

1 [Adopting findings related to disapproving the categorical exemption issued for the 376
2 Eureka Street project.]

3 **Motion adopting findings related to disapproving the determination by the Planning**
4 **Department that the 376 Eureka Street project is categorically exempt from**
5 **environmental review under the California Environmental Quality Act.**
6

7 The Planning Department determined that a proposal to expand a single-family
8 dwelling by adding a 2-story rear addition, raising the dwelling 2 feet, constructing a below-
9 grade garage and basement area and altering an accessory rear cottage by removing a
10 kitchen at 376 Eureka Street ("Project") was categorically exempt from the California
11 Environmental Quality Act ("CEQA") and issued a written exemption determination on May 2,
12 2007 ("determination").

13 By letter to the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors dated September 14, 2007, F. Joseph
14 Butler on behalf of Ms. Susan Lally and Ms. Priscilla Botsford (the "Appellants") filed an
15 appeal of the determination to the Board of Supervisors, which the Clerk of the Board of
16 Supervisors received on or around September 14, 2007.

17 On November 13, 2007, this Board held a duly noticed public hearing to consider the
18 appeal of the determination and following the public hearing disapproved the determination of
19 the Planning Department that the Project is categorically exempt from CEQA.

20 In reviewing the appeal of the categorical exemption determination, this Board
21 reviewed and considered the written record before the Board and all of the public comments
22 made in support of and opposed to the appeal. Following the conclusion of the public
23 hearing, the Board disapproved the Planning Department's categorical exemption
24 determination for 376 Eureka Street based on the written record before the Board as well as
25

1 all of the testimony at the public hearing in support of and opposed to the appeal. Said Motion
2 and written record is in the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors File No. 071319 and is
3 incorporated herein as though set forth in its entirety.

4 In regard to said decision, this Board made certain findings specifying the basis for its
5 decision to disapprove the Planning Department's approval of the determination for 376
6 Eureka Street based on the whole record before the Board including the written record in File
7 No. 071319, which is hereby declared to be a part of this motion as if set forth fully herein; the
8 written submissions to and official written records of the Planning Department determination
9 related to the 376 Eureka Street project; the official written and oral testimony at and audio
10 and video records of the public hearing in support of and opposed to the appeal and
11 deliberation of the oral and written testimony at the public hearing before the Board of
12 Supervisors by all parties and the public in support of and opposed to the appeal of the
13 categorical exemption.

14 NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors of the City and
15 County of San Francisco finds that the Project as proposed and evaluated in the exemption
16 determination issued by the Planning Department does not conform to the Secretary of
17 Interior Standards and will cause a significant adverse impact to an historic resource and,
18 therefore, is not exempt from CEQA under CEQA Sections 21084 and 21084.1 and CEQA
19 Guidelines Section 15300.2(f); and be it

20 FURTHER MOVED, That the Board finds that the Project will not retain the historic
21 character of the circa 1906 residence, believed by Planning Department staff to have been
22 constructed as temporary housing after the 1906 San Francisco earthquake and one of a
23 relatively few such residences that remain, because the Project will alter character-defining
24 features of the existing residence including the small scale and size and relationship of the
25 residence to its setting; and be it

1 FURTHER MOVED, That the Board finds that the proposed Project, consisting of an
2 approximately 2,080 square foot residence plus 800 square foot partially below-grade garage,
3 will adversely affect the existing 1,056 square foot building by altering the scale, size and the
4 unique relationship of the residence to its setting because the Project will: (1) raise the
5 building two feet, (2) excavate nearly half of the front setback and garden area to construct a
6 driveway and underground garage level, and (3) remove approximately 8 feet of the back of
7 the existing structure and add an approximately 31 foot rear addition that will be
8 approximately 22 feet longer and 5 feet higher than the existing building height and visible
9 from public streets; and be it

10 FURTHER MOVED, That the Board finds that the height and bulk added to the existing
11 structure by the Project will adversely affect the simple design and small scale of the existing
12 residence by creating multi-plane roof lines and slopes that will be visible above the existing
13 structure from the intersection of Eureka Street and 21st Street and by adding the back
14 addition, which will be deeper and taller than the existing structure and visible from 21st Street.

15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25