



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller

Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 29, 2018

Naomi Kelly, Director  
General Services Agency – City Administrator  
City Hall, Room 362  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attn: Jennifer Johnston, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Convention Facilities Management – FY 2018-19

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above has been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2018-19 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Ben Rosenfield". The signature is stylized and includes a large, sweeping flourish that extends to the right.

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations

**GENERAL SERVICES AGENCY - CITY ADMINISTRATOR**  
**CONVENTION FACILITIES**  
**CONVENTION FACILITIES MANAGEMENT (SMG Contract)**  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)  
**FISCAL YEAR 2018-19**

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager III	0931	9.0	\$ 4,638	\$ 5,920	\$ 1,089,487	\$ 1,390,711
Manager IV	0932	2.0	4,981	6,356	260,012	331,790
Manager V	0933	3.0	5,370	6,855	420,504	536,719
Deputy Director IV	0954	1.0	6,564	8,377	171,325	218,639
Department Head V	0965	1.0	9,365	11,951	244,420	311,923
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	0.6	2,876	3,617	45,034	56,648
IS Programmer Analyst-Principal	1064	0.6	4,069	5,119	63,713	80,165
Public Relations Officer	1314	1.0	3,423	4,160	89,332	108,580
Manager I	0922	6.0	4,007	5,115	627,449	801,006
Manager II	0923	1.0	4,303	5,491	112,317	143,313
Senior Clerk	1406	4.0	1,995	2,427	208,289	253,345
Principal Clerk	1408	2.0	2,634	3,202	137,480	167,158
Clerk Typist	1424	1.5	2,001	2,432	78,351	95,206
Secretary II	1446	3.0	2,419	2,941	189,445	230,253
Executive Secretary II	1452	1.0	2,898	3,523	75,649	91,940
Senior Account Clerk	1632	3.0	2,390	2,904	187,106	227,350
Principal Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1224	1.0	2,977	3,617	77,692	94,413
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	4,039	4,909	105,408	128,124
Storekeeper	1934	1.0	2,106	2,559	54,976	66,777
Senior Purchaser	1956	1.0	3,716	4,518	96,994	117,909
Supervising Purchaser	1958	1.0	4,518	5,491	117,909	143,313
Registered Nurse	2320	1.0	4,907	6,445	128,071	168,207
Custodian	2708	105.3	2,011	2,443	5,525,682	6,714,610
Custodial Supervisor	2718	7.0	2,437	2,963	445,236	541,397
Fire Safety Inspector II	6281	1.5	5,653	5,653	221,301	221,301
Buildings And Grounds Maintenance Superv	7203	14.0	4,572	4,572	1,670,671	1,670,671
Painter Supervisor I	7242	1.0	3,220	3,914	84,036	102,155
Operating Engineer, Universal	7328	16.0	3,355	4,078	1,400,927	1,702,877
Carpenter	7344	1.0	3,079	3,742	80,353	97,666
Electrician	7345	1.0	3,462	4,208	90,354	109,817
Painter	7346	2.0	2,835	3,445	147,964	179,847
Plumber	7347	2.0	3,583	4,356	187,052	227,376
Window Cleaner	7392	3.0	2,713	3,297	212,429	258,157
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	1.0	2,954	5,148	77,100	134,361
Building And Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	25.0	2,243	2,727	1,463,779	1,779,655
Head Park Patrol Officer	8210	9.0	2,781	3,381	653,257	794,312
Parking Control Officer	8214	6.4	2,112	2,720	350,501	451,547
Senior Parking Control Officer	8216	2.0	2,521	3,251	131,619	169,685
Utility Mechanic	7325	2.0	3,777	3,777	197,160	197,160
Stationary Engineer	7334	6.0	3,675	3,675	575,511	575,511
IS Engineer	1044	1.0	4,921	6,190	128,447	161,567
Communications Systems Technician	7362	1.0	4,007	4,871	104,575	127,130
Holiday Pay					272,560	324,547
Night / Shift Differential					322,951	386,855
Overtime Pay					281,233	334,874
Other Pay					297,339	354,052
<b>Total FTE</b>		<b>252.9</b>				
					<b>Total Salary Costs---&gt;</b>	
					<b>\$ 18,328,918</b>	<b>\$ 21,980,295</b>
					<b>Total of Other Compensation---&gt;</b>	
					<b>\$ 1,174,083</b>	<b>\$ 1,400,328</b>

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

	Amount				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 0931)	60,019				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 0932)	62,323				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 0933)	64,960				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 0954)	73,013				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 0965)	91,919				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1062)	40,837				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1064)	50,826				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1314)	44,701				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 0922)	55,758				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 0923)	57,747				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1406)	31,873				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1408)	37,402				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1424)	31,909				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1446)	35,536				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1452)	39,412				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1632)	35,272				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1224)	40,361				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1657)	49,416				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1934)	32,813				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1956)	47,245				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1958)	52,827				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 2320)	60,054				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 2708)	31,990				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 2718)	35,698				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 6281)	53,697				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 7203)	48,245				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 7242)	46,197				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 7328)	46,987				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 7344)	43,334				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 7345)	47,596				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 7346)	41,351				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 7347)	49,054				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 7392)	38,077				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 8205)	51,606				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 8207)	34,017				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 8210)	38,679				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 8214)	33,965				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 8216)	37,747				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 7325)	43,821				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 7334)	42,423				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 1044)	56,590				
Benefits per FTE (Job Class 7362)	48,685				
<b>Total Fringe Benefits</b>	<table border="0"> <tr> <td align="right">Low</td> <td align="right">High</td> </tr> <tr> <td align="right">\$ 8,837,490</td> <td align="right">\$ 9,848,830</td> </tr> </table>	Low	High	\$ 8,837,490	\$ 9,848,830
Low	High				
\$ 8,837,490	\$ 9,848,830				

<b>ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS</b>		
Contractual Services (training, operations, equipment, overhead)	4,500,950	4,500,950
Workers' Compensation	1,497,822	1,497,822
<b>Total Capital &amp; Operating</b>	<b>5,998,772</b>	<b>5,998,772</b>

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 34,339,263	\$ 39,228,225
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 33,084,798	\$ 33,138,568
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 1,254,465	\$ 6,089,658
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	4%	16%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1977 was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2018. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term
4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.