

From: [Doug McKirahan](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 12:57:29 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Doug McKirahan, ratt57@pacbell.net

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Lawrence Russo](#)
To: [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: SFMTA Parking and MUNI Fare Increases
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 1:17:46 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

To whom it may concern:

I wanted to express my support for Supervisor's proposal to make the mayor ultimately responsible for transit fares and parking fees.

Sincerely,

Lawrence J. Russo

From: fenechkristen@everyactioncustom.com on behalf of [Kristen Fenech](#)
To: [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: In Support of File #230985 - Supervisor Dorsey's Police Staffing Charter Amendment
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 2:20:15 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Victor Young,

I am writing to you to express my support of Supervisor Dorsey's San Francisco Police Full Staffing Act and to urge you to vote in support of it.

As San Francisco continues to grapple with severe public safety challenges including rampant car break-ins, shoplifting, and unprecedented open air drug markets, we as a City must do everything we can to increase public safety, including addressing the ongoing officer shortage in the San Francisco Police Department.

Reduced police staffing inhibits SFPD's ability to provide the level of community policing and foot patrols that are needed to help deter crime and enforce our city's laws. This charter amendment will make sure SFPD has the resources needed to attract and hire potential officers, reduce the need for costly overtime, and more effectively address crime.

I hope you will vote in support of this legislation and prioritize the safety of your constituents, as well as residents of and visitors to San Francisco.

Sincerely,
Kristen Fenech
San Francisco, CA 94109

From: [Cathy Cohn](#)
To: [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#)
Cc: [SafaiStaff \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: A SF VOTER SUPPORTING SUPERVISOR SAFAI'S CHARTER AMENDMENT!
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 3:45:16 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Clerk of the Rules Committee,

I am 100% in support of the Charter Amendment put forward by Supervisor Safai to require the San Francisco's Mayor to approve any proposed increases of SFMTA regarding fares, fees in parking meter max rates, along with hours of operation.

This matter should be put forward to the San Francisco constituency for an election ballot vote. Doing anything less is not democratic. We want a voice!

Thank you
Cathy

Cathy Cohn
6th Ave SF
Main: 415.564.7404]
Mobile: 415.310.4344
cc66@sbcglobal.net

From: [Christopher Pederson](#)
To: [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Waltonstaff \(BOS\)](#)
Cc: [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Peskin, Aaron \(BOS\)](#); [MelgarStaff \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: Rules Committee Agenda item 3 - Charter Amendment re SFMTA Budget (File No. 230986)
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 4:29:12 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Chair Dorsey and Supervisors Safai and Walton,

I urge the Rules Committee to either oppose the proposed charter amendment regarding SFMTA budgets or to recommend significant changes. As proposed, the real-world effect of the charter amendment would make it more politically difficult for SFMTA to raise revenue even though it is facing historically unprecedented budgetary challenges. That would then increase the likelihood of dramatic cutbacks in transit service despite the City's and Board's oft-repeated but too rarely acted upon proclamations of deep concern about the climate crisis.

I would prefer that the Committee refer the charter amendment to the full Board with a recommendation that it not pass. Alternatively, the Committee could recommend that the charter amendment be approved, but with the following changes:

1. An SFMTA budget shall be submitted to the Board of Supervisors as adopted by the SFMTA Board unless the mayor in writing requires changes to the budget. To the extent the charter amendment is intended to increase mayoral accountability, allowing a *sub silentio* disapproval without any explanation undercuts the goal of increasing accountability.
2. If the mayor disapproves an element of an SFMTA budget that would raise revenue, the disapproval must identify other measures to raise revenue and/or cut expenses by an equivalent amount. The current version of the charter amendment, by making it more politically difficult for SFMTA to raise revenue from parking meters and fares, puts the thumb on the scale in favor of service cuts but without either the mayor's or the Board's fingerprints being on that politically controversial decision. If the Committee supports the idea of increased political accountability, that accountability should apply to both revenue enhancements and service cuts.

Thank you for your consideration of my comments.

Sincerely,

Christopher Pederson
District 7 resident

From: [Cyrus Hall](#)
To: [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#)
Cc: [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Waltonstaff \(BOS\)](#); [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Chung, Lauren \(BOS\)](#); [Dylan Fabris](#); [Laura Tolkoﬀ](#); [Tumlin, Jeffrey \(MTA\)](#)
Subject: Comment on item 3 (Charter amendment) for 10/23 Rules Committee
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 4:34:56 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Chair Dorsey, and Supervisors Safai and Walton,

I write in regards to item 3 on the October 23rd Rules Committee agenda, the consideration of a Charter amendment introduced by Supervisor Safai requiring mayoral approval of SFMTA budgets containing certain revenue proposals.

I urge the committee to refer this Charter amendment to the full Board of Supervisors with a recommendation of **do not pass**. As currently written, the amendment chips away at the political independence and insulation created by 1999's Prop E, which guards against serious service disruptions caused by budgetary interventions by the Mayor and Board of Supervisors. Simultaneously, it fails to accomplish its goal of creating political accountability for the mayor, as it requires no written statement or acknowledgement of tradeoffs around *disapproval* of a proposed budget.

Further, by making it easy for the mayor to block new revenue measures, the proposed amendment does not reflect the city's Transit First values, or our environmental priorities, and is particularly dangerous as SFMTA faces a fiscal crisis.

If the committee desires to move a version of the Charter amendment forward, I urge it first make two changes that partially address the political asymmetries present in the current proposal:

- The amendment should structure the opportunity for mayoral input as disapproval, rather than approval. Any disapproval would need to be in writing.
- If the mayor disapproves an element of an SFMTA budget that would raise revenue, the disapproval must identify alternative revenue sources and/or cut expenses by an equivalent amount.

These points are explored more thoroughly below.

Structural Problems

The proposed amendment specifies a limited scope of budget oversight by the mayor, requiring the affirmative written approval of any SFMTA budget that does one or more of three things:

- Increases the hours or days of parking meter operation
- Increases the maximum meter fee rate that can be charged
- Changes Muni fares in any way, up or down

The rest of this letter refers to the three above items as *triggers*, as they force a proposed SFMTA budget to follow the newly defined path laid out by the Charter amendment.

The governance structure proposed in the Charter amendment is inadequate, and it is incumbent on this committee and the Board of Supervisors to improve the structure if the amendment is to be placed on the ballot. The Charter amendment introduces significant asymmetries, both in processes and in politics, around the SFMTA budget, and chops away at the modicum of independence and insulation from political concerns that SFMTA currently enjoys. As recognized by the voters first in 1999's Prop E, and again in 2007's Prop A, such independence and political insulation is vital to create the budget stability necessary for the agency to plan and implement successful transit service, and deliver on the city's Transit First principles.

Sponsors Safai and Peskin have made it clear in public statements that one of the core goals of the amendment is to increase mayoral accountability around the SFMTA budget. However, the current proposal only requires the mayor to make an affirmative statement if the budget triggers mayoral review. Thus the mayor escapes accountability for SFMTA budgets that make other tradeoffs, such as cutting Muni service, or significantly changing budget priorities.

Further, the Charter amendment only envisions mayoral accountability as an affirmative statement explicitly scoped to the three triggers (increased meter hours/days, increased max meter rate, or fare changes). It does not require the mayor to comment on other aspects of the budget, or, indeed, to comment at all. Rejection of a budget that triggers mayoral review does not require any statement, allowing the mayor to escape the need to explain their actions. In effect, it grants the mayor new power, but fails to require clear accountability.

As the Charter amendment is currently written, the mayor is *in no way* compelled to make any statement about a proposed budget that contains a trigger. Instead, a mayor can simply choose to issue no statement at all and wait for the specified 15 day approval period

to expire. While not clearly specified in the amendment, this would leave SFMTA with no option but to strip the budget of any and all changes that triggered mayoral review. The agency could then submit their budget to the Board of Supervisors without needing affirmative mayoral approval. Any service cuts necessary to balance the budget would also have to be made, *and would not trigger review or comment*.

This differentiates the current proposal from a veto/disapproval structure, in which the mayor must explicitly signal their disapproval of a measure. Moving to an disapproval structure, with a required written explanation, would be a significant improvement over the current proposal for two reasons: 1) the mayor would always have to clearly state why they are sending the budget back for changes, and 2) the default outcome, in the absence of a written disapproval, would be the budget plan of SFMTA staff and leadership. This is a more appropriate structure for an enterprise agency that needs significant independence in order to make and execute on long term operational plans. If the committee decides some form of mayoral input is preferred, I recommend changing the proposal to a veto/disapproval structure with a required written statement.

What of the three triggers? To the credit of the amendment sponsors, explicitly scoping mayoral review to only budgets that contain the three triggers seems to be an attempt to partially respect the will of the voters in 1999's Prop E. After a decade of poor service quality, to the point of service collapse in 1998, voters came to understand that SFMTA's budget could not be adjusted at the whims of the Board of Supervisors or the mayor. However, scoping mayoral review to only a limited subset of triggers creates an asymmetric political playing field, where opponents of parking meter changes, or fare changes, are uniquely empowered to lobby the mayor, while political opponents of other types of budget changes have no recourse.

In doing so, the amendment creates a structurally asymmetrical environment that gives priority consideration to specific political views - those that happen to oppose increases in parking meter hours or maximum rates, or changes to fares. This is not the same as political accountability, but rather stacks the deck against certain types of changes while offering no additional accountability over the budget as a whole.

This asymmetry can be resolved by requiring the mayor, in the case of disapproval, to identify other revenue sources and/or reductions in expenses to make up any reduction in revenue. This balances concerns, and makes it impossible for the mayor to silently, and without comment, force service reductions. As such, the mayor would be significantly more accountable for their decision to disapprove one or more changes.

Climate Crisis

San Francisco is failing to meet its environmental goals. SFMTA's most recent proposed Climate Roadmap projects the city is two decades behind on reducing greenhouse emissions from vehicles*. While the city has largely succeeded in driving building energy use down, the percentage of the city's greenhouse gas emissions from vehicles – largely private cars – has gone up from 33% in 1990 to 47% in 2019, the last year with published comparable data**. The city's goal of 80% sustainable trips has been weakened to 80% "low-carbon" trips, and yet we sit at under 50% of that goal, having backslid over the last 3 years***.

Fundamental to the city's failure to induce modeshift has been the protection of parking. Charging the real cost of parking is projected to reduce emissions, by 2040, offering a more than four times greater reduction than any other change studied by SFMTA****. Meanwhile, SFMTA projects aiming to improve transit, install active transportation lanes, and otherwise reduce automobile dependency are consistently blocked and slowed down by a loud minority of San Francisco residents, and by the political reaction to their complaints. The Office of the Mayor regularly intervenes in such projects, demanding more parking be created before they are allowed to move forward. Before 2007's Prop A, which made it far harder for the Board of Supervisors to kill parking changes, the Board regularly did the same.

The proposed Charter amendment does nothing to resolve these "hidden" structures, or provide the insulation the agency needs to make faster progress.

Instead, the amendment tips the scales further toward encouraging the use of parking in the city. This is a grave mistake in a time of environmental collapse, and when owning a car is becoming ever more out of reach due to the cost of ownership (average yearly cost of car ownership passed \$10k in 2022, or \$0.72/mile*****). The city needs to be focused on sustainable transportation, and that means properly funding SFMTA and Muni. It is vital that we build not just a mediocre transit system, as we currently have, but one that relieves the need to drive for the vast majority of residents.

For all of the above reasons – the inadequate, asymmetric governance structure, the privileging of parking in times of climate and economic crisis, and SFMTA's operational budget crisis – the proposed Charter amendment should be *rejected*, and returned to the full Board with the recommendation of **do not pass**. If the Committee feels that the legislation needs to be put to the voters, I urge moving to a disapproval structure and requiring the mayor to explicitly identify revenue sources and/or budget cuts to replace any revenue changes they are disapproving.

Thank you for your consideration,
Cyrus Hall
D7

Footnotes:

* Climate Roadmap for a Healthier San Francisco; <https://www.sfmta.com/projects/climate-roadmap-healthier-san-francisco>; pages 14, 48-49. Note that the original goal, 80% of trips by carbon-neutral modes, is not projected to be hit until after 2050, over two-decades late.

** San Francisco's Carbon Footprint; <https://sfenvironment.org/carbonfootprint>

*** Climate Roadmap for a Healthier San Francisco; page 15.

**** Climate Roadmap for a Healthier San Francisco; page 30-31, 36-41.

***** Average Car Miles Driven Per Year in the US;
<https://www.moneygeek.com/insurance/auto/analysis/costs-of-car-ownership/>

From: [Jamie Kendall](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 6:23:04 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Jamie Kendall, jkendall301@gmail.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Before anyone considers raising Muni fares, it's critically important to collect fares from ALL passengers, not just the honest ones. There are too few fare inspectors and fewer than 50% of passengers pay fares. Raising fares punishes the honest riders and rewards the cheaters.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

Jamie Kendall

From: [Georgia Qiao](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 6:45:27 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Georgia Qiao, georgiaqiao@yahoo.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Kenneth Camp](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 6:48:36 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Kenneth Camp, kennycamp@gmail.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Josue Dzul](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 6:51:25 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Josue Dzul, josuedz12@gmail.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Morgan Livermore](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 6:51:28 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Morgan Livermore, morganlivermore@gmail.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Moraya Khan](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 7:41:01 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Moraya Khan, morkhan@comcast.net

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [zrants](#)
To: [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#)
Cc: [Chan, Connie \(BOS\)](#); [Stefani, Catherine \(BOS\)](#); [Peskin, Aaron \(BOS\)](#); [EngardioStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Preston, Dean \(BOS\)](#); [Melgar, Myrna \(BOS\)](#); [MandelmanStaff, \[BOS\]](#); [Ronen, Hillary](#); [Waltonstaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: re: Item 2 Rules Committee, October 23
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 7:41:02 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

October 22, 2023

Mayor Breed, Board of Supervisors and Staff:

Re: Please support placing the Charter Amendment titled : *Mayor Approval Required for Certain SFMTA Budget Proposals*, on the March 5, 2024 ballot.

The Charter Amendment sponsored by Supervisor Asha Safai, supported by Aaron Peskin, would requires the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

We understand this matter comes before the Rules Committee October 23 and hope you will vote to support this unanimously.

There is a reason for separation of powers. And this is it. We have seen the results of a department run by appointees, that has the authority to write its own ordinances, enforce them and pass judgement on they own work. Appointees have no accountability to the voters. The result is a department that has not fulfilled the hopes and dreams of those who established the system.

As the department has lost sight of its role in servicing the public needs, the public has lost faith in the department. Ridership and fare recovery is down and MUNI is begging for another tax or bond bailout.

Passing this Charter Amendment will not be the answer to all MUNI problems, but we believe holding an elected individual accountable is a good place to start.

The Mayor is clamoring for more power so here is a chance to show how that power may be used to improve an under-performing organization.

Sincerely,

Mari Eliza,
Concerned Citizen,
With CSFN and EMIA

From: [Linda Simonin](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 7:57:31 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Linda Simonin, linda@thesloans.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Robert Wong](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 8:37:54 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Robert Wong, rawff@hotmail.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Geoffrey Platt](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 8:47:13 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Geoffrey Platt, gplattsf@gmail.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

The continued lack of transparency for setting the minimum parking meter fare from its lowest to its highest (causing parkers, who had no vote on the matter, to lower the time and fare from \$2 down instead of the minimum up) shows how corrupt SFMTA is and how necessary it is to have a citywide elected mayor have the final say over such matters rather than a group of power hungry progressive, failing factions on the board of supervisors. Give the mayor their proper power over SFMTA and the Board of Supes ignorant whims.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Judith Hurabiell](#)
To: [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: Please make Mayor Accountable for Parking and Muni Fare increases
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 8:58:54 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

It is necessary to listen to us San Franciscans.
Thank you
Judi Hurabiell

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Julie Fitzgerald](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 9:25:37 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Julie Fitzgerald, jafitz22@gmail.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Teresa Durling](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 9:30:54 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Teresa Durling, tadurling@sbcglobal.net

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Stephen Ernst](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 9:39:23 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Stephen Ernst, steve.ernst@yahoo.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Marie Hurabiell](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 10:18:59 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Marie Hurabiell, mhurabie@yahoo.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Maureen Perry](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 11:15:15 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Maureen Perry, mjpmab@yahoo.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Carol Sorgen](#)
To: [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#)
Cc: [Judith Hurabiell](#)
Subject: Muni Fare increases
Date: Sunday, October 22, 2023 11:55:42 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

I am opposed to Muni fare increases for the following reasons:

.I am a senior on a fixed income, and take buses almost daily

.The city has already closed many roads to car travel and to raise muni fees would only further deter residents from using muni

.I think we should go back to voting on muni fare hikes versus the having an individual decide on fees

Carol Sorgen

3900 California St Apt2

SF 94118

415 -205-9108

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Maria Aldaz](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 12:39:19 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Maria Aldaz, mealdaz58@gmail.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Lynne Schaad](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 1:21:46 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Lynne Schaad, lynneschaadt@hotmail.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Ronald Mungai](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 3:38:57 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Ronald Mungai, limo4usf@gmail.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Maureen Kelly](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 6:49:39 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Maureen Kelly, maureenkellysanf@aol.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Angela Tickler](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 7:20:59 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Angela Tickler, angela.tickler@gmail.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Janet McGee](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 7:29:14 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Janet McGee , janetmcgee@gmail.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Gail Rutherford](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 7:48:17 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Gail Rutherford , gail_rutherford@yahoo.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Charlotte Mosher](#)
To: [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: Make the Mayor Accountable to MUNI fare Hikes and more...
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 8:08:53 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Hi!

I am writing in support of the Charter Amendment for making the Mayor accountable, on public record, for SFMTA citywide changes.

I would like to see this Charter Amendment to include all major changes that impact residents, including road closures and slow streets.

As it stands, SFMTA is an agency where the Mayor has power in who she nominates to its board and who is hired and fired in its Director role. It is clear that SFMTA caters to a small, but highly organized, special interest group called the SF Bike Coalition. If you pull the SF Bike Coalition's publicly available 2021 Non-Profit 990 IRS form, you will notice that membership dues collected for the closing year was a little over \$127,000. If you divide this number by the lowest tiered membership dues of \$45, you will find that there are less than 3,000 members in this special interest group. Given that the Bike Coalition has a membership dues tier structure that goes beyond \$500, the membership number drops significantly lower than just under 3,000 people.

The bike people were organized enough to disrupt the lives of the Western side of the city, which was evident when the rest of the city voted to close their much needed roadways (JFK and Great Highway). The Western side voted to open their roads. There are far more members in the groups that wanted the roads open than the entire Bike Coalition Membership. The difference is about five times the number.

This group will NOT be able to stop the anger felt around the city when parking meters and MUNI fare hikes happen because it will impact far more residents than the JFK and GH road closures. The anger will be too widespread.

Clearly, the Mayor is not stopping SFMTA, even though she does have some power to do so in the form of firing the SFMTA Director and not appointing bike fanatics to its board. It is a bad policy for her not to see through this, given that the city has over 800,000 residents. The SF Bike Coalition, if all members live in the city, is less than 1% of the city's population!

Mayor Breed made her bed when she allowed SFMTA to do what it did during the Pandemic and beyond. Raising fares and parking fees will just make all the residents, in SF, notice that she has sided with a group that makes up less than 1% of the City's residents. It is her fate at the 2024 ballot box. But, this cannot continue. No mayor should cater to such a small special interest group over the needs of the rest of the city, no matter how well-organized they are!

Transportation is a vital part of the local economy.

I am a school teacher so I know that none of my city jobs were downtown. MUNI is most efficient at taking workers downtown. It is not set up to efficiently take workers to other parts of the city. I worked in a school located in the Mission District for a number of years while raising a child. I could not afford to ride MUNI for FOUR hours a day, round trip, going only three miles. I needed to drive because I was also responsible for a child.

I have been an Amazon Prime Member for 17 years. I joined the year it started, in 2006. I started using it a lot when the SFMTA road mess made it harder to spend my dollars in local stores. Amazon has gotten thousands upon

thousands of dollars from me that would have been spent shopping in San Francisco if the roadways weren't changed and if parking wasn't pulled out of shopping districts. This is what SFMTA has done to the local economy.

Making parking fees higher will just have me spend more money at Amazon.

According to a local ABC News report, Valencia St restaurants and shops are threatening to close within the year if SFMTA's bike mess isn't fixed. According to the report, restaurants are getting last minute cancelations based on the fact that customers cannot find parking. Seventy parking spots were removed. Delivery trucks cannot deliver goods because of the SFMTA special bike interest. I could not be happier this is happening to the Eastern side of the city because it is a wake-up call for the people who voted to close the Western side of the city's roads on how SFMTA impacts our local economy.

Sincerely,
Charlotte Mosher

From: [Gandhia Andrews](#)
To: [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: Rules Committee: SFMTA Hearing Monday, Oct. 23: Make the Mayor Accountable for Parking Fee & MUNI Fare Increases
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 10:20:43 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Hello Rules and Committee Clerk Young

I am writing in support of Agenda Item 2, Charter Amendment to require the position of the Mayor to approve rate increases for parking and MUNI.

Thank you,

Gandhia Andrews
District 7 resident

From: [Michael Chen](#)
To: [Dorsey, Matt \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#)
Cc: [Stefani, Catherine \(BOS\)](#)
Subject: Oppose: Item 230986: Mayoral Approval for SFMTA Actions
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 10:29:37 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Dear Supervisors on the Rules Committee:

I am a District 2 resident speaking to oppose File #230986, the proposed charter amendment to require Mayoral approval for certain changes to fees and fares. The leaders who created the SFMTA in Prop E, 1999 wanted a department of transportation that whose day-to-day goings were insulated from micromanagement by the Mayor and Supervisors. To that end, the Mayor and Supervisors have a say on the board of directors. Past that, the directors appoint the chief executive and provide high-level direction.

Supervisors have been able to change SFMTA policy through director appointments: Cristina Rubke was not re-appointed over a policy disagreement on Muni fares. And Supervisors approve the SFMTA budget. Through that conversation, the SFMTA paused fare increases as the Board of Supervisors wanted. The existing channels of feedback are sufficient for policy disagreement from the Supervisors or from the Mayor's office. The charter amendment in question, requiring Mayoral approval on a small subset of items, makes little sense with how the agency is designed. The mayor does not have a formal veto on any other aspect of SFMTA policy.

Furthermore, while fares and fees are politically contentious, they are important tools to keep SFMTA's budget going, especially as the SFMTA faces a structural deficit exceeding \$100 million in FY2024-2025. This is a matter of making sure we can run buses and trains to deliver people on time, especially the working class, to jobs, healthcare, recreation, small businesses, and more. Threatening the ways that SFMTA has to raise revenue jeopardize the health of our transit system. It means buses and trains that are less frequent, slower, more crowded, and less convenient. It means less opportunity for people who have less reliable transportation to jobs. It means waiting longer to ticket and tow a car blocking your driveway. It means less safe streets by cutting the planners and officers who regulate the road.

I humbly request you oppose this charter amendment and support the work of the SFMTA.

Mike Chen
Supervisor District 2 Resident

From: [Jane Russell](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 10:31:59 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Jane Russell, wisdom.jane@yahoo.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Eileen Sullivan](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 10:33:25 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Eileen Sullivan, easulliva@comcast.net

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Bryan Tullis](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Monday, October 23, 2023 11:45:45 AM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Bryan Tullis, bs_tullis@yahoo.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.

From: [Jill Alexander](#)
To: [Walton, Shamann \(BOS\)](#); [DorseyStaff \(BOS\)](#); [Safai, Ahsha \(BOS\)](#); [Young, Victor \(BOS\)](#); [Breed, Mayor London \(MYR\)](#)
Subject: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.
Date: Tuesday, October 24, 2023 8:31:34 PM

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Message to the Rules Committee and the Board of Supervisors

From your constituent: Jill Alexander, sunsetgirl94122@gmail.com

Message: I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment that would give Mayoral approval over parking meter and other transportation fees and fares.

Dear Supervisors,

I support Supervisor Safai's Charter Amendment for the March 5, 2024 election that would require the Mayor of San Francisco to approve any proposed increases to SFMTA fares, parking meter maximum rates, and hours or days of operation.

No single unelected city department head should have the sole authority to increase our parking or fare rates. To correct this, the proposed Charter Amendment requires the Mayor to approve any fare, parking, or MUNI rate increases put into the SFMTA budget, placing the authority back on elected leaders. Transportation fees significantly impact the lives of residents, and businesses, particularly those in lower-income areas, and when fees need to be changed, this decision should be made by our mayor, who can take all factors and constituents into consideration.

Please vote to support this Charter Amendment.