



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

April 28, 2022

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director  
San Francisco International Airport  
International Terminal, 5th Floor  
P.O. Box 8097  
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Denise Payton, Director of Budget and Capital Planning

RE: Contracting for Airport Information Booth & Guest Assistance – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_  
/s/

Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Shirley West, Principal Budget Analyst

Airport Commission  
 Airport Information and Guest Assistance Services  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
 FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Training Officer	1232	0.5	\$ 4,109	\$ 4,932	\$ 53,618	\$ 64,367
Customer Service Representative	1304	54.1	\$ 3,117	\$ 3,742	\$ 4,400,942	\$ 5,283,244
Customer Service Representative Supervis	1306	5.0	\$ 3,528	\$ 4,235	\$ 460,403	\$ 552,705
Management Assistant	1842	7.0	\$ 3,337	\$ 4,006	\$ 609,651	\$ 731,874
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.7	\$ 3,824	\$ 4,591	\$ 169,683	\$ 203,701
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 180,684	\$ 216,908
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 161,177	\$ 193,490
Total FTE		68.3				
Total Salary Costs--->					\$ 5,694,296	\$ 6,835,890
Total of Other Compensation--->					\$ 341,861	\$ 410,398

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1232	50,626	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1304	42,873	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1306	46,397	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1842	43,856	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844	47,888	
Total Fringe Benefits		2,641,046	2,965,132

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Office Equipment and Technical Support	\$ 46,552	\$ 46,552
Reward and Recognition	\$ 10,000	\$ 10,000
Uniform and Dry Cleaning	\$ 70,000	\$ 70,000
ADM Guest Support Supplies	\$ 15,000	\$ 15,000
Fringe Benefit	\$ 5,000	\$ 5,000
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 146,552	\$ 146,552

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	8,823,756	10,357,971
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	6,014,527	6,021,659
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<u>\$ 2,809,229</u>	<u>\$ 4,336,312</u>
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	32%	42%

Airport Commission  
 Airport Information and Guest Assistance Services  
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
 FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

**ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

**PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Training Officer	1232	0.5	\$ 4,227	\$ 5,074	\$ 54,945.93	\$ 65,961.50
Customer Service Representative	1304	54.1	3,229	3,877	\$ 4,542,311.85	\$ 5,452,955.40
Customer Service Representative Supervisor	1306	5.0	3,655	4,388	\$ 475,189.02	\$ 570,455.00
Management Assistant	1842	7.0	3,432	4,120	\$ 624,541.08	\$ 749,749.19
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.7	\$ 3,933	\$ 4,721	\$ 173,838	\$ 208,689
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 186,285.81	\$ 223,632.42
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 166,173.72	\$ 199,488.25
Total FTE		68.3				
Total Salary Costs--->					\$ 5,870,825	\$ 7,047,810
Total of Other Compensation--->					\$ 352,460	\$ 423,121

**FRINGE BENEFITS**

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1232	\$ 47,369	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1,304	\$ 40,827	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1,306	\$ 43,956	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1842	\$ 41,352	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844	\$ 44,884	
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 2,518,463	\$ 2,817,973

**ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS**

Office Equipment and Technical Support	\$ 46,552	\$ 46,552
Reward and Recognition	\$ 10,000	\$ 10,000
Uniform and Dry Cleaning	\$ 70,000	\$ 70,000
ADM Guest Support Supplies	\$ 15,000	\$ 15,000
Fringe Benefit	\$ 5,000	\$ 5,000
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 146,552	\$ 146,552

**COST COMPARISON SUMMARY**

<b>ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST</b>	\$ 8,888,300	\$ 10,435,455
<b>LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST</b>	\$ 6,014,478	\$ 6,021,599
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	\$ 2,873,822	\$ 4,413,855
<b>% of Savings to City Cost</b>	32%	42%