



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

July 31, 2020

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director
San Francisco International Airport
International Terminal, 5th Floor
P.O. Box 8097
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Ronda Chu, Acting Budget Director

RE: Contracting for Airport Shuttle Services – FY 2020-21

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2020-21 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Shirley West, Principal Budget Analyst

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Transit Operators	9163	69.0	\$ 2,500	\$ 3,001	\$ 4,501,949	\$ 5,404,501
Transit Supervisor	9139	4.9	\$ 3,414	\$ 4,099	\$ 433,111	\$ 519,942
Transit Manager II	9141	3.2	\$ 4,553	\$ 5,466	\$ 385,035	\$ 462,227
Transit Manager I	9140	3.2	\$ 4,033	\$ 4,841	\$ 341,009	\$ 409,374
Automotive Mechanic	7381	4.1	\$ 3,057	\$ 3,670	\$ 323,152	\$ 387,937
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	1.6	\$ 2,351	\$ 2,822	\$ 99,393	\$ 119,320
0	0.00				\$ -	\$ -
0	0.00				\$ -	\$ -
0	0.00				\$ -	\$ -
0	0.00				\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			193,039	231,739
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			172,198	206,720
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE			86.0			
					Total Salary Costs--->	
					6,083,650	7,303,301
					Total of Other Compensation--->	
					365,237	438,459

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	
9163	\$40,299
9139	\$49,520
9141	\$59,699
9140	\$54,893
7381	\$46,966
9102	\$37,723
0	\$0
0	\$0
0	0
0	0
Total Fringe Benefits	
	Low
	High
	\$ 3,250,825.44
	\$ 3,643,902.02

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Fuel, Lubricants and Utilities	\$ 789,915	\$ 789,915
Bus Maintenance (same as contractor)	\$ 488,013	\$ 488,013
Liability Insurance	\$ 361,433	\$ 361,433
Worker's Compensation (same as contractor)	\$ 307,315	\$ 307,315
Property Insurance	\$ 6,100	\$ 6,100
Unanticipated Operational Expenses	\$ 202,308	\$ 202,308
Emergency Contingency	\$ 550,357	\$ 550,357
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 2,705,441	\$ 2,705,441

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 12,405,153	\$ 14,091,103
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 11,284,709	\$ 11,287,927
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	<u>\$ 1,120,444</u>	<u>\$ 2,803,176</u>
% of Savings to City Cost	9%	20%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. This service has been contracted out since 1975
2. 50% of the contractor management fee is assumed to be spent on emergency contingency if city-operated.
3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement.
4. Estimated City capital and operating costs are included in the estimated total contract cost.