



2016 COLLABORATIVE REFORM INITIATIVE
RECOMMENDATIONS TRACKING MATRIX
Status as of 3/10/23

Objective Number & Title	Concept	Finding #	Findings	Rec #	Recommendations	Priority	Status	Substantial Compliance Date	Bureau	Findings Manager	Project Manager
1 - Use of Force	Leadership/ Management Culture	1	The majority of deadly use of force incidents by SFPD involved persons of color.	1.1	SFPD must commit to reviewing and understanding the reasons for the disparate use of deadly force. Specifically, SFPD needs to: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Partner with a research institution to evaluate the circumstances that give rise to deadly force, particularly those involving persons of color.• Develop and enhance relationships in those communities most impacted by deadly officer involved shootings and monitor trends in calls for service and community complaints to ensure appropriate police interaction occurs as a matter of routine police engagement.• Provide ongoing training for officers throughout the Department on how to assess and engage in encounters involving conflict with a potential for use of force with a goal of minimizing the level of force needed to successfully and safely resolve such incidents.	Low	In Progress		Chief of Staff	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Sgt. James Tacchini
1 - Use of Force	IT/Data Business Processes	20	The SFPD does not capture sufficient data on arrest and use of force incidents to support strong scientific analysis. Because of limitations in the manner in which use of force and arrest data were collected by the SFPD, assessment team members were unable to perform a multivariate frequency analysis, which would have shed light on whether individuals who are members of racial minorities were subjected to force more often than White individuals during arrests.	20.1	The SFPD needs to develop reliable electronic in-custody arrest data. It needs to ensure that these arrest data accurately reflect the incident number from the event, and the number should be cross-referenced on both the booking card and the use of force reporting form.	Low	In Progress		Chief of Staff	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Gordon Brussow, Manager
1 - Use of Force	IT/Data Business Processes	20	The SFPD does not capture sufficient data on arrest and use of force incidents to support strong scientific analysis. Because of limitations in the manner in which use of force and arrest data were collected by the SFPD, assessment team members were unable to perform a multivariate frequency analysis, which would have shed light on whether individuals who are members of racial minorities were subjected to force more often than White individuals during arrests.	20.2	The SFPD needs to audit arrest data and use of force data monthly to ensure proper recording of use of force incidents related to arrest incidents. An audit of these data should occur immediately upon publication of this report and monthly thereafter.	Immediate	In Progress		Chief of Staff	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Sgt. Stacy Youngblood & William Sanson-Mosier
1 - Use of Force	IT/Data Business Processes	20	The SFPD does not capture sufficient data on arrest and use of force incidents to support strong scientific analysis. Because of limitations in the manner in which use of force and arrest data were collected by the SFPD, assessment team members were unable to perform a multivariate frequency analysis, which would have shed light on whether individuals who are members of racial minorities were subjected to force more often than White individuals during arrests.	20.3	The SFPD needs to advocate for better coordination with the San Francisco Sheriff's Department to ensure that the recording of SFPD arrest data is accurate and corresponds with SFPD incident report and arrest data.	Low	In Progress		Chief of Staff	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Gordon Brussow, Manager
1 - Use of Force	IT/Data Business Processes	20	The SFPD does not capture sufficient data on arrest and use of force incidents to support strong scientific analysis. Because of limitations in the manner in which use of force and arrest data were collected by the SFPD, assessment team members were unable to perform a multivariate frequency analysis, which would have shed light on whether individuals who are members of racial minorities were subjected to force more often than White individuals during arrests.	20.4	The SFPD should identify a research partner to further refine its use of force data collection and to explore the data findings of this report to identify appropriate data for measurement and to determine causal factors.	Low	In Progress		Chief of Staff	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Sgt. Stacy Youngblood
1 - Use of Force	IT/Data Business Processes	21	Community members' race or ethnicity was not significantly associated with the severity of force used or injury arising from an officer's use of force.	21.1	The SFPD should continue to collect and analyze use of force data to identify patterns and trends over time consistent with recommendations in finding 20.	Low	In Progress		Chief of Staff	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Sgt. Stacy Youngblood



2016 COLLABORATIVE REFORM INITIATIVE
RECOMMENDATIONS TRACKING MATRIX
Status as of 3/10/23

Objective Number & Title	Concept	Finding #	Findings	Rec #	Recommendations	Priority	Status	Substantial Compliance Date	Bureau	Findings Manager	Project Manager
1 - Use of Force	IT/Data Business Processes	22	When only minority officers were involved in a use of force incident, the severity of force used and the injuries sustained by community members increased.	22.1	The SFPD needs to improve data collection on use of force so that further analysis can be conducted to better understand this finding.	Low	In Progress		Chief of Staff	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Sgt. Stacy Youngblood
2 - Bias	Community Policing	26	There is limited community input on the SFPD's actions regarding its anti-bias policies and practices.	26.1	The Chief's Advisory Forum should be re-invigorated and allow for diverse communities to have meaningful input into bias training, policies, and the SFPD's other anti-bias programming. The chief should ensure that marginalized communities are given a meaningful opportunity to be a part of the Advisory Forum.	Medium	In Progress		Special Operations	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Phil Lohaus
2 - Bias	Doctrine/ Policy Development	28	The SFPD's failure to fully and adequately address incidents of biased misconduct contributed to a perception of institutional bias in the department. The SFPD responded to the racist, sexist, homophobic, and transphobic texts by a large group of officers by investigating the incident and disciplining the officers directly involved. However, given the nature of the officers' open and flagrant behavior, the SFPD should have taken action to ensure that this was not an institutionalized problem, including steps to address the behavior at the organizational level. Community perceptions that biased behaviors exist in the SFPD were exacerbated by the explicit bias demonstrated by SFPD officers in the texting scandals and the subsequent failure to take appropriate action.	28.1	The SFPD should investigate complaints of bias transparently and openly and recognize its potential impact upon the larger group of officers who do not hold such views and upon the affected communities of San Francisco. To address these concerns, the department should · identify specific roles and responsibilities for supervision of officers regarding biased behavior; · analyze E-585 traffic stop incident report data and enforcement actions with a lens for possible bias or disparate treatment and require supervisors to review these analyses; · identify intervention mechanisms beyond discipline to deal with potentially biased behaviors.	Medium	In Progress		Special Operations	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Rachael Kilshaw
2 - Bias	Leadership/ Management Culture	28	The SFPD's failure to fully and adequately address incidents of biased misconduct contributed to a perception of institutional bias in the department. The SFPD responded to the racist, sexist, homophobic, and transphobic texts by a large group of officers by investigating the incident and disciplining the officers directly involved. However, given the nature of the officers' open and flagrant behavior, the SFPD should have taken action to ensure that this was not an institutionalized problem, including steps to address the behavior at the organizational level. Community perceptions that biased behaviors exist in the SFPD were exacerbated by the explicit bias demonstrated by SFPD officers in the texting scandals and the subsequent failure to take appropriate action.	28.4	The SFPD needs to engage in early identification of and intervention in behaviors that are indicative of bias through direct supervision, data review, and observation of officer activity.	Immediate	In Progress		Special Operations	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Ofc. Mike Petuya
2 - Bias	Training	28	The SFPD's failure to fully and adequately address incidents of biased misconduct contributed to a perception of institutional bias in the department. The SFPD responded to the racist, sexist, homophobic, and transphobic texts by a large group of officers by investigating the incident and disciplining the officers directly involved. However, given the nature of the officers' open and flagrant behavior, the SFPD should have taken action to ensure that this was not an institutionalized problem, including steps to address the behavior at the organizational level. Community perceptions that biased behaviors exist in the SFPD were exacerbated by the explicit bias demonstrated by SFPD officers in the texting scandals and the subsequent failure to take appropriate action.	28.5	The SFPD needs to train supervisors to recognize behaviors that are indicative of bias and intervene effectively.	Immediate	In Progress		Special Operations	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Ofc. Mike Petuya



2016 COLLABORATIVE REFORM INITIATIVE
RECOMMENDATIONS TRACKING MATRIX
Status as of 3/10/23

Objective Number & Title	Concept	Finding #	Findings	Rec #	Recommendations	Priority	Status	Substantial Compliance Date	Bureau	Findings Manager	Project Manager
2 - Bias	IT/Data Business Processes	30	The weight of the evidence indicates that African-American drivers were disproportionately stopped compared to their representation in the driving population. Citywide, African-American drivers were 24 percent more likely to be stopped by the police than their estimated representation in the driving population, and they were 9 percent more likely to be stopped given their estimated representation among potential traffic violators.	30.3	The SFPD should provide supervisors with the results of timely data analyses regarding the E-585 traffic stop incident report activity of their officers that allow them to identify and proactively intervene when outlier officers are identified.	Low	In Progress		Special Operations	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Ofc. Mike Petuya
2 - Bias	IT/Data Business Processes	30	The weight of the evidence indicates that African-American drivers were disproportionately stopped compared to their representation in the driving population. Citywide, African-American drivers were 24 percent more likely to be stopped by the police than their estimated representation in the driving population, and they were 9 percent more likely to be stopped given their estimated representation among potential traffic violators.	30.4	Until the data are electronic, supervisors should be provided with monthly paper reports regarding the E-585 traffic stop incident report activity of officers under their command.	High	In Progress		Special Operations	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Ofc. Mike Petuya
2 - Bias	IT/Data Business Processes	35	The SFPD does not have sufficient systems, tools, or resources needed to integrate and develop the appropriate data required to support a modern, professional police department. Many of the department's technology and information sharing systems are outdated and not integrated and do not support ready access for analysis to inform management decisions. Progressive police supervision requires timely access to accurate information regarding officer activity, traffic and pedestrian stops, use of force, and resident complaints to help analyze officers' actions and trends. The SFPD must conduct an assessment across the whole organization and determine how to prioritize the implementation of IT solutions for key management and operational practices.	35.3	SFPD leadership should make a concerted effort to focus on data collection and to create systems and analysis protocols that will inform supervisors where incidents of potential bias or disparate treatment occur or where patterns in officer behavior exist that warrant further examination or monitoring.	Medium	In Progress		Special Operations	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Ofc. Mike Petuya
3 - Community Policing	Community Policing	39	The SFPD does not have a department-wide strategic plan that articulates a mission and identifies the goals and objectives necessary to deliver overall policing services.	39.1	The SFPD needs to develop a comprehensive organizational strategic plan with supporting plans for the key reform areas identified within this report specifically directed at community policing, bias, and maintaining diversity within the department.	Medium	In Progress		Community Engagement Division	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Jason Cunningham, Program Manager
3 - Community Policing	Doctrine/ Policy Development	40	The SFPD does not formalize community engagement in support of community policing practices. The SFPD does not have a comprehensive, strategic community policing plan that focuses priorities, resources, programs, and activities for the department. Community policing involves partnerships, problem solving, and organizational transformation. In order to be a true community policing department, the SFPD needs to ensure the entire department is following the tenets of community policing systematically and strategically. The SFPD needs to bring the community to the table in order to establish comprehensive community policing resources, programs, and activities.	40.2	As part of recommendation 39.3, the SFPD should direct the Strategic Planning Steering Committee to develop a strategic plan within six months of the issuance of this report that clearly defines the following: · The department's vision, mission, and values statements. Once these statements are in place, the committee should establish agency-wide objectives and individual goals as the guiding principles that codify the SFPD's collective beliefs. · The department's strategic framework for the planning process. This framework will ensure that the process results in a plan that supports the coordination of priorities and objectives across individuals, work groups, and key operating divisions. · The department's strategy to engage the community, obtain community input, and develop support for the plan and its success. · The department's strategy to drive the plan down to the officer level by creating objectives that allow for individual goals that contribute to the overall plan. · The department's measurement processes for individual performance and participation towards accomplishing departmental goals.	High	In Progress		Community Engagement Division	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Jason Cunningham, Program Manager



2016 COLLABORATIVE REFORM INITIATIVE
RECOMMENDATIONS TRACKING MATRIX
Status as of 3/10/23

Objective Number & Title	Concept	Finding #	Findings	Rec #	Recommendations	Priority	Status	Substantial Compliance Date	Bureau	Findings Manager	Project Manager
3 - Community Policing	Doctrine/ Policy Development	40	The SFPD does not formalize community engagement in support of community policing practices. The SFPD does not have a comprehensive, strategic community policing plan that focuses priorities, resources, programs, and activities for the department. Community policing involves partnerships, problem solving, and organizational transformation. In order to be a true community policing department, the SFPD needs to ensure the entire department is following the tenets of community policing systematically and strategically. The SFPD needs to bring the community to the table in order to establish comprehensive community policing resources, programs, and activities.	40.6	The SFPD should develop and implement a community policing practices review and development process within 90 days of the issuance of this report so SFPD units can collaborate regarding community policing efforts.	Immediate	In Progress		Community Engagement Division	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Cmdr. Denise Flaherty
3 - Community Policing	Community Policing	41	The SFPD's community policing order Department General Order 1.08 – Community Policing (effective 9/28/11) and its Community Policing and Problem Solving manual are out of date and no longer relevant. These overarching directives do not sufficiently reflect the vision, plan, or goals of the SFPD with regard to community policing. They need to be updated and maintained as living documents that guide the community policing activities of the organization.	41.1	The SFPD should work with the newly convened Strategic Planning Steering Committee (recommendation 40.2) to draft a new community policing and problem solving manual for SFPD members within 12 months of the issuance of this report	Low	In Progress		Community Engagement Division	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Lt. Raymond Cruz
3 - Community Policing	Community Policing	48	The SFPD needs to develop a robust, broad-based community forum for input on policing priorities across all communities.	48.1	The chief's community forum groups—African American, Arab American, Asian Pacific Islander, Business, Hispanic, Interfaith, LGBT, Young Adults, Youth, and Youth Providers—need to be re-established and structured to engage in problem solving and action regarding issues affecting the groups they represent.	Medium	In Progress		Community Engagement Division	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Sgt. Torrie Grady
3 - Community Policing	IT/Data Business Processes	48	The SFPD needs to develop a robust, broad-based community forum for input on policing priorities across all communities.	48.2	The department needs to develop an annual reporting and measurement process of the issues raised at the forum and the progress made by the group in resolving them.	Low	In Progress		Community Engagement Division	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Sgt. Torrie Grady
4 - Accountability	IT/Data Business Processes	55	The SFPD is not transparent around officer discipline practices. During the community listening sessions and interviews with community members, there was a consistently stated belief, especially in the African-American and Hispanic communities, that officers are not held accountable for misconduct.	55.2	Consistent with the current practice on Early Intervention System data, the SFPD should develop and report aggregate data regarding complaints against Department members, their outcome, and trends in complaints and misconduct for both internal and external publication.	Low	In Progress		Administration	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Lt. Andrew Cox
4 - Accountability	IT/Data Business Processes	68	The SFPD has poor data collection and analysis, which significantly impacts effective overall organization management and accountability. The technology in the SFPD requires significant updating. However, poor data collection practices, including lack of supervisory review and accountability for improperly completed reports and form sets, contributes to the poor data environment.	68.1	As part of its technological capacity improvement strategy, the SFPD should develop a plan to advance its capacity to digest information it currently possesses in a consistent, easily accessible format such as a template containing key data points including officer performance indicators and crime indicators that could provide management with real-time information to inform their practice.	Low	In Progress		Administration	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	William Sanson-Mosier, Acting Director
4 - Accountability	Doctrine/ Policy Development	69	The SFPD does not consistently apply the principles of procedural justice.	69.2	The SFPD should task a committee to review internal discipline on a quarterly basis to assure the fairness and impartiality of the process overall and particularly to ensure that there is not bias in determination and application of discipline. This analysis should be multi-levelled to include aggregate data, trend analysis, and outcome impact on officer demographics including prior discipline and adherence to the discipline matrix.	Medium	In Progress		Administration	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Lt. Angela Wilhelm
4 - Accountability	Doctrine/ Policy Development	69	The SFPD does not consistently apply the principles of procedural justice.	69.3	The SFPD should report annually to the Police Commission the analysis of discipline including officer demographics and prior discipline histories.	Low	In Progress		Administration	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Phil Lohaus



2016 COLLABORATIVE REFORM INITIATIVE
RECOMMENDATIONS TRACKING MATRIX
Status as of 3/10/23

Objective Number & Title	Concept	Finding #	Findings	Rec #	Recommendations	Priority	Status	Substantial Compliance Date	Bureau	Findings Manager	Project Manager
4 - Accountability	Doctrine/ Policy Development	79	Evaluation of employee performance is not an institutionalized practice in the SFPD. SFPD personnel interviewed did not recall having or conducting a performance evaluation within the department.	79.1	The SFPD should adopt a policy and implement the practice of completing regular performance evaluations of all department employees tailored to goals and objectives, job functions, and desired behavior and performance indicators.	Low	In Progress		Administration	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Lt. Robert Kobold
4 - Accountability	Doctrine/ Policy Development	79	Evaluation of employee performance is not an institutionalized practice in the SFPD. SFPD personnel interviewed did not recall having or conducting a performance evaluation within the department.	79.2	SFPD leadership needs to create a system to ensure that all personnel are being evaluated at least twice a year.	Low	In Progress		Administration	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Lt. Robert Kobold
4 - Accountability	Doctrine/ Policy Development	79	Evaluation of employee performance is not an institutionalized practice in the SFPD. SFPD personnel interviewed did not recall having or conducting a performance evaluation within the department.	79.3	The SFPD should use performance evaluations as an evaluation factor in promotions.	Low	In Progress		Administration	A/Lt. Gabe Rivera	Lt. Robert Kobold