

Time to Get to Work

San Francisco's Hiring Crisis

A Report of the 2022-2023 San Francisco Civil Grand Jury

Presentation to Government Audit and Oversight Committee November 2, 2023



Civil Grand Jury Findings and Recommendations

- ❑ Eight Findings

- ❑ Seventeen Recommendations

Responses

- ❑ Mayor's Office

- ❑ City Administrator

- ❑ Department of Human Resources

- ❑ Civil Service Commission

- ❑ Office of the Controller

City Department Responses to Jury Recommendations

- ❑ **More Agreement than Disagreement**
- ❑ **Several Jury Recommendations already being implemented.**
- ❑ **Other Recommendations to be implemented in the future.**
- ❑ **One Recommendation requires further analysis.**

San Francisco Civil Grand Jury - Reports

<https://civilgrandjury.sfgov.org/report.html>

Follow-Up Actions and Reporting

Finding 2 - Hiring Process Takes Too Long.

Finding 5 - Recruiting and Retention Efforts cannot keep pace with separations.

Finding 6 - There is a Need for Transparency in the Hiring Process

Finding 2: The City Hiring Process Takes Too Long

One Jury Recommendation “requires further analysis.”

- ❑ 2.1 – Hiring timeline goal of 60 days

Three Civil Grand Jury Recommendations “will be implemented in the future.”

- ❑ 2.4 – Anticipating employee separations
- ❑ 2.5 – Completing Post-Referral process more quickly
- ❑ 2.6 – Evaluating and reducing number of job classifications

Recommendation 2.1

By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources and the Civil Service Commission should collaborate to modify civil service rules and City policies to establish a hiring timeline goals of 60 days from when a posing closes to when the hiring department makes a conditional job offer.

Response: *Requires Further Analysis*

Supervisors should require updates regarding the further analysis of a 60-day hiring timeline.

Recommendation 2.4

By January 1, 2024, DHR should develop a process to enable hiring managers to better anticipate impending employee separations and initiate efforts recruitment efforts for replacements.

Response: *Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future.*

Supervisors should issue a resolution requiring specific follow-up actions and reporting.

Recommendation 2.5

By July 1, 2024, DHR should explore and develop incentives for hiring managers to complete the post-referral selection process in a timely manner, including prioritizing reviewing applicants and entering data into the applicant tracking system in real time.

Response: *Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future.*

Supervisors should issue a resolution requiring specific follow-up actions and reporting.

Recommendation 2.6

By January 1, 2024, the Department of Human Resources and the Civil Service Commission should jointly develop and present a plan for evaluating the number of job classifications.

Response: *Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future.*

Supervisors should issue a resolution requiring specific follow-up actions and reporting.

Finding 5: The City's recruiting and retention efforts cannot keep pace with workforce separations.

Two Civil Grand Jury recommendations “will be implemented in the future.”

5.2 – DHR collaboration with public employee unions to develop recruiting and apprenticeship plans for critical service departments.

5.3 – DHR collaboration with public employee unions to develop plans for retention and succession.

Recommendation 5.2

By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should collaborate with public employee unions to develop recruiting and apprenticeship plans for the City's critical service departments for Fiscal Year 2024–25.

Response: *Has not yet been implemented, but will be implemented in the future.*

Supervisors should issue a resolution requiring specific follow-up actions and reporting.

Recommendation 5.3

By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should collaborate with public employee unions to develop plans for retention and succession of City workers in critical service departments for Fiscal Year 2024–25.

Response: *Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future.*

Supervisors should issue a resolution requiring specific follow-up actions and reporting.

Finding 6: It is difficult to evaluate the success of the City's hiring strategy due to lack of transparency in the hiring process.

Three Civil Grand Jury Recommendations "will be implemented in the future."

6.1 – Public dashboard

6.2 – Explanatory materials and training resources

6.3 – Training hiring managers on process changes

Recommendation 6.1

By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should work with the City Controller and City Administrator to produce a public dashboard, updated monthly, that reports time-to-hire and vacancy rates for critical service positions and departments.

Response: Has not yet been implemented, but will be implemented in the future.

Supervisors should issue a resolution requiring specific follow-up actions and reporting.

Recommendation 6.2

By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources and the Civil Service Commission should jointly develop and present improved explanatory materials and training resources for educating City workers, hiring managers and applicants on the City's hiring process.

Response: *Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future.*

Supervisors should issue a resolution requiring specific follow-up actions and reporting.

Recommendation 6.3

By July 1st, 2024, the Department of Human Resources should develop a plan to train hiring managers on hiring process changes in a timely manner while tracking feedback on how process changes are working.

Response: *Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future.*

Supervisors should issue a resolution requiring specific follow-up actions and reporting.

Conclusion

Are we up to the challenge?