

File No. 220493

Committee Item No. 4

Board Item No. _____

COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST

Committee: Budget and Appropriations Committee Date May 25, 2022

Board of Supervisors Meeting Date _____

Cmte Board

- | | | |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Motion |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Resolution |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Ordinance |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Legislative Digest |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Budget and Legislative Analyst Report |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Youth Commission Report |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Introduction Form |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Department/Agency Cover Letter and/or Report |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | MOU |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Grant Information Form |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Grant Budget |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Subcontract Budget |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Contract/Agreement |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Form 126 – Ethics Commission |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Award Letter |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Application |
| <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | Public Correspondence |

OTHER (Use back side if additional space is needed)

- | | | |
|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|---|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <u>Controller Certification Letter - MTA Citations 4/30/2022</u> |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <u>Controller Certification Letter - MTA Towing - 4/20/2022</u> |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <u>Controller Certification Letter - MTA Paratransit Services 043022</u> |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <u>Controller Certification Ltr - MTA Parking Meter Collections 4/30/2022</u> |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <u>Controller Certification Letter - MTA Security Svcs - 4/30/2022</u> |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <u>Controller Cert Ltr - MTA Transit Shelter Cleaning Services 050122</u> |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <u>Controller Cert Ltr - All PUC Contracted Security Services 042822</u> |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <u>Controller Certification Letter - PRT Janitorial 4/27/2022</u> |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <u>Controller Certification Letter - PRT Security 4/27/2022</u> |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <u>Controller Certification Letter - AIR Guest Services 4/28/2022</u> |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <u>Controller Certification Letter - AIR Parking Services 4/29/2022</u> |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <u>Controller Certification Letter - AIR Security Services 4/28/2022</u> |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <u>Controller Certification Letter - AIR Shuttle Services 4/29/2022</u> |

Completed by: Brent Jalipa Date May 20, 2022

Completed by: Brent Jalipa Date _____

1 [Proposition J Contract Certification Contracted-Out Department Services Previously Approved]

2
3 **Resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that department services**
4 **previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than**
5 **similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services:**
6 **security, information and guest services, parking operations, shuttle bus services**
7 **(Airport); citations, paratransit, parking meter collections, security, towing, transit**
8 **shelter cleaning services (Municipal Transportation Agency); janitorial and security**
9 **services (Port); and security services (Public Utilities Commission).**

10
11 WHEREAS, The Electorate of the City and County of San Francisco passed
12 Proposition J in November 1976, allowing City and County Departments to contract with
13 private companies for specific services that can be performed for a lower cost than similar
14 work by City and County employees (Charter, Section 10.104.15); and

15 WHEREAS, The City has previously approved outside contracts for the services
16 listed below; and

17 WHEREAS, The Controller has determined that a Purchaser's award of a contract for
18 the services listed below to a private contractor will continue to achieve cost savings for the
19 City; and

20 WHEREAS, The City and County of San Francisco has a Charter obligation to enact a
21 balanced budget each fiscal year; and

22 WHEREAS, The Controller's certification, which confirms that said services can be
23 performed at lower costs to the City and County by private contractor than by employees of
24 the City and County, is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 220493,
25

which is hereby declared to be part of this Resolution as if set forth fully herein; now,
therefore be it;

RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors hereby concurs with the Controller's certification, and approves the Proposition J Resolution concerning the Purchaser's award of a contract to a private contractor for the services listed below for the period of July 1, 2022, through June 30, 2023, and for the period of July 1, 2023, through June 30, 2024 for the Airport, Municipal Transportation Agency, Port, and Public Utilities Commission.

Fiscal Year 2022-2023

	City Cost	Contract Cost		
Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
Airport (AIR)				
Information and Guest Services	10,357,971	6,021,659	4,336,312	68.3
Security Services	6,373,266	3,440,679	2,932,587	48.1
Parking Operations	29,753,024	27,196,467	2,556,557	179.5
Shuttle Bus	13,547,304	9,737,989	3,809,315	83.0
Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA)				
Citations Processing	25,884,943	6,301,465	19,583,478	77.9
Towing Services	28,338,607	13,437,588	14,901,019	91.3
Paratransit Services	68,185,611	33,386,414	34,799,197	443.0
Parking Meter Services	10,245,682	4,541,597	5,704,085	35.0
Security Services	22,864,873	9,528,704	13,336,169	119.2
Transit Shelter Cleaning Services	2,057,625	455,160	1,602,465	9.4

Port (PRT)

1		City Cost	Contract Cost		
2	Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
3	Security Services	3,627,243	1,198,580	2,428,663	24.0
4	Janitorial Services	868,608	665,934	202,674	7.0
5	Public Utilities Commission (PUC)				
6	Security Services	2,824,013	1,311,056	1,512,957	22.1
7					
8					
9					
10	Fiscal Year 2023-2024				
11					
12		City Cost	Contract Cost		
13	Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
14	Airport (AIR)				
15	Information and Guest Services	10,435,455	6,021,599	4,413,855	68.3
16	Security Services	6,400,973	3,891,281	2,509,692	48.1
17	Parking Operations	29,317,931	27,196,799	2,122,132	179.5
18	Shuttle Bus	13,600,103	9,891,894	3,708,209	83.0
19	Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA)				
20	Citations Processing	17,754,007	6,301,271	11,452,735	59.0
21	Towing Services	28,498,350	14,058,705	14,439,645	91.3
22	Paratransit Services	68,027,600	34,212,457	33,815,143	443.0
23	Parking Meter Services	10,261,025	4,630,500	5,630,524	35.3
24	Security Services	22,915,531	9,667,829	13,247,701	119.2
25					

	City Cost	Contract Cost		
Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
Transit Shelter Cleaning Services	2,055,631	468,152	1,587,479	9.4
Port (PRT)				
Security Services	3,653,877	1,202,524	2,451,353	24.0
Janitorial Services	945,881	685,056	260,825	7.0
Public Utilities Commission (PUC)				
Security Services	2,839,711	1,310,869	1,528,842	22.1



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 30, 2022

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Citation Services – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Kamini Lall, Budget Manager
Ben Becker, Financial Analyst

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
IS Business Analyst	1052_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 4,017	\$ 4,822	209,663	251,696
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,226	\$ 5,073	110,286	132,396
IT Operations Support Administrator III	1093_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,706	\$ 4,449	96,728	116,120
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	2.4	\$ 4,504	\$ 5,407	279,429	335,449
IS Engineer-Senior	1043_C_MTA	4.7	\$ 5,517	\$ 6,623	678,498	814,523
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	5.3	\$ 6,392	\$ 7,674	891,930	1,070,744
IS Programmer Analyst	1062_C	4.0	\$ 3,468	\$ 4,163	359,264	431,290
IS Programmer Analyst-Senior	1063_C	4.4	\$ 4,216	\$ 5,061	486,856	584,461
IS Programmer Analyst-Principal	1064_C	3.3	\$ 5,283	\$ 6,342	458,964	550,977
IS Project Director	1070_C_MTA	0.5	\$ 6,392	\$ 7,674	81,399	97,718
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	11.2	\$ 2,241	\$ 2,691	653,725	784,784
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	5.2	\$ 3,070	\$ 3,686	415,795	499,153
Account Clerk	1630_C	3.1	\$ 2,405	\$ 2,887	195,369	234,536
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	9.3	\$ 3,146	\$ 3,777	766,875	920,619
Senior Management Assistant	1844_C_MTA	6.2	\$ 3,825	\$ 4,592	621,521	746,124
Cashier II	4321_C	8.0	\$ 2,496	\$ 2,996	524,320	629,436
Cashier III	4322_C	6.1	\$ 2,800	\$ 3,361	442,285	530,954
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	0.1	\$ 5,264	\$ 6,320	13,740	16,495
Total FTE		77.9			7,286,647	8,747,476
			Total Salary Costs-->			

FRINGE BENEFITS		
Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1052_C_MTA	49,882
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1823_C_MTA	51,609
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1093_C_MTA	47,313
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1094_C_MTA	53,231
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1043_C_MTA	59,986
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1044_C_MTA	65,386
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1062_C	45,345
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1063_C	51,524
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1064_C	58,627
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1070_C_MTA	65,386
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1404_C_MTA	34,785
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1408_C_MTA	41,651
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1630_C	36,133
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1634_C_MTA	42,278
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844_C_MTA	47,897
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4321_C	36,895
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4322_C	39,408
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9177_C_MTA	63,536
Total Fringe Benefits		
		Low High
		3,147,771 3,544,611

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS			
\$3,500 workstation x 60=\$210K/5 contract yrs	\$	42,000	\$ 42,000
\$1,000 computers x 60=\$60K/5	\$	12,000	\$ 12,000
\$2,500 tough book laptops x5=\$12.5K/5	\$	2,500	\$ 2,500
\$500 printers x 35=\$17.5K/5	\$	3,500	\$ 3,500
MTA overhead	\$	10,350,943	\$ 12,193,750
Postage	\$	306,340	\$ 360,400
Merchant Fees	\$	654,500	\$ 770,000
Mobile License Recognition Camera Fees	\$	24,120	\$ 24,120
Mis (handheld devices/accessories, data cards)	\$	7,380	\$ 7,380
Handheld Devices	\$	140,905	\$ 140,905
Tickets/Envelopes	\$	36,300	\$ 36,300
Total Capital & Operating	\$	11,580,488	\$ 13,592,855

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	22,014,907	25,884,943
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	6,057,384	6,301,465
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 15,957,523	\$ 19,583,478
% of Savings to City Cost	72%	76%

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
IS Business Analyst	1052_C_MTA	1.9	\$ 4,114	\$ 4,939	208,575	250,391
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,328	\$ 5,196	112,972	135,621
IT Operations Support Administrator	1093_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,796	\$ 4,557	99,085	118,949
IT Operations Support Administrator	1094_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,614	\$ 5,539	120,423	144,566
IS Engineer-Senior	1043_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,652	\$ 6,785	147,512	177,085
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 6,548	\$ 7,860	170,897	205,158
IS Programmer Analyst	1062_C	1.0	\$ 3,552	\$ 4,264	92,715	111,302
IS Programmer Analyst-Senior	1063_C	1.0	\$ 4,320	\$ 5,186	112,743	135,346
IS Programmer Analyst-Principal	1064_C	0.5	\$ 5,416	\$ 6,501	67,956	81,580
IS Project Director	1070_C_MTA	0.1	\$ 6,548	\$ 7,860	24,649	29,590
Clerk	1404_C_MTA	11.2	\$ 2,296	\$ 2,756	672,228	806,997
Principal Clerk	1408_C_MTA	5.2	\$ 3,145	\$ 3,776	427,559	513,276
Account Clerk	1630_C	3.1	\$ 2,463	\$ 2,957	200,917	241,197
Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	9.4	\$ 3,223	\$ 3,869	788,575	946,669
Senior Management Assistant	1844_C_MTA	6.3	\$ 3,918	\$ 4,703	639,109	767,238
Cashier II	4321_C	8.1	\$ 2,557	\$ 3,069	539,158	647,248
Cashier III	4322_C	6.1	\$ 2,868	\$ 3,443	454,803	545,982
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	0.1	\$ 5,393	\$ 6,474	14,075	16,897
Total FTE		59.0				
			Total Salary Costs-->		\$ 4,893,950	\$ 5,875,090

FRINGE BENEFITS		
Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1052_C_MTA	46,691
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1823_C_MTA	48,203
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1093_C_MTA	44,447
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1094_C_MTA	49,519
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1043_C_MTA	55,228
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1044_C_MTA	59,674
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1062_C	42,724
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1063_C	48,140
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1064_C	54,055
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1070_C_MTA	59,674
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1404_C_MTA	33,417
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1408_C_MTA	39,421
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1630_C	34,599
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1634_C_MTA	39,969
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844_C_MTA	44,884
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4321_C	35,260
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	4322_C	37,459
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9177_C_MTA	59,378
Total Fringe Benefits		Low High \$ 2,093,017.20 \$ 2,335,202.00

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
\$3,500 workstation x 60=\$210K/5 contract yrs	\$	42,000 \$ 42,000
\$1,000 computers x 60=\$60K/5	\$	12,000 \$ 12,000
\$2,500 tough book laptops x5=\$12.5K/5	\$	2,500 \$ 2,500
\$500 printers x 35=\$17.5K/5	\$	3,500 \$ 3,500
MTA overhead	\$	6,931,071 \$ 8,144,610
Postage	\$	360,400 \$ 360,400
Merchant Fees	\$	770,000 \$ 770,000
Mobile License Recognition Camera Fees	\$	24,120 \$ 24,120
Mis (handheld devices/accessories, data cards)	\$	7,380 \$ 7,380
Handheld Devices	\$	140,905 \$ 140,905
Tickets/Envelopes	\$	36,300 \$ 36,300
Total Capital & Operating	\$	8,330,176 \$ 9,543,715

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$	15,317,144	\$	17,754,007
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$	6,281,443	\$	6,301,271
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$	9,035,701	\$	11,452,735
% of Savings to City Cost		59%		65%



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 30, 2022

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Towing Services – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Kamini Lall, Budget Manager
Ben Becker, Fiscal Analyst

SFMTA - Streets
Towing

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
1052 IS Business Analyst	1052_C_MTA	0.0	\$ 4,094	\$ 4,915	-	-
1222_C Senior Payroll And Personnel Cler	1222_C_MTA	0.0	\$ 3,176.38	\$ 3,813	-	-
1657_C Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,158.70	\$ 6,193	134,642	161,635
1824_C Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,986.86	\$ 5,987	130,157	156,251
1404_C Clerk	1404_C_MTA	1.6	\$ 2,284.75	\$ 2,743	93,115	111,783
1630_C Account Clerk	1630_C	3.2	\$ 2,451.35	\$ 2,943	207,645	249,273
1634_C Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	6.6	\$ 3,207.08	\$ 3,850	549,229	659,338
1652_C Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,424.52	\$ 4,111	178,760	214,598
1704_C Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	4.2	\$ 2,524.12	\$ 3,030	276,391	331,802
1705_C Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	4.2	\$ 2,799.39	\$ 3,361	306,533	367,987
1844_C Senior Management Assistant	1844_C_MTA	0.0	\$ 3,898.82	\$ 4,680	-	-
4321_C Cashier II	4321_C	1.6	\$ 2,544.26	\$ 3,054	103,691	124,479
4322_C Cashier III	4322_C	1.6	\$ 2,853.78	\$ 3,426	116,306	139,623
1926_C Senior Materials And Supplies Sup	1926_C	1.0	\$ 2,574.10	\$ 3,090	67,184	80,653
1934_C Storekeeper	1934_C_MTA	7.6	\$ 2,500.44	\$ 3,002	496,149	595,617
1936_C Senior Storekeeper	1936_C_MTA	3.0	\$ 2,665.28	\$ 3,200	208,691	250,530
1942_C Assistant Materials Coordinator	1942_C_MTA	0.0	\$ 4,204.83	\$ 5,048	-	-
1952_C Purchaser	1952_C	1.0	\$ 3,631.43	\$ 4,359	94,780	113,782
8202_C Security Guard	8202_C	11.4	\$ 2,665.28	\$ 3,200	792,388	951,246
4308 Senior Collections Officer	4308_C	0.0	\$ 3,167.63	\$ 3,803	-	-
7355_C Truck Driver	7355_C_MTA	31.2	\$ 3,461.35	\$ 4,155	2,821,350	3,386,975
7382_C Automotive Mechanic Assistant Su	7382_C_MTA	0.0	\$ 4,151.31	\$ 4,984	-	-
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,504.20	\$ 5,407	117,560	141,128
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 6,392.05	\$ 7,674	166,832	200,279
Manager IV	9174_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 5,786.45	\$ 6,947	302,052	362,608
7381_C Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	5.2	\$ 3,448.21	\$ 4,140	468,439	562,351
Holiday Pay (if applicable)						
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					29,759	35,725
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay (if applicable)						
Total FTE		91.3				
Total Salary Costs-->					7,631,895	9,161,938
Total of Other Compensation-->					29,759	35,725
FRINGE BENEFITS						
					Low	High
Total Fringe Benefits					3,632,669	4,086,358

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years
Postage+supplies+uniforms			72,772
Specialized Software			404,890
Vehicles - tow trucks (7 year useful life)			579,563
Fuel (15-20 miles/day/truck, assume 20mi/gal at \$5-\$7/gallon)			60,225
Communications: ipad air \$650 + case \$30 + cellular data (\$200/year for 4 years) *32 drivers / useful l			11,840
Utilities			46,189
Lien Fees			133,498
Dolly equipment (2 year useful life)			24,450
Credit card fees			85,185
Overhead, at 99.2% applied to salaries and fringe benefits			11,203,968
Total Capital & Operating			12,622,579

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	23,916,901	28,338,607
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	13,375,555	13,437,588
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	10,541,346	14,901,019
% of Savings to City Cost	44%	53%

SFMTA - Finance and Information Technology
Towing

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
			Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions				
1052 IS Business Analyst	1052_C_MTA	-	\$ 4,242	\$ 5,093	-	-
1222_C Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerl	1222_C_MTA	-	\$ 3,323	\$ 3,989	-	-
1657_C Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,345	\$ 6,416	138,966	166,826
1824_C Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,167	\$ 6,203	134,336	161,268
1404_C Clerk	1404_C_MTA	1.6	\$ 2,367	\$ 2,842	96,107	115,374
1630_C Account Clerk	1630_C	3.2	\$ 2,540	\$ 3,049	214,317	257,283
1634_C Principal Account Clerk	1634_C_MTA	6.6	\$ 3,323	\$ 3,989	566,872	680,519
1652_C Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,548	\$ 4,259	184,501	221,490
1704_C Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	4.2	\$ 2,615	\$ 3,140	285,271	342,462
1705_C Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	4.2	\$ 2,900	\$ 3,482	316,378	379,806
1844_C Senior Management Assistant	1844_C_MTA	-	\$ 4,040	\$ 4,849	-	-
4321_C Cashier II	4321_C	1.6	\$ 2,636	\$ 3,165	107,021	128,477
4322_C Cashier III	4322_C	1.6	\$ 2,957	\$ 3,550	120,041	144,107
1926_C Senior Materials And Supplies Sup	1926_C	1.0	\$ 2,667	\$ 3,202	69,342	83,244
1934_C Storekeeper	1934_C_MTA	7.6	\$ 2,591	\$ 3,110	512,083	614,745
1936_C Senior Storekeeper	1936_C_MTA	3.0	\$ 2,761	\$ 3,315	215,396	258,579
1942_C Assistant Materials Coordinator	1942_C_MTA	-	\$ 4,357	\$ 5,230	-	-
1952_C Purchaser	1952_C	1.0	\$ 3,763	\$ 4,517	97,825	117,437
8202_C Security Guard	8202_C	11.4	\$ 2,761	\$ 3,315	817,846	981,808
Senior Collections Officer	4308_C	-	\$ 3,282	\$ 3,940	-	-
7355_C Truck Driver	7355_C_MTA	31.2	\$ 3,586	\$ 4,305	2,911,958	3,495,748
7382_C Automotive Mechanic Assistant Su	7382_C_MTA	-	\$ 4,301	\$ 5,163	-	-
IT Operations Support Administrator IV	1094_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,632	\$ 5,560	120,423	144,566
IS Engineer-Principal	1044_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 6,573	\$ 7,891	170,897	205,158
Manager IV	9174_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 5,995	\$ 7,197	311,752	374,252
Senior Account Clerk	1632	5.2	\$ 3,573	\$ 4,289	483,484	580,413
Holiday Pay (if applicable)						
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					30,715	36,872
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay (if applicable)						
Total FTE	91.3					
			Total Salary Costs-->		7,874,817	9,453,561
			Total of Other Compensation-->		30,715	36,872

FRINGE BENEFITS			
	Low	High	
Total Fringe Benefits	3,456,483	3,874,850	

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years
Postage+supplies+uniforms			72,476
Specialized Software			403,243
Vehicles - tow trucks (7 year useful life)			579,563
Fuel (15-20 miles/day/truck, assume 20mi/gal at \$5-\$7/gallon)			60,225
Communications: ipad air \$650 + case \$30 + cellular data (\$200/year for 4 years) *32 drivers / useful life			11,840
Utilities			46,001
Lien Fees			133,498
Dolly equipment (2 year useful life)			24,450
Credit card fees			85,185
Overhead, at 99.2% applied to salaries and fringe benefits			11,271,118
Total Capital & Operating			12,687,598
			15,133,067

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	24,049,611	28,498,350
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	13,997,231	14,058,705
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	10,052,381	14,439,645
% of Savings to City Cost	42%	51%



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 30, 2022

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Paratransit Services – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Kamini Lall, Budget Manager
Ben Becker, Financial Analyst

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Transit Operator	9163_C_MTA	178.0	\$ 2,755	\$ 3,307	\$ 12,799,012	\$ 15,364,960
Transit Operator	9163_C_MTA	121.0	\$ 2,754.96	\$ 3,307	\$ 8,700,451.76	\$ 10,444,720.00
Automotive Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 4,072.44	\$ 4,889	\$ 212,581.60	\$ 255,200.00
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	12.0	\$ 3,382.65	\$ 4,061	\$ 1,059,446.05	\$ 1,271,844.00
Automotive Service Worker	7410_C_MTA	8.0	\$ 2,724.71	\$ 3,271	\$ 568,919.01	\$ 682,976.00
Senior Parts Storekeeper	1931_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 2,996.50	\$ 3,597	\$ 78,208.70	\$ 93,888.00
Transit Car Cleaner	9102_C_MTA	7.0	\$ 2,600.84	\$ 3,122	\$ 475,174.02	\$ 570,437.00
Transit Supervisor	9139_C_MTA	15.0	\$ 3,777.42	\$ 4,535	\$ 1,478,858.22	\$ 1,775,340.00
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	3.0	\$ 5,264.50	\$ 6,320	\$ 412,210.05	\$ 494,850.00
Transit Manager I	9140_C_MTA	7.0	\$ 4,461.21	\$ 5,356	\$ 815,063.01	\$ 978,467.00
Transportation Safety Specialist	9520_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,696.88	\$ 5,639	\$ 122,588.45	\$ 147,165.00
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	29.0	\$ 2,746.22	\$ 3,297	\$ 2,078,613.22	\$ 2,495,334.00
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	21.0	\$ 2,476.15	\$ 2,973	\$ 1,357,176.91	\$ 1,629,264.00
Planner I	5277_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,048.97	\$ 3,660	\$ 79,578.16	\$ 95,532.00
Executive Secretary I	1450_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,070.48	\$ 3,686	\$ 160,279.20	\$ 192,412.00
Senior Transit Information Clerk	9124_C_MTA	5.0	\$ 2,968.96	\$ 3,564	\$ 387,449.13	\$ 465,125.00
Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1222_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,146.15	\$ 3,777	\$ 164,229.28	\$ 197,154.00
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,060.68	\$ 6,075	\$ 132,083.81	\$ 158,564.00
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	4.0	\$ 3,359.45	\$ 4,033	\$ 350,726.32	\$ 421,040.00
Human Services Agency Senior Eligibility W	2905_C	4.0	\$ 3,189.79	\$ 3,829	\$ 333,013.88	\$ 399,776.57
Eligibility Worker Supervisor	2907_C	1.0	\$ 3,536.86	\$ 4,246	\$ 92,311.92	\$ 110,818.63
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	7.0	\$ 2,819.31	\$ 3,385	\$ 515,087.22	\$ 618,352.00
Senior Account Clerk	1632_C_MTA	3.0	\$ 2,784.04	\$ 3,342	\$ 217,990.27	\$ 261,693.00
Human Resources Analyst	1241_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,823.02	\$ 4,589	\$ 199,561.81	\$ 239,570.00
IT Operations Support Administrator V	1095_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,847.36	\$ 5,819	\$ 126,516.04	\$ 151,880.00
IT Operations Support Administrator II	1092_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,048.97	\$ 3,660	\$ 159,156.31	\$ 191,064.00
Custodian	2708_C_MTA	3.0	\$ 2,341.97	\$ 2,811	\$ 183,376.62	\$ 220,140.00
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					\$ 723,275.74	\$ 868,278.20
Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)					\$ 803,862.13	\$ 965,020.56
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$300/person/year Shoes \$250/year)					\$ 164,450.00	\$ 164,450.00
Other Pay: 7381, 7382, and 7410 (Uniform \$300/person/year Shoes \$250/year)					\$ 12,100.00	\$ 12,100.00
Other Pay: 9102 (Uniform \$300/person/year Shoes \$250/person/year)					\$ 3,850.00	\$ 3,850.00
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$600/person/year)					\$ 8,400.00	\$ 8,400.00
Other Pay: 9140 (Shoes \$150/person/year)					\$ 1,050.00	\$ 1,050.00
Other Pay: 9139 (Shoes \$150/person/year)					\$ 2,250.00	\$ 2,250.00
Total FTE		443.0	Total Salary Costs-->		\$ 33,259,662.64	\$ 39,927,566.20
			Total of Other Compensation-->		\$ 1,719,237.87	\$ 2,025,398.76

FRINGE BENEFITS			
		Low	High
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 16,253,032.82	\$ 18,179,253.09

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years		
Sedan, 4 door midsize	200	\$ 28,000.00	4	\$ 1,445,500	\$ 1,445,500
Van, Type A, life equipped	49	\$ 56,000.00	4	\$ 708,295	\$ 708,295
Van, Type B, lift equipped	64	\$ 60,000.00	4	\$ 991,200	\$ 991,200
Minivans, ramp equipped	25	\$ 45,000.00	4	\$ 290,391	\$ 290,391
2 way radios	338	\$ 50.00	4	\$ 4,362	\$ 4,362
Mobile Data Computers	200	\$ 1,900.00	4	\$ 98,088	\$ 98,088
Fuel: (Est miles per gal is 5.9 at \$3.57 per gallon)				\$ 1,501,210	\$ 1,501,210
Parts (Est at \$2,467 per vehicle)				\$ 860,946	\$ 860,946
Computer Supplies, maintenance, hosting, "Trapeze" system				\$ 200,787	\$ 200,787
CabConnect				\$ 395,440	\$ 395,440
Claims Est.				\$ 1,297,127	\$ 1,557,175
Total Capital & Operating				\$ 7,793,345	\$ 8,053,393

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 59,025,278.51	\$ 68,185,611.46
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 33,336,751.65	\$ 33,386,414.53
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 25,688,527	\$ 34,799,197
% of Savings to City Cost	44%	51%

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
			Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
		# of Full Time Equivalent Positions				
Job Class Title	Class		Low	High	Low	High
Transit Operator	3163_C_MTA	178.0	\$ 2,833	\$ 3,401	\$ 13,111,277	\$ 15,739,828
Transit Operator	3163_C_MTA	121.0	\$ 2,833.03	\$ 3,401	\$ 8,912,721.82	\$ 10,699,546.00
Automotive Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 4,187.68	\$ 5,027	\$ 217,759.53	\$ 261,416.00
Automotive Mechanic	7381_C_MTA	12.0	\$ 3,478.38	\$ 4,176	\$ 1,085,255.72	\$ 1,302,828.00
Automotive Service Worker	7410_C_MTA	8.0	\$ 2,801.83	\$ 3,364	\$ 582,780.13	\$ 699,616.00
Senior Parts Storekeeper	1931_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,081.30	\$ 3,699	\$ 80,113.78	\$ 96,175.00
Transit Car Cleaner	3102_C_MTA	7.0	\$ 2,674.44	\$ 3,211	\$ 486,748.56	\$ 584,332.00
Transit Supervisor	3139_C_MTA	15.0	\$ 3,884.34	\$ 4,663	\$ 1,514,893.80	\$ 1,818,600.00
Manager III, MTA	3177_C_MTA	3.0	\$ 5,413.47	\$ 6,499	\$ 422,251.03	\$ 506,904.00
Transit Manager I	3140_C_MTA	7.0	\$ 4,587.46	\$ 5,507	\$ 834,917.57	\$ 1,002,302.00
Transportation Safety Specialist	3520_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,829.80	\$ 5,798	\$ 125,574.75	\$ 150,750.00
Communications Dispatcher II	1705_C_MTA	29.0	\$ 2,823.93	\$ 3,390	\$ 2,129,246.29	\$ 2,556,118.00
Communications Dispatcher I	1704_C_MTA	21.0	\$ 2,546.22	\$ 3,057	\$ 1,390,238.68	\$ 1,668,954.00
Planner I	5277_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,135.25	\$ 3,764	\$ 81,516.55	\$ 97,859.00
Executive Secretary I	1450_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,157.36	\$ 3,790	\$ 164,182.63	\$ 197,098.00
Senior Transit Information Clerk	3124_C_MTA	5.0	\$ 3,053.01	\$ 3,665	\$ 396,891.18	\$ 476,460.00
Senior Payroll And Personnel Clerk	1222_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,235.18	\$ 3,884	\$ 168,229.35	\$ 201,956.00
Accountant IV	1657_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,203.88	\$ 6,247	\$ 135,300.86	\$ 162,426.00
Accountant II	1652_C_MTA	4.0	\$ 3,454.52	\$ 4,147	\$ 359,269.57	\$ 431,296.00
Human Services Agency Senior Eligibility W	2905_C	4.0	\$ 3,281.19	\$ 3,939	\$ 341,243.45	\$ 409,656.00
Eligibility Worker Supervisor	2907_C	1.0	\$ 3,637.58	\$ 4,367	\$ 94,577.15	\$ 113,538.00
Senior Clerk	1406_C_MTA	7.0	\$ 2,899.10	\$ 3,480	\$ 527,635.53	\$ 633,416.00
Senior Account Clerk	1632	3.0	\$ 2,862.83	\$ 3,437	\$ 223,300.64	\$ 268,068.00
Human Resources Analyst	1241	2.0	\$ 3,931.22	\$ 4,719	\$ 204,423.20	\$ 245,406.00
IT Operations Support Administrator V	1095_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 4,984.54	\$ 5,984	\$ 129,598.14	\$ 155,580.00
IT Operations Support Administrator II	1092_C_MTA	2.0	\$ 3,135.25	\$ 3,764	\$ 163,033.09	\$ 195,718.00
Custodian	2708	3.0	\$ 2,408.27	\$ 2,891	\$ 187,844.83	\$ 225,504.00
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					\$ 740,915.24	\$ 889,454.08
Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)					\$ 823,466.56	\$ 988,555.30
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$300/person/year Shoes \$250/year)					\$ 164,450.00	\$ 164,450.00
Other Pay: 7312 (Uniform \$300/person/year Shoes \$250/year)					\$ 12,100.00	\$ 12,100.00
Other Pay: 7410 (Shoes \$250/person/year)					\$ 3,850.00	\$ 3,850.00
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$600/person/year)					\$ 8,400.00	\$ 8,400.00
Other Pay: 9140 (Shoes \$150/person/year)					\$ 1,050.00	\$ 1,050.00
Other Pay: 9139 (Shoes \$150/person/year)					\$ 2,250.00	\$ 2,250.00
Total FTE			443.0			
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 33,882,979.72	\$ 40,675,846.00
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 1,756,481.81	\$ 2,070,109.37

FRINGE BENEFITS		
	Low	High
Total Fringe Benefits	\$ 15,443,369.22	\$ 17,207,267.97

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years		
Sedan, 4 door midsize	200	\$ 28,000.00	4	\$ 1,439,620	\$ 1,439,620
Van, Type A, life equipped	49	\$ 56,000.00	4	\$ 705,414	\$ 705,414
Van, Type B, lift equipped	64	\$ 60,000.00	4	\$ 987,168	\$ 987,168
Minivans, ramp equipped	25	\$ 45,000.00	4	\$ 289,209	\$ 289,209
2 way radios	338	\$ 50.00	4	\$ 4,345	\$ 4,345
Mobile Data Computers	200	\$ 1,900.00	4	\$ 97,689	\$ 97,689
Fuel: (Est miles per gal is 5.9 at \$3.57 per gallon)				\$ 1,495,103	\$ 1,495,103
Parts (Est at \$2,467 per vehicle)				\$ 857,444	\$ 857,444
Computer Supplies, maintenance, hosting, "Trapeze" system				\$ 210,658	\$ 210,658
CabConnect				\$ 401,370	\$ 401,370
Claims Est.				\$ 1,321,436	\$ 1,586,358
Total Capital & Operating				\$ 7,809,456	\$ 8,074,377

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 58,892,286.32	\$ 68,027,600.70
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 34,163,635.25	\$ 34,212,457.27
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 24,728,651	\$ 33,815,143
% of Savings to City Cost	42%	50%



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 30, 2022

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Parking Meter Collections – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Kamini Lall, Budget Manager
Ben Becker, Financial Analyst

SFMTA - Streets
Parking Meter Collections

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager IV, MTA	9174_C_MTA	0	5,676	6,814	37,039	44,465
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	1	5,264	6,320	137,403	164,950
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1	4,892	5,873	127,683	153,281
Principal Fare Collections Receiver	9117_C_MTA	5	3,789	4,548	494,415	593,535
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116_C_MTA	12	3,009	3,613	942,543	1,131,504
Fare Collections Receiver	9110_C_MTA	16	2,601	3,122	1,086,112	1,303,856
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			80,059	96,109
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			50,002	58,136
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		35				
Total Salary Costs--->					2,955,256	3,391,591
Total of Other Compensation--->					130,061	154,246

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9174_C_MTA	66034	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9177_C_MTA	63536	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1824_C_MTA	56125	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9117_C_MTA	47599	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9116_C_MTA	41146	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9110_C_MTA	37763	
Total Fringe Benefits			
		Low	High
		\$ 1,314,580.96	\$ 1,472,124.50

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Rent	\$ 86,730	\$ 86,730
Utilities	\$ 12,390	\$ 12,390
Uniform	\$ 15,333	\$ 15,333
Vehicles	\$ 73,708	\$ 73,708
Radios	\$ 20,444	\$ 20,444
Gas	\$ 41,300	\$ 41,300
Overhead (99.2% of salary and benefits)	\$ 4,364,699	\$ 4,977,817
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 4,614,603	\$ 5,227,721

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	9,014,502	10,245,682
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	4,523,714	4,541,597
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 4,490,788	\$ 5,704,085
% of Savings to City Cost	50%	56%

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager IV, MTA	9174_C_MTA	0.3	\$ 5,815	\$ 6,980	\$ 37,941	\$ 45,548
Manager III, MTA	9177_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,393	\$ 6,474	\$ 140,750.34	\$ 168,968.00
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,011	\$ 6,016	\$ 130,793.50	\$ 157,015.00
Principal Fare Collections Receiver	9117_C_MTA	5.0	\$ 3,881	\$ 4,659	\$ 506,459.84	\$ 607,995.00
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116_C_MTA	12.0	\$ 3,083	\$ 3,701	\$ 965,503.64	\$ 1,159,068.00
Fare Collections Receiver	9110_C_MTA	16.0	\$ 2,664	\$ 3,198	\$ 1,112,568.13	\$ 1,335,616.00
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			82,009	98,450
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			51,220	59,553
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		35.3				
Total Salary Costs-->					2,894,017	3,474,210
Total of Other Compensation-->					133,230	158,003

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9174_C_MTA	61426
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9177_C_MTA	59378
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1824_C_MTA	52048
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9117_C_MTA	44622
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9116_C_MTA	38979
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9110_C_MTA	36020
Total Fringe Benefits		
		Low High
		\$ 1,249,470.35 \$ 1,393,960.50

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Rent	\$ 86,377	\$ 86,377
Utilities	\$ 12,340	\$ 12,340
Uniform	\$ 15,270	\$ 15,270
Vehicles	\$ 73,408	\$ 73,408
Radios	\$ 20,360	\$ 20,360
Gas	\$ 41,132	\$ 41,132
Overhead (99.2% of salary and benefits)	\$ 4,242,503	\$ 4,985,964
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 4,491,391	\$ 5,234,852

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	8,768,107	10,261,025
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	4,612,655	4,630,500
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 4,155,452	\$ 5,630,524
% of Savings to City Cost	47%	55%



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 30, 2022

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Security Services – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Kamini Lall, Budget Manager
Ben Becker, Financial Analyst

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

			Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Low	High	Low	High
Client Manager	3172_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 5,043	\$ 6,054	131,116	157,402
ADA Observer	8202_C	4.0	\$ 2,688.64	\$ 3,228	279,618	335,676
Badging Clerk	1406_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 2,899.10	\$ 3,480	75,377	90,488
Administrative Support	1408_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,157.36	\$ 3,790	82,091	98,549
Video Surveillance Supervisor	1410_C_MTA	1.0	\$ 3,619.03	\$ 4,345	94,095	112,959
Video Surveillance Assistants	1408_C_MTA	15.0	\$ 3,157.36	\$ 3,790	1,231,370	1,478,235
Security Operations Coordinator	8202_C	1.0	\$ 2,688.64	\$ 3,228	69,905	83,919
Field Supervisor	8202_C	5.2	\$ 2,688.64	\$ 3,228	363,504	436,379
Armed Security Guards	8202_C	15.0	\$ 2,688.64	\$ 3,228	1,048,569	1,258,787
Unarmed Security Guards	8202_C	75.0	\$ 2,688.64	\$ 3,228	5,242,846	6,293,933
Overtime Pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					170,295	204,435
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					225,811	271,081
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay (if applicable)						
Total FTE		119.2				
Total Salary Costs---					\$ 8,618,490.77	\$ 10,346,327.46
Total of Other Compensation---					\$ 396,105.16	\$ 475,516.40

FRINGE BENEFITS

	Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	172_C_MTA	\$ 57,585
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202_C	\$ 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	406_C_MTA	\$ 37,601
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	408_C_MTA	\$ 39,421
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	410_C_MTA	\$ 42,673
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	408_C_MTA	\$ 39,421
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202_C	\$ 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202_C	\$ 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202_C	\$ 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202_C	\$ 36,119
Total Fringe Benefits		Low \$ 3,953,600 High \$ 4,387,759

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years
MTA Transit Overhead of 52.3% of salary + benefits		\$ 6,575,203	\$ 7,705,927
Total Capital & Operating		\$ 6,575,203	\$ 7,705,927

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 19,543,399	\$ 22,915,531
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 9,645,997	\$ 9,667,829
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 9,897,402	\$ 13,247,701
% of Savings to City Cost	51%	58%



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 1, 2022

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation
Municipal Transportation Agency
One South Van Ness Avenue, 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Jonathan Rewers, Acting Chief Financial Officer

RE: Contracting for SFMTA Transit Shelter Cleaning – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Kamini Lall, Budget Manager
Ben Becker, Fiscal Analyst

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

			Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions				
General Laborer	7514_C_MTA	4.7	\$ 2,646	\$ 3,176	324,534	389,597
Track Maintenance Worker	7540_C_MTA	4.7	\$ 2,699.75	\$ 3,241	331,178	397,573
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					13,871	16,652
Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)					18,560	22,281
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay:						
Total FTE		9.4				
Total Salary Costs--->					\$ 655,713	\$ 787,170
Total of Other Compensation--->					\$ 32,431	\$ 38,933

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7514_C_MTA	38,154	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7540_C_MTA	38,604	
Total Fringe Benefits			Low High 324,062 360,763

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years
Materials & Supplies		\$	158,947 \$ 158,947
Safety Equipment		\$	5,679 \$ 5,679
Vehicle Maintenance		\$	1,136 \$ 1,136
Overhead at 59.4% of salaries and benefits		\$	601,250 \$ 704,998
Total Capital & Operating		\$	767,012 \$ 870,760

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	1,779,218	2,057,625
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	451,913	455,160
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,327,305	\$ 1,602,465
% of Savings to City Cost	75%	78%

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

			Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Low	High	Low	High
General Laborer	7514_C_MTA	4.7	\$ 2,720	\$ 3,266	331,356	397,786
Track Maintenance Worker	7540_C_MTA	4.7	\$ 2,776.16	\$ 3,333	338,142	405,933
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)					14,162	17,002
Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)					18,950	22,749
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay:						
Total FTE		9.4				
Total Salary Costs--->					669,498	803,719
Total of Other Compensation--->					33,113	39,751

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7514_C_MTA	36,364	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7540_C_MTA	36,756	
Total Fringe Benefits			
		Low	High
		308,830	342,567

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS	Quantity	Unit cost	Replacement Years	
Materials & Supplies		\$	158,301	\$ 158,301
Safety Equipment		\$	5,656	\$ 5,656
Vehicle Maintenance		\$	1,131	\$ 1,131
Overhead at 59.4% of salaries and benefits		\$	600,796	\$ 704,506
Total Capital & Operating		\$	765,883	\$ 869,594

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	1,777,324	2,055,631
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	464,961	468,152
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,312,363	\$ 1,587,479
% of Savings to City Cost	74%	77%



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 28, 2022

Charles Perl, Deputy Chief Financial Officer
San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
525 Golden Gate Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Laura Busch, Budget Director

RE: Contracting for Security Services – FY 2022-23 and FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contracted services referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-2024 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

_____/s/
Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
Security Services

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
			Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	1.0	\$ 2,615	\$ 3,139	68,242	81,923
Security Guard (1800 Oakdale/SECF)	8202	2.0	\$ 2,615	\$ 3,139	136,484	163,846
Security Guard As-Needed M-F (1800 Oak	8202	0.5	2,615	3,139	34,121	40,961
Security Guard As-Needed Sa-Su (1800 O	8202	0.7	2,615	3,139	47,769	57,346
Security Guard (750 Phelps/SEP)	8202	6.0	2,615	3,139	409,451	491,538
Security Guard As-Needed (750 Phelps/SE	8202	0.5	2,615	3,139	34,121	40,961
Security Guard - Saturday (750 Phelps/SE	8202	0.2	2,615	3,139	13,648	16,385
Security Guard (3500 Great Highway/OSP	8202	5.0	2,615	3,139	341,209	409,615
Security Guard As-Needed (3500 Great Hi	8202	0.5	2,615	3,139	34,121	40,961
Security Guard - Saturday (3500 Great Hig	8202	0.2	2,615	3,139	13,648	16,385
Security Guard (1601 Griffith/Griffith Yard)	8202	4.0	2,615	3,139	272,967	327,692
Security Guard As-Needed (1601 Griffith/C	8202	0.5	2,615	3,139	34,121	40,961
Administrator/Manager	0931	1.0	5,498	6,600	143,493	172,260
Overtime Pay	n/a	n/a	980	1,177	25,591	30,721
Total FTE			22.1			
Total Salary Costs-->					1,583,395	1,900,835
Total of Other Compensation-->					25,591	30,721

FRINGE BENEFITS		
Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	37,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931	66,439
Total Fringe Benefits		Low 776,446 High 865,649

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Two-way radios (1 per shift/location) - Four (4) needed.	10,008	10,008
Uniforms (\$800 per year per person) - Fifteen (21) needed.	16,800	16,800
Total Capital & Operating	26,808	26,808

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	2,412,240	2,824,013
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	1,282,233	1,311,056
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	1,130,007	1,512,957
% of Savings to City Cost	47%	54%

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

			Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
		# of Full Time Equivalent Positions				
Job Class Title	Class		Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	1.0	\$ 2,689	\$ 3,228	69,905	83,919
Security Guard (1800 Oakdale/SECF)	8202	2.0	\$ 2,689	\$ 3,228	139,809	167,838
Security Guard As-Needed M-F (1800 Oak	8202	0.5	2,689	3,228	34,952	41,960
Security Guard As-Needed Sa-Su (1800 O	8202	0.7	2,689	3,228	48,933	58,743
Security Guard (750 Phelps/SEP)	8202	6.0	2,689	3,228	419,428	503,515
Security Guard As-Needed (750 Phelps/SE	8202	0.5	2,689	3,228	34,952	41,960
Security Guard - Saturday (750 Phelps/SE	8202	0.2	2,689	3,228	13,981	16,784
Security Guard (3500 Great Highway/OSP	8202	5.0	2,689	3,228	349,523	419,596
Security Guard As-Needed (3500 Great Hi	8202	0.5	2,689	3,228	34,952	41,960
Security Guard - Saturday (3500 Great Hig	8202	0.2	2,689	3,228	13,981	16,784
Security Guard (1601 Griffith/Griffith Yard)	8202	4.0	2,689	3,228	279,618	335,676
Security Guard As-Needed (1601 Griffith/C	8202	0.5	2,689	3,228	34,952	41,960
Administrator/Manager	0931	1.0	5,837	7,007	151,757	182,181
Overtime Pay		n/a	1,008	1,210	26,214	31,470
Total FTE		22.1				
Total Salary Costs-->					1,626,745	1,952,875
Total of Other Compensation-->					26,214	31,470

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931 66,439
Total Fringe Benefits	Low 745,550 High 828,558

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Two-way radios (1 per shift/location) - Four (4) needed.	10,008	10,008
Uniforms (\$800 per year per person) - Fifteen (21) needed.	16,800	16,800
	-	-
	-	-
Total Capital & Operating	26,808	26,808

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	2,425,316	2,839,711
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	1,281,188	1,310,869
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	1,144,129	1,528,842
% of Savings to City Cost	47%	54%



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 27, 2022

Elaine Forbes, Executive Director
Port of San Francisco
Pier 1, The Embarcadero
San Francisco, CA 94111

Attention: Katharine Petrucione, Deputy Director of Finance and Administration

RE: Contracting for Port Janitorial Services – FY 2022-23 and FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Nate Cruz, Port Finance Director

Port

Real Estate - Janitorial

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

			Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Low	High	Low	High
Custodial Supervisor	2718.00	1.0	\$ 2,841	\$ 3,410	\$ 74,145	\$ 89,010
Custodian	2708.00	5.0	\$ 2,342	\$ 2,811	\$ 305,620	\$ 366,891
Porter	2736.00	1.0	\$ 2,342	\$ 2,811	\$ 61,123	\$ 73,377
Total FTE		7.0				
Total Salary Costs--->					440,888	529,278
Total of Other Compensation--->					-	-

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2718	39,750	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2708	35,618	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2736	36,491	
Total Fringe Benefits		Low	High
		229,392	254,330

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Janitorial supplies	\$ 35,000	\$ 55,000
Vehicles	\$ 30,000	\$ 30,000
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 65,000	\$ 85,000

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	735,280	868,608
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	664,550	665,934
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 70,730	\$ 202,674
% of Savings to City Cost	10%	23%

Port
Real Estate - Janitorial
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

			Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Low	High	Low	High
Custodial Supervisor	2718.00	1.0	\$ 2,921	\$ 3,507	\$ 75,947	\$ 91,173
Custodian	2708.00	5.0	\$ 2,408	\$ 2,891	\$ 375,688	\$ 451,006
Porter	2736.00	1.0	\$ 2,408	2,891	\$ 62,615	\$ 75,168
Total FTE		7.0				
Total Salary Costs---					514,250	617,347
Total of Other Compensation---					-	-

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2718	37,749	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2708	34,143	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	2736	35,069	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	-	-	
Total Fringe Benefits			
		Low	High
		220,399	243,535

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Janitorial supplies	\$ 35,000	\$ 55,000
Vehicles	\$ 30,000	\$ 30,000
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 65,000	\$ 85,000

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	799,649	945,881
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	683,631	685,056
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 116,018	\$ 260,825
% of Savings to City Cost	15%	28%



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 27, 2022

Elaine Forbes, Executive Director
Port of San Francisco
Pier 1, The Embarcadero
San Francisco, CA 94111

Attention: Katharine Petrucione, Deputy Director of Finance and Administration

RE: Contracting for Port Security Services – FY 2022-23 and FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

/s/

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Nate Cruz, Port Finance Director

Port

Security Services

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

			Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Low	High	Low	High
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205.00	3.0	\$ 5,032	\$ 6,040	393,972	472,956
Institutional Police Officer	8204.00	21.0	3,108	3,731	1,703,503	2,045,022
Total FTE		24.0				
Total Salary Costs--->					2,097,476	2,517,978
Total of Other Compensation--->					-	-

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8205	60,169	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8204	42,798	
Total Fringe Benefits		Low	High
		959,148	1,079,265

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Vehicles, fuel	-	-
	30,000	30,000
Total Capital & Operating	30,000	30,000

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	3,086,623	3,627,243
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	1,197,375	1,198,580
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	1,889,249	2,428,663
%of Savings to City Cost	61%	67%

Port

Security Services

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

			Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Low	High	Low	High
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205.00	3.0	\$ 5,213	\$ 6,258	\$ 406,625	\$ 488,145
Institutional Police Officer	8204.00	21.0	3,220	\$ 3,866	\$ 1,758,204	\$ 2,110,689
Total FTE		24.0				
Total Salary Costs--->					\$2,164,828.72	\$2,598,834.00
Total of Other Compensation--->					\$ -	\$ -

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8205	56,361	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8204	40,760	
Total Fringe Benefits		Low	High
		913,981	1,025,043

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Vehicles, fuel	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ 30,000	\$ 30,000
	\$ -	\$ -
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 30,000	\$ 30,000

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	3,108,810	3,653,877
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	1,201,492	1,202,524
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	1,907,317	2,451,353
%of Savings to City Cost	61%	67%



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 28, 2022

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director
San Francisco International Airport
International Terminal, 5th Floor
P.O. Box 8097
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Denise Payton, Director of Budget and Capital Planning

RE: Contracting for Airport Information Booth & Guest Assistance – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

_____/s/
Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Shirley West, Principal Budget Analyst

Airport Commission
 Airport Information and Guest Assistance Services
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
 FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Training Officer	1232	0.5	\$ 4,109	\$ 4,932	\$ 53,618	\$ 64,367
Customer Service Representative	1304	54.1	\$ 3,117	\$ 3,742	\$ 4,400,942	\$ 5,283,244
Customer Service Representative Supervis	1306	5.0	\$ 3,528	\$ 4,235	\$ 460,403	\$ 552,705
Management Assistant	1842	7.0	\$ 3,337	\$ 4,006	\$ 609,651	\$ 731,874
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.7	\$ 3,824	\$ 4,591	\$ 169,683	\$ 203,701
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 180,684	\$ 216,908
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 161,177	\$ 193,490
Total FTE		68.3				
Total Salary Costs--->					\$ 5,694,296	\$ 6,835,890
Total of Other Compensation--->					\$ 341,861	\$ 410,398

FRINGE BENEFITS		
Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1232	50,626
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1304	42,873
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1306	46,397
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1842	43,856
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844	47,888
Total Fringe Benefits		
	Low	High
	2,641,046	2,965,132

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Office Equipment and Technical Support	\$ 46,552	\$ 46,552
Reward and Recognition	\$ 10,000	\$ 10,000
Uniform and Dry Cleaning	\$ 70,000	\$ 70,000
ADM Guest Support Supplies	\$ 15,000	\$ 15,000
Fringe Benefit	\$ 5,000	\$ 5,000
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 146,552	\$ 146,552

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	8,823,756	10,357,971
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	6,014,527	6,021,659
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 2,809,229	\$ 4,336,312
% of Savings to City Cost	32%	42%

Airport Commission

Airport Information and Guest Assistance Services

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES

FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

			Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
		# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Low	High	Low	High
Training Officer	1232	0.5	\$ 4,227	\$ 5,074	\$ 54,945.93	\$ 65,961.50
Customer Service Representative	1304	54.1	3,229	3,877	\$ 4,542,311.85	\$ 5,452,955.40
Customer Service Representative						
Supervisor	1306	5.0	3,655	4,388	\$ 475,189.02	\$ 570,455.00
Management Assistant	1842	7.0	3,432	4,120	\$ 624,541.08	\$ 749,749.19
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.7	\$ 3,933	\$ 4,721	\$ 173,838	\$ 208,689
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 186,285.81	\$ 223,632.42
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 166,173.72	\$ 199,488.25
Total FTE		68.3				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 5,870,825	\$ 7,047,810
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 352,460	\$ 423,121

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1232	\$ 47,369	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1,304	\$ 40,827	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1,306	\$ 43,956	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1842	\$ 41,352	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	1844	\$ 44,884	
Total Fringe Benefits			
		Low	High
		\$ 2,518,463	\$ 2,817,973

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Office Equipment and Technical Support	\$ 46,552	\$ 46,552
Reward and Recognition	\$ 10,000	\$ 10,000
Uniform and Dry Cleaning	\$ 70,000	\$ 70,000
ADM Guest Support Supplies	\$ 15,000	\$ 15,000
Fringe Benefit	\$ 5,000	\$ 5,000
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 146,552	\$ 146,552

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 8,888,300	\$ 10,435,455
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 6,014,478	\$ 6,021,599
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 2,873,822	\$ 4,413,855
% of Savings to City Cost	32%	42%



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 29, 2022

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director
San Francisco International Airport
International Terminal, 5th Floor
P.O. Box 8097
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Denise Payton, Director of Budget and Capital Planning

RE: Contracting for Airport Parking Services – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2022-23 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

_____/s/
Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Shirley West, Principal Budget Analyst

Airport Commission
Parking

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager IV	0932	1.0	\$ 6,092	\$ 7,314	\$ 159,006	\$ 190,884
Manager II	0923	2.0	5,263	6,319	\$ 274,746	\$ 329,827
Manager I	0922	1.0	4,903	5,886	\$ 127,971	\$ 153,626
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	5,061	6,075	\$ 132,084	\$ 158,564
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.0	3,824	4,591	\$ 99,813	\$ 119,824
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	3,145	3,776	\$ 82,090	\$ 98,547
Clerk	1404	1.0	2,241	2,691	\$ 58,499	\$ 70,227
Senior Clerk	1406	4.0	2,819	3,384	\$ 294,313	\$ 353,317
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	3,070	3,686	\$ 80,128	\$ 96,192
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	3,337	4,006	\$ 87,093	\$ 104,553
Accountant II	1652	1.0	3,359	4,033	\$ 87,682	\$ 105,260
Collection Supervisor	4366	1.0	3,346	4,016	\$ 87,323	\$ 104,829
Investigator, Tax Collector	4334	2.0	3,731	4,479	\$ 194,759	\$ 233,804
Customer Service Agent Sup	1326	19.0	3,461	4,155	\$ 1,716,264	\$ 2,060,341
Customer Service Agent	1324	2.5	3,057	3,670	\$ 199,485	\$ 239,478
Cashier III	4322	35.0	2,800	3,361	\$ 2,557,360	\$ 3,070,060
Electronic Maintenance Tech	7318	1.0	4,473	5,370	\$ 116,752	\$ 140,158
Stationary Engineer	7334	2.0	3,654	4,387	\$ 190,758	\$ 229,001
Chief Stationary Engineer	7205	1.0	4,636	5,565	\$ 120,995	\$ 145,252
Sheriff's Lieutenant	8310	1.0	5,768	6,925	\$ 150,557	\$ 180,741
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	3.0	4,917	5,903	\$ 385,003	\$ 462,189
Building & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	54.0	2,614	3,138	\$ 3,684,174	\$ 4,422,778
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,841	3,410	\$ 74,145	\$ 89,010
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	3.0	2,577	3,094	\$ 201,773	\$ 242,225
Custodian	2708	39.0	2,342	2,811	\$ 2,383,839	\$ 2,861,751
					\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			429,844	516,020
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			383,437	460,308
Total FTE		179.5				
			Total Salary Costs-->		\$ 13,546,611	\$ 16,262,439
			Total of Other Compensation-->		\$ 813,281	\$ 976,328

FRINGE BENEFITS			
		Low	High
Total Fringe Benefits		\$ 6,479,951	\$ 7,239,260

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Operating Expenses	\$ 1,172,536	\$ 1,172,536
Credit Card Processing Fees and remote airline check in	\$ 3,002,461	\$ 3,502,461
Training	\$ 300,000	\$ 300,000
Parking/Billing Technology	\$ 300,000	\$ 300,000
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 4,774,997	\$ 5,274,997

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 25,614,841	\$ 29,753,024
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 22,950,804	\$ 27,196,467
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 2,664,037	\$ 2,556,557
% of Savings to City Cost	10%	9%

Airport Commission
Parking

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager IV	0932	1.0	\$ 6,265	\$ 7,521	\$ 162,895	\$ 195,552
Manager II	0923	2.0	5,413	6,499	281,499	337,934
Manager I	0922	1.0	5,043	6,054	131,115	157,401
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	5,204	6,247	135,301	162,426
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.0	3,933	4,721	102,257	122,758
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	3,235	3,884	84,115	100,978
Clerk	1404	1.0	2,305	2,767	59,924	71,938
Senior Clerk	1406	4.0	2,899	3,480	301,506	361,952
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	3,157	3,790	82,091	98,549
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	3,432	4,120	89,220	107,107
Accountant II	1652	1.0	3,455	4,147	89,817	107,824
Collection Supervisor	4366	1.0	3,440	4,130	89,449	107,382
Investigator, Tax Collector	4334	2.0	3,837	4,606	199,504	239,500
Customer Service Agent Sup	1326	19.0	3,559	4,272	1,758,079	2,110,539
Customer Service Agent	1324	2.5	3,144	3,774	204,366	245,338
Cashier III	4322	35.0	2,879	3,456	2,619,664	3,144,855
Electronic Maintenance Tech	7318	1.0	4,600	5,522	119,595	143,572
Stationary Engineer	7334	2.0	3,758	4,511	195,408	234,584
Chief Stationary Engineer	7205	1.0	4,767	5,723	123,942	148,790
Sheriff's Lieutenant	8310	1.0	5,932	7,121	154,225	185,144
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	3.0	5,076	6,093	395,899	475,269
Building & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	54.0	2,689	3,228	3,774,843	4,531,625
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,921	3,507	75,947	91,173
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	3.0	2,650	3,181	206,677	248,112
Custodian	2708	39.0	2,408	2,891	2,441,973	2,931,540
					\$ -	\$ -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			440,401	528,693
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			392,854	471,613
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		179.5				
			Total Salary Costs--->		\$ 13,879,313	\$ 16,661,840
			Total of Other Compensation--->		\$ 833,255	\$ 1,000,306

FRINGE BENEFITS			
Job Class	\$ Amount		
Total Fringe Benefits	Low	High	
	\$ 6,181,343	\$ 6,880,787	

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Operating Expenses	\$ 1,172,536	\$ 1,172,536
Credit Card Processing Fees and remote airline check in	\$ 3,002,461	\$ 3,002,461
Training	\$ 300,000	\$ 300,000
Parking/Billing Technology	\$ 300,000	\$ 300,000
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 4,774,997	\$ 4,774,997

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 25,668,908	\$ 29,317,931
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 25,459,323	\$ 27,195,799
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 209,585	\$ 2,122,132
% of Savings to City Cost	1%	7%



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 28, 2022

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director
San Francisco International Airport
International Terminal, 5th Floor
P.O. Box 8097
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Denise Payton, Director of Budget and Capital Planning

RE: Contracting for Airport Security Services – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023-24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

_____/s/
Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Shirley West, Principal Budget Analyst

Airport Commission
Safety & Security Services

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

			Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions				
Security Guard	8202	40.0	\$ 2,615	\$ 3,139	\$ 2,729,674	\$ 3,276,919
Building and Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	8.0	\$ 2,614	\$ 3,138	\$ 545,804	\$ 655,226
Aviation Security Operations Supervisor	9220	0.1	\$ 4,318	\$ 5,184	\$ 5,636	\$ 6,765
Aviation Security Manager	0931	0.1	\$ 5,676	\$ 6,814	\$ 7,407	\$ 8,892
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			125,646	135,302
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			137,839	165,473
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			220,609	264,837
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		48.1				
Total Salary Costs--->					\$ 3,288,520	\$ 3,947,803
Total of Other Compensation--->					\$ 484,094	\$ 565,612

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount		
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	\$ 37,877	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8207	\$ 37,861	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9220	\$ 51,332	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931	\$ 66,057	
Total Fringe Benefits			
		Low	High
		\$ 1,639,758	\$ 1,823,851

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Uniforms for each guard and officer	\$ 28,800	\$ 28,800
May include capital costs, materials & supplies, uniforms, technology, as is comparable to the contract components.	\$ 7,200	\$ 7,200
	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ -	\$ -
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 36,000	\$ 36,000

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 5,448,373	\$ 6,373,266
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 3,437,121	\$ 3,440,679
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 2,011,252	\$ 2,932,587
% of Savings to City Cost	37%	46%

Airport Commission
Safety & Security Services

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	40.0	\$ 2,689	\$ 3,228	\$ 2,796,185	\$ 3,356,764
Building and Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	8.0	\$ 2,689	\$ 3,228	\$ 559,236	\$ 671,352
Aviation Security Operations Supervisor	9220	0.1	\$ 4,441	\$ 5,331	\$ 5,773	\$ 6,930
Aviation Security Manager	0931	0.1	\$ 5,837	\$ 7,007	\$ 7,588	\$ 9,109
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 129,206	\$ 139,132
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 141,744	\$ 170,161
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 226,854	\$ 272,334
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		48.1				
Total Salary Costs--->					\$ 3,368,781	\$ 4,044,155
Total of Other Compensation--->					\$ 497,804	\$ 581,627

FRINGE BENEFITS		
Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8202	\$ 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	8207	\$ 36,119
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9220	\$ 47,790
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	0931	\$ 61,460
Total Fringe Benefits		Low High \$ 1,569,236 \$ 1,739,191

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Uniforms for each guard and officer	\$ 28,800	\$ 28,800
May include capital costs, materials & supplies, uniforms, technology, as is comparable to the contract components.	\$ 7,200	\$ 7,200
	\$ -	\$ -
	\$ -	\$ -
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 36,000	\$ 36,000

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 5,471,822	\$ 6,400,973
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 3,887,906	\$ 3,891,281
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,583,916	\$ 2,509,692
% of Savings to City Cost	29%	39%



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller

Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

April 29, 2022

Ivar C. Satero, Airport Director
San Francisco International Airport
International Terminal, 5th Floor
P.O. Box 8097
San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Denise Payton, Director of Budget and Capital Planning

RE: Contracting for Airport Shuttle Services – FY 2022-23 & FY 2023 -24

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2022-23 and 2023-24 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at Risa.Sandler@sfgov.org if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

_____/s/
Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations
Shirley West, Principal Budget Analyst

Airport Commission
109699 - AIR Operations & Security
Airport Shuttle Bus Service
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
FISCAL YEAR 2022-23

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
			Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Low	High	Low	High
Transit Operators	9163	64.0	\$ 2,755	\$ 3,307	\$ 4,601,892	\$ 5,524,480
Transit Supervisor	9139	5.0	3,777	4,535	\$ 492,953	\$ 591,780
Transit Manager II	9141	2.0	5,037	6,047	\$ 262,955	\$ 315,672
Transit Manager I	9140	1.0	4,461	5,356	\$ 116,438	\$ 139,781
Automotive Mechanic	7381	5.0	3,383	4,061	\$ 441,436	\$ 529,935
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	2.0	2,601	3,122	\$ 135,764	\$ 162,982
Transit Spotter	7454	4.0	1,941	2,330	\$ 202,659	\$ 243,288
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 30,353	\$ 36,439
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 27,076	\$ 32,505
Total FTE		83.0				
Total Salary Costs---					\$ 6,254,096	\$ 7,507,918
Total of Other Compensation---					\$ 57,430	\$ 68,943

FRINGE BENEFITS		
Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9163	\$ 40,242
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9139	\$ 49,200
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9141	\$ 58,335
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9140	\$ 54,188
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7381	\$ 46,289
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9102	\$ 37,763
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7454	\$ 33,475
Total Fringe Benefits		Low High \$ 3,067,785 \$ 3,433,217
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Operating costs: Fuel, Lubricants and Utilities, maintenance, worker's comp		\$ 1,752,400 \$ 1,752,400
Unanticipated Operational Expenses		\$ 140,749 \$ 140,749
Emergency Contingency		\$ 322,038 \$ 644,076
Total Capital & Operating		2,215,187 2,537,225

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	11,594,498	13,547,304
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	9,736,615	9,737,989
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,857,883	\$ 3,809,315
% of Savings to City Cost	16%	28%

Airport Commission
 109699 - AIR Operations & Security
 Airport Shuttle Bus Service
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES
 FISCAL YEAR 2023-24

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Transit Operators	9163	64.0	\$ 2,833	\$ 3,401	\$ 4,714,167	\$ 5,659,264
Transit Supervisor	9139	5.0	3,884	4,663	\$ 504,964.60	\$ 606,200.00
Transit Manager II	9141	2.0	5,180	6,219	\$ 269,360.55	\$ 323,362.00
Transit Manager I	9140	1.0	4,587	5,507	\$ 119,273.94	\$ 143,186.00
Automotive Mechanic	7381	5.0	3,478	4,176	\$ 452,189.89	\$ 542,845.00
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	2.0	2,674	3,211	\$ 139,071.02	\$ 166,952.00
Transit Spotter	7454	4.0	1,996	2,396	\$ 207,596.93	\$ 249,216.00
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 31,092.83	\$ 37,326.33
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			\$ 27,735.94	\$ 33,296.45
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a				
Total FTE		83.0				
Total Salary Costs--->					\$ 6,406,623.83	\$ 7,691,025.00
Total of Other Compensation--->					\$ 58,828.77	\$ 70,622.78

FRINGE BENEFITS		
Job Class	\$ Amount	
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9163	\$ 38,419
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9139	\$ 46,333
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9141	\$ 54,174
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9140	\$ 50,593
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7381	\$ 43,866
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	9102	\$ 36,020
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #:	7454	\$ 31,843
Total Fringe Benefits		Low High \$ 2,930,295.60 \$ 3,268,163.99

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		
Operating costs: Fuel, Lubricants and Utilities, maintenance, worker's comp	\$ 1,783,008	\$ 1,783,008
Unanticipated Operational Expenses	\$ 143,208	\$ 143,208
Emergency Contingency	\$ 322,038	\$ 644,076
Total Capital & Operating	2,248,253	2,570,291

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 11,644,002	\$ 13,600,103
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 9,890,569	\$ 9,891,894
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 1,753,432	\$ 3,708,209
% of Savings to City Cost	15%	27%



To: Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors
From: Ashley Groffenberger, Mayor's Budget Director
Date: May 1, 2022
Re: Mayor's May 1 FY 2022-23 and FY 2023-24 Budget Submission

Madam Clerk,

In accordance with Administrative Code section 3.3, the Mayor's Office hereby submits the Mayor's proposed May 1 budget by May 1st, corresponding legislation, and related materials for Fiscal Year (FY) 2022-23 and FY 2023-24.

In addition to the Mayor's Proposed FY 2022-23 and FY 2023-24 May 1 Budget Book, the following items are included in the Mayor's submission:

- The May 1 Annual Appropriation Ordinance and Annual Salary Ordinance, along with Administrative Provisions, physical copies of which will be delivered by the Controller's Office
- 11 separate pieces of trailing legislation (see list attached)
- A Transfer of Function letter detailing the transfer of positions from one City department to another
- An Interim Exception letter
- A letter from the City Controller regarding the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency budget

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "A. Groffenberger", followed by a long horizontal flourish.

Ashley Groffenberger
Mayor's Budget Director

cc: Members of the Board of Supervisors
Budget & Legislative Analyst's Office
Controller

DEPT	Item	Relevance to Budget	Type of Legislation
AIR	Prop J Certification - previously approved	Costs related to Prop J services assumed in budget.	Resolution
BOA	Board of Appeals Surcharges on Permit Fees	Legislation that allows the Board of Appeals to adjust existing surcharges on permit fees, license fees, permit review fees, and permit and license renewal fees for permits and licenses issued by the Planning Department, Department of Building Inspection, Department of Public Works, Department of Public Health, Police Department, and the Entertainment Commission	Ordinance
LIB	In-Kind Grant of Friends of San Francisco Public Library	Grant assumed in budget.	Resolution
MTA	Prop J Certification - previously approved	Costs related to Prop J services assumed in budget.	Resolution
PRT	California State Lands Commission Grant	Grant assumed in budget.	Resolution
PRT	Prop J Certification - previously approved	Costs related to Prop J services assumed in budget.	Resolution
PUC	CleanPowerSF Capital Budget	Appropriates funds to support PUC CleanPowerSF capital budget expenditures.	Ordinance
PUC	Hetch Hetchy Capital Budget	Appropriates funds to support PUC Hetch Hetchy capital budget expenditures.	Ordinance
PUC	Wastewater Capital Budget	Appropriates funds to support PUC Wastewater Enterprise capital budget expenditures.	Ordinance
PUC	Water Capital Budget	Appropriates funds to support PUC Water Enterprise capital budget expenditures.	Ordinance
PUC	Power Debt Authorization	Authorizes bond issuance to finance Power capital projects.	Ordinance
PUC	Wastewater Debt Authorization	Authorizes bond issuance to finance Wastewater capital projects.	Ordinance
PUC	Water Debt Authorization	Authorizes bond issuance to finance Water capital projects.	Ordinance
PUC	Prop J Certification - previously approved	Costs related to Prop J services assumed in budget.	Resolution



TO: Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors
FROM: Tom Paulino
RE: Proposition J Contract Certification Contracted-Out Department Services
Previously Approved
DATE: May 1, 2022

Resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that department services previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services: security, information and guest services, parking operations, shuttle bus services (Airport); citations, paratransit, parking meter collections, security, towing, transit shelter cleaning services (Municipal Transportation Agency); janitorial and security services (Port); and security services (Public Utilities Commission).

Should you have any questions, please contact Tom Paulino at 415-554-6153.