

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689  
Tel. No. (415) 554-5184  
Fax No. (415) 554-5163  
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

## MEMORANDUM

TO: Phil Ginsburg, General Manager, Recreation and Parks Department

FROM: Erica Major, Assistant Clerk, Land Use and Transportation Committee

DATE: December 3, 2021

SUBJECT: LEGISLATION INTRODUCED

---

The Board of Supervisors' Land Use and Transportation Committee has received the following proposed legislation, introduced by Supervisor Mar on November 30, 2021:

**File No. 211219**

**Ordinance amending the Planning Code to designate Trocadero Clubhouse, located within Sigmund Stern Recreation Grove, northwest of 19th Avenue and Sloat Boulevard, in Assessor's Parcel Block No. 2488, Lot No. 001, as a Landmark consistent with the standards set forth in Article 10 of the Planning Code; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making public necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code, Section 302, and findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.**

If you have comments or reports to be included with the file, please forward them to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102 or by email at: [erica.major@sfgov.org](mailto:erica.major@sfgov.org).

cc: Sarah Madland, Recreation and Parks Department

1 [Planning Code - Landmark Designation - Trocadero Clubhouse]

2

3 **Ordinance amending the Planning Code to designate Trocadero Clubhouse, located**  
4 **within Sigmund Stern Recreation Grove, northwest of 19th Avenue and Sloat**  
5 **Boulevard, in Assessor’s Parcel Block No. 2488, Lot No. 001, as a Landmark consistent**  
6 **with the standards set forth in Article 10 of the Planning Code; affirming the Planning**  
7 **Department’s determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and**  
8 **making public necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code,**  
9 **Section 302, and findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority**  
10 **policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.**

11 NOTE: **Unchanged Code text and uncodified text** are in plain Arial font.  
12 **Additions to Codes** are in *single-underline italics Times New Roman font*.  
13 **Deletions to Codes** are in *strikethrough italics Times New Roman font*.  
14 **Board amendment additions** are in double-underlined Arial font.  
15 **Board amendment deletions** are in ~~strikethrough Arial font~~.  
16 **Asterisks (\* \* \* \*)** indicate the omission of unchanged Code  
17 subsections or parts of tables.

18 Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:

19 Section 1. Findings.

20 (a) CEQA and Land Use Findings.

21 (1) The Planning Department has determined that the Planning Code  
22 amendment proposed in this ordinance is subject to a Categorical Exemption from the  
23 California Environmental Quality Act (California Public Resources Code Sections 21000 et  
24 seq., hereinafter "CEQA") pursuant to Section 15308 of California Code of Regulations, Title  
25 14, Sections 15000 et seq., the Guidelines for implementation of the statute, for actions by  
regulatory agencies for protection of the environment (in this case, landmark designation).  
Said determination is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No.  
\_\_\_\_\_ and is incorporated herein by reference. The Board of Supervisors affirms

1 this determination.

2 (2) Pursuant to Planning Code Section 302, the Board of Supervisors finds that  
3 the proposed landmark designation of Trocadero Clubhouse will serve the public necessity,  
4 convenience, and welfare for the reasons set forth in Historic Preservation Commission  
5 Resolution No. \_\_\_\_\_, recommending approval of the proposed designation, which is  
6 incorporated herein by reference.

7 (3) The Board of Supervisors finds that the proposed landmark designation of  
8 Trocadero Clubhouse is consistent with the General Plan and with Planning Code Section  
9 101.1(b) for the reasons set forth in Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No.  
10 \_\_\_\_\_.

11 (b) General Findings.

12 (1) On March 9, 2021, the Board of Supervisors adopted Resolution No. 111-  
13 21, initiating landmark designation of Trocadero Clubhouse as a San Francisco Landmark  
14 pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. On March 19, 2021, the Mayor approved  
15 the resolution. Said resolution is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No.  
16 210087.

17 (2) Pursuant to Charter Section 4.135, the Historic Preservation Commission  
18 has authority "to recommend approval, disapproval, or modification of landmark designations  
19 and historic district designations under the Planning Code to the Board of Supervisors."

20 (3) The Landmark Designation Fact Sheet was prepared by Planning  
21 Department Preservation staff. All preparers meet the Secretary of the Interior's Professional  
22 Qualification Standards for historic preservation program staff, as set forth in Code of Federal  
23 Regulations Title 36, Part 61, Appendix A. The report was reviewed for accuracy and  
24 conformance with the purposes and standards of Article 10 of the Planning Code.

1 (4) The Historic Preservation Commission, at its regular meeting of September  
2 15, 2021, reviewed Planning Department staff's analysis of the historical significance of  
3 Trocadero Clubhouse set forth in the Landmark Designation Fact Sheet dated September 15,  
4 2021.

5 (5) On September 15, 2021, after holding a public hearing on the proposed  
6 designation and having considered the specialized analyses prepared by Planning  
7 Department staff and the Landmark Designation Fact Sheet, the Historic Preservation  
8 Commission recommended designation of Trocadero Clubhouse as a landmark consistent  
9 with the standards set forth in Section 1004 of the Planning Code, by Resolution No.  
10 \_\_\_\_\_. Said resolution is on file with the Clerk of the Board in File No. \_\_\_\_\_.

11 (6) The Board of Supervisors hereby finds that Trocadero Clubhouse has a  
12 special character and special historical, architectural, and aesthetic interest and value, and  
13 that its designation as a Landmark will further the purposes of and conform to the standards  
14 set forth in Article 10 of the Planning Code. In doing so, the Board hereby incorporates by  
15 reference the findings of the Landmark Designation Fact Sheet.

16  
17 Section 2. Designation.

18 Pursuant to Section 1004.3 of the Planning Code, Trocadero Clubhouse is hereby  
19 designated as a San Francisco Landmark consistent with the standards set forth in Section  
20 1004. Appendix A to Article 10 of the Planning Code is hereby amended to include this  
21 property.

22  
23 Section 3. Required Data.

24 (a) The description, location, and boundary of the Landmark site consists of the  
25 historic building footprint of Trocadero Clubhouse, inclusive of the covered porch that spans

1 the south façade and wraps around the west façade and excluding the ramp and portion of  
2 the porch at the entrance to the adjacent Ladies Convenience Station building. Trocadero  
3 Clubhouse is located within Sigmund Stern Recreation Grove, northwest of 19<sup>th</sup> Avenue and  
4 Sloat Boulevard, in Assessor’s Parcel Block No. 2488, Lot No. 001, in San Francisco’s  
5 Parkside neighborhood.

6 (b) The characteristics of the Landmark that justify its designation are described and  
7 shown in the Landmark Designation Fact Sheet and other supporting materials contained in  
8 Planning Department Record Docket No. 2021-003608DES. In brief, Trocadero Clubhouse is  
9 eligible for local designation as it is associated with events that have made a culturally and  
10 historically significant contribution to the broad patterns of San Francisco history and it  
11 embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction.  
12 Specifically, designation of Trocadero Clubhouse is proper as it is one of the earliest buildings  
13 constructed in the Parkside District and one of the only extant nineteenth-century buildings in  
14 southwestern San Francisco. The building is also architecturally and historically significant as  
15 an excellent and well-preserved example of the Stick-Eastlake architectural style and as the  
16 city’s last intact example of a nineteenth-century roadhouse with ground floor interior rooms –  
17 Social Hall/Meeting Room and Bar Room – associated with the former roadhouse history.  
18 Further, the building is historically significant as an early recreational facility, first as a  
19 roadhouse and then as part of Sigmund Stern Recreation Grove.

20 (c) The particular features that should be preserved, or replaced in-kind as determined  
21 necessary, are those generally shown in photographs and described in the Landmark  
22 Designation Fact Sheet, which can be found in Planning Department Record Docket No.  
23 2021-003608DES, and which are incorporated in this designation by reference as though fully  
24 set forth herein. Specifically, the following features are character-defining and shall be  
25 preserved or replaced in kind:

1 (1) All those exterior elevations, form, massing, structure, rooflines, architectural  
2 ornament, and materials of Trocadero Clubhouse, identified as:

3 (A) Siting of the building within the park setting of Sigmund Stern  
4 Recreation Grove, including adjacent steeply sloping hillsides and the driveway leading to the  
5 building from 19<sup>th</sup> Avenue and Sloat Boulevard;

6 (B) Two-story-over-raised-basement wood frame building with one-story  
7 projection at east façade;

8 (C) Rectangular footprint with slight projections;

9 (D) Asymmetrically arranged façades;

10 (E) Location, size, and shape of fenestration openings;

11 (F) Cross-gable roof with large and small gabled dormers;

12 (G) Gable ends ornamented with shaped shingles, shaped brackets, and  
13 sunburst moldings and that terminate with a projecting molded cornice, and gable ends with  
14 simpler expression;

15 (H) Cupola at the roof ridge where primary gables intersect, consisting of:

16 (i) Square footprint and wood-framed construction;

17 (ii) Shaped wood shingle cladding;

18 (iii) Intersecting gable roof with crest moldings, finials, and a  
19 central pole with ball cap;

20 (iv) Drop arched window surrounds (window area infilled with  
21 shaped shingles) at each side of cupola;

22 (v) Starburst molding and projecting molded cornice at each side  
23 of the cupola roof;

24 (I) Horizontally incised wood shiplap cladding;

25 (J) Shaped wood shingle cladding;

1 (K) Wood beadboard cladding;

2 (L) Covered porch with sloped roof, enclosed by a cross-brace balustrade  
3 and wood railings with ball finials, that spans the south façade and wraps around the west  
4 façade. The compatible contemporary extension, including ramp up to the porch, the ramp  
5 accessing the adjacent restroom building, and the metal railings, are not character-defining  
6 and are not required to be preserved or replaced in kind.

7 (M) Porch features and ornament, including existing physical fabric that is  
8 not historic but is consistent with historic photographs, including:

9 (i) Short, straight run wood stair aligned with main entry, above  
10 which a pedimented dormer with gable end ornamented in sunburst pattern extends from the  
11 porch roof;

12 (ii) Turned and fluted posts;

13 (iii) Arched latticework;

14 (iv) Curved brackets; and

15 (v) Dentil course molding;

16 (N) Primary entrances consisting of paired half-lite ornamented panel  
17 doors with gabled hoods and an undivided transom;

18 (O) Wood, multi-lite sash windows as follows:

19 (i) Tall, double-hung, wood sash windows with ogee lugs and nine-  
20 lite upper panes with large center lite surrounded by smaller lites, some of which have colored  
21 glass;

22 (ii) Smaller gable dormers that have wood double-hung sash with  
23 ogee lugs and five-faceted divided-lite upper pane;

24 (iii) Secondary elevations that have multi-light wood sash with  
25 various operations and one-over-one lite double-hung wood sash with ogee lugs; and

1 (P) Wood window details including molded surrounds, shaped brackets,  
2 and incised trim;

3 (2) The character-defining interior features of Trocadero Clubhouse are those  
4 depicted in photos and written description in the Landmark Designation Fact Sheet, including:

5 (A) Spatial configuration and layout of the Bar Room and Social  
6 Hall/Meeting Room on ground floor of building;

7 (B) Narrow gauge wood flooring, where extant within Bar Room and  
8 Social Hall/Meeting Room;

9 (C) Beadboard wainscotting, where extant within Bar Room and Social  
10 Hall/Meeting Room;

11 (D) Crown molding, where extant within Bar Room and Social  
12 Hall/Meeting Room;

13 (E) Wood paneled bar and backbar with projecting molded cornice and  
14 dentils;

15 (F) Fieldstone fireplace and chimney; and

16 (G) Wood trim around window and door openings and wood paneled  
17 doors, where extant within Bar Room and Social Hall/Meeting Room.

18

19 Section 4. Standards of Review for Applications.

20 The following scopes of work shall not require a Certificate of Appropriateness, or shall  
21 be subject to an Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness, as specified below:

22 (a) No Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for work consisting of “ordinary  
23 maintenance and repairs,” pursuant to Planning Code Section 1005(e)(3). For purposes of  
24 this ordinance, “ordinary maintenance and repairs” at Trocadero Clubhouse includes limited  
25 in-kind replacement of deteriorated historic features and materials, consisting only of



1 replacement of individual features (e.g., a carved gable bracket) or replacement of a portion of  
2 historic materials (e.g., a section of the wood wainscotting or a section of shaped shingle  
3 cladding);

4 (b) No Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for non-structural interior  
5 alterations and maintenance within non-character-defining interior spaces, including in  
6 basement, kitchen, restrooms, and upper floor;

7 (c) No Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for new plantings, pruning,  
8 changes to vegetation, changes to driveways, pathways, retaining walls, or other structures  
9 within the surroundings of Trocadero Clubhouse. Nothing in this ordinance shall be construed  
10 to regulate maintenance of or changes to vegetation, driveways, pathways, or other features  
11 aside from those specified herein, within Sigmund Stern Recreation Grove and Stern Grove  
12 and Pine Lake Park; and

13 (d) An Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for work  
14 delegated by the Historic Preservation Commission to Planning Department Preservation staff  
15 pursuant to Planning Code Section 1006.2.

16

17 Section 5. Effective Date.

18 This ordinance shall become effective 30 days after enactment. Enactment occurs  
19 when the Mayor signs the ordinance, the Mayor returns the ordinance unsigned or does not

20 //

21 //

22 //

23 //

24 //

25 //

1 sign the ordinance within ten days of receiving it, or the Board of Supervisors overrides the  
2 Mayor's veto of the ordinance.

3

4 APPROVED AS TO FORM:  
5 DAVID CHIU, City Attorney

6 By: /s/ Victoria Wong

7 VICTORIA WONG  
8 Deputy City Attorney

9 n:\legana\as2021\1800206\01554397.docx

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

## LEGISLATIVE DIGEST

[Planning Code - Landmark Designation - Trocadero Clubhouse]

**Ordinance amending the Planning Code to designate Trocadero Clubhouse, located within Sigmund Stern Recreation Grove, northwest of 19th Avenue and Sloat Boulevard, in Assessor's Parcel Block No. 2488, Lot No. 001, as a Landmark consistent with the standards set forth in Article 10 of the Planning Code; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making public necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code, Section 302, and findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.**

### Existing Law

Under Article 10, Section 1004 of the Planning Code, the Board of Supervisors may, by ordinance, designate an individual structure that has special character or special historical, architectural or aesthetic interest or value as a City landmark. Unless prohibited by state law, once a structure has been named a landmark, any construction, alteration, removal or demolition for which a City permit is required necessitates a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Historic Preservation Commission. (Planning Code § 1006; Charter of the City and County of San Francisco, § 4.135.) Thus, landmark designation generally affords a high degree of protection to historic and architectural structures of merit in the City. There are currently 292 individual landmarks in the City under Article 10, in addition to structures and districts in the downtown area that are protected under Article 11. (See App. A to Article 10.)

### Amendments to Current Law

This ordinance amends the Planning Code to add a new historic landmark to the list of individual landmarks under Article 10: Trocadero Clubhouse, located within Sigmund Stern Recreation Grove, northwest of 19th Avenue and Sloat Boulevard, in Assessor's Parcel Block No. 2488, Lot No. 001.

The ordinance finds that Trocadero Clubhouse is eligible for designation as it is associated with events that have made a culturally and historically significant contribution to the broad patterns of San Francisco history and it embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction. Specifically, designation of Trocadero Clubhouse is proper as it is one of the earliest buildings constructed in the Parkside District and one of the only extant nineteenth-century buildings in southwestern San Francisco. The building is also architecturally and historically significant as an excellent and well-preserved example of the Stick-Eastlake architectural style and as the city's last intact example of a nineteenth-century roadhouse with ground floor interior rooms – Social Hall/Meeting Room and Bar Room – associated with the former roadhouse history. Further, the building is historically significant as

FILE NO. 211219

an early recreational facility, first as a roadhouse and then as part of Sigmund Stern Recreation Grove.

As required by Section 1004, the ordinance lists the particular features that shall be preserved, or replaced in-kind as determined necessary.

n:\legana\as2021\1800206\01553570.docx