



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Greg Wagner
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 26, 2024

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Bree Mawhorter, Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Security Services – FY 2024-25 & FY 2025-26

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2024-25 and 2025-26 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Devin Macaulay at Devin.Macaulay@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

_____/s/_____

Greg Wagner,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Diana Hammons, Senior Manager

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Security Services (18763)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2024-25

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Name	Job Class	FTE	FY 2024-25 Personnel Costs Low	FY 2024-25 Personnel Costs High
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 99,547	\$ 137,976
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	16.00	\$ 2,007,604	\$ 2,378,001
Chief Clerk	1410_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 141,250	\$ 167,673
Security Guard	8202_C_MTA	100.20	\$ 9,364,868	\$ 12,956,981
Manager II, MTA	9172_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 187,325	\$ 232,110
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 32,490	\$ 40,036
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 43,082	\$ 53,089
Sum:		119.20	\$ 11,876,166	\$ 15,965,866

ADDITIONAL CITY COST

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2024-25 Low Estimate	FY 2024-25 High Estimates
MTA Transit Overhead of 52.3% of salary + benefits	0		\$ 6,211,235	\$ 8,350,148
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 6,211,235	\$ 8,350,148

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 18,087,401 \$ 24,316,014

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 18,087,401	\$ 24,316,014
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 9,917,035	\$ 9,946,340
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 8,170,366	\$ 14,369,674
% of Savings to City Cost	45.17%	59.10%

MTA - Municipal Transportation Agency

Security Services (18763)

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2025-26

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Name	Job Class	FTE	FY 2025-26 Personnel Cost Low	FY 2025-26 Personnel Cost High
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 103,461	\$ 143,095
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	16.00	\$ 2,083,237	\$ 2,465,257
Chief Clerk	1410_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 146,472	\$ 173,723
Security Guard	8202_C_MTA	100.20	\$ 9,737,881	\$ 13,442,800
Manager II, MTA	9172_C_MTA	1.00	\$ 194,305	\$ 240,493
Overtime - Miscellaneous			\$ 33,324	\$ 40,006
Premium Pay - Miscellaneous			\$ 44,188	\$ 53,048
Sum:		119.20	\$ 12,342,868	\$ 16,558,422

ADDITIONAL CITY COST

Item Description	Nbr of Units	Notes / Unit Measure	FY 2025-26 Low Estimate	FY 2025-26 High Estimates
MTA Transit Overhead of 52.3% of salary + benefits	0		\$ 6,455,320	\$ 8,660,055
Total Non-Personnel Costs:			\$ 6,455,320	\$ 8,660,055

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST \$ 18,798,188 \$ 25,218,477

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 18,798,188	\$ 25,218,477
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 10,113,647	\$ 10,143,863
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 8,684,541	\$ 15,074,614
% of Savings to City Cost	46.20%	59.78%