



**City and County of San Francisco**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**Government Audit and Oversight Committee**

City Hall  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

*Members: Dean Preston, Catherine Stefani, Connie Chan*

*Clerk: Alisa Somera*  
*(415) 554-7711 ~ [alisa.somera@sfgov.org](mailto:alisa.somera@sfgov.org)*

---

Thursday, November 2, 2023

10:00 AM

City Hall, Legislative Chamber, Room 250

---

**Regular Meeting**

---

*President Aaron Peskin appointed Supervisor Joel Engardio, in place of Supervisor Dean Preston, to the Government Audit and Oversight Committee for the regular meeting of November 2, 2023.*

**Present:** 3 - Catherine Stefani, Connie Chan, and Joel Engardio

**Excused:** 1 - Dean Preston

*The Government Audit and Oversight Committee met in regular session on Thursday, November 2, 2023, with Vice Chair Catherine Stefani presiding. Vice Chair Stefani called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m.*

## **ROLL CALL AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*On the call of the roll, Vice Chair Stefani and Member Engardio were noted present. Chair Preston and Member Chan were noted not present.*

*A quorum of the Committee was present.*

## **Supervisor Preston Excused from Attendance**

**Vice Chair Stefani moved that Supervisor Preston be excused from the Government Audit and Oversight Committee meeting of November 2, 2023. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 2 - Stefani, Engardio

Excused: 1 - Preston

Absent: 1 - Chan

## **COMMUNICATIONS**

*Stephanie Cabrera, Assistant Clerk, informed the public that on October 17, 2023, the Board of Supervisors approved a Motion discontinuing remote public comment and participation at all Board and Committee meetings; going forward all public comment will be taken in-person, with remote access only being provided for those who require an ADA accommodation.*

*(Written comments may be submitted through email ([alisa.somera@sfgov.org](mailto:alisa.somera@sfgov.org)) or the U.S. Postal Service at City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102.)*

## AGENDA CHANGES

*There were no agenda changes.*

## REGULAR AGENDA

*Member Chan noted present at 10:06 a.m.*

### **230873 [Memorandum of Understanding - Friends and Foundation of the San Francisco Public Library]**

#### **Sponsor: Mayor**

Resolution approving the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between the Friends and Foundation of the San Francisco Public Library and the San Francisco Public Library to establish roles and responsibilities of each party for purposes of fundraising, enhancing operations, and capital projects for a term of 10 years effective upon approval of this Resolution; and to authorize the San Francisco Public Library to enter into amendments or modifications of the MOU prior to its final execution by all parties that do not materially increase the obligations or liabilities to the City and are necessary to effectuate the purposes of the MOU or this Resolution. (Public Library)

07/25/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

07/31/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Public Library and the Friends and Foundation of the San Francisco Public Library for informational purposes.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Maureen Singleton (San Francisco Public Library); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Carrie Blanding (Friends and Foundation of the San Francisco Public Library); Matthew Keniston; spoke in support of the hearing matter.*

**Vice Chair Stefani moved that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Stefani, Chan, Engardio

Excused: 1 - Preston

**231100 [Hearing - Annual Comprehensive Financial Reports, Single Audit, and Management Letters - FY2021-2022 - External Audit Plans for FY2022-2023]****Sponsor: Preston**

Hearing to receive and review external auditors' Annual Comprehensive Financial Reports (ACFR), Single Audit, and Management Letters, if any, related to the City audit for Fiscal Year (FY) June 30, 2021 and June 30, 2022; to present their audit plan for FY2022-2023 as required under Charter, Section 9.117; and requesting the City's external auditors Macias Gini & O'Connell to report.

10/17/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

10/25/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to Macias Gini & O'Connell, LLP and Crowe, LLP for informational purposes and requesting the external auditors to report.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Carmen LeFranc and Todd Rydstrom (Office of the Controller); Annie Louis (Macias Gini & O'Connell); Kathy Lai (Crowe, LLP); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion*

**Vice Chair Stefani moved that this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Stefani, Chan, Engardio

Excused: 1 - Preston

**230728 [Hearing - Civil Grand Jury Report - Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis]**

Hearing on the 2022-2023 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Time to Get to Work: San Francisco's Hiring Crisis." (Clerk of the Board)

06/27/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

06/30/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Mayor, Office of the Controller, Homelessness and Supportive Housing, SF Homelessness Oversight Commission, Office of Contracts Administration, and the City Administrator for informational purposes and requesting the departments respond to Findings and Recommendations as requested in the report.

08/21/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED. Response to the Civil Grand Jury findings and recommendations received from the Office of the Controller.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): None.*

**Vice Chair Stefani moved that this Hearing be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Stefani, Chan, Engardio

Excused: 1 - Preston

**230725 [Hearing - Civil Grand Jury Report - Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers]**

Hearing on the 2022-2023 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Not Making the Grade: San Francisco's Shortage of Credentialed Teachers" (Clerk of the Board)

06/15/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

06/30/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Mayor, Superintendent of Schools, Board of Education, and Office of the Controller for informational purposes and requesting the departments respond to Findings and Recommendations as requested in the report.

08/15/23; RESPONSE RECEIVED. The Office of the Controller submitted response to Recommendations R4.1 and R4.2.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Karen Kennard, Foreperson and Pauline Soffa (2022-2023 Civil Grand Jury); Hong Mei Pang and Swen Ervin (San Francisco Unified School District); Kevine Boggess (San Francisco Board of Education); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion. Michael Carboy; Lawrence Lee; spoke on various concerns relating to the hearing matter.*

**Supervisor Chan moved that this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Stefani, Chan, Engardio

Excused: 1 - Preston

*Vice Chair Stefani requested File Nos. 230726 and 230727 be called together.*

**230726 [Hearing - Civil Grand Jury Report - Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses]**

Hearing on the 2022-2023 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses"

06/21/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

06/30/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Mayor, Treasurer Tax Collector, City Administrator, Office of Small Business, Office of Economic and Workforce Development, Planning Department, Building Inspection, Department of Public Health, Public Works, Entertainment Commission, Fire Department, and Police Department for informational purposes and requesting the departments respond to Findings and Recommendations as requested in the report.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Rob Chansler (2022-2023 Civil Grand Jury); Tom Paulino (Office of the Mayor); Katy Tang (Office of Small Business); Nicolas Menard (Office of the Budget and Legislative Analyst); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.*

*Vice Chair Stefani moved that this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED. The motion carried by the following vote:*

*Ayes: 3 - Stefani, Chan, Engardio*

*Excused: 1 - Preston*

*Vice Chair Stefani moved to RESCIND the previous vote that this Hearing be Heard and Filed. The motion carried by the following vote:*

*Ayes: 3 - Stefani, Chan, Engardio*

*Excused: 1 - Preston*

**Vice Chair Stefani moved that this Hearing be CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Ayes: 3 - Stefani, Chan, Engardio**

**Excused: 1 - Preston**

**230727 [Board Response - Civil Grand Jury Report - Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses]**

Resolution responding to the Presiding Judge of the Superior Court on the findings and recommendations contained in the 2022-2023 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Taking Care of Business: San Francisco's Plan to Save its Small Businesses;" and urging the Mayor to cause the implementation of accepted findings and recommendations through her department heads and through the development of the annual budget. (Government Audit and Oversight Committee)

06/21/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Rob Chansler (2022-2023 Civil Grand Jury); Tom Paulino (Office of the Mayor); Katy Tang (Office of Small Business); Nicolas Menard (Office of the Budget and Legislative Analyst); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.*

**Vice Chair Stefani moved that this Resolution be AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE, by adding Board of Supervisors' responses to Findings No. F1 and F9; and Recommendations R1, R5, R7, R8.5, and R9. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Stefani, Chan, Engardio

Excused: 1 - Preston

**Vice Chair Stefani moved that this Resolution be RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Stefani, Chan, Engardio

Excused: 1 - Preston

**230613 [Hearing - Impact of Downtown Business Closures]**

**Sponsor: Engardio**

Hearing to review the economic impact, potential tax revenue loss, and City budget consequence of downtown business closures; and requesting the Controller to report.

05/23/23; RECEIVED AND ASSIGNED to Government Audit and Oversight Committee.

06/15/23; REFERRED TO DEPARTMENT. Referred to the Office of the Controller for informational purposes and requesting the department to report.

*Heard in Committee. Speaker(s): Ted Egan (Office of the Controller); Sarah Dennis-Phillips, Director (Office of Economic and Workforce Development); presented information and answered questions raised throughout the discussion.*

**Member Engardio moved that this Hearing be HEARD AND FILED. The motion carried by the following vote:**

Ayes: 3 - Stefani, Chan, Engardio

Excused: 1 - Preston

**ADJOURNMENT**

*There being no further business, the Government Audit and Oversight Committee adjourned at the hour of 12:39 p.m.*

*N.B. The Minutes of this meeting set forth all actions taken by the Government Audit and Oversight Committee on the matters stated, but not necessarily in the chronological sequence in which the matters were taken up.*