



# City and County of San Francisco

## Meeting Minutes

### Rules Committee

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Members: Matt Dorsey, Shamann Walton, Ahsha Safai*

*Clerk: Victor Young  
(415) 554-7723 ~ victor.young@sfgov.org*

---

**Monday, July 24, 2023**

**10:00 AM**

**City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250**

### **Regular Meeting**

---

**Present:** 3 - Matt Dorsey, Shamann Walton, and Ahsha Safai

*The Rules Committee met in regular session, in-person with remote access and public comment via telephone, on Monday, July 24, 2023, with Chair Matt Dorsey presiding. Chair Dorsey called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m.*

### **Remote Access to Information and Participation**

*The Board of Supervisors ([www.sfbos.org](http://www.sfbos.org)) and its committees convene hybrid meetings that allow in-person attendance, in-person public comment (prioritized before remote public comment), remote access (watch: [www.sfgovtv.org](http://www.sfgovtv.org)), and remote public comment via teleconference (<https://sfbos.org/remote-meeting-call>).*

### **ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*On the call of the roll, Chair Dorsey and Vice-Chair Walton were noted present. Member Safai was noted not present. A quorum of the committee was present.*

*Member Safai was noted present at 10:09 a.m.*

### **COMMUNICATIONS**

*Victor Young, Rules Committee Clerk, instructed members of the public, that when general public comment is called, to contribute live comments in-person or by dialing the telephone number published on the agenda and scrolling across the screen. Clerk Young further announced that in-person public comment will be taken before remote public comment is called.*

*(Those who are providing public comment remotely must dial \*3 to be added to the remote queue to speak. Written comments may be submitted through email ([victor.young@sfgov.org](mailto:victor.young@sfgov.org)) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.)*

### **AGENDA CHANGES**

*There were no agenda changes.*

## REGULAR AGENDA

### **230790 [Mayoral Appointment, Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors - Dominica Henderson]**

Motion approving/rejecting the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Dominica Henderson to the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors, for a term ending March 1, 2026. (Clerk of the Board)

(Charter, Section 8A.102(a), provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors, with no timeframe to confirm specified. Transmittal Date: June 30, 2023.)

Seat 6, succeeding Gwyneth Borden, resigned, Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors, for the unexpired portion of a four-year term ending March 1, 2026

The MTA includes a Board of Directors governed by a board of seven directors appointed by the Mayor and confirmed by the Board of Supervisors. At least four of the directors must be regular riders of the municipal railway and must continue to ride the municipal railway during their terms. The directors must possess significant knowledge of, or professional experience in, one or more the fields of government, finance, or labor relations. At least two of the directors must possess significant knowledge of, or professional experience in, the field of public transportation.

07/12/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Dominica Henderson; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Patricia Wells, Executive Director (Oakland Housing Authority); Marlena Cannon, Javier Rivas; spoke in support of the appointment of Dominica Henderson.*

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE, to approve the Mayor's nomination for appointment and making clarifying and conforming changes. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

Motion approving the Mayor's nomination for the appointment of Dominica Henderson to the Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors, for a term ending March 1, 2026. (Clerk of the Board) (Charter, Section 8A.102(a), provides that the Board of Supervisors shall confirm the Mayor's appointment by a majority (six votes) of the Board of Supervisors, with no timeframe to confirm specified. Transmittal Date: June 30, 2023.)

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**230538 [Appointments, Sunshine Ordinance Task Force - Saul Sugarman and David Pilpel]**

Hearing to consider appointing two members, terms ending April 27, 2024, and two members, terms ending April 27, 2025, to the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force. (Rules Committee)

Seat 3, succeeding Kevin Frazier, resigned, must be a member from the press or electronic media, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2024.

Seat 4, succeeding Jaya Padmanabhan, resigned, must be nominated by the local chapter of the Society of Professional Journalists and be either a journalist from a racial/ethnic-minority-owned news organization, a journalist whose work focuses on issues impacting minority racial or ethnic communities, or a journalist who works with a media organization or publication whose target audience is a minority racial or ethnic community. For purposes of this subsection (a), the term "journalist" shall be interpreted broadly, including but not limited to freelance journalists, photographers, and videographers, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2025.

Seat 9, succeeding Laurie Jones Neighbors, deceased, must have demonstrated interest in, or have experience in, the issues of citizen access and participation in local government, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2024.

Seat 11, \*\*Bruce Wolfe (meets additional qualification), term expired, must have demonstrated interest in, or have experience in, the issues of citizen access and participation in local government (and member of the public who is physically handicapped), for a two-year term ending April 27, 2025.

\*\*Additional Qualifications: At all times, the Task Force shall include at least one member who shall be a member of the public who is physically handicapped. All members must have experience and/or demonstrated interest in the issues of citizen access and participation in local government.

05/08/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Anne Pearson (Office of the City Attorney); provided an overview and responded to questions raised throughout the discussion. Saul Sugarman; David Pilpel; Ruth Ellenberg Ferguson; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Barry Taranto; Christine Linnenbach; Lara Pettis; spoke in support of the appointment of David Pilpel. Speaker; spoke in opposition of the appointment of David Pilpel. Peter Warfield (Library Users Association); Patrick Monette-Shaw; spoke both in support and opposition of the appointment of various applicant(s).*

*Saul Sugarman, seat 3, recommended.*

*David Pilpel, seat 9, recommended.*

**PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION**

Motion appointing Saul Sugarman and David Pilpel, terms ending April 27, 2024, to the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force. (Rules Committee)

Saul Sugarman, seat 3, succeeding Kevin Frazier, resigned, must be a member from the press or electronic media, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2024.

David Pilpel, seat 9, succeeding Laurie Jones Neighbors, deceased, must have demonstrated interest in, or have experience in, the issues of citizen access and participation in local government, for the unexpired portion of a two-year term ending April 27, 2024.

**Chair Dorsey moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**230832 [Appointments, Committee on City Workforce Alignment - Ruth Barajas, Tiffany Jackson, and Bartolomy Pantoja]**

Hearing to consider appointing three members, terms ending November 6, 2025, to the Committee on City Workforce Alignment. (Rules Committee)

Seat 15, inaugural appointment, shall be a member of the public who, at the time of their appointments are employed by Nonprofit Corporations that provide Workforce Development Services to low-income San Francisco residents and those with barriers to employment, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending November 6, 2025;

Seat 16, inaugural appointment, shall be a member of the public who, at the time of their appointments are employed by Nonprofit Corporations that provide Workforce Development Services to low-income San Francisco residents and those with barriers to employment, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending November 6, 2025;

Seat 17, inaugural appointment, shall be a member of the public who is affiliated with labor organization and has leadership experience and demonstrated expertise in workforce development systems, policies, and programs, including registered apprenticeship programs, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending November 6, 2025.

07/18/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Rules Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speakers: Tiffany Jackson; spoke on their qualifications and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Joe Wilson Executive Director (Hospitality House); spoke in support of the appointment of Tiffany Jackson.*

*Ruth Barajas, seat 15, recommended (residency requirement waived).*

*Tiffany Jackson, seat 16, recommended (residency requirement waived).*

*Bartolomy Pantoja, seat 17, recommended.*

**PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION**

Motion appointing Ruth Barajas (residency requirement waived), Tiffany Jackson (residency requirement waived), and Bartolomy Pantoja, terms expiring November 6, 2025, to the Committee on City Workforce Alignment. (Rules Committee)

Ruth Barajas (residency requirement waived) seat 15, inaugural appointment, shall be a member of the public who, at the time of their appointments are employed by Nonprofit Corporations that provide Workforce Development Services to low-income San Francisco residents and those with barriers to employment, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending November 6, 2025.

Tiffany Jackson (residency requirement waived), seat 16, inaugural appointment, shall be a member of the public who, at the time of their appointments are employed by Nonprofit Corporations that provide Workforce Development Services to low-income San Francisco residents and those with barriers to employment, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending November 6, 2025

Bartolomy Pantoja, seat 17, inaugural appointment, shall be a member of the public who is affiliated with labor organization and has leadership experience and demonstrated expertise in workforce development systems, policies, and programs, including registered apprenticeship programs, for the unexpired portion of a three-year term ending November 6, 2025.

**Vice Chair Walton moved that this Motion be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

**230809 [Park Code - PROSAC Membership]****Sponsors: Peskin; Walton, Safai and Chan**

Ordinance amending the Park Code to 1) reduce the number of seats on the Parks, Recreation, and Open Space Advisory Committee (PROSAC), 2) provide for alternate members, 3) allow members to serve for more than four consecutive terms, 4) provide for the appointment of members having experience with racial equity and disability issues; and 5) provide that meetings shall occur at City Hall.

07/11/23; RE-REFERRED to Rules Committee. Duplicated from File No. 230482.

07/11/23; DUPLICATED. Supervisor Safai DUPLICATED the Ordinance in File No. 230482 on Final Passage.

07/17/23; AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING NEW TITLE. Heard in Committee. Speakers: Richard Rothman; Wenda Aragon; Steven Depont-Kalani; spoke in support of the matter. David Pilpel; provided information on the matter.

07/17/23; CONTINUED AS AMENDED.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker: David Pilpel; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.*

**Member Safai moved that this Ordinance be RECOMMENDED AS COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Dorsey, Walton, Safai

## ADJOURNMENT

*There being no further business, the Rules Committee adjourned at the hour of 11:01 a.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Rules Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*