



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 28, 2022

Charles Perl, Deputy Chief Financial Officer
San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
525 Golden Gate Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Laura Busch, Budget Director

RE: Contracting for Security Services – FY 2022-23 and FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contracted services referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-2024 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

_____/s/
Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

**San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
Security Services**

**COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23**

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	1.0	\$ 2,615	\$ 3,139	68,242	81,923
Security Guard (1800 Oakdale/SECF)	8202	2.0	\$ 2,615	\$ 3,139	136,484	163,846
Security Guard As-Needed M-F (1800 Oak)	8202	0.5	2,615	3,139	34,121	40,961
Security Guard As-Needed Sa-Su (1800 O)	8202	0.7	2,615	3,139	47,769	57,346
Security Guard (750 Phelps/SEP)	8202	6.0	2,615	3,139	409,451	491,538
Security Guard As-Needed (750 Phelps/SE)	8202	0.5	2,615	3,139	34,121	40,961
Security Guard - Saturday (750 Phelps/SE)	8202	0.2	2,615	3,139	13,648	16,385
Security Guard (3500 Great Highway/OSP)	8202	5.0	2,615	3,139	341,209	409,615
Security Guard As-Needed (3500 Great Hi)	8202	0.5	2,615	3,139	34,121	40,961
Security Guard - Saturday (3500 Great Hig	8202	0.2	2,615	3,139	13,648	16,385
Security Guard (1601 Griffith/Griffith Yard)	8202	4.0	2,615	3,139	272,967	327,692
Security Guard As-Needed (1601 Griffith/C	8202	0.5	2,615	3,139	34,121	40,961
Administrator/Manager	0931	1.0	5,498	6,600	143,493	172,260
Overtime Pay	n/a	n/a	980	1,177	25,591	30,721
Total FTE		22.1				
Total Salary Costs-->					1,583,395	1,900,835
Total of Other Compensation-->					25,591	30,721

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931 66,439
Total Fringe Benefits	Low 776,446 High 865,649

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Two-way radios (1 per shift/location) - Four (4) needed.	10,008	10,008
Uniforms (\$800 per year per person) - Fifteen (21) needed.	16,800	16,800
Total Capital & Operating	26,808	26,808

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	2,412,240	2,824,013
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	1,282,233	1,311,056
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	1,130,007	1,512,957
% of Savings to City Cost	47%	54%

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	1.0	\$ 2,689	\$ 3,228	69,905	83,919
Security Guard (1800 Oakdale/SECF)	8202	2.0	\$ 2,689	\$ 3,228	139,809	167,838
Security Guard As-Needed M-F (1800 Oak	8202	0.5	2,689	3,228	34,952	41,960
Security Guard As-Needed Sa-Su (1800 O	8202	0.7	2,689	3,228	48,933	58,743
Security Guard (750 Phelps/SEP)	8202	6.0	2,689	3,228	419,428	503,515
Security Guard As-Needed (750 Phelps/SE	8202	0.5	2,689	3,228	34,952	41,960
Security Guard - Saturday (750 Phelps/SEI	8202	0.2	2,689	3,228	13,981	16,784
Security Guard (3500 Great Highway/OSP	8202	5.0	2,689	3,228	349,523	419,596
Security Guard As-Needed (3500 Great Hi	8202	0.5	2,689	3,228	34,952	41,960
Security Guard - Saturday (3500 Great Hi	8202	0.2	2,689	3,228	13,981	16,784
Security Guard (1601 Griffith/Griffith Yard)	8202	4.0	2,689	3,228	279,618	335,676
Security Guard As-Needed (1601 Griffith/C	8202	0.5	2,689	3,228	34,952	41,960
Administrator/Manager	0931	1.0	5,837	7,007	151,757	182,181
Overtime Pay	n/a	n/a	1,008	1,210	26,214	31,470
Total FTE		22.1				
Total Salary Costs-->					1,626,745	1,952,875
Total of Other Compensation-->					26,214	31,470

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931 66,439
Total Fringe Benefits	Low High 745,550 828,558

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Two-way radios (1 per shift/location) - Four (4) needed.	10,008	10,008
Uniforms (\$800 per year per person) - Fifteen (21) needed.	16,800	16,800
	-	-
	-	-
Total Capital & Operating	26,808	26,808

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	2,425,316	2,839,711
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	1,281,188	1,310,869
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	1,144,129	1,528,842
% of Savings to City Cost	47%	54%