



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 30, 2022

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Paratransit Services – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Kamini Lall, Budget Manager
Ben Becker, Financial Analyst

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Transit Operator	9163_C_MTA	178.0	\$ 2,755	\$ 3,307	\$ 12,799,012	\$ 15,364,960
Transit Operator	9163_C_MTA	121.0	\$ 2,754.96	\$ 3,307	\$ 8,700,451.76	\$ 10,444,720.00
Automotive Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 4,072.44	\$ 4,889	\$ 212,581.60	\$ 255,200.00
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	12.0	\$ 3,382.65	\$ 4,061	\$ 1,059,446.05	\$ 1,271,844.00
Automotive Service Worker	7410_C_MTA	8.0	\$ 2,724.71	\$ 3,271	\$ 568,919.01	\$ 682,976.00
Senior Parts Storekeeper	1931_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 2,996.50	\$ 3,597	\$ 78,208.70	\$ 93,888.00
Transit Car Cleaner	9102_C_MTA	7.0	\$ 2,600.84	\$ 3,122	\$ 475,174.02	\$ 570,437.00
Transit Supervisor	9139_C_MTA	15.0	\$ 3,777.42	\$ 4,535	\$ 1,478,858.22	\$ 1,775,340.00
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	3.0	\$ 5,264.50	\$ 6,320	\$ 412,210.05	\$ 494,850.00
Transit Manager I	9140_C_MTA	7.0	\$ 4,461.21	\$ 5,356	\$ 815,063.01	\$ 978,467.00
Transportation Safety Specialist	9520_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,696.88	\$ 5,639	\$ 122,588.45	\$ 147,165.00
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	29.0	\$ 2,746.22	\$ 3,297	\$ 2,078,613.22	\$ 2,495,334.00
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	21.0	\$ 2,476.15	\$ 2,973	\$ 1,357,176.91	\$ 1,629,264.00
Planner I	5277_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,048.97	\$ 3,660	\$ 79,578.16	\$ 95,532.00
Executive Secretary I	1450_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,070.48	\$ 3,686	\$ 160,279.20	\$ 192,412.00
Senior Transit Information Clerk	9124_C_MTA	5.0	\$ 2,968.96	\$ 3,564	\$ 387,449.13	\$ 465,125.00
Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1222_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,146.15	\$ 3,777	\$ 164,229.28	\$ 197,154.00
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,060.68	\$ 6,075	\$ 132,083.81	\$ 158,564.00
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	4.0	\$ 3,359.45	\$ 4,033	\$ 350,726.32	\$ 421,040.00
Human Services Agency Senior Eligibility W	2905_C	4.0	\$ 3,189.79	\$ 3,829	\$ 333,013.88	\$ 399,776.57
Eligibility Worker Supervisor	2907_C	1.0	\$ 3,536.86	\$ 4,246	\$ 92,311.92	\$ 110,818.63
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	7.0	\$ 2,819.31	\$ 3,385	\$ 515,087.22	\$ 618,352.00
Senior Account Clerk	1632_C_MTA	3.0	\$ 2,784.04	\$ 3,342	\$ 217,990.27	\$ 261,693.00
Human Resources Analyst	1241_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,823.02	\$ 4,589	\$ 199,561.81	\$ 239,570.00
IT Operations Support Administrator V	1095_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,847.36	\$ 5,819	\$ 126,516.04	\$ 151,880.00
IT Operations Support Administrator II	1092_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,048.97	\$ 3,660	\$ 159,156.31	\$ 191,064.00
Custodian	2708_C_MTA	3.0	\$ 2,341.97	\$ 2,811	\$ 183,376.62	\$ 220,140.00
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					\$ 723,275.74	\$ 868,278.20
Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)					\$ 803,862.13	\$ 965,020.56
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$300/person/year Shoes \$250/year)					\$ 164,450.00	\$ 164,450.00
Other Pay: 7381, 7382, and 7410 (Uniform \$300/person/year Shoes \$250/year)					\$ 12,100.00	\$ 12,100.00
Other Pay: 9102 (Uniform \$300/person/year Shoes \$250/person/year)					\$ 3,850.00	\$ 3,850.00
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$600/person/year)					\$ 8,400.00	\$ 8,400.00
Other Pay: 9140 (Shoes \$150/person/year)					\$ 1,050.00	\$ 1,050.00
Other Pay: 9139 (Shoes \$150/person/year)					\$ 2,250.00	\$ 2,250.00
Total FTE		443.0				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 33,259,662.64	\$ 39,927,566.20
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 1,719,237.87	\$ 2,025,398.76

FRINGE BENEFITS			
Total Fringe Benefits	Low	High	
	\$ 16,253,032.82	\$ 18,179,253.09	

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years	Low	High
Sedan, 4 door midsize	200	\$ 28,000.00	4	\$ 1,445,500	\$ 1,445,500
Van, Type A, life equipped	49	\$ 56,000.00	4	\$ 708,295	\$ 708,295
Van, Type B, lift equipped	64	\$ 60,000.00	4	\$ 991,200	\$ 991,200
Minivans, ramp equipped	25	\$ 45,000.00	4	\$ 290,391	\$ 290,391
2 way radios	338	\$ 50.00	4	\$ 4,362	\$ 4,362
Mobile Data Computers	200	\$ 1,900.00	4	\$ 98,088	\$ 98,088
Fuel: (Est miles per gal is 5.9 at \$3.57 per gallon)				\$ 1,501,210	\$ 1,501,210
Parts (Est at \$2,467 per vehicle)				\$ 860,946	\$ 860,946
Computer Supplies, maintenance, hosting, "Trapeze" system				\$ 200,787	\$ 200,787
CabConnect				\$ 395,440	\$ 395,440
Claims Est.				\$ 1,297,127	\$ 1,557,175
Total Capital & Operating				\$ 7,793,345	\$ 8,053,393

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 59,025,278.51	\$ 68,185,611.46
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 33,336,751.65	\$ 33,386,414.53
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 25,688,527	\$ 34,799,197
% of Savings to City Cost	44%	51%

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
 FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Transit Operator	3163_C_MTA	178.0	\$ 2,833	\$ 3,401	\$ 13,111,277	\$ 15,739,828
Transit Operator	3163_C_MTA	121.0	\$ 2,833.03	\$ 3,401	\$ 8,912,721.82	\$ 10,699,546.00
Automotive Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 4,187.68	\$ 5,027	\$ 217,759.53	\$ 261,416.00
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	12.0	\$ 3,478.38	\$ 4,176	\$ 1,085,255.72	\$ 1,302,828.00
Automotive Service Worker	7410_C_MTA	8.0	\$ 2,801.83	\$ 3,364	\$ 582,780.13	\$ 699,616.00
Senior Parts Storekeeper	1931_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,081.30	\$ 3,699	\$ 80,113.78	\$ 96,175.00
Transit Car Cleaner	3102_C_MTA	7.0	\$ 2,674.44	\$ 3,211	\$ 486,748.56	\$ 584,332.00
Transit Supervisor	3139_C_MTA	15.0	\$ 3,884.34	\$ 4,663	\$ 1,514,893.80	\$ 1,818,600.00
Manager III, MTA	3177_C_MTA	3.0	\$ 5,413.47	\$ 6,499	\$ 422,251.03	\$ 506,904.00
Transit Manager I	3140_C_MTA	7.0	\$ 4,587.46	\$ 5,507	\$ 834,917.57	\$ 1,002,302.00
Transportation Safety Specialist	3520_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,829.80	\$ 5,798	\$ 125,574.75	\$ 150,750.00
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	29.0	\$ 2,823.93	\$ 3,390	\$ 2,129,246.29	\$ 2,556,118.00
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	21.0	\$ 2,546.22	\$ 3,057	\$ 1,390,238.68	\$ 1,668,954.00
Planner I	5277_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,135.25	\$ 3,764	\$ 81,516.55	\$ 97,859.00
Executive Secretary I	1450_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,157.36	\$ 3,790	\$ 164,182.63	\$ 197,098.00
Senior Transit Information Clerk	3124_C_MTA	5.0	\$ 3,053.01	\$ 3,665	\$ 396,891.18	\$ 476,460.00
Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1222_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,235.18	\$ 3,884	\$ 168,229.35	\$ 201,956.00
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,203.88	\$ 6,247	\$ 135,300.86	\$ 162,426.00
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	4.0	\$ 3,454.52	\$ 4,147	\$ 359,269.57	\$ 431,296.00
Human Services Agency Senior Eligibility W	2905_C	4.0	\$ 3,281.19	\$ 3,939	\$ 341,243.45	\$ 409,656.00
Eligibility Worker Supervisor	2907_C	1.0	\$ 3,637.58	\$ 4,367	\$ 94,577.15	\$ 113,538.00
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	7.0	\$ 2,899.10	\$ 3,480	\$ 527,635.53	\$ 633,416.00
Senior Account Clerk	1632	3.0	\$ 2,862.83	\$ 3,437	\$ 223,300.64	\$ 268,068.00
Human Resources Analyst	1241	2.0	\$ 3,931.22	\$ 4,719	\$ 204,423.20	\$ 245,406.00
IT Operations Support Administrator V	1095_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,984.54	\$ 5,984	\$ 129,598.14	\$ 155,580.00
IT Operations Support Administrator II	1092_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,135.25	\$ 3,764	\$ 163,033.09	\$ 195,718.00
Custodian	2708	3.0	\$ 2,408.27	\$ 2,891	\$ 187,844.83	\$ 225,504.00
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					\$ 740,915.24	\$ 889,454.08
Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)					\$ 823,466.56	\$ 988,555.30
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$300/person/year Shoes \$250/year)					\$ 164,450.00	\$ 164,450.00
Other Pay: 7312 (Uniform \$300/person/year Shoes \$250/year)					\$ 12,100.00	\$ 12,100.00
Other Pay: 7410 (Shoes \$250/person/year)					\$ 3,850.00	\$ 3,850.00
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$600/person/year)					\$ 8,400.00	\$ 8,400.00
Other Pay: 9140 (Shoes \$150/person/year)					\$ 1,050.00	\$ 1,050.00
Other Pay: 9139 (Shoes \$150/person/year)					\$ 2,250.00	\$ 2,250.00
Total FTE		443.0				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 33,882,979.72	\$ 40,675,846.00
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 1,756,481.81	\$ 2,070,109.37

FRINGE BENEFITS			
Total Fringe Benefits	Low	High	
	\$ 15,443,369.22	\$ 17,207,267.97	

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years	Low	High
Sedan, 4 door midsize	200	\$ 28,000.00	4	\$ 1,439,620	\$ 1,439,620
Van, Type A, life equipped	49	\$ 56,000.00	4	\$ 705,414	\$ 705,414
Van, Type B, lift equipped	64	\$ 60,000.00	4	\$ 987,168	\$ 987,168
Minivans, ramp equipped	25	\$ 45,000.00	4	\$ 289,209	\$ 289,209
2 way radios	338	\$ 50.00	4	\$ 4,345	\$ 4,345
Mobile Data Computers	200	\$ 1,900.00	4	\$ 97,689	\$ 97,689
Fuel: (Est miles per gal is 5.9 at \$3.57 per gallon)				\$ 1,495,103	\$ 1,495,103
Parts (Est at \$2,467 per vehicle)				\$ 857,444	\$ 857,444
Computer Supplies, maintenance, hosting, "Trapeze" system				\$ 210,658	\$ 210,658
CabConnect				\$ 401,370	\$ 401,370
Claims Est.				\$ 1,321,436	\$ 1,586,358
Total Capital & Operating				\$ 7,809,456	\$ 8,074,377

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 58,892,286.32	\$ 68,027,600.70
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 34,163,635.25	\$ 34,212,457.27
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 24,728,651	\$ 33,815,143
% of Savings to City Cost	42%	50%

