



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 30, 2022

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Security Services – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Kamini Lall, Budget Manager
Ben Becker, Financial Analyst

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Client Manager	9172_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,904	\$ 5,887	127,998	153,659
ADA Observer	8202_C	4.0	\$ 2,614.63	\$ 3,139	272,967	327,692
Badging Clerk	1406_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 2,819.31	\$ 3,385	73,584	88,336
Administrative Support	1408_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,070.48	\$ 3,686	80,140	96,206
Video Surveillance Supervisor	1410_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,519.44	\$ 4,225	91,857	110,273
Video Surveillance Assistants	1408_C_MTA	15.0	\$ 3,070.48	\$ 3,686	1,202,094	1,443,090
Security Operations Coordinator	8202_C	1.0	\$ 2,614.63	\$ 3,139	68,242	81,923
Field Supervisor	8202_C	5.2	\$ 2,614.63	\$ 3,139	354,858	425,999
Armed Security Guards	8202_C	15.0	\$ 2,614.63	\$ 3,139	1,023,628	1,228,845
Unarmed Security Guards	8202_C	75.0	\$ 2,614.63	\$ 3,139	5,118,138	6,144,223
Overtime Pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					166,244	199,573
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					220,440	264,634
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay (if applicable)						
Total FTE		119.2				
Total Salary Costs-->					8,413,505	10,100,246
Total of Other Compensation-->					386,684	464,206

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 9172_C_MTA	61350
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8202_C	37877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1406_C_MTA	39572
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1408_C_MTA	41651
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1410_C_MTA	45368
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1408_C_MTA	41651
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8202_C	37877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8202_C	37877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8202_C	37877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8202_C	37877
Total Fringe Benefits	
	Low High
	4,137,064 4,608,005

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years
MTA Transit Overhead of 52.3% of salary + benefits			6,563,948 7,692,415
Total Capital & Operating			6,563,948 7,692,415

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	19,501,201	22,864,873
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	9,497,555	9,528,704
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 10,003,646	\$ 13,336,169
% of Savings to City Cost	51%	58%

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Client Manager	3172_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,043	\$ 6,054	131,116	157,402	
ADA Observer	8202_C	4.0	\$ 2,688.64	\$ 3,228	279,618	335,676	
Badging Clerk	1406_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 2,899.10	\$ 3,480	75,377	90,488	
Administrative Support	1408_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,157.36	\$ 3,790	82,091	98,549	
Video Surveillance Supervisor	1410_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,619.03	\$ 4,345	94,095	112,959	
Video Surveillance Assistants	1408_C_MTA	15.0	\$ 3,157.36	\$ 3,790	1,231,370	1,478,235	
Security Operations Coordinator	8202_C	1.0	\$ 2,688.64	\$ 3,228	69,905	83,919	
Field Supervisor	8202_C	5.2	\$ 2,688.64	\$ 3,228	363,504	436,379	
Armed Security Guards	8202_C	15.0	\$ 2,688.64	\$ 3,228	1,048,569	1,258,787	
Unarmed Security Guards	8202_C	75.0	\$ 2,688.64	\$ 3,228	5,242,846	6,293,933	
Overtime Pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)						170,295	204,435
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)						225,811	271,081
Overtime Pay (if applicable)							
Other Pay (if applicable)							
Total FTE		119.2					
Total Salary Costs-->						\$ 8,618,490.77	\$ 10,346,327.46
Total of Other Compensation-->						\$ 396,105.16	\$ 475,516.40

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	172_C_MTA \$ 57,585	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202_C \$ 36,119	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	406_C_MTA \$ 37,601	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	408_C_MTA \$ 39,421	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	410_C_MTA \$ 42,673	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	408_C_MTA \$ 39,421	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202_C \$ 36,119	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202_C \$ 36,119	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202_C \$ 36,119	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202_C \$ 36,119	
Total Fringe Benefits		Low \$ 3,953,600 High \$ 4,387,759

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years
MTA Transit Overhead of 52.3% of salary + benefits			\$ 6,575,203 \$ 7,705,927
Total Capital & Operating			\$ 6,575,203 \$ 7,705,927

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 19,543,399	\$ 22,915,531
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 9,645,997	\$ 9,667,829
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 9,897,402	\$ 13,247,701
% of Savings to City Cost	51%	58%