



**City and County of San Francisco**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**Rules Committee**

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Members: Matt Dorsey, Shamann Walton, Ahsha Safai*

*Clerk: Victor Young (415) 554-7723*

---

**Monday, April 3, 2023**

**10:00 AM**

**Regular Meeting**

**IN-PERSON MEETING**  
**City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250**

**(remote access provided)**  
**(remote public comment provided via teleconference)**

---

**Present:** 3 - Matt Dorsey, Shamann Walton, and Ahsha Safai

*The Rules Committee met in regular session, in-person with remote access and public comment via telephone, on Monday, April 3, 2023, with Chair Matt Dorsey presiding. Chair Dorsey called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m.*

### **Remote Access to Information and Participation**

*The Board of Supervisors and its committees convene hybrid meetings that allow in-person attendance, in-person public comment (prioritized before remote public comment), remote access, and remote public comment via teleconference (<https://sfbos.org/remote-meeting-call>). Members of the public may submit their comments by email to: [victor.young@sfgov.org](mailto:victor.young@sfgov.org); all comments received will be made a part of the official record.*

*Live watch San Francisco Cable Channels 26, 28, 78 or 99 (depending on your provider) or stream meetings on the SFGovTV website ([www.sfgovtv.org](http://www.sfgovtv.org)). Regularly scheduled Rules Committee Meetings begin at 10:00 a.m. every Monday of each month. Committee agendas and their associated documents are available at <https://sfbos.org/committees>.*

*Visit the Board's website ([www.sfbos.org](http://www.sfbos.org)) for additional information or contact the Clerk, Victor Young, at (415) 554-7723 or [victor.young@sfgov.org](mailto:victor.young@sfgov.org).*

## ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

*On the call of the roll, Chair Dorsey, Vice-Chair Walton, and Member Safai were noted present. A quorum of the committee was present.*

## COMMUNICATIONS

*Victor Young, Rules Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public, that when general public comment is called, to contribute live comments in-person or by dialing the telephone number published on the agenda and scrolling across the screen. Clerk Young further announced that in-person public comment will be taken before remote public comment is called.*

*(Those who are providing public comment remotely must dial \*3 to be added to the remote queue to speak. Written comments may be submitted through email ([victor.young@sfgov.org](mailto:victor.young@sfgov.org)) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.)*

## AGENDA CHANGES

*There were no agenda changes.*

## REGULAR AGENDA

### **230053 [Appointment, Ethics Commission]**

Hearing to consider appointing one member, term ending February 1, 2029, to the Ethics Commission. (Rules Committee)

Seat 1, succeeding Larry Bush, term expired, shall be broadly representative of the general public, for a six-year term ending February 1, 2029.

01/24/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

03/20/23; CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. Heard in Committee. Speakers: Francisco Da Costa; Patrick Monette-Shaw; share various concerns about the hearing matter.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: David Pilpel; Patrick Monette-Shaw; provided information on the hearing matter.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Hearing be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**230186 [Mayoral Appointment, Treasure Island Development Authority Board of Directors - Timothy Reyff]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Timothy Reyff to the Treasure Island Development Authority Board of Directors, for a term ending February 26, 2026. (Clerk of the Board)

(Pursuant to the Treasure Island Conversion Act of 1997, appointments of Directors who are not City officers are only effective upon approval by a majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action.

Transmittal Date: February 15, 2023.)

02/14/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Timothy Reyff; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. James Talus and Sean McGary (Local 22); spoke in support of the appointment of Timothy Reyff.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Timothy Reyff to the Treasure Island Development Authority Board of Directors, for a term ending February 26, 2026. (Clerk of the Board)

(Pursuant to the Treasure Island Conversion Act of 1997, appointments of Directors who are not City officers are only effective upon approval by a majority of the Board of Supervisors. There is no deadline for confirmation and the appointment is not effective until the Board takes action.

Transmittal Date: February 15, 2023.)

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**230254 [Mayoral Reappointment, Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors - Steve Heminger]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the reappointment of Steve Heminger to the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors, term ending March 1, 2027. (Clerk of the Board) (Charter, Section 8A.102(a), provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors after a public hearing. Transmittal Date: March 7, 2023.)

03/07/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Steve Heminger; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Amanda Eaken; Jodie Medeiros (Walk SF); David Pilpel; Stephanie Cajina (SFMTA Board of Directors); spoke in support of the reappointment of Steve Heminger. Eileen Boken; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for the reappointment of Steve Heminger to the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors, term ending March 1, 2027. (Clerk of the Board)

(Charter, Section 8A.102(a), provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors after a public hearing. Transmittal Date: March 7, 2023.)

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**230255 [Mayoral Reappointment, Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors - Amanda Eaken]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the reappointment of Amanda Eaken to the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors, term ending March 1, 2027. (Clerk of the Board) (Charter, Section 8A.102(a), provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors after a public hearing. Transmittal Date: March 7, 2023.)

03/07/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Amanda Eaken; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Stephanie Cajina (SFMTA Board of Directors); Jodie Medeiros (Walk SF); Cyrus Hall; Lianne Chang; spoke in support of the reappointment of Amanda Eaken. David Pilpel; spoke in opposition of the reappointment of Amanda Eaken. Speaker; Michael Chen; Patrick Monette-Shaw; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for the reappointment of Amanda Eaken to the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors, term ending March 1, 2027. (Clerk of the Board) (Charter, Section 8A.102(a), provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors after a public hearing. Transmittal Date: March 7, 2023.)

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**230284 [Mayoral Appointment, Port Commission - Ed Harrington]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for appointment of Ed Harrington to the Port Commission, term ending May 1, 2024. (Clerk of the Board) (Charter, Section 4.114, provides that the Mayor's appointment is subject to confirmation by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors, with no timeframe to confirm specified. Transmittal Date: March 13, 2023.)

03/14/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Ed Harrington; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. David Pilpel; spoke in support of the appointment of Ed Harrington.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for appointment of Ed Harrington to the Port Commission, term ending May 1, 2024. (Clerk of the Board) (Charter, Section 4.114, provides that the Mayor's appointment is subject to confirmation by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors, with no timeframe to confirm specified. Transmittal Date: March 13, 2023.)

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**230306 [Amending the Rules of Order - Providing for Remote Public Comment Opportunities]**

Motion amending the Board of Supervisors' Rules of Order by creating a new Rule 1.3.3, In-Person and Remote Public Comment, and amending Rule 4.22, Public Comment, to provide for remote comment opportunities by all members of the public who wish to comment remotely. (Clerk of the Board)

03/14/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: David Pilpel; spoke in support of the matter. Patrick Monette-Shaw; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE, on Page 2, Line 10, to relace 'Rules' with 'Rule'. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

## ADJOURNMENT

*There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 11:29 a.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*