



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 31, 2022

Carmen Chu, City Administrator
General Services Agency – City Administrator
City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 362
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention: Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Convention Facilities Management – FY 2022-23

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2022-23 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/ _____
Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Trisha McMahon, Budget and Planning Manager

278641 - Convention Facilities
 Convention Facilities Management

Insert name of the contract's main purpose here

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager II	0922	13.0	\$ 4,999	\$ 6,001	\$ 1,696,200	\$ 2,036,255
Manager II	0923	3.0	\$ 5,366	\$ 6,442	\$ 420,194	\$ 504,435
Manager III	0931	1.0	\$ 5,786	\$ 6,947	\$ 151,026	\$ 181,304
Manager IV	0932	7.0	\$ 6,211	\$ 7,456	\$ 1,134,713	\$ 1,362,200
Manager V	0933	1.0	\$ 6,700	\$ 8,043	\$ 174,869	\$ 209,927
Deputy Director III	0953	1.0	\$ 7,192	\$ 8,634	\$ 187,707	\$ 225,338
Deputy Director IV	0954	2.0	\$ 8,185	\$ 9,826	\$ 427,267	\$ 512,926
Deputy Director V	0955	1.0	\$ 8,716	\$ 10,463	\$ 227,476	\$ 273,081
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	0.8	\$ 3,535	\$ 4,244	\$ 73,810	\$ 88,608
IS Manager	1071	0.8	\$ 7,192	\$ 8,634	\$ 150,165	\$ 180,270
Payroll Supervisor	1218	1.0	\$ 4,111	\$ 4,935	\$ 107,297	\$ 128,808
Payroll Clerk	1222	1.0	\$ 3,207	\$ 3,850	\$ 83,705	\$ 100,486
Senior Personnel Analyst	1244	1.0	\$ 4,546	\$ 5,457	\$ 118,648	\$ 142,434
Senior Clerk	1406	1.0	\$ 2,372	\$ 2,847	\$ 61,898	\$ 74,307
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	\$ 3,130	\$ 3,757	\$ 81,691	\$ 98,069
Secretary II	1446	2.0	\$ 2,874	\$ 3,450	\$ 150,018	\$ 180,094
Executive Secretary III	1454	1.0	\$ 3,739	\$ 4,489	\$ 97,595	\$ 117,161
Accountant III	1654	2.0	\$ 4,146	\$ 4,977	\$ 216,425	\$ 259,814
Senior Storekeeper	1936	1.0	\$ 2,665	\$ 3,200	\$ 69,564	\$ 83,510
Senior Purchaser	1956	2.0	\$ 4,416	\$ 5,301	\$ 230,521	\$ 276,736
Supervising Purchaser	1958	1.0	\$ 5,366	\$ 6,442	\$ 140,065	\$ 168,145
Custodian	2708	137.0	\$ 2,387	\$ 2,866	\$ 8,536,479	\$ 10,247,874
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	\$ 2,896	\$ 3,476	\$ 75,582	\$ 90,735
Fire Safety Inspector II	6281	1.0	\$ 5,207	\$ 6,251	\$ 135,901	\$ 163,146
Bldg & Grounds Maint Supv	7203	6.0	\$ 4,634	\$ 5,563	\$ 725,745	\$ 871,242
Chief Stationary Engineer	7205	1.0	\$ 4,726	\$ 5,673	\$ 123,337	\$ 148,064
Painting Supervisor	7242	1.0	\$ 3,824	\$ 4,591	\$ 99,814	\$ 119,825
Stationary Engineer	7334	15.0	\$ 3,725	\$ 4,472	\$ 1,458,429	\$ 1,750,815
Senior Stationary Engineer	7335	3.0	\$ 4,221	\$ 5,068	\$ 330,540	\$ 396,807
Carpenter	7344	1.0	\$ 3,658	\$ 4,391	\$ 95,467	\$ 114,606
Electrician	7345	1.0	\$ 4,111	\$ 4,935	\$ 107,297	\$ 128,808
Painter	7346	3.0	\$ 3,366	\$ 4,041	\$ 263,540	\$ 316,374
Plumber	7347	1.0	\$ 4,257	\$ 5,111	\$ 111,118	\$ 133,395
Security Guard	8202	23.0	\$ 2,191	\$ 2,630	\$ 1,315,227	\$ 1,578,904
Head Park Control Officer	8210	6.0	\$ 3,470	\$ 4,166	\$ 543,423	\$ 652,368
Supv Bldg Grounds Patrol Officer	8211	3.0	\$ 2,949	\$ 3,541	\$ 230,933	\$ 277,230
Parking Control Officer	8214	11.0	\$ 2,658	\$ 3,191	\$ 763,186	\$ 916,190
Lead Parking Control Officer	8216	2.0	\$ 3,176	\$ 3,813	\$ 165,807	\$ 199,048
Public SafetyComm Supv	8239	1.0	\$ 4,443	\$ 5,334	\$ 115,969	\$ 139,219
Pub Safety Communication Coordinator	8240	1.0	\$ 4,666	\$ 5,601	\$ 121,782	\$ 146,197
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 335,965	\$ 403,319
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 260,856	\$ 313,152
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 317,767	\$ 381,473
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 335,965	\$ 403,319
Total FTE		262.6				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 21,320,431	\$ 25,594,755
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 1,250,552	\$ 1,501,263

FRINGE BENEFITS

	Job Class	\$ Amount		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0922	\$ 63,272		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0923	\$ 65,605		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931	\$ 68,273		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0932	\$ 70,969		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0933	\$ 74,077		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0953	\$ 77,199		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0954	\$ 83,510		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0955	\$ 86,879		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1062	\$ 46,866		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1071	\$ 77,199		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1218	\$ 51,392		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1222	\$ 43,646		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1244	\$ 53,603		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1406	\$ 33,662		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1408	\$ 42,985		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1446	\$ 40,793		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1454	\$ 47,381		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1654	\$ 52,095		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1936	\$ 39,006		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1956	\$ 53,735		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1958	\$ 58,724		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2708	\$ 36,624		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2718	\$ 40,981		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	6281	\$ 59,516		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7203	\$ 57,170		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7205	\$ 57,937		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7242	\$ 49,611		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7334	\$ 50,081		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7335	\$ 54,334		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7344	\$ 49,986		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7345	\$ 54,976		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7346	\$ 46,591		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7347	\$ 56,708		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	\$ 32,064		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8210	\$ 45,902		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8211	\$ 41,438		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8214	\$ 38,945		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8216	\$ 43,385		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8239	\$ 53,568		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8240	\$ 55,837		
			Low	High
	Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 10,069,430	\$ 11,298,460

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS			
Contractual Services	\$	6,183,870	\$ 6,183,870
Worker's Compensation	\$	1,646,068	\$ 1,646,068
	\$	-	\$ -
	\$	-	\$ -
Total Capital & Operating	\$	7,829,938	\$ 7,829,938

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$	40,470,352	\$	46,224,416
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$	37,914,521	\$	37,966,418
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$	2,555,831	\$	8,257,999
% of Savings to City Cost			6%	18%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1997 was the first year these services were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2021. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.