



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller

Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

April 30, 2022

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation  
Municipal Transportation Agency  
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Towing Services – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

---

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Kamini Lall, Budget Manager  
Ben Becker, Fiscal Analyst

SFMTA - Streets  
Towing

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
1052 IS Business Analyst	1052_C_MTA	0.0	\$ 4,094	\$ 4,915	-	-
1222_C Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerl	1222_C_MTA	0.0	\$ 3,176.38	\$ 3,813	-	-
1657_C Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,158.70	\$ 6,193	134,642	161,635
1824_C Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,986.86	\$ 5,987	130,157	156,251
1404_C Clerk	1404_C_MTA	1.6	\$ 2,284.75	\$ 2,743	93,115	111,783
1630_C Account Clerk	1630_C	3.2	\$ 2,451.35	\$ 2,943	207,645	249,273
1634_C Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	6.6	\$ 3,207.08	\$ 3,850	549,229	659,338
1652_C Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,424.52	\$ 4,111	178,760	214,598
1704_C Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	4.2	\$ 2,524.12	\$ 3,030	276,391	331,802
1705_C Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	4.2	\$ 2,799.39	\$ 3,361	306,533	367,987
1844_C Senior Management Assistant	1844_C_MTA	0.0	\$ 3,898.82	\$ 4,680	-	-
4321_C Cashier II	4321_C	1.6	\$ 2,544.26	\$ 3,054	103,691	124,479
4322_C Cashier III	4322_C	1.6	\$ 2,853.78	\$ 3,426	116,306	139,623
1926_C Senior Materials And Supplies Sup	1926_C	1.0	\$ 2,574.10	\$ 3,090	67,184	80,653
1934_C Storekeeper	1934_C_MTA	7.6	\$ 2,500.44	\$ 3,002	496,149	595,617
1936_C Senior Storekeeper	1936_C_MTA	3.0	\$ 2,665.28	\$ 3,200	208,691	250,530
1942_C Assistant Materials Coordinator	1942_C_MTA	0.0	\$ 4,204.83	\$ 5,048	-	-
1952_C Purchaser	1952_C	1.0	\$ 3,631.43	\$ 4,359	94,780	113,782
8202_C Security Guard	8202_C	11.4	\$ 2,665.28	\$ 3,200	792,388	951,246
4308 Senior Collections Officer	4308_C	0.0	\$ 3,167.63	\$ 3,803	-	-
7355_C Truck Driver	7355_C_MTA	31.2	\$ 3,461.35	\$ 4,155	2,821,350	3,386,975
7382_C Automotive Mechanic Assistant Su	7382_C_MTA	0.0	\$ 4,151.31	\$ 4,984	-	-
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,504.20	\$ 5,407	117,560	141,128
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 6,392.05	\$ 7,674	166,832	200,279
Manager IV	9174_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 5,786.45	\$ 6,947	302,052	362,608
7381_C Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	5.2	\$ 3,448.21	\$ 4,140	468,439	562,351
Holiday Pay (if applicable)						
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					29,759	35,725
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay (if applicable)						
<b>Total FTE</b>		<b>91.3</b>				
<b>Total Salary Costs--&gt;</b>					<b>7,631,895</b>	<b>9,161,938</b>
<b>Total of Other Compensation--&gt;</b>					<b>29,759</b>	<b>35,725</b>
<b>FRINGE BENEFITS</b>						
					Low	High
<b>Total Fringe Benefits</b>					<b>3,632,669</b>	<b>4,086,358</b>

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years		
Postage+supplies+uniforms				72,772	72,772
Specialized Software				404,890	404,890
Vehicles - tow trucks (7 year useful life)				579,563	982,143
Fuel (15-20 miles/day/truck, assume 20mi/gal at \$5-\$7/gallon)				60,225	112,420
Communications: ipad air \$650 + case \$30 + cellular data (\$200/year for 4 years) *32 drivers / useful l				11,840	11,840
Utilities				46,189	46,189
Lien Fees				133,498	133,498
Dolly equipment (2 year useful life)				24,450	27,900
Credit card fees				85,185	85,185
Overhead, at 99.2% applied to salaries and fringe benefits				11,203,968	13,177,750
<b>Total Capital &amp; Operating</b>				<b>12,622,579</b>	<b>15,054,586</b>

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	23,916,901	28,338,607
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	13,375,555	13,437,588
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<b>10,541,346</b>	<b>14,901,019</b>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	<b>44%</b>	<b>53%</b>

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
1052 IS Business Analyst	1052_C_MTA	-	\$ 4,242	\$ 5,093	-	-
1222_C Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerl	1222_C_MTA	-	\$ 3,323	\$ 3,989	-	-
1657_C Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,345	\$ 6,416	138,966	166,826
1824_C Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,167	\$ 6,203	134,336	161,268
1404_C Clerk	1404_C_MTA	1.6	\$ 2,367	\$ 2,842	96,107	115,374
1630_C Account Clerk	1630_C	3.2	\$ 2,540	\$ 3,049	214,317	257,283
1634_C Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	6.6	\$ 3,323	\$ 3,989	566,872	680,519
1652_C Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,548	\$ 4,259	184,501	221,490
1704_C Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	4.2	\$ 2,615	\$ 3,140	285,271	342,462
1705_C Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	4.2	\$ 2,900	\$ 3,482	316,378	379,806
1844_C Senior Management Assistant	1844_C_MTA	-	\$ 4,040	\$ 4,849	-	-
4321_C Cashier II	4321_C	1.6	\$ 2,636	\$ 3,165	107,021	128,477
4322_C Cashier III	4322_C	1.6	\$ 2,957	\$ 3,550	120,041	144,107
1926_C Senior Materials And Supplies Sup	1926_C	1.0	\$ 2,667	\$ 3,202	69,342	83,244
1934_C Storekeeper	1934_C_MTA	7.6	\$ 2,591	\$ 3,110	512,083	614,745
1936_C Senior Storekeeper	1936_C_MTA	3.0	\$ 2,761	\$ 3,315	215,396	258,579
1942_C Assistant Materials Coordinator	1942_C_MTA	-	\$ 4,357	\$ 5,230	-	-
1952_C Purchaser	1952_C	1.0	\$ 3,763	\$ 4,517	97,825	117,437
8202_C Security Guard	8202_C	11.4	\$ 2,761	\$ 3,315	817,846	981,808
Senior Collections Officer	4308_C	-	\$ 3,282	\$ 3,940	-	-
7355_C Truck Driver	7355_C_MTA	31.2	\$ 3,586	\$ 4,305	2,911,958	3,495,748
7382_C Automotive Mechanic Assistant Su	7382_C_MTA	-	\$ 4,301	\$ 5,163	-	-
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,632	\$ 5,560	120,423	144,566
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 6,573	\$ 7,891	170,897	205,158
Manager IV	9174_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 5,995	\$ 7,197	311,752	374,252
Senior Account Clerk	1632	5.2	\$ 3,573	\$ 4,289	483,484	580,413
Holiday Pay (if applicable)						
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					30,715	36,872
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay (if applicable)						
Total FTE		91.3				
Total Salary Costs-->					7,874,817	9,453,561
Total of Other Compensation-->					30,715	36,872

FRINGE BENEFITS			
	Low	High	
Total Fringe Benefits	3,456,483	3,874,850	

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years
Postage+supplies+uniforms			72,476 72,476
Specialized Software			403,243 403,243
Vehicles - tow trucks (7 year useful life)			579,563 982,143
Fuel (15-20 miles/day/truck, assume 20mi/gal at \$5-\$7/gallon)			60,225 112,420
Communications: ipad air \$650 + case \$30 + cellular data (\$200/year for 4 years) *32 drivers / useful life			11,840 11,840
Utilities			46,001 46,001
Lien Fees			133,498 133,498
Dolly equipment (2 year useful life)			24,450 27,900
Credit card fees			85,185 85,185
Overhead, at 99.2% applied to salaries and fringe benefits			11,271,118 13,258,361
Total Capital & Operating			12,687,598 15,133,067

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	24,049,611	28,498,350
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	13,997,231	14,058,705
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	10,052,381	14,439,645
% of Savings to City Cost	42%	51%