

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689
Tel. No. (415) 554-5184
Fax No. (415) 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. (415) 554-5227

June 28, 2023

The Honorable Anne-Christine Massullo
Presiding Judge
Superior Court of California, County of San Francisco
400 McAllister
San Francisco, CA 94102

Subject: 2018-2019 Civil Grand Jury Report, "Act Now Before it is Too Late: Aggressively Expand and Enhance our High-Pressure Emergency Firefighting Water System" (Board File No. 190785).

Dear Judge Massullo:

The following is a status update on the 2018-2019 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Act Now Before it is Too Late: Aggressively Expand and Enhance our High-Pressure Emergency Firefighting Water System" (Board File No. 190785).

The Board of Supervisors' Government Audit and Oversight Committee conducted a public hearing on June 1, 2023, to update the responses offered during the 2018-2019 Civil Grand Jury season; the Board of Supervisors adopted Motion No. M23-089 on June 13, 2023.

Motion No. M23-089 updated the Board of Supervisors responses to:

- Recommendation Nos. R1, R2, R3, R6, R7 and R8.

Please accept this copy of Motion No. M23-089 for the Civil Grand Jury records. If you have any questions, please contact me at (415) 554-5184.

Sincerely,


Angela Calvillo
Clerk of the Board

sc:jec:ams

cc:

Members, Board of Supervisors
Tom Paulino, Office of the Mayor
Anne Pearson, Office of the City Attorney
Alisa Somera, Legislative Deputy
Ben Rosenfield, City Controller, Office of the Controller
Todd Rydstrom, Office of the Controller
Michelle Allersma, Office of the Controller
Carol Lu, Office of the Controller
Natasha Mihal, Office of the Controller
Janice Levy, Office of the Controller
Mark dela Rosa, Office of the Controller
Helen Vo, Office of the Controller
Ted Egan, Office of the Controller
Carmen Chu, City Administrator, Office of the City Administrator
Vivian Po, Office of the City Administrator

Harvey Rose, Budget Analyst, Office of the Budget and Legislative Analyst
Severin Campbell, Office of the Budget and Legislative Analyst
Nicholas Menard, Office of the Budget and Legislative Analyst
Dan Goncher, Office of the Budget and Legislative Analyst
Amanda Guma, Office of the Budget and Legislative Analyst
Peter Brastow, Department of the Environment
Charles Sheehan, Department of the Environment
Jeanine Nicholson, Chief, Fire Department
Theresa Ludwig, Fire Department
Maureen Conefrey, Fire Commission
Dennis Herrera, General Manager, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
Masood Ordikhani, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
Jeremy Spitz, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission
Donna Hood, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission

1 [Follow-Up Board Response - Civil Grand Jury Report - Act Now Before it is Too Late:
2 Aggressively Expand and Enhance Our High-Pressure Emergency Firefighting Water System]

3 **Motion responding to the Civil Grand Jury’s request to provide a status update on the**
4 **Board of Supervisor’s response to Recommendation Nos. R1, R2, R3, R6, R7, and R8**
5 **contained in the 2018-2019 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled “Act Now Before it is Too**
6 **Late: Aggressively Expand and Enhance Our High-Pressure Emergency Firefighting**
7 **Water System.”**

8
9 WHEREAS, The 2018-2019 San Francisco Civil Grand Jury published a report, entitled
10 “Act Now Before it is Too Late: Aggressively Expand and Enhance Our High-Pressure
11 Emergency Firefighting Water System” (“Report”) on July 17, 2019; and

12 WHEREAS, The Board of Supervisors’ Government Audit and Oversight Committee
13 (“GAO”) conducted a public hearing to hear and respond to the Report on
14 September 19, 2019; and, the Board of Supervisors adopted Resolution No. 422-19 on
15 October 1, 2019, reflecting the GAO responses to the Report; a copy of which is on file with
16 the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 190786; and

17 WHEREAS, Recommendation No. R1 states “By no later than December 31, 2020, the
18 Mayor, the SFPUC, the SFFD, and Office of Resilience and Capital Planning should jointly
19 present to the Board of Supervisors a detailed plan to ensure the City is well prepared to fight
20 fires in all parts of San Francisco in the event of a 1906-magnitude (7.8) earthquake;” and

21 WHEREAS, The Board of Supervisors on October 1, 2019, responded in Resolution
22 No. 422-19 that Recommendation No. R1 “has not been implemented but will be implemented
23 no later than December 31, 2021, and urges the Mayor, the SFPUC, the SFFD, and Office of
24 Resilience and Capital Planning to jointly present a detailed plan to the Board of Supervisors
25 by no later than December 31, 2021;” and

1 WHEREAS, Recommendation No. R2 states “The plan discussed in Recommendation
2 R1 should include a detailed proposal, including financing sources, for the installation
3 within 15 years of a high-pressure, multi-sourced, seismically safe emergency water system
4 for those parts of the City that don’t currently have one, i.e., by no later than June 30, 2034;”
5 and

6 WHEREAS, The Board of Supervisors on October 1, 2019, responded in Resolution
7 No. 422-19 that Recommendation No. R2 “has not been implemented but will be implemented
8 by December 31, 2021, and urges the Departments to include in its detailed plan a detailed
9 proposal, including financing sources, for the installation within 15 years of a high-pressure,
10 multi-sourced, seismically safe emergency water system for those parts of the City that don't
11 currently have one by no later than June 30, 2034;” and

12 WHEREAS, Recommendation No. R3 states “The Board of Supervisors should direct
13 the Budget and Legislative Analyst to study through an equity lens and issue a report to the
14 Board regarding (a) which areas of the City do not have sufficient water supplies for the
15 anticipated demand for water to fight fires following a major earthquake similar in magnitude
16 to the 1906 earthquake, and (b) options to address the issue in both the short term and the
17 long term. The Board should issue its request by no later than December 31, 2019, and the
18 Budget and Legislative Analyst should complete its report by no later than
19 December 31, 2020;” and

20 WHEREAS, The Board of Supervisors on October 1, 2019, responded in Resolution
21 No. 422-19 that Recommendation No. R3 “has not been implemented but will be implemented
22 in the future, and Supervisor Gordon Mar will issue a request for a Budget and Legislative
23 Analyst report no later than December 31, 2019, and will direct the Budget and Legislative
24 Analyst to issue the completed report no later than December 31, 2020;” and
25

1 WHEREAS, Recommendation No. R6 states “The SFPUC, the SFFD, and the SF
2 Department of the Environment should study adding salt-water pump stations to improve the
3 redundancy of water sources, especially on the west side. Findings and recommendations
4 from this study should be presented to the Board of Supervisors by no later than
5 June 30, 2021;” and

6 WHEREAS, The Board of Supervisors on October 1, 2019, responded in Resolution
7 No. 422-19 that Recommendation No. R6 “has not been implemented but will be implemented
8 in the future, and urges the completion of a study for adding a salt-water pump stations to be
9 presented to the Board of Supervisors by no later than June 30, 2021;” and

10 WHEREAS, Recommendation No. R7 states “The SFPUC should (a) continue its
11 efforts to complete a more detailed analysis of emergency firefighting water needs (including
12 above-the-median needs) by neighborhood, and not just by FRA, and (b) present a completed
13 analysis to the Board of Supervisors by no later than June 30, 2021;” and

14 WHEREAS, The Board of Supervisors on October 1, 2019, responded in Resolution
15 No. 422-19 that Recommendation No. R7 “has not been implemented but will be implemented
16 in the future, and urges that a completed analysis be presented to the Board of Supervisors
17 by no later than June 30, 2021;” and

18 WHEREAS, Recommendation No. R8 states “By no later than June 30, 2022, the
19 Mayor and Board of Supervisors should analyze whether to propose a separate bond for the
20 development of a high-pressure, multi-sourced, seismically safe emergency water system for
21 those parts of the City that don’t currently have one, with a target date of completing
22 construction by no later than June 30, 2034;” and

23 WHEREAS, The Board of Supervisors on October 1, 2019, responded in Resolution
24 No. 422-19 that Recommendation No. R8 “has not been implemented but will be implemented
25 in the future, and will analyze by June 30, 2022, in coordination with the Mayor, whether to

1 propose a separate bond for the development of a high-pressure, multi-sourced, seismically
2 safe emergency water system for those parts of the City that don't currently have one, with a
3 target date of completing construction by no later than June 30, 2034;" and

4 WHEREAS, The GAO Committee conducted an additional hearing on July 16, 2020, to
5 receive an update from City departments on Recommendation Nos. R1, R2, R3, R6, R7 and
6 R8; now, therefore, be it

7 MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors reports that Recommendation R1 has been
8 implemented, as the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC), San Francisco Fire
9 Department (SFFD), and Office of Resilience and Capital Planning (ORCP) jointly presented
10 such report to the Government Audit and Oversight (GAO) Committee on July 16, 2020; and
11 be it

12 FURTHER MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors reports that Recommendation R2
13 has been implemented, as the Budget and Legislative Analyst submitted a policy analysis
14 report analyzing potential financing sources to the file on November 17, 2021, and on
15 December 19, 2021, the SFPUC submitted its Emergency Firefighting Water System (EFWS)
16 2050 Planning Study, which included analysis of potential costs, uses of saltwater or
17 freshwater, and various timing options for implementation of EFWS improvements; and be it

18 FURTHER MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors reports that Recommendation R3
19 has been implemented, as the Board requested that the BLA report on this issue through
20 Resolution No. 484-19, approved on November 27, 2019, and the BLA issued its report for the
21 file on November 17, 2021; and be it

22 FURTHER MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors reports that Recommendation R6
23 has been implemented, as the SFPUC submitted its EFWS Seawater Supply study to address
24 this recommendation on June 4, 2021, and later submitted its EFWS 2050 Planning Study,
25 which included further analysis of possible EFWS improvements; and be it

1 FURTHER MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors reports that Recommendation R7
2 has been implemented, as the SFPUC submitted its Earthquake Water Requirements report
3 to address this recommendation on June 7, 2021, and later submitted its EFWS 2050
4 Planning Study, which included further analysis of possible EFWS improvements; and be it

5 FURTHER MOVED, That the Board of Supervisors reports that Recommendation R8
6 has been implemented, as ORCP published its EFWS Financing Study, which analyzed
7 potential uses of bonds to finance EFWS improvements, on April 3, 2022, and performed
8 further analysis of such bonds in its 10-Year Capital Plan, which was approved by the Board
9 of Supervisors on May 9, 2023.

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25



City and County of San Francisco

Tails

Motion: M23-089

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

File Number: 190785

Date Passed: June 13, 2023

Motion responding to the Civil Grand Jury's request to provide a status update on the Board of Supervisor's response to Recommendation Nos. R1, R2, R3, R6, R7, and R8 contained in the 2018-2019 Civil Grand Jury Report, entitled "Act Now Before it is Too Late: Aggressively Expand and Enhance Our High-Pressure Emergency Firefighting Water System."

September 19, 2019 Government Audit and Oversight Committee - CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR

July 16, 2020 Government Audit and Oversight Committee - CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR

January 21, 2021 Government Audit and Oversight Committee - CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR

November 18, 2021 Government Audit and Oversight Committee - CONTINUED TO CALL OF THE CHAIR

June 01, 2023 Government Audit and Oversight Committee - PREPARED IN COMMITTEE AS A MOTION


June 01, 2023 Government Audit and Oversight Committee - RECOMMENDED

June 13, 2023 Board of Supervisors - APPROVED

Ayes: 11 - Chan, Dorsey, Engardio, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Stefani and Walton

File No. 190785

I hereby certify that the foregoing Motion was APPROVED on 6/13/2023 by the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco.


Angela Calvillo
Clerk of the Board