



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller

Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

May 1, 2022

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation  
Municipal Transportation Agency  
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Transit Shelter Cleaning – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

---

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Kamini Lall, Budget Manager  
Ben Becker, Fiscal Analyst

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
**FISCAL YEAR 2022-23**

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
General Laborer	7514_C_MTA	4.7	\$ 2,646	\$ 3,176	324,534	389,597
Track Maintenance Worker	7540_C_MTA	4.7	\$ 2,699.75	\$ 3,241	331,178	397,573
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					13,871	16,652
Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)					18,560	22,281
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay:						
Total FTE		9.4				
Total Salary Costs--->					\$ 655,713	\$ 787,170
Total of Other Compensation--->					\$ 32,431	\$ 38,933

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7514_C_MTA 38,154		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7540_C_MTA 38,604		
Total Fringe Benefits		324,062	360,763

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years
Materials & Supplies		\$ 158,947	\$ 158,947
Safety Equipment		\$ 5,679	\$ 5,679
Vehicle Maintenance		\$ 1,136	\$ 1,136
Overhead at 59.4% of salaries and benefits		\$ 601,250	\$ 704,998
Total Capital & Operating		\$ 767,012	\$ 870,760

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	1,779,218	2,057,625
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	451,913	455,160
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<u>\$ 1,327,305</u>	<u>\$ 1,602,465</u>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	75%	78%

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
 FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
General Laborer	7514_C_MTA	4.7	\$ 2,720	\$ 3,266	331,356	397,786
Track Maintenance Worker	7540_C_MTA	4.7	\$ 2,776.16	\$ 3,333	338,142	405,933
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					14,162	17,002
Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)					18,950	22,749
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay:						
Total FTE		9.4				
Total Salary Costs-->					669,498	803,719
Total of Other Compensation-->					33,113	39,751

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7514_C_MTA	36,364	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7540_C_MTA	36,756	
Total Fringe Benefits		308,830	342,567

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years
Materials & Supplies		\$ 158,301	\$ 158,301
Safety Equipment		\$ 5,656	\$ 5,656
Vehicle Maintenance		\$ 1,131	\$ 1,131
Overhead at 59.4% of salaries and benefits		\$ 600,796	\$ 704,506
Total Capital & Operating		\$ 765,883	\$ 869,594

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	1,777,324	2,055,631
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	464,961	468,152
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,312,363	\$ 1,587,479
% of Savings to City Cost	74%	77%