

File No. 121029

Committee Item No. 2

Board Item No. \_\_\_\_\_

## COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

### AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST

Committee: Land Use and Economic Development Date November 19, 2012

Board of Supervisors Meeting

Date \_\_\_\_\_

#### Cmte Board

- |                                     |                          |  |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Motion                                       |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Resolution                                   |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Ordinance                                    |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Legislative Digest                           |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Budget and Legislative Analyst Report        |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Legislative Analyst Report                   |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Youth Commission Report                      |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Introduction Form                            |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Department/Agency Cover Letter and/or Report |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | MOU  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Grant Information Form                       |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Grant Budget                                 |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Subcontract Budget                           |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Contract/Agreement                           |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Form 126 – Ethics Commission                 |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Award Letter                                 |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Application                                  |
| <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | Public Correspondence                        |

#### OTHER (Use back side if additional space is needed)

<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	_____

Completed by: Alisa Miller Date November 16, 2012

Completed by: \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

An asterisked item represents the cover sheet to a document that exceeds 25 pages.  
The complete document can be found in the file.

1 [Environment Code - Suspending Yellow Pages Distribution Pilot Program]

2  
3 **Ordinance amending the San Francisco Environment Code by adding Section 2109 to**  
4 **suspend the Yellow Pages Distribution Pilot Program.**

5 NOTE: Additions are *single-underline italics Times New Roman*;  
6 deletions are *strike-through italics Times New Roman*.  
7 Board amendment additions are double-underlined;  
8 Board amendment deletions are ~~strikethrough normal~~.

9 Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:

10  
11 Section 1. Background

12 (a) On May 17, 2011, the Board of Supervisors passed Ordinance 78-11, which  
13 created the Yellow Pages Distribution Pilot Program ("Pilot Program"), regulating the  
14 distribution of Commercial Phone Directories for a three-year period beginning May 1, 2012.  
15 At the time the legislation was passed, only one federal court decision had addressed whether  
16 Commercial Phone Directories were commercial speech subject to lesser speech protections  
17 by the First Amendment of the United States Constitution or whether they were speech  
18 entitled to full First Amendment protection. That decision determined that Commercial Phone  
19 Directories were commercial speech. See *Dex Media West, Inc. v. City of Seattle*, No. C10-  
20 1857, 2011 WL 1869330 (W.D. Wash. May 16, 2011.)

21 (b) According to Ordinance 78-11, codified at Environment Code Sections 2101 to  
22 2108, the Pilot Program was to take effect on May 1, 2012. On February 9, 2012, a three-  
23 judge panel of the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit heard argument in *Dex*  
24 *Media West, Inc. v. City of Seattle* (Nos. 11-35399 & 11-35787) and cast doubt upon whether  
25 Commercial Phone Directories are commercial speech. To allow the Ninth Circuit to render

1 its determination, the Department of the Environment has suspended implementation or  
2 enforcement of the Pilot Program until May 1, 2013.

3 (c) On October 15, 2012, the Ninth Circuit, in a ruling issued by the three-judge panel,  
4 decided that Commercial Phone Directories are not commercial speech but are instead  
5 subject to full First Amendment protection. *Dex Media West, Inc. v. City of Seattle*, 2012 WL  
6 4857200, -- F.3d -- (9th Cir. Oct. 15, 2012). The Board of Supervisors has determined in light  
7 of this ruling to suspend the Pilot Program as specified below.

8 (d) Ordinance 78-11 stated that its provisions would be codified at Environment Code  
9 Chapter 20, Sections 20.1 through 20.8. Because Chapter 20 of the Environment Code  
10 already existed at the time Ordinance 78-11 was enacted, the Pilot Program has been  
11 codified as Chapter 21 of the Environment Code, Sections 2101 through 2108. To avoid  
12 confusion, this suspension ordinance refers to the Pilot Program as Chapter 21, Sections  
13 2101 through 2108.

14  
15 Section 2. The San Francisco Environment Code is hereby amended by adding  
16 Section 2109, to read as follows:

17 **SEC. 2109. SUSPENSION OF YELLOW PAGES DISTRIBUTION PILOT PROGRAM.**

18 (a) Chapter 21 of the San Francisco Environment Code, Sections 2101 through 2108, is  
19 suspended. During the period of suspension, Chapter 21 shall have no force or effect and shall not be  
20 enforced.

21 (b) In the event that, upon further proceedings in *Dex Media West, Inc. v. City of Seattle*, the  
22 United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit or the Supreme Court of the United States finally  
23 holds that the City of Seattle's restrictions on the distribution of Commercial Phone Directories are  
24 consistent with the First Amendment to the United States Constitution, then the suspension of Chapter  
25 21 shall be lifted one year from the date the mandate issues in that case.

1 (c) In the event that the suspension of Chapter 21 is lifted as described in the foregoing  
2 subsection (b), then Chapter 21 shall be in force and effect for three years following the date the  
3 suspension is lifted, notwithstanding any conflicting sunset date set forth in Section 2108.

4  
5 Section 3. Effective Date. This ordinance shall become effective 30 days from the  
6 date of passage. The Board of Supervisors acknowledges that before this ordinance  
7 becomes effective the Department of the Environment will continue its suspension of  
8 implementation and enforcement of Chapter 21.

9  
10 APPROVED AS TO FORM:  
DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

11  
12 By:

  
CHRISTINE VAN AKEN  
Deputy City Attorney

**LEGISLATIVE DIGEST**

[Environment Code - Suspending Yellow Pages Distribution Pilot Program]

**Ordinance amending the San Francisco Environment Code by adding Section 2109 to suspend the Yellow Pages Distribution Pilot Program.**

Existing Law

Existing law provides that Commercial Phone Directories, familiarly known as Yellow Pages, may not be distributed to private residences or businesses unless the occupant or authorized representative requests or personally accepts a Yellow Pages. This restriction is in effect through April 30, 2015.

Amendments to Current Law

In light of *Dex Media West, Inc. v. City of Seattle*, 2012 WL 4857200, -- F.3d -- (9th Cir. Oct. 15, 2012), which held that Yellow Pages are fully protected speech under the First Amendment and that the City of Seattle's restrictions on Yellow Pages distribution violated the First Amendment, the current law is amended to suspend the restrictions on distribution of Commercial Phone Directories unless subsequent federal appellate proceedings determine that Seattle's Yellow Pages restrictions are consistent with the First Amendment to the United States Constitution.

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall  
Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244  
San Francisco 94102-4689  
Tel. No. 554-5184  
Fax No. 554-5163  
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

## MEMORANDUM

TO: Regina Dick-Endrizzi, Director  
Chris Schulman, Commission Secretary  
**Small Business Commission, City Hall, Room 448**

FROM: Alisa Miller, Clerk, Land Use and Economic Development Committee  
Board of Supervisors

DATE: November 1, 2012

SUBJECT: REFERRAL FROM BOARD OF SUPERVISORS  
Land Use & Economic Development Committee

The Board of Supervisors' Land Use and Economic Development Committee has received the following substitute legislation, which is being referred to the Small Business Commission for comment and recommendation. The Commission may provide any response it deems appropriate within 12 days from the date of this referral.

**File No. 121029**

Ordinance amending the San Francisco Environment Code by adding Section 2109 to suspend the Yellow Pages Distribution Pilot Program

Please return this cover sheet with the Commission's response to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.

\*\*\*\*\*

RESPONSE FROM SMALL BUSINESS COMMISSION - Date: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_ No Comment

\_\_\_\_\_ Recommendation Attached

\_\_\_\_\_  
Chairperson, Small Business Commission

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall  
Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244  
San Francisco 94102-4689  
Tel. No. 554-5184  
Fax No. 554-5163  
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

## MEMORANDUM

TO: Melanie Nutter, Director, Department of the Environment

FROM: Alisa Miller, Clerk, Land Use and Economic Development Committee  
Board of Supervisors

DATE: November 1, 2012

SUBJECT: LEGISLATION INTRODUCED

---

The Board of Supervisors' Land Use and Economic Development Committee has received the following proposed legislation, introduced by Supervisor Chiu on October 23, 2012. This matter is being referred to your department informational purposes only and no additional action is required.

**File No. 121029**

Ordinance amending the San Francisco Environment Code by adding Section 2109 to suspend the Yellow Pages Distribution Pilot Program.

If you do wish to submit any reports or documentation to be included as part of the file, please send those to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.

# Introduction Form

By a Member of the Board of Supervisors or the Mayor

Time stamp  
or meeting date

I hereby submit the following item for introduction (select only one):

- 1. For reference to Committee:   
An ordinance, resolution, motion, or charter amendment.
- 2. Request for next printed agenda without reference to Committee.
- 3. Request for hearing on a subject matter at Committee:
- 4. Request for letter beginning "Supervisor  inquires"
- 5. City Attorney request.
- 6. Call File No.  from Committee.
- 7. Budget Analyst request (attach written motion).
- 8. Substitute Legislation File No.
- 9. Request for Closed Session (attach written motion).
- 10. Board to Sit as A Committee of the Whole.
- 11. Question(s) submitted for Mayoral Appearance before the BOS on

Please check the appropriate boxes. The proposed legislation should be forwarded to the following:

- Small Business Commission       Youth Commission       Ethics Commission
- Planning Commission       Building Inspection Commission

**Note: For the Imperative Agenda (a resolution not on the printed agenda), use a different form.**

**Sponsor(s):**

**Subject:**

**The text is listed below or attached:**

Signature of Sponsoring Supervisor: David U

For Clerk's Use Only:

12/029