



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller

Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

April 30, 2022

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation  
Municipal Transportation Agency  
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Parking Meter Collections – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

---

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Kamini Lall, Budget Manager  
Ben Becker, Financial Analyst

SFMTA - Streets  
Parking Meter Collections

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager IV, MTA	9174_C_MTA	0	5,676	6,814	37,039	44,465
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	1	5,264	6,320	137,403	164,950
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1	4,892	5,873	127,683	153,281
Principal Fare Collections Receiver	9117_C_MTA	5	3,789	4,548	494,415	593,535
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116_C_MTA	12	3,009	3,613	942,543	1,131,504
Fare Collections Receiver	9110_C_MTA	16	2,601	3,122	1,086,112	1,303,856
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			80,059	96,109
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			50,002	58,136
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		35				
Total Salary Costs--->					2,955,256	3,391,591
Total of Other Compensation--->					130,061	154,246

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9174_C_MTA	66034	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9177_C_MTA	63536	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1824_C_MTA	56125	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9117_C_MTA	47599	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9116_C_MTA	41146	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9110_C_MTA	37763	
Total Fringe Benefits			
		Low	High
		\$ 1,314,580.96	\$ 1,472,124.50

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Rent	\$ 86,730	\$ 86,730
Utilities	\$ 12,390	\$ 12,390
Uniform	\$ 15,333	\$ 15,333
Vehicles	\$ 73,708	\$ 73,708
Radios	\$ 20,444	\$ 20,444
Gas	\$ 41,300	\$ 41,300
Overhead (99.2% of salary and benefits)	\$ 4,364,699	\$ 4,977,817
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 4,614,603	\$ 5,227,721

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	9,014,502	10,245,682
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	4,523,714	4,541,597
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 4,490,788	\$ 5,704,085
% of Savings to City Cost	50%	56%

SFMTA - Streets  
Meter Collections

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager IV, MTA	9174_C_MTA	0.3	\$ 5,815	\$ 6,980	\$ 37,941	\$ 45,548
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,393	\$ 6,474	\$ 140,750.34	\$ 168,968.00
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,011	\$ 6,016	\$ 130,793.50	\$ 157,015.00
Principal Fare Collections Receiver	9117_C_MTA	5.0	\$ 3,881	\$ 4,659	\$ 506,459.84	\$ 607,995.00
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116_C_MTA	12.0	\$ 3,083	\$ 3,701	\$ 965,503.64	\$ 1,159,068.00
Fare Collections Receiver	9110_C_MTA	16.0	\$ 2,664	\$ 3,198	\$ 1,112,568.13	\$ 1,335,616.00
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			82,009	98,450
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			51,220	59,553
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		35.3				
Total Salary Costs-->					2,894,017	3,474,210
Total of Other Compensation-->					133,230	158,003

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9174_C_MTA	61426	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9177_C_MTA	59378	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1824_C_MTA	52048	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9117_C_MTA	44622	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9116_C_MTA	38979	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9110_C_MTA	36020	
Total Fringe Benefits			\$ 1,249,470.35 \$ 1,393,960.50

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Rent	\$ 86,377	\$ 86,377
Utilities	\$ 12,340	\$ 12,340
Uniform	\$ 15,270	\$ 15,270
Vehicles	\$ 73,408	\$ 73,408
Radios	\$ 20,360	\$ 20,360
Gas	\$ 41,132	\$ 41,132
Overhead (99.2% of salary and benefits)	\$ 4,242,503	\$ 4,985,964
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 4,491,391	\$ 5,234,852

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	8,768,107	10,261,025
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	4,612,655	4,630,500
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 4,155,452	\$ 5,630,524
% of Savings to City Cost	47%	55%