



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**  
**CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

Ben Rosenfield  
Controller  
Todd Rydstrom  
Deputy Controller

April 29, 2022

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director  
San Francisco International Airport  
International Terminal, 5th Floor  
P.O. Box 8097  
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Denise Payton, Director of Budget and Capital Planning

RE: Contracting for Airport Parking Services – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2022-23 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at [Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org](mailto:Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org) if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

\_\_\_\_\_/s/  
Ben Rosenfield,  
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst  
Human Resources, Employee Relations  
Shirley West, Principal Budget Analyst

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Manager IV	0932	1.0	\$ 6,092	\$ 7,314	\$ 159,006	\$ 190,884	
Manager II	0923	2.0	5,263	6,319	\$ 274,746	\$ 329,827	
Manager I	0922	1.0	4,903	5,886	\$ 127,971	\$ 153,626	
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	5,061	6,075	\$ 132,084	\$ 158,564	
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.0	3,824	4,591	\$ 99,813	\$ 119,824	
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	3,145	3,776	\$ 82,090	\$ 98,547	
Clerk	1404	1.0	2,241	2,691	\$ 58,499	\$ 70,227	
Senior Clerk	1406	4.0	2,819	3,384	\$ 294,313	\$ 353,317	
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	3,070	3,686	\$ 80,128	\$ 96,192	
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	3,337	4,006	\$ 87,093	\$ 104,553	
Accountant II	1652	1.0	3,359	4,033	\$ 87,682	\$ 105,260	
Collection Supervisor	4366	1.0	3,346	4,016	\$ 87,323	\$ 104,829	
Investigator, Tax Collector	4334	2.0	3,731	4,479	\$ 194,759	\$ 233,804	
Customer Service Agent Sup	1326	19.0	3,461	4,155	\$ 1,716,264	\$ 2,060,341	
Customer Service Agent	1324	2.5	3,057	3,670	\$ 199,485	\$ 239,478	
Cashier III	4322	35.0	2,800	3,361	\$ 2,557,360	\$ 3,070,060	
Electronic Maintenance Tech	7318	1.0	4,473	5,370	\$ 116,752	\$ 140,158	
Stationary Engineer	7334	2.0	3,654	4,387	\$ 190,758	\$ 229,001	
Chief Stationary Engineer	7205	1.0	4,636	5,565	\$ 120,995	\$ 145,252	
Sheriff's Lieutenant	8310	1.0	5,768	6,925	\$ 150,557	\$ 180,741	
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	3.0	4,917	5,903	\$ 385,003	\$ 462,189	
Building & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	54.0	2,614	3,138	\$ 3,684,174	\$ 4,422,778	
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,841	3,410	\$ 74,145	\$ 89,010	
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	3.0	2,577	3,094	\$ 201,773	\$ 242,225	
Custodian	2708	39.0	2,342	2,811	\$ 2,383,839	\$ 2,861,751	
					\$ -	\$ -	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			429,844	516,020	
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			383,437	460,308	
Total FTE		179.5					
					Total Salary Costs-->	\$ 13,546,611	\$ 16,262,439
					Total of Other Compensation-->	\$ 813,281	\$ 976,328

FRINGE BENEFITS

	Low	High
Total Fringe Benefits	\$ 6,479,951	\$ 7,239,260

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Operating Expenses	\$ 1,172,536	\$ 1,172,536
Credit Card Processing Fees and remote airline check in	\$ 3,002,461	\$ 3,502,461
Training	\$ 300,000	\$ 300,000
Parking/Billing Technology	\$ 300,000	\$ 300,000
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 4,774,997	\$ 5,274,997

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 25,614,841	\$ 29,753,024
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 22,950,804	\$ 27,196,467
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 2,664,037	\$ 2,556,557
% of Savings to City Cost	10%	9%

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager IV	0932	1.0	\$ 6,265	\$ 7,521	\$ 162,895	\$ 195,552
Manager II	0923	2.0	5,413	6,499	281,499	337,934
Manager I	0922	1.0	5,043	6,054	131,115	157,401
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	5,204	6,247	135,301	162,426
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.0	3,933	4,721	102,257	122,758
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	3,235	3,884	84,115	100,978
Clerk	1404	1.0	2,305	2,767	59,924	71,938
Senior Clerk	1406	4.0	2,899	3,480	301,506	361,952
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	3,157	3,790	82,091	98,549
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	3,432	4,120	89,220	107,107
Accountant II	1652	1.0	3,455	4,147	89,817	107,824
Collection Supervisor	4366	1.0	3,440	4,130	89,449	107,382
Investigator, Tax Collector	4334	2.0	3,837	4,606	199,504	239,500
Customer Service Agent Sup	1326	19.0	3,559	4,272	1,758,079	2,110,539
Customer Service Agent	1324	2.5	3,144	3,774	204,366	245,338
Cashier III	4322	35.0	2,879	3,456	2,619,664	3,144,855
Electronic Maintenance Tech	7318	1.0	4,600	5,522	119,595	143,572
Stationary Engineer	7334	2.0	3,758	4,511	195,408	234,584
Chief Stationary Engineer	7205	1.0	4,767	5,723	123,942	148,790
Sheriff's Lieutenant	8310	1.0	5,932	7,121	154,225	185,144
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	3.0	5,076	6,093	395,899	475,269
Building & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	54.0	2,689	3,228	3,774,843	4,531,625
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,921	3,507	75,947	91,173
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	3.0	2,650	3,181	206,677	248,112
Custodian	2708	39.0	2,408	2,891	2,441,973	2,931,540
					\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			440,401	528,693
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			392,854	471,613
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
<b>Total FTE</b>		<b>179.5</b>				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 13,879,313	\$ 16,661,840
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 833,255	\$ 1,000,306

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	Low	High
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 6,181,343	\$ 6,880,787

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Operating Expenses	\$ 1,172,536	\$ 1,172,536
Credit Card Processing Fees and remote airline check in	\$ 3,002,461	\$ 3,002,461
Training	\$ 300,000	\$ 300,000
Parking/Billing Technology	\$ 300,000	\$ 300,000
<b>Total Capital &amp; Operating</b>	<b>\$ 4,774,997</b>	<b>\$ 4,774,997</b>

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 25,668,908	\$ 29,317,931
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 25,459,323	\$ 27,195,799
<b>ESTIMATED SAVINGS</b>	<b>\$ 209,585</b>	<b>\$ 2,122,132</b>
% of Savings to City Cost	1%	7%