# SFMTA - FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY Con Collection, Counting and Data Management Services COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL YEAR 2015

## **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

## PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

| Job Class Title  | Class                                  | # of Full Time<br>Equivalent<br>Positions |    | Bi-Weekly Rate |    | Low   |  | High   |                            |  |
|--|--|---|----|----------------|----|-------|--|--|----------------------------|--|
| Collections  |  |   |    |                |    |       |  |  |                            |  |
| Manager IV   | 9174                                   | 0.75                                      | \$ | 3,989          | \$ | 5,090 | \$   | 78,085   | \$                         | 99,637   |
| Analyst  | 1824                                   | 0.25                                      | \$ | 3,608          | \$ | 4,385 | \$   | 23,542   | \$                         | 28,612   |
| Transit Revenue Supervisor   | 9118                                   | 2.00                                      | \$ | 2,902          | \$ | 3,527 |  | 151,484  | \$                         | 184,109  |
| Principal Fare Collections Receiver  | 9117                                   | 2.00                                      | \$ | 2,793          | \$ | 3,396 | \$   | 145,795  |                            | 177,271  |
| Senior Fare Collections Receiver   | 9116                                   | 8.00                                      | \$ | 2,221          | \$ | 2,700 | \$   | 463,745  | \$                         | 563,760  |
| Fare Collections Receiver  Counting  | 9110                                   | 24.00                                     | \$ | 1,918          | \$ | 2,332 | \$   | 1,201,435  | \$                         | 1,460,765  |
| Senior Fare Collections Receiver   | 9116                                   | 1.00                                      | \$ | 2,221          | \$ | 2,700 | \$   | 57,968   | \$                         | 70.470   |
| Fare Collections Receiver  | 9110                                   | 3.00                                      | \$ | 1,918          |    | 2,332 | \$   | 150,179  | \$                         | 182,596  |
| Holiday Pay (if applicable)  | 0                                      | 0.00                                      | ٠  | .,             | Ψ  | 2,002 | \$   | -  | \$                         | .02,000  |
| Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)   |  |   |    |                |    |       | \$   | _  | \$                         | _  |
| Overtime Pay (if applicable)   |  |   |    |                |    |       | \$   | _  | \$                         | _  |
| Other Pay (if applicable)  |  |   |    |                |    |       | \$   | _  | \$                         | _  |
| Total Salary Co.   | sts                                    | 41.0                                      |    |                |    |       | \$   | 2,170,607  | \$                         | 2,638,971  |
| FRINGE BENEFITS  Variable Fringes (3)  Fixed Fringes (4)  Total Fringe Benefit Total Personnel Control | ent<br>ies<br>rm<br>eles<br>ios<br>Sas |   |    |                |    |       | \$<br>\$<br>\$<br>\$<br>\$<br>\$<br>\$<br>\$ | 557,920<br>532,765<br>1,090,685<br>3,261,292<br>84,000<br>24,000<br>40,000<br>108,000<br>18,000<br>43,200<br>317,200 | \$<br>\$<br>\$<br>\$<br>\$ | 679,418<br>532,765<br>1,212,183<br>3,851,154<br>84,000<br>24,000<br>40,000<br>108,000<br>18,000<br>43,200<br>317,200 |
| Subto  | tal                                    |   |    |                |    |       | \$   | 3,578,492  | \$                         | 4,168,354  |
|  |  |   |    |                |    |       | \$   | -  | \$                         | -  |
| ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST  |  |   |    |                |    |       | \$   | 3,578,492  | \$                         | 4,168,354  |
| LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST  |  |   |    |                |    |       |  | (3,498,993)  |                            | (3,512,649   |
| ESTIMATED SAVINGS  |  |   |    |                |    |       | \$   | 79,499   | \$                         | 655,705  |
| % of Savings to City Co  | net                                    |   |    |                |    |       |  | 2%   |                            | 16%  |
| % of Savings to City Co  | vai                                    |   |    |                |    |       |  | 270  |                            | 1076   |

# Comments/Assumptions:

- 1. FY 1978-1979 was the first year these services were contracted out.
- 2. Salary levelsare as posted on DHR website salary rates effective June 30,2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

## SFMTA - FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY

Con Collection, Counting and Data Management Services

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES  $\,^{(1)}(2)$ 

FISCAL YEAR 2016

## **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

# PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

| Job Class Title                                | Class | # of Full Time<br>Equivalent<br>Positions | Bi-Weekly Rate |    | Low   |          | High        |             |             |
|--|-------|---|----------------|----|-------|----------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Collections                                    |       |   |                |    |       |          |             |             |             |
| Manager IV                                     | 9174  | 0.75                                      | \$<br>3,989    | \$ | 5,090 | \$       | 78,085      | \$          | 99,637      |
| Analyst  | 1824  | 0.25                                      | \$<br>3,608    | \$ | 4,385 | \$       | 23,542      |             | 28,612      |
| Transit Revenue Supervisor                     | 9118  | 2.0                                       | \$<br>2,902    |    | 3,527 | \$       | 151,484     | \$          | 184,109     |
| Principal Fare Collections Receiver            | 9117  | 2.0                                       | \$<br>2,793    | \$ | 3,396 | \$       | 145,795     | \$          | 177,271     |
| Senior Fare Collections Receiver               | 9116  | 8.0                                       | \$<br>2,221    | \$ | 2,700 | \$       | 463,745     | \$          | 563,760     |
| Fare Collections Receiver                      | 9110  | 24.0                                      | \$<br>1,918    | \$ | 2,332 | \$       | 1,201,435   | \$          | 1,460,765   |
| Counting                                       |       |   |                |    |       |          |             |             |             |
| Senior Fare Collections Receiver               | 9116  | 1.0                                       | \$<br>2,221    | \$ | 2,700 | \$       | 57,968      | \$          | 70,470      |
| Fare Collections Receiver                      | 9110  | 3.0                                       | \$<br>1,918    | \$ | 2,332 | \$       | 150,179     | \$          | 182,596     |
| Holiday Pay (if applicable)                    |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | -           | \$          | -           |
| Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)     |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | -           | \$          | -           |
| Overtime Pay (if applicable)                   |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | -           | \$          | -           |
| Other Pay (if applicable)                      |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | -           | \$          | -           |
| Total Salary Costs                             | ;     | 41.0                                      |                |    |       | \$       | 2,272,233   | \$          | 2,767,220   |
| FRINGE BENEFITS                                |       |   |                |    |       |          |             |             |             |
| Variable Fringes (3)                           |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | 525,427     | Φ.          | 639,847     |
| Fixed Fringes (4)                              |       |   |                |    |       |          | •           |             | ,           |
| <u> </u>                                       |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | 551,162     |             | 551,162     |
| Total Fringe Benefits<br>Total Personnel Costs |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | 1,076,589   | <b>&gt;</b> | 1,191,009   |
|  | •     |   |                |    |       |          | 3,348,823   |             | 3,958,229   |
| ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)          |       |   |                |    |       |          |             |             |             |
| Rent   |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | ,           | \$          | 86,520      |
| Utilities                                      | 3     |   |                |    |       | \$       |             | \$          | 24,720      |
| Uniform  |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | 41,200      | \$          | 41,200      |
| Vehicles                                       |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | 108,000     | \$          | 108,000     |
| Radios   |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | 18,540      | \$          | 18,540      |
| Gas  |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | 44,496      | \$          | 44,496      |
| Total City Additional Costs                    | ;     |   |                |    |       | \$       | 323,476     | \$          | 323,476     |
| Subtotal                                       |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | 3,672,299   | \$          | 4,281,705   |
| Subtotal                                       |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | 5,012,299   | \$          | -,201,703   |
| ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST                      |       |   |                |    |       | \$<br>\$ | 3,672,299   | -           | 4,281,705   |
| ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST                      |       |   |                |    |       | Þ        | 3,072,299   | Ψ           | 4,201,703   |
| LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST            |       |   |                |    |       |          | (3,498,788) |             | (3,514,127) |
| ESTIMATED SAVINGS                              |       |   |                |    |       | \$       | 173,511     | \$          | 767,578     |
| % of Savings to City Cost                      | +     |   |                |    |       |          | 5%          |             | 18%         |

## Comments/Assumptions:

- 1. FY 1978-1979 was the first year these services were contracted out.
- 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.