File No.	230312	Committee Item No.	3	
		Board Item No.		
	COMMITTEE	/BOARD OF SUBERVISO	De	

# COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST

Committee: Budget and Appropriations Committee Date June 23, 2023				
Board of Supervisors Meeting Date				
Cmte Board				
OTHER (Use back side if additional space is needed)				
CEQA Determination 3/31/2023  SBC Response 4/24/2023  Referral FYI 3/24/2023  CEQA-GP Referral 3/24/2023				
Completed by: Brent Jalipa Date June 16, 2023 Completed by: Brent Jalipa Date				

#### AMENDED IN COMMITTEE 6/22/2023 ORDINANCE NO.

FILE NO. 230312

1	[Public Works, Ac	Iministrative Codes - Curbside Shared Spaces Permit and License Fees]
2		
3	Ordinance amen	ding the Public Works and Administrative Code to eliminate permit
4	fees for <u>a</u> Curbs	ide Shared Spaces <u>permit approved before June 30, 2025; amending</u>
5	the Administrati	ve Code to and increase the gross receipts threshold from \$2,000,000
6	to \$2,500,000 for	reductions to annual Curbside Shared Spaces <u>permit and</u> license
7	fees; <u>and</u> affirmi	ng the Planning Department's determination under the California
8	Environmental G	Quality Act <del>; and making findings of consistency with the General Plan</del>
9	and the eight pri	ority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.
10		<b>Inchanged Code text and uncodified text</b> are in plain Arial font. <b>Additions to Codes</b> are in <i>single-underline italics Times New Roman font</i> .
11		Deletions to Codes are in <u>single-underline lidits Times New Roman font.</u> Board amendment additions are in <u>double-underlined Arial font.</u>
12		Board amendment additions are in <u>additioned Arial font.</u> Board amendment deletions are in strikethrough Arial font.  Asterisks (* * * *) indicate the omission of unchanged Code
13		subsections or parts of tables.
14		
15	Be it ordair	ned by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:
16		
17	Section 1.	CEQA and Land Use Findings.
18	(a) The PI	anning Department has determined that the actions contemplated in this
19	ordinance comply	with the California Environmental Quality Act (California Public Resources
20	Code Sections 21	000 et seq.). Said determination is on file with the Clerk of the Board of
21	Supervisors in Fil	e No. 230312 and is incorporated herein by reference. The Board affirms
22	this determination	1.
23	<del>(b) On</del>	the Planning Department determined that the actions
24	contemplated in t	his ordinance are consistent, on balance, with the City's General Plan and
25	eight priority polic	ies of Planning Code Section 101.1. The Board adopts this determination

as its own. A copy of said determination is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No.

, and is incorporated herein by reference.

- Section 2. Background and Findings.
- (a) Due to the density of San Francisco, many restaurants and other businesses do not have significant amounts of outdoor space as part of their premises. Thus, for many San Francisco restaurants and businesses to receive the economic boost that often accompanies outdoor operations, it is necessary to operate outdoors beyond their premises.
- (b) In response to the COVID-19 pandemic, on June 9, 2020, the Mayor issued the 18th Supplement to the Proclamation declaring a local emergency to create a temporary program (known as "Shared Spaces") for retail businesses and restaurants to occupy the public sidewalk and parking lane fronting their premises, subject to certain conditions. The Mayor issued several subsequent Supplements to the Proclamation in order to expand opportunities for businesses to conduct operations in additional types of outdoor places.
- (c) In addition to its positive economic impact on small businesses, their owners, employees, and owner and employee families, the Shared Spaces Program delivers multiple other benefits to neighborhoods and to the City, including general civic, social, and psychological wellbeing, and increased pedestrian access in areas typically used for vehicular traffic.
- (d) On July 28, 2021 the Board of Supervisors enacted Ordinance No. 99-21, to create a permanent Shared Spaces Program. The legislation streamlined the interagency review process to allow retail, cultural events, and general recreation to occur in "Curbside Shared Spaces" or parklets, Sidewalk Shared Spaces, "Roadway Shared Spaces" or street closures, City-owned lots under the administration of the Real Estate Division, and some privately owned open spaces. Curbside Shared Spaces are the focus of this ordinance.

- (e) Curbside Shared Spaces includes fixed commercial parklets, movable commercial parklets, and public parklets. For a Curbside Shared Spaces permit, the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency is responsible for reviewing and approving the closure of the parking space to vehicular traffic, and the Department of Public Works is responsible for issuing the permit to occupy the right of way, subject to payment of an initial permit fee and an annual licensing fee. Permit and license fees are due and payable en beginning after March 31, 2023. Businesses or individuals with annual gross receipts within the City that do not exceed \$2,000,000 are eligible for a 50% reduction to the annual license fee.
- (f) Individuals or businesses may convert their Shared Spaces permit issued pursuant to the 18th Supplement or related supplements to the Mayor's proclamation declaring the existence of a local emergency to a permit under the permanent Shared Spaces Program created by Ordinance No. 99-21. Currently, under that legislation, the initial annual license fees and the first subsequent annual license fees are waived for such permittees; however, permit fees are not waived, and are due and payable on March 31, 2023.
- (g) The Board of Supervisors finds that Curbside Shared Spaces permit costs discourage businesses from keeping their existing parklets or applying to construct new parklets. These parklets not only help the business expand but also provide additional employment opportunities for service workers. Curbside Shared Spaces help improve the vibrancy of commercial corridors, and the City wants to encourage small businesses to keep their parklets or apply to create new parklets. Eliminating permit fees Temporarily waiving permit fees will provide businesses with more resources to invest in complying with Curbside Shared Spaces program requirements.
- (h) This ordinance would eliminate permit fees for all Curbside Shared Spaces permittees, including existing permittees under the 18th Supplement and later supplements, in addition to all future permittees. This temporary waiver would expire on June 30, 2025.

1	Further, this ordinance would expand the existing 50% reduction of the permit and annual
2	license fee to businesses or individuals with gross receipts that do not exceed \$2,500,000, in
3	contrast to the current \$2,000,000 limit. But this ordinance does not alter fees for other types
4	of Shared Spaces, including but not limited to fees payable under the Sidewalk Shared
5	Spaces permit.
6	
7	Section 3. Article 2.1 of the Public Works Code is hereby amended by revising Section
8	2.1.1, to read as follows:
9	
10	SEC. 2.1.1. FEES.
11	Notwithstanding the permit fee provisions listed elsewhere in this Code, the permit fee
12	and assessment schedule for the permit categories and uses specifically listed below shall be
13	* * * *
14	(s) Curbside Parklet Fee. The permit and permit and license fees for the types of
15	Curbside Shared Space Permits issued pursuant to Administrative Code Chapter 94A and
16	Public Works Code Section 793 et seq. are as follows, with one half of the fees allocated to
17	the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Authority, and one half of the fees allocated to
18	Public Works. The permit and permit and license fees shall be due and payable as provided in
19	Chapter 94A of the Administrative Code. There shall be no permit fees for Curbside Shared
20	<del>Spaces permits.</del>
21	(i) Public Parklet fees: annual license fee of \$100 per parking space.
22	(A) Permit fee of \$1,000 for the first parking space and \$250 for each additional
23	parking space;
24	(B) Annual license fee of \$100 per parking space.

1	(A) Permit fee of \$1,000 for the first parking space and \$250 for each additional
2	parking space:
3	(B) Annual license fee of \$100 per parking space.
4	(ii) Movable Commercial Parklet fees: annual license fee of \$1,500 per parking
5	<del>space.</del>
6	(A) Permit fee of \$2,000 for the first parking space and \$1,000 for each additional
7	parking space;
8	(B) Annual license fee of \$1,500 per parking space.
9	(A) Permit fee of \$2,000 for the first parking space and \$1,000 for each
10	additional parking space;
11	(B) Annual license fee of \$1,500 per parking space.
12	(iii) Fixed Commercial Parklet fees: annual license fee of \$2,000 per parking
13	<del>space.</del>
14	(A) Permit fee of \$3,000 for the first parking space and \$1,500 for each additional
15	parking space;
16	(B) Annual license fee of \$2,000 per parking space.
17	(A) Permit fee of \$3,000 for the first parking space and \$1,500 for each
18	additional parking space;
19	(B) Annual license fee of \$2,000 per parking space.
20	(t) Temporary Curbside Parklet Fee Waiver. For any Curbside Shared Space Permit
21	approved before June 30, 2025, including any Parklet Permittee or pandemic Shared Spaces
22	Permittee that seeks to convert to a Curbside Shared Space Permit, the following fees shall
23	apply:
24	(i) Public Parklet fees:
25	(A) No permit fee;

1	(B) Annual license fee of \$100 per parking space.
2	(ii) Movable Commercial Parklet fees:
3	(A) No permit fee;
4	(B) Annual license fee of \$1,500 per parking space.
5	(iii) Fixed Commercial Parklet fees:
6	(A) No permit fee;
7	(B) Annual license fee of \$2,000 per parking space.
8	(iv) Sunset. Subsection (t) of Section 2.1.1 shall expire by operation of law on
9	June 30, 2025, unless the duration of the subsection has been extended by ordinance
10	effective on or before that date. Upon expiration, the City Attorney shall cause subsection (t)
11	to be removed from the Public Works Code.
12	
13	Section 4. Chapter 94A of the Administrative Code is hereby amended by revising
14	Sections 94A.10 and 94A.12, to read as follows:
15	
16	SEC. 94A.10. FEES.
17	(a) Shared Space Permit and License Fees. Pursuant to Section 94A.5(c)(1), a
18	Shared Space Permit substitutes for a permit that would otherwise be required by the
19	Municipal Code. Notwithstanding any other provision of the Municipal Code including Public
20	Works Code Section 2.1.3, the permit and license fees may be adjusted each year, without
21	further action by the Board of Supervisors, only to reflect changes in the relevant Consumer
22	Price Index, as determined by the Controller.
23	(1) Public Works shall assess Sidewalk Shared Spaces permit and license fees
24	using the fees authorized in Article 2.1 of the Public Works Code. The fees to be imposed
25	

- shall be based on the proposed scope of the Sidewalk Shared Spaces Permit (e.g. sidewalk tables and chairs, or other appropriate permit types).
  - (2) The *permit and* permit and license fee amounts for Curbside Shared Space

    Permits are set forth in Public Works Code Section 2.1.1(s) and shall be collected by the Tax

    Collector and due and payable as follows:
  - (A) The <u>permit license permit fees</u> for Curbside Shared Spaces shall be due and payable <u>upon the Tax Collector's issuance of the bill following permit approval, and the annual license fees shall be due and payable upon the Tax Collector's issuance of the bill following permit approval, and the annual license fees shall be due and payable annually on March 31, in accordance with Article 2, Section 76.1 of the Business and Tax Regulations Code, with the initial license fee, prorated as described in Section 76.1(a), being due and payable upon the Tax Collector's issuance of the bill for that fee following permit approval.</u>
  - (B) The permit and permit and license fees for a Curbside Shared Spaces shall be reduced by 50% for a person or combined group within the meaning of Article 12-A-1 of the Business and Tax Regulations Code if the person or combined group's gross receipts within the City as determined under Article 12-A-1 reflected on the person or combined group's most recently filed gross receipts tax return, business registration renewal, or initial business registration application did not exceed \$2,000,000 \\$2,500,000, adjusted annually in accordance with the increase in the Consumer Price Index: All Urban Consumers for the San Francisco/Oakland/San Jose Area for All Items as reported by the United States Bureau of Labor Statistics, or any successor to that index, as of December 31 of the preceding year, beginning with December 31, 2021–2023. If no San Francisco gross receipts were reflected on a person or combined group's gross receipts tax return, business registration renewal, or initial business registration application, such person or combined group will be treated as having \$0 San Francisco gross receipts for purposes of this subsection (a)(2)(B).

(C) If a Permittee does not pay the permit fee within 30 days after it becomes due and
payable, the Tax Collector shall add 10% to the amount of the permit fee as a penalty for nonpayment.
If the permittee does not pay the fee within 60 days after it becomes due and payable, the Tax Collector
shall add 15% to the amount of the permit fee as a penalty for nonpayment. If the permittee does not
pay the fee within 90 days after it becomes due and payable, the Tax Collector shall add 25% to the
amount of the permit fee as a penalty for nonpayment. If the permittee has failed for a period of six
months or more to pay a permit fee, the Tax Collector shall impose an additional penalty of 25% on the
amount of the delinquent permit fee, and shall refer the delinquent permittee to the Department of
Public Works for administrative action on the permit. These penalties are mandatory and City officers
and employees may not waive them in whole or in part. If a Permittee does not pay the permit fee
within 30 days after it becomes due and payable, the Tax Collector shall add 10% to the
amount of the permit fee as a penalty for nonpayment. If the permittee does not pay the fee
within 60 days after it becomes due and payable, the Tax Collector shall add 15% to the
amount of the permit fee as a penalty for nonpayment. If the permittee does not pay the fee
within 90 days after it becomes due and payable, the Tax Collector shall add 25% to the
amount of the permit fee as a penalty for nonpayment. If the permittee has failed for a period
of six months or more to pay a permit fee, the Tax Collector shall impose an additional penalty
of 25% on the amount of the delinquent permit fee, and shall refer the delinquent permittee to
the Department of Public Works for administrative action on the permit. These penalties are
mandatory and City officers and employees may not waive them in whole or in part. Licensees
shall be subject to penalties for delinquent payment of license fees as provided in Article 2,
Section 76.1 of the Business and Tax Regulations Code.
(3) The fees for Roadway Shared Space Permits shall be authorized by the

25 \* \* \* \*

Transportation Code.

A	
1	
- 1	
_	

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

## SEC. 94A.12. TRANSITION OF EXISTING SHARED SPACES AND PARKLETS.

3

(c) Temporary Fee Waiver and Deferral for Parklet and Pandemic Shared Space **Permit Conversion.** Notwithstanding the provisions regarding permit and license fee payment set forth in Section 94A.10(a)(2)(adminiA), for any Parklet Permittee or pandemic Shared Spaces Permittee that seeks to convert to a Curbside Shared Space Permit: (i) the permit fees shall be due and payable on March 31, 2023, (ii) the permit fees shall be due and payable on March 31, 2023, (ii) the initial annual license fees and the first subsequent annual license fees shall be waived, and (iii) (iii) the annual license fees thereafter shall be due and payable annually on March 31, in accordance with Article 2, Section 76.1 of the Business and Tax Regulations Code, beginning with the second March 31 following the date the Curbside Shared Space Permit is approved. Establishments that are considered a Formula Retail Use, as defined in Section 102 of the Planning Code, shall be ineligible for the temporary fee waiver and deferral set forth in this subsection (c). A Parklet Permittee or pandemic Shared Spaces Permittee that seeks to convert to a Curbside Shared Space Permit shall be eligible for the permit fee waivers set forth in Public Works Code Section 2.1.1(t).

18 19

20

21

22

23

24

Section <u>56</u>. Effective Date; Retroactivity.

(a) This ordinance shall become effective 30 days after enactment. Enactment occurs when the Mayor signs the ordinance, the Mayor returns the ordinance unsigned or does not sign the ordinance within ten days of receiving it, or the Board of Supervisors overrides the Mayor's veto of the ordinance.

1	(b) The Board of Supervisors intends that this ordinance be operative to eliminate the
2	permit fees for Curbside Shared Space Permits that are due and payable on March 31, 2023
3	and thereafter. To effectuate this intent, the operative provisions of this ordinance shall be
4	retroactive to March 31, 2023 should the effective date of the ordinance occur after March 31,
5	2023. If any fees that are waived by this ordinance have been collected prior to its effective
6	date, said fees shall be promptly refunded on or after the effective date of the ordinance.
7	without interest, upon request of the payor of the fee. Any refund request under this
8	ordinance must be filed in writing with the Tax Collector within one year of payment of the fee
9	
10	Section 67. Scope of Ordinance. In enacting this ordinance, the Board of Supervisors
11	intends to amend only those words, phrases, paragraphs, subsections, sections, articles,
12	numbers, punctuation marks, charts, diagrams, or any other constituent parts of the Municipa
13	Code that are explicitly shown in this ordinance as additions, deletions, Board amendment
14	additions, and Board amendment deletions in accordance with the "Note" that appears under
15	the official title of the ordinance.
16	
17	APPROVED AS TO FORM:
18	DAVID CHIU, City Attorney
19	By: /s/ Giulia Gualco-Nelson
20	GIULIA GUALCO-NELSON Deputy City Attorney
21	n:\legana\as2023\2300272\01685035.docx
22	
23	
24	
25	

# **REVISED LEGISLATIVE DIGEST**

(Amended in Committee, 6/22/2023)

[Public Works, Administrative Codes - Curbside Shared Spaces Permit and License Fees]

Ordinance amending the Public Works and Administrative Code to eliminate permit fees for a Curbside Shared Spaces permit approved before June 30, 2025; amending the Administrative Code to increase the gross receipts threshold from \$2,000,000 to \$2,500,000 for reductions to annual Curbside Shared Spaces permit and license fees; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act.

## **Existing Law**

Under Administrative Code Sections 94A.10 and 94A.12, permit and annual license fees for Curbside Shared Spaces, including Curbside Shared Spaces permitted pursuant to the 18th Supplement to the Mayor's proclamation of a public emergency and related supplements, are due and payable on March 31, 2023. Businesses or individuals with annual gross receipts that do not exceed \$2,000,000 are eligible for a 50% reduction to the annual license fee. Public Works Code Section 2.1.1 sets forth the fee schedule for the Curbside Shared Spaces permit fees and annual license fees.

## Amendments to Current Law

This ordinance would amend Public Works Code Section 2.1.1 and Administrative Code Sections 94A.10 and 94A.12 to waive permit fees for Curbside Shared Spaces permits approved before June 30, 2025. In addition to the temporary permit fee waiver, the ordinance would increase the gross receipts threshold to \$2,500,000 to qualify for the 50% reduction to the annual license and permit fees.

The operative provisions of this ordinance would be retroactive to March 31, 2023 should the effective date of the ordinance occur after March 31, 2023. If any fees that are waived by this ordinance have been collected prior to its effective date, the fees would be promptly refunded without interest, upon request of the payor of the fee.

# Background Information

This ordinance reflects amendments made at the Budget and Appropriations Committee on June 22, 2023. Those amendments limited the permit fee waiver to two years, expiring on June 30, 2025, in addition to restoring the references to Curbside Shared Spaces permit fees that earlier versions of the ordinance (versions 1 and 2) had removed from the Public Works and Administrative Codes.

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS Page 1

# FILE NO. 230312

This ordinance also reflects previous amendments made at the Budget and Appropriations Committee on June 14, 2023. Those amendments clarified the refund procedures.

n:\legana\as2023\2300272\01685654.docx

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS Page 2

Item 8	Department:
File 23-0312	Public Works, Municipal Transportation Agency, Planning
(Continued from 6/14/21 meeting)	

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

## **Legislative Objectives**

 The proposed ordinance would amend Section 2.1.1 of the Public Works Code and Chapter 94A of the Administrative Code to eliminate fees for Curbside Shared Space permits and increase the gross receipts fee discount threshold from \$2.19 million to \$2.5 million. Annual Curbside license fees and other Program fees would not be changed.

## **Key Points**

- Administrative Code Chapter 94A establishes the Shared Spaces Program, which allows
  private entities to occupy public right of way, including sidewalks, curbside street areas
  (including parking spaces), roadways, and City-owned lots, for commercial activity. The
  focus of the proposed ordinance is curbside shared spaces.
- For a Curbside Shared Spaces permit, the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA) is responsible for approving the closure of the parking space and the Department of Public Works (DPW) is responsible for reviewing the parklet design, issuing the permit to occupy the right of way, and ensuring compliance of permit requirements. Permitees must pay an initial one-time permit fee and an annual licensing fee. Curbside fee revenues are split evenly between MTA and DPW.
- FY 2022-23 total program costs are \$7.7 million and consist of MTA, DPW, and Planning staff costs (\$3.6 million), parking meter revenue loss (\$3.5 million), and MTA citation enforcement revenue loss associated with replacing parking meters with shared spaces (\$0.6 million).

#### **Fiscal Impact**

The proposed fee reduction would result in a reduction of one-time permit revenue of \$1.4 million in FY 2022-23. Future permit revenue, which depends on how many new parklets are established, would also be foregone as the ordinance permanently waives permit fees. Annual license fees would decrease by approximately \$20,000 due to the increase in the small business discount eligibility threshold.

#### **Policy Consideration**

Under the Administrative Code, the Planning Department is tasked with "general coordination of program activities," which was provided by a Project Manager I, vacant as of June 2023. The Board of Supervisors should consider amending the Code to remove that responsibility from Planning and deleting that position, providing annual savings of \$250,000.

#### Recommendation

Approval of the proposed ordinance is a policy matter for the Board of Supervisors.

#### **MANDATE STATEMENT**

City Charter Section 2.105 states that all legislative acts shall be by ordinance, approved by a majority of the members of the Board of Supervisors.

## **BACKGROUND**

Administrative Code Chapter 94A establishes the Shared Spaces Program, which allows private entities to occupy public right of way, including sidewalks, curbside street areas (including parking spaces), roadways, and City-owned lots, for commercial activity.

The focus of the proposed ordinance is curbside shared spaces, which may be occupied by fixed, movable, or public parklets. For a Curbside Shared Spaces permit, the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA) is responsible for approving the closure of the parking space and the Department of Public Works (DPW) is responsible for reviewing the parklet design, issuing the permit to occupy the right of way, and ensuring compliance of permit requirements. Permitees must pay an initial one-time permit fee and an annual licensing fee. The Planning Department is responsible for coordinating the program and participating in the design review.

Based on current law, permit and license fees were due and payable on March 31, 2023. Curbside fee revenues are split evenly between MTA and DPW. Businesses with annual gross receipts up to \$2,000,000 are eligible for a "small business discount" - a 50% reduction to the permit fees and annual license fee. Prior to 2023, no fees were collected since the start of the program in 2020.

#### **DETAILS OF PROPOSED LEGISLATION**

The proposed ordinance would amend Section 2.1.1 of the Public Works Code and Chapter 94A of the Administrative Code to eliminate fees for Curbside Shared Space permits and increase the gross receipts fee discount threshold from \$2.19 million to \$2.5 million. Annual Curbside license fees and other Program fees would not be changed. Exhibit 1 below shows the current and proposed fee structure.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Public parklets do not have commercial activity.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The Shared Space Program also has fees for the Entertainment Commission, use of sidewalks, and use of roadways.

**Exhibit 1: Current and Proposed Fees** 

		Current			Proposed	
	First	Additional	Annual	First	Additional	Annual
	Parking	Parking	License	Parking	Parking	License
Parklet Type	Space	Space	Fee	Space	Space	Fee
Public	\$1,000	\$250	\$100	\$0	\$0	\$100
Movable	\$2,000	\$1,000	\$1,500	\$0	\$0	\$1,500
Fixed	\$3,000	\$1,500	\$2,000	\$0	\$0	\$2,000
	If gross receipts are less than		If gross red	eipts are less t	han	
50% Discount	\$2.19 millio	on		\$2.5 millio	n	

Source: Public Works Code, Administrative Code, Proposed Ordinance

According to Treasurer-Tax Collector data, 74 percent of program participants qualify for the fee discount because they have gross receipts of \$2.19 million per year or less. Increasing the threshold would increase the proportion of businesses that qualify for the discount to 78 percent.

Exhibit 2 below shows the program cost projected in FY 2023-24, based on permit applications that have been submitted as of May 2023.<sup>3</sup>

**Exhibit 2: FY 2022-23 Curbside Shared Space Program Costs** 

	FY 2022-23
<u>MTA</u>	
Labor	\$2,100,000
Meter Revenue	\$3,500,000
Citation Loss	\$600,000
Subtotal, MTA	\$6,200,000
DPW	
Labor	\$1,210,000
<u>Planning</u>	
Labor	\$250,000
Total	\$7,660,000

Sources: MTA, DPW, BLA Analysis

As shown above, FY 2022-23 total program costs are \$7.7 million and consist of MTA, DPW, and Planning staff costs (\$3.6 million), parking meter revenue loss (\$3.5 million), and citation enforcement revenue loss associated with replacement of parking meters with shared spaces (\$0.6 million). DPW and MTA labor costs include overhead and consist primarily of evaluating permit applications. If the program achieves a "steady state" and has fewer new participants in future years, DPW and MTA staff costs for this program will be lower.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> As of April 2023, the program provided 644 permits covering 1,133 parking spaces, of which 763 were metered. This was a decrease from FY 2021-22, which provided permits covering 1,937 metered parking spaces.

#### **FISCAL IMPACT**

Exhibit 3 below shows the change in revenue from the proposed ordinance, which would apply to permits issued in FY 2022-23. Detail by parklet type is included in Attachment I to this report.

**Exhibit 3: Change in Fee Revenue in FY 2022-23** 

Revenue	Current	Proposed	Change	
Permits (one-time)	\$1,371,668	\$0	(\$1,371,668)	
License (ongoing)	\$665,280	\$645,447	(\$19,833)	

Sources: MTA, TTX, BLA Analysis

Notes: Amounts shown include the current and proposed small business discount.

As shown above, the proposed fee reduction would result in a reduction of one-time permit revenue of \$1.4 million in FY 2022-23. Future permit revenue, which depends on how many new parklets are established, would also be foregone as the ordinance permanently waives permit fees. Annual license fees would decrease by approximately \$20,000 due to the increase in the small business discount eligibility threshold.

Reducing permit fees may increase the number of businesses that participate in the Shared Space Curbside program, increasing program costs. For example, the number of parking meters taken offline for the Shared Space program decreased from 1,937 in FY 2021-22 to 763 in FY 2022-23, the year when the program began collecting fees.

#### **POLICY CONSIDERATION**

#### **Use of Public Property**

The Curbside Shared Spaces program re-purposes public right of way, 67 percent of which is metered, largely for commercial purposes. As noted above, this results in an annual revenue loss to MTA of \$4.1 million. A portion of this may be offset by increased business and sales tax resulting from commercial activity.

#### Revenue

The program's existing fees are not based on a fee study and do not provide for full cost recovery. Before including the small business discount, for which most businesses are eligible, the average cost for a fixed parklet is \$4,100 per permit and \$2,000 per annual license. Based on FY 2022-23 program costs and lost revenues totaling \$7.66 million and 645 permits issues that year, the cost per permit is approximately \$11,900.

#### **Programmatic Data**

Administrative Code Section 94A requires collection and reporting of programmatic data, including: data on time between permit application and issuance, participation and user feedback data, reporting on revoked permits, and compliance audits of existing shared space permits. Documentation of this work was not available for our review and the work does not appear to be underway. According to the former Shared Spaces Program manager, the Mayor's Office of Civic Innovation is currently building a reporting tool that will aggregate program data for management analysis. The Board should request a report from Public Works, MTA, and Planning on the performance of the program.

#### **Planning Department Role**

Under the Administrative Code, the Planning Department is tasked with "general coordination of program activities," which was provided by a Project Manager I, vacant as of June 2023. The Board of Supervisors should consider amending the Code to remove that responsibility from Planning and deleting that position, providing annual savings of \$250,000. DPW and MTA each already have senior management staff assigned to this program (a Manager VII and Transportation Planner IV, respectively).

#### **RECOMMENDATION**

Approval of the proposed ordinance is a policy matter for the Board of Supervisors.

# **Attachment I: Revenue Change Detail**

# **Permits**

Count	Revenue	Current	Proposed	Change
104	Public	\$125,500	\$0.00	(\$125,500)
12	Movable	\$31,000	\$0.00	(\$31,000)
528	Fixed	\$2,177,250	\$0.00	(\$2,177,250)
	Discounts	(\$805,583)	\$0.00	n/a
644	Total	\$1,371,668	\$0.00	(\$1,371,668)

## Licenses

Count	Revenue	Current	Proposed	Change
104	Public	\$10,400	\$10,400	\$0
12	Movable	\$18,000	\$18,000	\$0
528	Fixed	\$1,056,000	\$1,056,000	\$0
	Discounts	(\$390,720)	(\$410,553)	(\$19,833)
644	Total	\$665,280	\$645,447	(\$19,833)

Source: BLA Analysis

Item 14	Department:
File 23-0312	Public Works, Municipal Transportation Agency, Planning

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

## **Legislative Objectives**

• The proposed ordinance would amend Section 2.1.1 of the Public Works Code and Chapter 94A of the Administrative Code to eliminate fees for Curbside Shared Space permits and increase the gross receipts fee discount threshold from \$2.19 million to \$2.5 million. Annual Curbside license fees and other Program fees would not be changed.

#### **Key Points**

- Administrative Code Chapter 94A establishes the Shared Spaces Program, which allows
  private entities to occupy public right of way, including sidewalks, curbside street areas
  (including parking spaces), roadways, and City-owned lots, for commercial activity. The
  focus of the proposed ordinance is curbside shared spaces.
- For a Curbside Shared Spaces permit, the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA) is responsible for approving the closure of the parking space and the Department of Public Works (DPW) is responsible for reviewing the parklet design, issuing the permit to occupy the right of way, and ensuring compliance of permit requirements. Permitees must pay an initial one-time permit fee and an annual licensing fee. Curbside fee revenues are split evenly between MTA and DPW.
- FY 2022-23 total program costs are \$7.7 million and consist of MTA, DPW, and Planning staff costs (\$3.6 million), parking meter revenue loss (\$3.5 million), and MTA citation enforcement revenue loss associated with replacing parking meters with shared spaces (\$0.6 million).

#### **Fiscal Impact**

• The proposed fee reduction would result in a reduction of one-time permit revenue of \$1.4 million in FY 2022-23. Future permit revenue, which depends on how many new parklets are established, would also be foregone as the ordinance permanently waives permit fees. Annual license fees would decrease by approximately \$20,000 due to the increase in the small business discount eligibility threshold.

#### **Policy Consideration**

Under the Administrative Code, the Planning Department is tasked with "general coordination of program activities," which was provided by a Project Manager I, vacant as of June 2023. The Board of Supervisors should consider amending the Code to remove that responsibility from Planning and deleting that position, providing annual savings of \$250,000.

#### Recommendation

Approval of the proposed ordinance is a policy matter for the Board of Supervisors.

#### **MANDATE STATEMENT**

City Charter Section 2.105 states that all legislative acts shall be by ordinance, approved by a majority of the members of the Board of Supervisors.

## **BACKGROUND**

Administrative Code Chapter 94A establishes the Shared Spaces Program, which allows private entities to occupy public right of way, including sidewalks, curbside street areas (including parking spaces), roadways, and City-owned lots, for commercial activity.

The focus of the proposed ordinance is curbside shared spaces, which may be occupied by fixed, movable, or public parklets. For a Curbside Shared Spaces permit, the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA) is responsible for approving the closure of the parking space and the Department of Public Works (DPW) is responsible for reviewing the parklet design, issuing the permit to occupy the right of way, and ensuring compliance of permit requirements. Permitees must pay an initial one-time permit fee and an annual licensing fee. The Planning Department is responsible for coordinating the program and participating in the design review.

Based on current law, permit and license fees were due and payable on March 31, 2023. Curbside fee revenues are split evenly between MTA and DPW. Businesses with annual gross receipts up to \$2,000,000 are eligible for a "small business discount" - a 50% reduction to the permit fees and annual license fee. Prior to 2023, no fees were collected since the start of the program in 2020.

#### **DETAILS OF PROPOSED LEGISLATION**

The proposed ordinance would amend Section 2.1.1 of the Public Works Code and Chapter 94A of the Administrative Code to eliminate fees for Curbside Shared Space permits and increase the gross receipts fee discount threshold from \$2.19 million to \$2.5 million. Annual Curbside license fees and other Program fees would not be changed. Exhibit 1 below shows the current and proposed fee structure.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Public parklets do not have commercial activity.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The Shared Space Program also has fees for the Entertainment Commission, use of sidewalks, and use of roadways.

**Exhibit 1: Current and Proposed Fees** 

		Current			Proposed	
	First	Additional	Annual	First	Additional	Annual
	Parking	Parking	License	Parking	Parking	License
Parklet Type	Space	Space	Fee	Space	Space	Fee
Public	\$1,000	\$250	\$100	\$0	\$0	\$100
Movable	\$2,000	\$1,000	\$1,500	\$0	\$0	\$1,500
Fixed	\$3,000	\$1,500	\$2,000	\$0	\$0	\$2,000
	If gross red	If gross receipts are less than		If gross red	eipts are less	than
50% Discount	\$2.19 million \$2.5 m		\$2.5 millio	n		

Source: Public Works Code, Administrative Code, Proposed Ordinance

According to Treasurer-Tax Collector data, 74 percent of program participants qualify for the fee discount because they have gross receipts of \$2.19 million per year or less. Increasing the threshold would increase the proportion of businesses that qualify for the discount to 78 percent.

Exhibit 2 below shows the program cost projected in FY 2023-24, based on permit applications that have been submitted as of May 2023.<sup>3</sup>

**Exhibit 2: FY 2022-23 Curbside Shared Space Program Costs** 

	FY 2022-23
MTA	
Labor	\$2,100,000
Meter Revenue	\$3,500,000
Citation Loss	\$600,000
Subtotal, MTA	\$6,200,000
<u>DPW</u>	
Labor	\$1,210,000
<u>Planning</u>	
Labor	\$250,000
<u>Total</u>	\$7,660,000

Sources: MTA, DPW, BLA Analysis

As shown above, FY 2022-23 total program costs are \$7.7 million and consist of MTA, DPW, and Planning staff costs (\$3.6 million), parking meter revenue loss (\$3.5 million), and citation enforcement revenue loss associated with replacement of parking meters with shared spaces (\$0.6 million). DPW and MTA labor costs include overhead and consist primarily of evaluating permit applications. If the program achieves a "steady state" and has fewer new participants in future years, DPW and MTA staff costs for this program will be lower.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> As of April 2023, the program provided 644 permits covering 1,133 parking spaces, of which 763 were metered. This was a decrease from FY 2021-22, which provided permits covering 1,937 metered parking spaces.

#### **FISCAL IMPACT**

Exhibit 3 below shows the change in revenue from the proposed ordinance, which would apply to permits issued in FY 2022-23. Detail by parklet type is included in Attachment I to this report.

**Exhibit 3: Change in Fee Revenue in FY 2022-23** 

Revenue	Current	Proposed	Change	
Permits (one-time)	\$1,371,668	\$0	(\$1,371,668)	
License (ongoing)	\$665,280	\$645,447	(\$19,833)	

Sources: MTA, TTX, BLA Analysis

Notes: Amounts shown include the current and proposed small business discount.

As shown above, the proposed fee reduction would result in a reduction of one-time permit revenue of \$1.4 million in FY 2022-23. Future permit revenue, which depends on how many new parklets are established, would also be foregone as the ordinance permanently waives permit fees. Annual license fees would decrease by approximately \$20,000 due to the increase in the small business discount eligibility threshold.

Reducing permit fees may increase the number of businesses that participate in the Shared Space Curbside program, increasing program costs. For example, the number of parking meters taken offline for the Shared Space program decreased from 1,937 in FY 2021-22 to 763 in FY 2022-23, the year when the program began collecting fees.

#### **POLICY CONSIDERATION**

#### Use of Public Property

The Curbside Shared Spaces program re-purposes public right of way, 67 percent of which is metered, largely for commercial purposes. As noted above, this results in an annual revenue loss to MTA of \$4.1 million. A portion of this may be offset by increased business and sales tax resulting from commercial activity.

#### Revenue

The program's existing fees are not based on a fee study and do not provide for full cost recovery. Before including the small business discount, for which most businesses are eligible, the average cost for a fixed parklet is \$4,100 per permit and \$2,000 per annual license. Based on FY 2022-23 program costs and lost revenues totaling \$7.66 million and 645 permits issues that year, the cost per permit is approximately \$11,900.

#### **Programmatic Data**

Administrative Code Section 94A requires collection and reporting of programmatic data, including: data on time between permit application and issuance, participation and user feedback data, reporting on revoked permits, and compliance audits of existing shared space permits. Documentation of this work was not available for our review and the work does not appear to

SAN FRANCISCO BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

**BUDGET AND LEGISLATIVE ANALYST** 

be underway. According to the former Shared Spaces Program manager, the Mayor's Office of Civic Innovation is currently building a reporting tool that will aggregate program data for management analysis. The Board should request a report from Public Works, MTA, and Planning on the performance of the program.

#### **Planning Department Role**

Under the Administrative Code, the Planning Department is tasked with "general coordination of program activities," which was provided by a Project Manager I, vacant as of June 2023. The Board of Supervisors should consider amending the Code to remove that responsibility from Planning and deleting that position, providing annual savings of \$250,000. DPW and MTA each already have senior management staff assigned to this program (a Manager VII and Transportation Planner IV, respectively).

#### **RECOMMENDATION**

Approval of the proposed ordinance is a policy matter for the Board of Supervisors.

# **Attachment I: Revenue Change Detail**

# **Permits**

Count	Revenue	Current	Proposed	Change
104	Public	\$125,500	\$0.00	(\$125,500)
12	Movable	\$31,000	\$0.00	(\$31,000)
528	Fixed	\$2,177,250	\$0.00	(\$2,177,250)
	Discounts	(\$805,583)	\$0.00	n/a
644	Total	\$1,371,668	\$0.00	(\$1,371,668)

## Licenses

Count	Revenue	Current	Proposed	Change
104	Public	\$10,400	\$10,400	\$0
12	Movable	\$18,000	\$18,000	\$0
528	Fixed	\$1,056,000	\$1,056,000	\$0
	Discounts	(\$390,720)	(\$410,553)	(\$19,833)
644	Total	\$665,280	\$645,447	(\$19,833)

Source: BLA Analysis



**City Hall** 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244 San Francisco, CA 94102-4689 Tel. No. (415) 554-5184 Fax No. (415) 554-5163 TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

# **MEMORANDUM**

	Date:	March 24, 2023
	To:	Planning Department / Commission
	From:	Brent Jalipa, Clerk of the Budget and Finance Committee
	Subject:	Board of Supervisors Legislation Referral - File No. 230312 Public Works, Administrative Codes - Curbside Shared Spaces Permit and License Fees
$\boxtimes$	(Californi ⊠	ia Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Determination ia Public Resources Code, Sections 21000 et seq.) Ordinance / Resolution Ballot Measure
	(Planning	nent to the Planning Code, including the following Findings:  *Code, Section 302(b): 90 days for Planning Commission review)  *eral Plan   Planning Code, Section 101.1   Planning Code, Section 302
		nent to the Administrative Code, involving Land Use/Planning ule 3.23: 30 days for possible Planning Department review)
	(Charter, (Require subdivise relocation public he the annu	Plan Referral for Non-Planning Code Amendments Section 4.105, and Administrative Code, Section 2A.53) d for legislation concerning the acquisition, vacation, sale, or change in use of City property; ion of land; construction, improvement, extension, widening, narrowing, removal, or in of public ways, transportation routes, ground, open space, buildings, or structures; plans for ousing and publicly-assisted private housing; redevelopment plans; development agreements; all capital expenditure plan and six-year capital improvement program; and any capital ment project or long-term financing proposal such as general obligation or revenue bonds.)
		Preservation Commission  Landmark (Planning Code, Section 1004.3)  Cultural Districts (Charter, Section 4.135 & Board Rule 3.23)  Mills Act Contract (Government Code, Section 50280)  Designation for Significant/Contributory Buildings (Planning Code, Article 11)

Please send the Planning Department/Commission recommendation/determination to Brent Jalipa at Brent.Jalipa@sfgov.org.

Not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines Section 15378 and 15060(c)(2) because it would not result in a direct and indirect physical change in the environment.

03/31/2023



CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO LONDON BREED, MAYOR

OFFICE OF SMALL BUSINESS
DIRECTOR KATY TANG

April 24, 2023

Ms. Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board City Hall Room 244 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

RE: BOS File No. 230312 – Public Works, Administrative Codes - Curbside Shared Spaces Permit and License Fees - SUPPORT

Dear Ms. Calvillo,

On April 24, 2023 the Small Business Commission (the Commission) heard BOS File 230312 – Public Works, Administrative Codes - Curbside Shared Spaces Permit and License Fees. Supervisor Safai presented the legislation, explaining the importance of curbside Shared Spaces and his hope that eliminating permit fees will help operators keep their parklets. Under this proposal, permit fees for curbside Shared Spaces will be eliminated, and the gross receipts threshold to receive a partial fee waiver for ongoing annual license fees will increase from \$2 million in gross receipts to \$2.5 million.

The Commission unanimously voted to support this legislation noting that businesses are still in economic recovery and many rely on their parklets to bring in revenue and expand seating. The permit and license fee costs for the Shared Spaces curbside program can be significant, especially when considered alongside the costs of upgrading a parklet to meet design guidelines. Eliminating fees will support and encourage small businesses to keep their parklets post-pandemic. Increasing the gross receipts threshold to qualify for reduced annual license fees will expand eligibility to more small businesses, especially restaurants. The Commission has been a champion of the Shared Spaces Program and supports proposals such as this that make it easier for businesses to operate their parklets.

The Commission commends Supervisor Safai and his staff for their ongoing support of small businesses. Thank you for considering the Commission's recommendations. Please feel free to contact me should you have any questions.

Sincerely,

**Katy Tang** 

Director, Office of Small Business



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. (415) 554-5184
Fax No. (415) 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

# MEMORANDUM

TO: Carla Short, Interim Director, Public Works

Andrico Penick, Director, Real Estate Division

Jeffrey Tumlin, Executive Director, Municipal Transportation Agency José Cisneros, City Treasurer, Office of the Treasurer and Tax Collector

FROM: Brent Jalipa, Assistant Clerk, Budget and Finance Committee

DATE: March 24, 2023

SUBJECT: PROPOSED ORDINANCE INTRODUCED

The Board of Supervisors' Budget and Finance Committee has received the following proposed Ordinance, introduced by Supervisor Ahsha Safai:

File No. 230312

Ordinance amending the Public Works and Administrative Code to eliminate permit fees for Curbside Shared Spaces and increase the gross receipts threshold from \$2,000,000 to \$2,500,000 for reductions to annual Curbside Shared Spaces license fees; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.

If you have any comments or reports to be included with the file, please forward them to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.

c: David Steinberg, Public Works
Ian Schneider, Public Works
Lena Liu, Public Works
Kate Breen, Municipal Transportation Agency
Janet Martinsen, Municipal Transportation Agency
Joel Ramos, Municipal Transportation Agency
Amanda Kahn Fried, Office of the Treasurer and Tax Collector



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689
Tel. No. (415) 554-5184
Fax No. (415) 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

# **MEMORANDUM**

_		
	Date:	March 24, 2023
	To:	Planning Department / Commission
	From:	Brent Jalipa, Clerk of the Budget and Finance Committee
	Subject:	Board of Supervisors Legislation Referral - File No. 230312 Public Works, Administrative Codes - Curbside Shared Spaces Permit and License Fees
$\boxtimes$	(Californio	a Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Determination a Public Resources Code, Sections 21000 et seq.) Ordinance / Resolution Ballot Measure
		nent to the Planning Code, including the following Findings:  Code, Section 302(b): 90 days for Planning Commission review)  eral Plan   Planning Code, Section 101.1   Planning Code, Section 302
		nent to the Administrative Code, involving Land Use/Planning ule 3.23: 30 days for possible Planning Department review)
	(Charter, Control (Required subdivision relocation public house)	Plan Referral for Non-Planning Code Amendments Section 4.105, and Administrative Code, Section 2A.53) d for legislation concerning the acquisition, vacation, sale, or change in use of City property; on of land; construction, improvement, extension, widening, narrowing, removal, or n of public ways, transportation routes, ground, open space, buildings, or structures; plans for busing and publicly-assisted private housing; redevelopment plans; development agreements; all capital expenditure plan and six-year capital improvement program; and any capital ment project or long-term financing proposal such as general obligation or revenue bonds.)
		Preservation Commission  Landmark ( <i>Planning Code, Section 1004.3</i> )  Cultural Districts ( <i>Charter, Section 4.135 &amp; Board Rule 3.23</i> )  Mills Act Contract ( <i>Government Code, Section 50280</i> )  Designation for Significant/Contributory Buildings ( <i>Planning Code, Article 11</i> )

Please send the Planning Department/Commission recommendation/determination to Brent Jalipa at Brent Jalipa@sfgov.org.



City Hall
Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. (415) 554-5184
Fax No. (415) 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

## MEMORANDUM

TO: Katy Tang

Small Business Commission, City Hall, Room 448

FROM: Brent Jalipa, Assistant Clerk

**Budget and Finance Committee** 

DATE: March 24, 2023

SUBJECT: REFERRAL FROM BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

**Budget and Finance Committee** 

The Board of Supervisors' Budget and Finance Committee has received the following proposed legislation, introduced by Supervisor Ahsha Safai on March 21, 2023, which is being referred to the Small Business Commission for comment and recommendation.

File No. 230312

Ordinance amending the Public Works and Administrative Code to eliminate permit fees for Curbside Shared Spaces and increase the gross receipts threshold from \$2,000,000 to \$2,500,000 for reductions to annual Curbside Shared Spaces license fees; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.

Please return this cover sheet with the Commission's response to Brent Jalipa, Budget

**Chairperson, Small Business Commission** 

# **Introduction Form**

(by a Member of the Board of Supervisors or the Mayor)

I here	by subm	nit the following item for introduction (select only one):	
	1,	For reference to Committee (Ordinance, Resolution, Motion or Charter Amendme	nt)
	2.	Request for next printed agenda (For Adoption Without Committee Reference) (Routine, non-controversial and/or commendatory matters only)	,
	3.	Request for Hearing on a subject matter at Committee	
	4.	Request for Letter beginning with "Supervisor in	iquires"
	5.	City Attorney Request	
	6.	Call File No. from Committee.	
	7.	Budget and Legislative Analyst Request (attached written Motion)	
	8.	Substitute Legislation File No.	
	9.	Reactivate File No.	
	10.	Topic submitted for Mayoral Appearance before the Board on	
The p		legislation should be forwarded to the following (please check all appropriate boxenall Business Commission    Youth Commission    Ethics Commission anning Commission    Building Inspection Commission    Human Resources	n
Gene	al Plan i □ Ye	Referral sent to the Planning Department (proposed legislation subject to Charter 4.	105 & Admin 2A.53)
(Note	: For Im	perative Agenda items (a Resolution not on the printed agenda), use the Imperative	: Agenda Form.)
	sor(s):		
	na Safa	a <b>i</b>	
Subje Publ		s, Administrative Codes - Curbside Shared Spaces Permit and License Fee	s
L Long	Title or	text listed:	
and ir Space	ncrease t es license	nending the Public Works and Administrative Code to eliminate permit fees for Curbside State gross receipts threshold from \$2,000,000 to \$2,500,000 for reductions to annual Curbs e fees; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environme and and the eight priority policies of Planning Code and the eight priority policies a	ide Shared ntal Quality Act;
		Signature of Sponsoring Supervisor:	