



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller

Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

April 30, 2022

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation  
Municipal Transportation Agency  
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Citation Services – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

---

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Kamini Lall, Budget Manager  
Ben Becker, Financial Analyst

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
IS Business Analyst	1052_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 4,017	\$ 4,822	209,663	251,696
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,226	\$ 5,073	110,286	132,396
IT Operations Support Administrator III	1093_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,706	\$ 4,449	96,728	116,120
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	2.4	\$ 4,504	\$ 5,407	279,429	335,449
IS Engineer-Senior	1043_C_MTA	4.7	\$ 5,517	\$ 6,623	678,498	814,523
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	5.3	\$ 6,392	\$ 7,674	891,930	1,070,744
IS Programmer Analyst	1062_C	4.0	\$ 3,468	\$ 4,163	359,264	431,290
IS Programmer Analyst-Senior	1063_C	4.4	\$ 4,216	\$ 5,061	486,856	584,461
IS Programmer Analyst-Principal	1064_C	3.3	\$ 5,283	\$ 6,342	458,964	550,977
IS Project Director	1070_C_MTA	0.5	\$ 6,392	\$ 7,674	81,399	97,718
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	11.2	\$ 2,241	\$ 2,691	653,725	784,784
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	5.2	\$ 3,070	\$ 3,686	415,795	499,153
Account Clerk	1630_C	3.1	\$ 2,405	\$ 2,887	195,369	234,536
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	9.3	\$ 3,146	\$ 3,777	766,875	920,619
Senior Management Assistant	1844_C_MTA	6.2	\$ 3,825	\$ 4,592	621,521	746,124
Cashier II	4321_C	8.0	\$ 2,496	\$ 2,996	524,320	629,436
Cashier III	4322_C	6.1	\$ 2,800	\$ 3,361	442,285	530,954
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	0.1	\$ 5,264	\$ 6,320	13,740	16,495
Total FTE		77.9			7,286,647	8,747,476
			Total Salary Costs-->			

FRINGE BENEFITS		
Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1052_C_MTA	49,882
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1823_C_MTA	51,609
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1093_C_MTA	47,313
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1094_C_MTA	53,231
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1043_C_MTA	59,986
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1044_C_MTA	65,386
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1062_C	45,345
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1063_C	51,524
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1064_C	58,627
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1070_C_MTA	65,386
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1404_C_MTA	34,785
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1408_C_MTA	41,651
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1630_C	36,133
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1634_C_MTA	42,278
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844_C_MTA	47,897
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4321_C	36,895
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4322_C	39,408
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9177_C_MTA	63,536
Total Fringe Benefits		
		Low
		High
		3,147,771
		3,544,611

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
\$3,500 workstation x 60=\$210K/5 contract yrs	\$	42,000
\$1,000 computers x 60=\$60K/5	\$	12,000
\$2,500 tough book laptops x5=\$12.5K/5	\$	2,500
\$500 printers x 35=\$17.5K/5	\$	3,500
MTA overhead	\$	10,350,943
Postage	\$	306,340
Merchant Fees	\$	654,500
Mobile License Recognition Camera Fees	\$	24,120
Mis (handheld devices/accessories, data cards)	\$	7,380
Handheld Devices	\$	140,905
Tickets/Envelopes	\$	36,300
Total Capital & Operating	\$	11,580,488
	\$	13,592,855

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	22,014,907	25,884,943
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	6,057,384	6,301,465
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 15,957,523	\$ 19,583,478
% of Savings to City Cost	72%	76%

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
IS Business Analyst	1052_C_MTA	1.9	\$ 4,114	\$ 4,939	208,575	250,391
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,328	\$ 5,196	112,972	135,621
IT Operations Support Administrator	1093_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,796	\$ 4,557	99,085	118,949
IT Operations Support Administrator	1094_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,614	\$ 5,539	120,423	144,566
IS Engineer-Senior	1043_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,652	\$ 6,785	147,512	177,085
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 6,548	\$ 7,860	170,897	205,158
IS Programmer Analyst	1062_C	1.0	\$ 3,552	\$ 4,264	92,715	111,302
IS Programmer Analyst-Senior	1063_C	1.0	\$ 4,320	\$ 5,186	112,743	135,346
IS Programmer Analyst-Principal	1064_C	0.5	\$ 5,416	\$ 6,501	67,956	81,580
IS Project Director	1070_C_MTA	0.1	\$ 6,548	\$ 7,860	24,649	29,590
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	11.2	\$ 2,296	\$ 2,756	672,228	806,997
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	5.2	\$ 3,145	\$ 3,776	427,559	513,276
Account Clerk	1630_C	3.1	\$ 2,463	\$ 2,957	200,917	241,197
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	9.4	\$ 3,223	\$ 3,869	788,575	946,669
Senior Management Assistant	1844_C_MTA	6.3	\$ 3,918	\$ 4,703	639,109	767,238
Cashier II	4321_C	8.1	\$ 2,557	\$ 3,069	539,158	647,248
Cashier III	4322_C	6.1	\$ 2,868	\$ 3,443	454,803	545,982
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	0.1	\$ 5,393	\$ 6,474	14,075	16,897
Total FTE		59.0				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 4,893,950	\$ 5,875,090

FRINGE BENEFITS		
Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1052_C_MTA	46,691
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1823_C_MTA	48,203
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1093_C_MTA	44,447
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1094_C_MTA	49,519
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1043_C_MTA	55,228
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1044_C_MTA	59,674
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1062_C	42,724
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1063_C	48,140
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1064_C	54,055
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1070_C_MTA	59,674
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1404_C_MTA	33,417
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1408_C_MTA	39,421
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1630_C	34,599
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1634_C_MTA	39,969
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844_C_MTA	44,884
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4321_C	35,260
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4322_C	37,459
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9177_C_MTA	59,378
Total Fringe Benefits		
	Low	High
	\$ 2,093,017.20	\$ 2,335,202.00

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
\$3,500 workstation x 60=\$210K/5 contract yrs	\$	42,000 \$ 42,000
\$1,000 computers x 60=\$60K/5	\$	12,000 \$ 12,000
\$2,500 tough book laptops x5=\$12.5K/5	\$	2,500 \$ 2,500
\$500 printers x 35=\$17.5K/5	\$	3,500 \$ 3,500
MTA overhead	\$	6,931,071 \$ 8,144,610
Postage	\$	360,400 \$ 360,400
Merchant Fees	\$	770,000 \$ 770,000
Mobile License Recognition Camera Fees	\$	24,120 \$ 24,120
Mis (handheld devices/accessories, data cards)	\$	7,380 \$ 7,380
Handheld Devices	\$	140,905 \$ 140,905
Tickets/Envelopes	\$	36,300 \$ 36,300
Total Capital & Operating	\$	8,330,176 \$ 9,543,715

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 15,317,144	\$ 17,754,007
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 6,281,443	\$ 6,301,271
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 9,035,701	\$ 11,452,735
% of Savings to City Cost	59%	65%