		\$ 152,525	\$ 172,225
Other Pay: 9139 (Shoes \$165/person/year)	0		\$ 2,062	\$ 2,475
Overhead @45.6%	0		\$ 19,934,187	\$ 25,390,761
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 26,880,761</b>	<b>\$ 33,679,849</b>

### ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

**\$ 70,596,084 \$ 89,361,343**

### COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 70,596,084	\$ 89,361,343
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 27,074,627	\$ 32,505,813
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$ 43,521,457	\$ 56,855,530
	% of Savings to City Cost	61.65%	63.62%

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Paratransit (24163)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
IT Operations Support Administrator II	1092_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 285,784	\$ 342,488
IT Operations Support Administrator V	1095_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 212,102	\$ 256,977
Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1222_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 294,068	\$ 347,152
Human Resources Analyst	1241_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 306,790	\$ 428,904
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 803,998	\$ 1,105,710
Executive Secretary I	1450_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 287,929	\$ 339,905
Senior Account Clerk	1632_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 398,617	\$ 468,855
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	4.00	\$ 646,192	\$ 763,770
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 215,634	\$ 256,697
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	21.00	\$ 2,535,436	\$ 2,973,742
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	29.00	\$ 3,808,825	\$ 4,481,736
Senior Parts Storekeeper	1931_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 141,069	\$ 166,500
Custodian	2708_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 346,505	\$ 405,574
Planner I	5277_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 144,141	\$ 169,849
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	12.00	\$ 2,258,004	\$ 2,258,004
Automotive Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 440,572	\$ 440,572
Automotive Service Worker	7410_C_MTA	8.00	\$ 1,035,421	\$ 1,218,826
Transit Car Cleaner	9102_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 886,163	\$ 1,041,038
Senior Transit Information Clerk	9124_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 699,950	\$ 825,521
Transit Supervisor	9139_C_MTA	15.00	\$ 2,637,281	\$ 3,115,274
Transit Manager I	9140_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 1,413,015	\$ 1,675,721
Transit Operator	9163_C_MTA	299.00	\$ 22,961,042	\$ 31,248,594
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 685,202	\$ 846,141
Transportation Safety Specialist	9520_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 211,137	\$ 250,676
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 883,143	\$ 1,060,194
Premium Pay - Platform			\$ 984,429	\$ 1,181,786
	<b>Sum:</b>	<b>438.00</b>	<b>\$ 45,522,449</b>	<b>\$ 57,670,206</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
Sedan, 4 door midsize	200	FY27: Unit Cost \$14,000, Replacement Years 4	\$ 583,100	\$ 700,000
Van, Type A, lift equipped	49	FY27: Unit Cost \$38,315, Replacement Years 4	\$ 390,976	\$ 469,359
Van, Type B, lift equipped	64	FY27: Unit Cost \$41,772, Replacement Years 4	\$ 556,737	\$ 668,352
Minivans, ramp equipped	25	FY27: Unit Cost \$18,417, Replacement Years 4	\$ 95,884	\$ 115,106
2 way radios	338	FFY27: Unit Cost \$54.21, Replacement Years 4	\$ 3,816	\$ 4,581
Tablets	200	FY27: Unit Cost \$1000 Replacement Years 4	\$ 41,650	\$ 50,000
Fuel: (Est miles per gal is 5.1 at \$5.20 per gallon)	0		\$ 1,936,423	\$ 2,324,637
Parts (Est at \$2,467 per vehicle)	0		\$ 753,391	\$ 904,431
Computer Supplies, maintenance, hosting, "Trapeze" system	0		\$ 233,899	\$ 280,791
CabConnect	0		\$ 340,272	\$ 408,490
Claims Est.	0	3.9% of Total Salary	\$ 1,230,429	\$ 1,477,105
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$330/person/year Shoes \$275/year)	0		\$ 141,507	\$ 169,877
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$660/person/year)	0		\$ 7,951	\$ 9,545
Other Pay: 7382/7381/7410 (Uniform \$330/person/year Shoes \$275/year)	0		\$ 11,453	\$ 13,749
Other Pay: 9140 (Shoes \$165/person/year)	0		\$ 994	\$ 1,193
2905_C Human Services Agency Senior Eligibility Worker	4		\$ 564,539	\$ 637,453
2907_C Eligibility Worker Supervisor	1		\$ 156,445	\$ 176,651
Other Pay: 9139 (Shoes \$165/person/year)	0		\$ 2,130	\$ 2,475
Overhead @45.6%	0		\$ 20,758,237	\$ 26,297,614
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 27,809,833</b>	<b>\$ 34,711,409</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 73,332,282 \$ 92,381,615**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 73,332,282	\$ 92,381,615
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 27,975,019	\$ 33,586,423
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 45,357,263	\$ 58,795,192
% of Savings to City Cost	61.85%	63.64%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
ChiaYu Ma  
Deputy Controller

April 24, 2026

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transportation  
Municipal Transportation Agency  
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for Parking Meter Collections – FY 2026-27 & FY 2027-28

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2026-27 and Fiscal Year 2027-28 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Greg Wagner  
Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Parking Meter Collections (24175)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS				
Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 204,795	\$ 244,161
Fare Collections Receiver	9110_C_MTA	10.00	\$ 1,198,448	\$ 1,410,015
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 946,957	\$ 1,118,340
Principal Fare Collections Receiver	9117_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 823,432	\$ 977,949
Manager IV, MTA	9174_C_MTA	0.25	\$ 57,785	\$ 71,671
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 216,537	\$ 267,761
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 65,511	\$ 78,646
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 40,745	\$ 46,649
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>24.25</b>	<b>\$ 3,554,210</b>	<b>\$ 4,215,192</b>

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS				
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
Rent	0		\$ 93,855	\$ 93,855
Utilities	0		\$ 21,205	\$ 21,205
Uniform	0		\$ 10,490	\$ 10,490
Vehicles	0		\$ 75,648	\$ 75,648
Radios	0		\$ 13,987	\$ 13,987
Gas	0		\$ 42,387	\$ 42,387
Overhead (66.9% of salary and benefits)	0		\$ 2,377,766	\$ 2,819,963
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 2,635,338</b>	<b>\$ 3,077,535</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 6,189,548 \$ 7,292,727**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 6,189,548	\$ 7,292,727
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 4,835,165	\$ 4,852,530
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$ 1,354,383	\$ 2,440,197
	% of Savings to City Cost	21.88%	33.46%

Parking Meter Collections (24175)  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 215,704	\$ 256,873
Fare Collections Receiver	9110_C_MTA	10.00	\$ 1,265,944	\$ 1,487,196
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116_C_MTA	7.00	\$ 999,444	\$ 1,178,675
Principal Fare Collections Receiver	9117_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 868,061	\$ 1,029,656
Manager IV, MTA	9174_C_MTA	0.25	\$ 60,928	\$ 75,451
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 228,400	\$ 282,046
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 67,196	\$ 80,668
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 41,793	\$ 47,846
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>24.25</b>	<b>\$ 3,747,470</b>	<b>\$ 4,438,411</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
Rent	0		\$ 96,952	\$ 96,952
Utilities	0		\$ 21,904	\$ 21,904
Uniform	0		\$ 10,845	\$ 10,845
Vehicles	0		\$ 78,203	\$ 78,203
Radios	0		\$ 14,460	\$ 14,460
Gas	0		\$ 43,818	\$ 43,818
Overhead (66.9%) of salary and benefits)	0		\$ 2,507,057	\$ 2,969,297
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 2,773,239</b>	<b>\$ 3,235,479</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 6,520,709 \$ 7,673,890**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 6,520,709	\$ 7,673,890
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 4,996,465	\$ 5,014,627
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$ 1,524,244	\$ 2,659,263
	% of Savings to City Cost	23.38%	34.65%



MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency  
 Security Services (24176)  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
**FISCAL YEAR 2026-27**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 108,600	\$ 149,817
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	16.00	\$ 2,182,573	\$ 2,580,168
Chief Clerk	1410_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 153,376	\$ 181,685
Security Guard	8202_C_MTA	100.20	\$ 10,228,510	\$ 14,078,335
Manager II, MTA	9172_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 203,692	\$ 251,712
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 32,490	\$ 40,036
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 43,081	\$ 53,089
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>119.20</b>	<b>\$ 12,952,322</b>	<b>\$ 17,334,842</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
MTA Transit Overhead of 52.3% of salary + benefits	0		\$ 6,774,064	\$ 9,066,122
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 6,774,064</b>	<b>\$ 9,066,122</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 19,726,386 \$ 26,400,964**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 19,726,386	\$ 26,400,964
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 10,419,771	\$ 10,452,702
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 9,306,615	\$ 15,948,262
% of Savings to City Cost	47.18%	60.41%

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Security Services (24176)

aved: Just now | TIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

**FISCAL YEAR 2027-28**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 114,857	\$ 157,959
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	16.00	\$ 2,303,433	\$ 2,719,232
Chief Clerk	1410_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 161,754	\$ 191,358
Security Guard	8202_C_MTA	100.20	\$ 10,823,242	\$ 14,849,235
Manager II, MTA	9172_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 214,927	\$ 265,144
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 33,324	\$ 40,006
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 44,189	\$ 53,048
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>119.20</b>	<b>\$ 13,695,726</b>	<b>\$ 18,275,982</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
MTA Transit Overhead of 52.3% of salary + benefits	0		\$ 7,162,865	\$ 9,558,339
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 7,162,865</b>	<b>\$ 9,558,339</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 20,858,591 \$ 27,834,321**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 20,858,591	\$ 27,834,321
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 10,766,400	\$ 10,800,836
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 10,092,191	\$ 17,033,485
% of Savings to City Cost	48.38%	61.20%



MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Towing (24172)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS				
Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 236,207	\$ 289,587
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 188,791	\$ 228,555
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	1.56	\$ 164,487	\$ 192,720
Account Clerk	1630_C_MTA	3.25	\$ 362,683	\$ 425,713
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	6.56	\$ 914,061	\$ 1,080,562
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 306,296	\$ 362,513
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 204,728	\$ 243,995
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 571,284	\$ 671,079
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 621,846	\$ 732,784
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 204,795	\$ 244,161
Senior Materials And Supplies Supervisor	1926_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 116,118	\$ 136,410
Storekeeper	1934_C_MTA	7.60	\$ 862,034	\$ 1,011,946
Senior Storekeeper	1936_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 357,937	\$ 421,507
Purchaser	1952_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 155,706	\$ 184,514
Cashier II	4321_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 230,041	\$ 270,094
Cashier III	4322_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 252,596	\$ 297,902
Truck Driver	7355_C_MTA	34.23	\$ 5,016,566	\$ 6,150,698
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	5.20	\$ 928,168	\$ 928,168
Security Guard	8202_C_MTA	11.39	\$ 1,162,699	\$ 1,600,322
Manager IV, MTA	9174_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 462,271	\$ 570,959
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 33,189	\$ 39,845
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>96.79</b>	<b>\$ 13,352,503</b>	<b>\$ 16,084,034</b>

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS				
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
Postage+supplies+uniforms	0		\$ 65,746	\$ 65,746
Specialized Software	0		\$ 365,801	\$ 365,801
Vehicles - tow trucks (7 year useful life)	0		\$ 890,950	\$ 890,950
Fuel (15-20 miles/day/truck, assume 20mi/gal at \$5-\$7/gallon)	0		\$ 84,950	\$ 101,981
Communications: ipad air \$672 + case \$31 + cellular data (\$207/year for 4 years) *32 drivers / useful life 4 years	0		\$ 7,280	\$ 7,280
Utilities	0		\$ 41,729	\$ 41,729

Lien Fees	0	\$	183,971	\$	183,971
Dolly equipment (2 year useful life)	0	\$	25,309	\$	25,309
Credit card fees	0	\$	77,275	\$	77,275
Overhead, at 66.9% applied to salaries and fringe benefits	0	\$	8,932,825	\$	10,760,219
		<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>	<b>\$ 10,675,836</b>	<b>\$</b>	<b>12,520,261</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 24,028,339 \$ 28,604,295**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>		<b>\$ 24,028,339</b>	<b>\$ 28,604,295</b>
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>		<b>\$ 17,933,273</b>	<b>\$ 18,020,848</b>
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>		<b>\$ 6,095,066</b>	<b>\$ 10,583,447</b>
	<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	<b>25.37%</b>	<b>37.00%</b>

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Towing (24172)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 248,663	\$ 304,565
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 198,931	\$ 240,514
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	1.56	\$ 173,924	\$ 203,448
Account Clerk	1630_C_MTA	3.25	\$ 383,315	\$ 449,235
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	6.56	\$ 964,545	\$ 1,138,662
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 323,097	\$ 381,886
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 215,634	\$ 256,697
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 603,673	\$ 708,033
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	5.00	\$ 656,692	\$ 772,713
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 215,704	\$ 256,873
Senior Materials And Supplies Supervisor	1926_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 122,687	\$ 143,907
Storekeeper	1934_C_MTA	7.60	\$ 910,962	\$ 1,067,731
Senior Storekeeper	1936_C_MTA	3.00	\$ 378,110	\$ 444,589
Purchaser	1952_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 164,234	\$ 194,360
Cashier II	4321_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 243,074	\$ 284,954
Cashier III	4322_C_MTA	2.00	\$ 266,722	\$ 314,100
Truck Driver	7355_C_MTA	34.23	\$ 5,297,773	\$ 6,483,794
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	5.20	\$ 978,467	\$ 978,467
Security Guard	8202_C_MTA	11.39	\$ 1,230,307	\$ 1,687,951

Manager IV, MTA	9174_C_MTA	2.00	\$	487,416	\$	601,239
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$	34,229	\$	41,091
<b>Sum:</b>		96.79	\$	14,098,159	\$	16,954,809

### ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
Postage+supplies+uniforms	0		\$ 67,967	\$ 67,967
Specialized Software	0		\$ 378,157	\$ 378,157
Vehicles - tow trucks (7 year useful life)	0		\$ 921,045	\$ 921,045
Fuel (15-20 miles/day/truck, assume 20mi/gal at \$5-\$7/gallon)	0		\$ 87,820	\$ 105,426
Communications: ipad air \$672 + case \$31 + cellular data (\$207/year for 4 years) *32 drivers / useful life 4 years	0		\$ 7,280	\$ 7,280
Utilities	0		\$ 43,139	\$ 43,139
Lien Fees	0		\$ 190,185	\$ 190,185
Dolly equipment (2 year useful life)	0		\$ 26,164	\$ 26,164
Credit card fees	0		\$ 79,825	\$ 79,825
Overhead, at 66.9% applied to salaries and fringe benefits	0		\$ 9,431,668	\$ 11,342,767
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 11,233,250</b>	<b>\$ 13,161,955</b>

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	<b>\$ 25,331,409</b>	<b>\$ 30,116,764</b>
----------------------------------	----------------------	----------------------

### COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 25,331,409	\$ 30,116,764
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 18,534,055	\$ 18,625,640
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	<u>\$ 6,797,354</u>	<u>\$ 11,491,124</u>
% of Savings to City Cost	26.83%	38.16%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
ChiaYu Ma  
Deputy Controller

April 24, 2026

Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transportation  
Municipal Transportation Agency  
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for Transit Shelter Platform Cleaning Services – FY 2026-27 & FY 2027-28

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2026-27 and Fiscal Year 2027-28 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Greg Wagner  
Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency  
 Transit Shelter Platform Cleaning (24177)  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
 FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS				
Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
General Laborer	7514_C_MTA	9.35	\$ 1,131,118	\$ 1,330,803
Track Maintenance Worker	7540_C_MTA	9.35	\$ 1,195,505	\$ 1,409,483
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 16,815	\$ 20,185
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 22,499	\$ 27,008
		<b>Sum:</b>	<b>\$ 2,365,937</b>	<b>\$ 2,787,479</b>

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS				
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
Materials & Supplies	0		\$ 171,672	\$ 171,672
Safety Equipment	0		\$ 6,134	\$ 6,134
Vehicle Maintenance	0		\$ 1,227	\$ 1,227
Overhead at 44.9% of salaries and benefits	0		\$ 1,062,306	\$ 1,251,578
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 1,241,339</b>	<b>\$ 1,430,611</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 3,607,276 \$ 4,218,090**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 3,607,276	\$ 4,218,090
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 921,334	\$ 927,621
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$ 2,685,942	\$ 3,290,469
	% of Savings to City Cost	74.46%	78.01%

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency  
 Transit Shelter Platform Cleaning (24177)  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
 FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
General Laborer	7514_C_MTA	9.35	\$ 1,194,901	\$ 1,403,718
Track Maintenance Worker	7540_C_MTA	9.35	\$ 1,262,407	\$ 1,486,185
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 17,246	\$ 20,703
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 23,077	\$ 27,704
<b>Sum:</b>		<b>18.70</b>	<b>\$ 2,497,631</b>	<b>\$ 2,938,310</b>

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
Materials & Supplies	0		\$ 177,337	\$ 177,337
Safety Equipment	0		\$ 6,336	\$ 6,336
Vehicle Maintenance	0		\$ 1,267	\$ 1,267
Overhead at 44.9% of salaries and benefits	0		\$ 1,121,436	\$ 1,319,301
<b>Total Non-Personnel Costs:</b>			<b>\$ 1,306,376</b>	<b>\$ 1,504,241</b>

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST** **\$ 3,804,007** **\$ 4,442,551**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		\$ 3,804,007	\$ 4,442,551
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		\$ 952,488	\$ 959,062
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		<u>\$ 2,851,519</u>	<u>\$ 3,483,489</u>
	% of Savings to City Cost	74.96%	78.41%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
ChiaYu Ma  
Deputy Controller

April 24, 2026

Michael Martin, Executive Director  
Port of San Francisco  
Pier 1, The Embarcadero  
San Francisco, CA 94111

Attention: Meghan Wallace, Deputy Director of Finance & Administration

RE: Contracting for Janitorial Services – FY 2026-27 & FY 2027-28

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2026-27 and Fiscal Year 2027-28 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ Greg Wagner  
Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations

PRT - Port

Janitorial Service (24164)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
Custodian	2708_C	6.00	\$ 655,600	\$ 768,566
Custodial Supervisor	2718_C	1.00	\$ 127,894	\$ 150,748
Porter	2736_C	1.00	\$ 110,760	\$ 129,587
Sum:		8.00	\$ 894,254	\$ 1,048,901

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
Janitorial supplies (cleaning supplies, paper products, uniforms, etc.)	0		\$ 55,000	\$ 65,000
Vehicles and fuel	0		\$ 25,000	\$ 35,000
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 80,000	\$ 100,000

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 974,254 \$ 1,148,901**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 974,254	\$ 1,148,901
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 643,787	\$ 714,535
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 330,467	\$ 434,366
% of Savings to City Cost	33.92%	37.81%

PRT - Port

Janitorial Service (24164)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS				
Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
Custodian	2708_C	6.00	\$ 693,011	\$ 811,149
Custodial Supervisor	2718_C	1.00	\$ 135,037	\$ 158,936
Porter	2736_C	1.00	\$ 117,127	\$ 136,818
Sum:		8.00	\$ 945,175	\$ 1,106,903

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS				
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
Janitorial supplies (cleaning supplies, paper products, uniforms, etc.)	0		\$ 55,000	\$ 65,000
Vehicles and fuel	0		\$ 25,000	\$ 35,000
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 80,000	\$ 100,000

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST** \$ 1,025,175 \$ 1,206,903

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 1,025,175	\$ 1,206,903
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 669,946	\$ 818,129
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 355,229	\$ 388,774
% of Savings to City Cost	34.65%	32.21%



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner  
Controller  
ChiaYu Ma  
Deputy Controller

April 24, 2026

Nancy Hom, Chief Financial Officer  
San Francisco Public Utilities Commission  
525 Golden Gate Avenue  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Laura Busch, Deputy Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for Security Services – FY 2026-27 & FY 2027-28

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2026-27 and Fiscal Year 2027-28 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at [Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org](mailto:Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

    /s/ Greg Wagner      
Greg Wagner,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations

PUC - Public Utilities Commission

Security Services (24158)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2026-27

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS				
Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2026-27 Personnel Cost High
Manager III	0931_C	0.50	\$ 115,567	\$ 143,343
Security Guard	8202_C	24.00	\$ 2,449,945	\$ 3,372,057
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 113,697	\$ 136,443
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 81,145	\$ 97,378
Sum:		24.50	\$ 2,760,354	\$ 3,749,221

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS				
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2026-27 Low Estimate	FY 2026-27 High Estimate
Two-way radios (1 per shift/location)	5	\$2,502 per shift/location	\$ 12,510	\$ 12,510
Uniforms	24	\$800 per year per person	\$ 19,200	\$ 19,200
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 31,710	\$ 31,710

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 2,792,064 \$ 3,780,931**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 2,792,064	\$ 3,780,931
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 1,406,374	\$ 1,893,684
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,385,690	\$ 1,887,247
% of Savings to City Cost	49.63%	49.91%

PUC - Public Utilities Commission

Security Services (24158)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2027-28

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS				
Job Class Title	Job Class	FTE	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2027-28 Personnel Cost High
Manager III	0931_C	0.50	\$ 121,853	\$ 150,900
Security Guard	8202_C	24.00	\$ 2,592,394	\$ 3,556,705
Holiday Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 122,760	\$ 147,318
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 87,614	\$ 105,140
Sum:		24.50	\$ 2,924,621	\$ 3,960,063

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS				
Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2027-28 Low Estimate	FY 2027-28 High Estimate
Two-way radios (1 per shift/location)	5	\$2,502 per shift/location	\$ 12,510	\$ 12,510
Uniforms	24	\$800 per year per person	\$ 19,200	\$ 19,200
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 31,710	\$ 31,710

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 2,956,331 \$ 3,991,773**

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 2,956,331	\$ 3,991,773
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 1,412,660	\$ 1,901,241
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,543,671	\$ 2,090,532
% of Savings to City Cost	52.22%	52.37%

OFFICE OF THE MAYOR  
SAN FRANCISCO



DANIEL LURIE  
MAYOR

RECEIVED  
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS  
SAN FRANCISCO  
2026 MAY 01 PM02:02

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to be "D.L.", located below the received stamp.

To: Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors  
From: Sophia Kittler, Mayor's Budget Director  
Date: May 1, 2026  
Re: Mayor's May 1 FY 2026-27 and FY 2027-28 Budget Submission

---

Madam Clerk,

In accordance with City and County of San Francisco Administrative Code, Section 3.3, the Mayor's Office hereby submits the Mayor's proposed May 1 budget, corresponding legislation, and related materials for Fiscal Year (FY) 2026-27 and FY 2027-28.

In addition to the Mayor's Proposed FY 2026-27 and FY 2027-28 May 1 Budget Book, the following items are included in the Mayor's submission:

- The May 1 Proposed Budget and Annual Appropriation Ordinance (AAO) for Selected Departments
- The May 1 Proposed Annual Salary Ordinance (ASO) for Selected Departments
- The Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA) Budget Memo
- The Public Utilities Commission (PUC) Capital Budgets and Borrowing Ordinances
- Seven separate pieces of trailing legislation (see list attached)
- A Transfer of Function letter detailing the transfer of positions from one City department to another
- An Interim Exception letter
- Memo to the Board President requesting for 30-day rule waivers on ordinances

Please note the following:

- Technical adjustments to the budget are being prepared, but are not submitted with this set of materials.

Should you have any questions, please email Adam Thongsavat at [adam.thongsavat@sfgov.org](mailto:adam.thongsavat@sfgov.org).

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be "SK", located below the word "Sincerely".

Sophia Kittler  
Mayor's Budget Director

cc: Members of the Board of Supervisors  
Budget & Legislative Analyst's Office  
Controller

DEPT	Item	Description	Type of Legislation	File #
AIR	Continuing Prop J	Contracting for information and guest services, security services, parking operations, and shuttle bus services	Resolution	260480
DBI	Fee Change	Adjusts the fees for services provided by the Department of Building Inspection and Planning Department pursuant to the 2024 Fee Study	Ordinance	260478
LIB	Recurring A&E	The Friends and Foundation of the San Francisco Public Library – Annual Grant Award	Resolution	260481
MTA	Continuing Prop J	Contracting for citations processing, towing services, paratransit services, security services, transit shelter, and cleaning services	Resolution	260480
PRT	Continuing Prop J	Contracting for Janitorial services at Port facilities	Resolution	260480
PUC	Continuing Prop J	Contracting for security services at PUC Wastewater Enterprise facilities	Resolution	260480
PUC	Prop J (New)	Security services at PUC administrative office at 525 Golden Gate Avenue	Resolution	260479

OFFICE OF THE MAYOR  
SAN FRANCISCO



DANIEL LURIE  
MAYOR

To: Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors  
From: Sophia Kittler, Mayor's Budget Director  
Date: May 1, 2026  
Re: Proposition J Contract Certification Contracted-Out Department Services  
Previously Approved

RECEIVED  
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS  
SAN FRANCISCO  
2026 MAY 01 PM02:17  
*B.A.*

---

**Resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that department services previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services: security, information and guest services, parking operations, shuttle bus services (Airport); citations, paratransit, parking meter collections, security, towing, transit shelter cleaning services (Municipal Transportation Agency); janitorial services (Port); and security services (Public Utilities Commission).**

Should you have any questions, please contact Adam Thongsavat at [adam.thongsavat@sfgov.org](mailto:adam.thongsavat@sfgov.org)