



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 29, 2022

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director
San Francisco International Airport
International Terminal, 5th Floor
P.O. Box 8097
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Denise Payton, Director of Budget and Capital Planning

RE: Contracting for Airport Shuttle Services – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023 -24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

_____/s/_____
Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Shirley West, Principal Budget Analyst

Airport Commission
 109699 - AIR Operations & Security
 Airport Shuttle Bus Service
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
 FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS							
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost		
			Low	High	Low	High	
Transit Operators	9163	64.0	\$ 2,755	\$ 3,307	\$ 4,601,892	\$ 5,524,480	
Transit Supervisor	9139	5.0	3,777	4,535	\$ 492,953	\$ 591,780	
Transit Manager II	9141	2.0	5,037	6,047	\$ 262,955	\$ 315,672	
Transit Manager I	9140	1.0	4,461	5,356	\$ 116,438	\$ 139,781	
Automotive Mechanic	7381	5.0	3,383	4,061	\$ 441,436	\$ 529,935	
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	2.0	2,601	3,122	\$ 135,764	\$ 162,982	
Transit Spotter	7454	4.0	1,941	2,330	\$ 202,659	\$ 243,288	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 30,353	\$ 36,439	
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 27,076	\$ 32,505	
Total FTE		83.0					
					Total Salary Costs--->	\$ 6,254,096	\$ 7,507,918
					Total of Other Compensation--->	\$ 57,430	\$ 68,943

FRINGE BENEFITS			
Job Class		\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9163	\$ 40,242	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9139	\$ 49,200	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9141	\$ 58,335	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9140	\$ 54,188	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7381	\$ 46,289	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9102	\$ 37,763	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7454	\$ 33,475	
Total Fringe Benefits			
		Low	High
		\$ 3,067,785	\$ 3,433,217
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS			
Operating costs: Fuel, Lubricants and Utilities, maintenance, worker's comp		\$ 1,752,400	\$ 1,752,400
Unanticipated Operational Expenses		\$ 140,749	\$ 140,749
Emergency Contingency		\$ 322,038	\$ 644,076
Total Capital & Operating		2,215,187	2,537,225

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	11,594,498	13,547,304
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	9,736,615	9,737,989
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,857,883	\$ 3,809,315
% of Savings to City Cost	16%	28%

Airport Commission
 109699 - AIR Operations & Security
 Airport Shuttle Bus Service
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
 FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Transit Operators	9163	64.0	\$ 2,833	\$ 3,401	\$ 4,714,167	\$ 5,659,264
Transit Supervisor	9139	5.0	3,884	4,663	\$ 504,964.60	\$ 606,200.00
Transit Manager II	9141	2.0	5,180	6,219	\$ 269,360.55	\$ 323,362.00
Transit Manager I	9140	1.0	4,587	5,507	\$ 119,273.94	\$ 143,186.00
Automotive Mechanic	7381	5.0	3,478	4,176	\$ 452,189.89	\$ 542,845.00
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	2.0	2,674	3,211	\$ 139,071.02	\$ 166,952.00
Transit Spotter	7454	4.0	1,996	2,396	\$ 207,596.93	\$ 249,216.00
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 31,092.83	\$ 37,326.33
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 27,735.94	\$ 33,296.45
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		83.0				
Total Salary Costs--->					\$ 6,406,623.83	\$ 7,691,025.00
Total of Other Compensation--->					\$ 58,828.77	\$ 70,622.78

FRINGE BENEFITS		
Job Class		\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9163	\$ 38,419
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9139	\$ 46,333
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9141	\$ 54,174
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9140	\$ 50,593
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7381	\$ 43,866
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9102	\$ 36,020
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7454	\$ 31,843
Total Fringe Benefits		
		Low
		High
		\$ 2,930,295.60
		\$ 3,268,163.99

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Operating costs: Fuel, Lubricants and Utilities, maintenance, worker's comp	\$ 1,783,008	\$ 1,783,008
Unanticipated Operational Expenses	\$ 143,208	\$ 143,208
Emergency Contingency	\$ 322,038	\$ 644,076
Total Capital & Operating	2,248,253	2,570,291

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 11,644,002	\$ 13,600,103
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 9,890,569	\$ 9,891,894
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,753,432	\$ 3,708,209
% of Savings to City Cost	15%	27%