File No. \_\_\_\_140487\_\_\_\_

Committee Item No. \_\_\_\_\_\_ Board Item No. \_\_\_\_\_\_25\_\_\_\_

# **COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS**

AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST

Committee: Budget & Finance Committee

Date May 14, 2014

**Board of Supervisors Meeting** 

Date June 3, 2014

# **Cmte Board**

	Motion Resolution Ordinance Legislative Digest Budget and Legislative An Youth Commission Report Introduction Form Department/Agency Cover MOU Grant Information Form Grant Budget Subcontract Budget Contract/Agreement Form 126 – Ethics Commis Award Letter Application Public Correspondence	t r Letter and/or Report
OTHER	(Use back side if additiona	al space is needed)
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
	<b>by:</b> Linda Wong by:ω	DateMay 9, 2014 Date <i>Merg</i> 28, 2014

FILE NO. 140487

### **RESOLUTION NO.**

[Proposition J Contract Certification - Specified Contracted-Out Services Previously Approved]

Resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that services previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than similar work performed by City and County employees for the following services: information booths, security, parking operations, and shuttle bus (Airport); citations processing, towing, paratransit, parking meter, security, and transit shelter (Municipal Transportation Agency); security and janitorial (Port); security (Public Utilities Commission).

WHEREAS, The Electorate of the City and County of San Francisco passed Proposition J in November 1976, allowing City and County Departments to contract with private companies for specific services which can be performed for a lower cost than similar work by City and County employees (Charter Section 10.104.15); and

WHEREAS, The City has previously approved outside contracts for the services listed below; and

WHEREAS, The Controller has determined that a Purchaser's award of a contract for the services listed below to a private contractor will continue to achieve substantial cost savings for the City; and

WHEREAS, The City and County of San Francisco must reconcile a projected \$66.7 million budget deficit for Fiscal Year 2014-2015 and a projected \$133.4 million budget deficit for Fiscal Year 2015-2016 with a Charter obligation to enact a balanced budget each fiscal year; and

WHEREAS, The Mayor has determined that the state of the City's budget for Fiscal Year 2014-2015 and Fiscal Year 2015-2016 as indicated herein has created an emergency situation justifying a Purchaser's award of a contract for the following services: information booth,

Mayor Lee BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

Page 1

security, parking, and shuttle bus services (Airport); citations processing, towing, paratransit, parking meter, security, and transit shelter services (MTA); security and janitorial services (Port); security services (PUC); and

WHEREAS, The Controller's certification, which confirms that said services can be performed at lower costs to the City and County by private contractor than by employees of the City and County, is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. <u>14647k</u>, which is hereby declared to be part of this resolution as if set forth fully herein; now, therefore be it;

RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors hereby concurs with the Controller's certification, and the Mayor's determination of an emergency situation, and approves the Proposition J Resolution concerning the Purchaser's award of a contract to a private contractor for the services listed below for the period of July 1, 2014 through June 30, 2015.

TEs
29.7
28.0
226.5
98.0
48.0
12.00
341:3

Mayor Lee BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

	City Cost Contract Cost						
Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs			
Parking Meter Services	4,168,354	3,512,649	655,705	41.0			
Security Services	8,300,490	6,316,572	1,983,918	100.0			
Transit Shelter Services	444,072	377,741	66,331	3.0			
Port (PRT)							
Security Services	1,683,774	708,208	975,566	15.0			
Janitorial Services	548,271	300,105	248,166	6.0			
Public Utilities Commission (PUC)							
Security Services	434,865	153,446	281,419	4.0			

RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors hereby concurs with the Mayor'' determination that the state of the City's budget for fiscal year 2015-16 as indicated herein has created an emergency situation and concurs with the Controller's certification and approves the Proposition J Resolution concerning the Purchaser's award of a contract to a private contractor for the services listed below for the period of July 1, 2015 through June 30, 2016.

	City Cost Contract Cost					
Departmen <b>t</b> /Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs		
Airport (AIR)						
Info Booths	3,608,142	2,099,645	1,508,497	29.7		
Security Services	2,393,144	1,780,104	613,040	28.0		
Parking Operations	26,090,555	19,933,707	6,156,847	226.5		
Shuttle Bus	13,866,359	10,428,071	3,438,288	98.0		

Mayor Lee BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA)			• •	
Citations Processing	8,855,758	8,026,148	829,611	48.
Towing Services	17,089,834	14,548,501	2,541,332	112.0
Paratransit Services	36,586,598	21,116,844	15,469,753	341.
Parking Meter Services	4,281,705	3,514,127	767,578	41
Security Services	8,268,333	6,316,572	1,951,761	100
Transit Shelter Services	442,703	384,991	57,712	3
Port (PRT)			: :	
Security Services	1,731,349	755,667	975,682	15
Janitorial Services	554,454	308,466	245,987	6
Public Utilities Commission (PUC)				
Security Services	431,546	153,446	278,100	4
	· · · ·			
			· · ·	
Mayor Lee				D- 4
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS	75			Page 4

### **OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**

### Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

John L. Martin Airport Director San Francisco International Airport International Terminal, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Bruce Robertson, Budget Director San Francisco International Airport Terminal 2, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

RE: Airport Information Booth - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Airport Information Booth services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year (FY) 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Beh Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

FAX 415-554-7466

AIRPORT COMMISSION

INFORMATION BOOTH CONTRACT

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

	**************************************	# of Full Time		T	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
		Equivalent	1			
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Week	v Rate	Low	High
Senior Operational Manger	9143	1.0	4,766	5,794	124,393	151,223
Accountant	1650	1.0	2,236	2,719	58,360	70,966
Airport Operations Coordinator	0923	1.0	3,696	4,717	96,466	123,114
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	2.0	2,819	3,426	147,152	178,837
Management Assistant	1842	3.0	2,459	2,989	192,540	234,039
Passenger Service Specialist	1634	13.8	2,319	2,819	835,257	1,015,347
Transit Information Clerk	1632	6.5	2,053	2,496	348,291	423,446
Account Clerk	1630	1.4	1,773	2,156	64,785	78,780
Bilingual Pay			.,	_,		,
						-
Holiday Pay (if applicable)			· ·		59,249	72,211
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)			,		52,852	64,415
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay (if applicable)					-	_
Total Salary Costs		29.70			1,979,345	2,412,380
, oral onlary ousid		23,7 0				_,,
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Variable Fringes (3)					611,306	726,792
Fixed Fringes (4)					393,879	393,879
Total Fringe Benefits					1,005,186	1,120,671
ADDITIONAL CITY COST'S (if applicable)						
Flight Information Service					48,000	48,000
Communications					7,500	7,500
Office/booth supplies - (DBE)					12,000	12,000
Uniforms					3,000	3,000
POS System maintenance support					1,500	1,500
POS Web portal Maintenance					4,110	4,110
Technical support consultant					3,000	3,000
ADM Uniforms					2,000	2,000
Printing					3,000	3,000
OAG Subscription		-		1	1,105	1,105
Subway Gift Cards for AD M's					1,000	1,000
Monthly payment to Trave ler's Aid					600	600
Dry Cleaning - (DBE)					2,000	2,000
Training Support - (DBE)					2,500	2,500
Contingency for supplies/services as needed.					5,000	5,000
Total Capital & Operating				-	96,315	96,315
i oreal Gapital & Operalling					0,010	
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST				-	3,080,846	3,629,365
LESS: ESTIMATED TOT AL CONTRACT COST				_	(2,035,385)	(2,038,167)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS				_	\$ 1,045,460	<b>\$ 1,591,199</b>
% of Savings to City Cost				. =	34%	44%
3						

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1990 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Estimated City capital and operating costs are included in the estimate total contract cost.

6. The Estimated Contract Cost for annual services is based upon contractor's bid for services and contract monitoring costs. Total includes 0.10 FTE for contract monitoring.

AIRPORT COMMISSION INFORMATION BOOTH CONTRACT COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS					
	Ę.	# of Full Time	·	Į	l
		Equivalent	· ·	1	
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekty Rate	Low	High
Senior Operational Manger	9143	1.0	4,766 5,794	124,393	151,223
Accountant	1650	1.0	2,236 2,719	58,360	70,966
Airport Operations Coordinator	0923	1.0	3,696 4,717	96,466	123,114
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	2.0	2,819 3,426	147,152	178,837
Management Assistant	1842	3.0	2,459 2,989	192,540	234,039
Passenger Service Specialist	1634	13.8	2,319 2,819	835,257	1,015,347
Transit Information Clerk	1632	6.5	2,053 2,496	348,291	423,446
Account Clerk	1630	1.4	1,773 2,156	64,785	78,780
Bilingual Pay				-	
					•
Holiday Pay (if applicable)				59,249	72,211
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)			• .	52,852	64,415
Overtime Pay (if applicable)				-	
Other Pay (if applicable)	-	·		-	-
Total Salary Costs		29.70	-	1,979,345	2,412,380
	4			•	
FRINGE BENEFITS				670 000	007 000
Variable Fringes (3)		÷		578,839	687,220
Fixed Fringes (4)				410,228	410,228
Total Fringe Benefits				989,067	1,097,448
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)					
Flight Information Service				50,000	50,000
Communications				7,500	7,500
Office/booth supplies - (DBE)				12,000	12,000
POS System maintenance support				1,500	1,500
POS Web portal Maintenance				4,110	4,110
Technical support consultant				3,000	3,000
Uniforms				3,000	3,000
ADM Uniforms		`		2,000	2,000
Printing				3,000	3,000
OAG Subscription				1,105	1,105
Subway Gift Cards for ADM's				1,000	1,000
Monthly payment to Traveler's Aid				600	600
Dry Cleaning - (DBE)				2,000	2,000
Training Support - (DBE)	•	·		2,500	2,500
• • • •				-	-
Contingency for supplies/services as needed.				5,000	5,000
Total Capital & Operating				98,315	98,315
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST			•	3,066,727	3,608,142
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COS	T			(2,096,901)	(2,099,645)
				¢ 000 000	E 1 E09 407
ESTIMATED SAVINGS				\$ 969,825	\$ 1,508,497
% of Savings to City Cost				32%	42%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1990 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2015. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Estimated City capital and operating costs are included in the estimate total contract cost.

6. The Estimated Contract Cost for annual services is based upon contractor's bid for services and contract monitoring costs.

Total includes 0.10 FTE for contract monitoring.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

John L. Martin Airport Director San Francisco International Airport International Terminal, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Bruce Robertson, Budget Director San Francisco International Airport Terminal 2, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

RE: Airport Information Booth - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Airport Information Booth services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year (FY) 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Beh Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

FAX 415-554-7466

AIRPORT COMMISSION INFORMATION BOOTH C ONTRACT COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time	·····		1
		Equivalent			
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate	Low	High
Senior Operational Manger	9143	1.0	4.766 5.79	والمحمد والمستحقة فتستحج والمحاد	151,223
Accountant	1650	1.0	2,236 2,71		70,966
Airport Operations Coordirator	0923	1.0	3,696 4,71	•	123,114
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	2.0	2,819 3,42		178,837
Management Assistant	1842	3.0	2,459 2,98		234,039
Passenger Service Specialist	1634	13.8	2,319 2,81		1,015,347
Transit Information Clerk	1632	6.5	2,053 2,49		423,446
Account Clerk	1630	1.4	1,773 2,15		78,780
Bilingual Pay			.,	-	-
			•	· •	· ·
Holiday Pay (if applicable)				59,249	72,211
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)				52,852	64,415
Overtime Pay (if applicable)				-	-
Other Pay (if applicable)					
Total Salary Costs		29.70		1,979,345	2,412,380
FRINGE BENEFITS Variable Fringes (3)		•		. 014 000	700 700
				611,306	726,792
Fixed Fringes (4) Total Fringe Benefits				<u>393,879</u> 1,005,186	<u>393,879</u> 1,120,671
				1,000,100	1,120,071
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)					
Flight Information Service				48,000	48,000
Communications				7,500	7,500
Office/booth supplies - (D BE)				12,000	12,000
Uniforms				3,000	3,000
POS System maintenance support	,			1,500	1,500
POS Web portal Mainten ance				4,110	4,110
Technical support consultant				3,000	3,000
ADM Uniforms				2,000	2,000
Printing				3,000	3,000
OAG Subscription				1,105	1,105
Subway Gift Cards for ADM's				1,000	1,000
Monthly payment to Traveler's Aid				600	600
Dry Cleaning - (DBE)				2,000	2,000
Training Support - (DBE)				2,500	2,500
Contingency for supplies/services as needed.				5,000	5,000
Total Capital & Operating		· •		96,315	96,315
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST				3,080,846	3,629,365
LESS: ESTIMATED TO TAL CONTRACT COST				(2,035,385)	(2,038,167)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS				\$ 1,045,460	\$ 1,591,199
% of Savings to City Cost				34%	44%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1990 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Estimated City capital and operating costs are included in the estimate total contract cost.

6. The Estimated Contract Cost for annual services is based upon contractor's bid for services and contract monitoring costs.

Total includes 0.10 FTE for contract monitoring.

AIRPORT COMMISSION INFORMATION BOOTH CONTRACT COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS	·······	1 / _ f /	rr	<u> </u>	
		# of Full Time		1	1
		Equivalent		.	
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate	Low	High
Senior Operational Manger	9143	1.0	4,766 5,794	124,393	151,223
Accountant	1650	1.0	2,236 2,719	58,360	70,966
Airport Operations Coordinator	0923	1.0	3,696 4,717	96,466	123,114
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	2.0	2,819 3,426	147,152	178,837
Management Assistant	1842	3.0	2,459 2,989	192,540	234,039
Passenger Service Specialist	1634 1632	13.8 6.5	2,319 2,819	835,257	1,015,347
Transit Information Clerk Account Clerk	1630	1.4	2,053 2,496 1,773 2,156	348,291	423,446
	1030	1.4	1,713 2,150	64,785	78,780
Bilingual Pay					
Haliday Bast (if applicable)				59,249	-
Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)			· .	59,249	72,211
Overtime Pay (if applicable)				02,002	- 64,415
Other Pay (if applicable)				-	· •
Total Salary Costs	•	29.70	-	1,979,345	2,412,380
		20110		1,070,040	2,412,000
FRINGE BENEFITS					
Variable Fringes (3)				578,839	687,220
Fixed Fringes (4)				410,228	410,228
Total Fringe Benefits				989,067	1,097,448
				-, -	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)					
Flight Information Service				50,0 <b>00</b>	50,000
Communications				7,500	7,500
Office/booth supplies - (DBE)				12,000	12,000
POS System maintenance support				1,500	1,500
POS Web portal Maintenance				4,110	4,110
Technical support consultant				3,000	3,000
Uniforms				3,000	3,000
ADM Uniforms				2,000	2,000
Printing				3,000	3,000
OAG Subscription				1,105	1,105
Subway Gift Cards for ADM's			•	1,000	1,000
Monthly payment to Traveler's Aid				600	600
Dry Cleaning - (DBE)				2,000	2,000
Training Support - (DBE)				2,500	2,500
Contingency for supplies/services as needed.	-			5,000	5,000
Total Capital & Operating				98,315	98,315
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST				3,066,727	3,608,142
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	Ξ			(2,096,901)	(2,099,645)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS				\$969,825	\$ 1,508,497
% of Savings to City Cost				32%	42%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1990 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2015. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Estimated City capital and operating costs are included in the estimate total contract cost.

6. The Estimated Contract Cost for annual services is based upon contractor's bid for services and contract monitoring costs. Total includes 0.10 FTE for contract monitoring.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield · Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

John L. Martin Airport Director San Francisco International Airport International Terminal, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Bruce Robertson, Budget Director San Francisco International Airport Terminal 2, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

RE: Airport Information Booth - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Airport Information Booth services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year (FY) 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

AIRPORT COMMISSION INFORMATION BOOTH CONTRACT COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PHODEOFED I ENGONINEE COURS		1			
		# of Full Time			
		Equivalent			
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekly Ra	te Low	High
Senior Operational Manger	9143	1.0		794 124,39	3 151,223
Accountant	1650	1.0		719 58,36	
Airport Operations Coordinator	0923	1.0		717 96,46	-
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	2.0		426 147,15	
Management Assistant	1842	3.0		989 192,54	
•					•
Passenger Service Specialist	1634	13.8	•	819 835,25	
Transit Information Clerk	1632	6.5		496 348,29	
Account Clerk	1630	1.4	1,773 2,1	156 64,78	5 78,780
Bilingual Pay					
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	-			59,24	9 72,211
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)				52,85	2 64,415
Overtime Pay (if applicable)				1	
Other Pay (if applicable)					
Total Salary Costs		29.70	•	1,979,34	5 2,412,380
i otal Galary Gosta		20.70		1,070,04	u
FRINGE BENEFITS					
				014.00	e 700 700
Variable Fringes (3)				611,30	
Fixed Fringes (4)				393,87	
Total Fringe Benefits				1,005,18	6 1,120,671
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)					
Flight Information Service				48,00	
Communications				7,50	0 7,500
Office/booth supplies - (DBE)				12,00	0 12,000
Uniforms				3,00	0 3,000
POS System maintenance support				1.50	
POS Web portal Maintenance		1		4,11	
Technical support consultant				3,00	
ADM Uniforms	-			2,00	•
Printing OAC Subscription		· ·		3,00	
OAG Subscription				1,10	
Subway Gift Cards for ADM's				1,00	
Monthly payment to Traveler's Aid				60	
Dry Cleaning - (DBE)			•	2,00	
Training Support - (DBE)				2,50	0 2,500
Contingency for supplies/services as needed.				5,00	0 5,000
Total Capital & Operating				96,31	
and a share a share of					
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST				3,080,84	6 3,629,365
				0,000,04	,0-0,000
LESS ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST				(2,035,38	5) (2 A39 167)
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST				(2,030,38	5) (2,038,167)
FOTHLATED CAVINICO					0 0 1 001 100
ESTIMATED SAVINGS				\$ 1,045,46	
% of Savings to City Cost				34	% 44%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1990 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Estimated City capital and operating costs are included in the estimate total contract cost.

6. The Estimated Contract Cost for annual services is based upon contractor's bid for services and contract monitoring costs. Total includes 0.10 FTE for contract monitoring.

#### AIRPORT COMMISSION INFORMATION BOOTH CONTRACT COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS					······
		# of Full Time			1
		Equivalent			
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate	Low	High
Senior Operational Manger	9143	1.0	4,766 5,794	124,393	151,223
Accountant	1650	1.0	2,236 2,719	58,360	70,966
Airport Operations Coordinator	0923	1.0	3,696 4,717	96,466	123,114
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	2.0	2,819 3,426	147,152	178,837
Management Assistant	1842	3.0	2,459 2,989	192,540	234,039
Passenger Service Specialist	1634	13.8	2,319 2,819	835,257	1,015,347
Transit Information Clerk	1632	6.5	2,053 2,496	348,291	423,446
Account Clerk	1630	1.4	1,773 2,156	64,785	78,780
Bilingual Pay			.,	-	,
Danguarray				_	_
Holiday Pay (if applicable)				59,249	72,211
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)				52,852	64.415
Overtime Pay (if applicable)				02,002	04,410
Other Pay (if applicable)				_	
Total Salary Costs		29.70	-	1,979,345	2,412,380
Total Salary Ousis		29.70	. ,	1,979,040	2,412,300
FRINGE BENEFITS					
Variable Fringes (3)				578,839	687,220
Fixed Fringes (4)				410,228	410,228
Total Fringe Benefits				989,067	1,097,448
rotal i ninge benefits				969,007	1,097,440
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)					
Flight Information Service				50,000	50,000
Communications				7,500	7,500
Office/booth supplies - (DBE)				12,000	12,000
POS System maintenance support				1,500	1,500
POS Web portal Maintenance				4,110	4,110
Technical support consultant				3,000	3,000
Uniforms				3,000	3,000
ADM Uniforms				2,000	2,000
Printing				3,000	•
OAG Subscription				•	3,000
Subway Gift Cards for ADM's				1,105	1,105
			4	1,000	1,000
Monthly payment to Traveler's Aid		•	•	600	600
Dry Cleaning ~ (DBE)				2,000	2,000
Training Support - (DBE)				2,500	2,500
Contingency for supplies/services as needed.				5,000	5,000
Total Capital & Operating				98,315	98,315
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST				3,066,727	3,608,142
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST				(2,096,901)	(2,099,645)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS				\$ 969,825	\$ 1.508.497
				The second s	
% of Savings to City Cost				32%	42%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1990 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2015. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Estimated City capital and operating costs are included in the estimate total contract cost.

 The Estimated Contract Cost for annual services is based upon contractor's bid for services and contract monitoring costs. Total includes 0.10 FTE for contract monitoring.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

John L. Martin Airport Director San Francisco International Airport International Terminal, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Bruce Robertson, Budget Director San Francisco International Airport Terminal 2, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

RE: Airport Security Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Airport Security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year (FY) 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield

Controller Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

FAX 415-554-7466

AIRPORT COMMISSION GENERAL AIRPORT SECURITY SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time Equivalent				
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	. Bi-Weekl	y Rate	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	24.0	1,588	1,927	994,723	1,207,073
Building and Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	4.0	1,927	2,342	201,179	244,505
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					37,802	45,883
Night / Shift Differentia I (if applicable)					33,850	41,087
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					. –	-
Other Pay (if applicable)						<u> </u>
Total Salary Costs		28.0			1,267,554	1,538,548
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Variable Fringes (3)					425,104	507,430
Fixed Fringes (4)					361,088	361,088
Total Fringe Benefits					786,192	868,518
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					2,053,745	2,407,066
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT C	OST	• • • • •			(1,776,579)	(1,780,012)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 277,166	\$ 627,053
% of Savings to City Cost					13%	26%

### Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2007 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

AIRPORT COMMISSION GENERAL AIRPORT SECURITY SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

1				1	
1	# of Full Time				
	Equivalent	•			
Class	Positions	Bi-Weekl	y Rate	Low	High
8202	24.0	1,588	1,927	994,723	1,207,073
8207	4.0	1,927	2,342	201,179	244,505
•				- 37.657	45,708
1					41,087
	· · · ·				
				-	_
	29.00			1 267 400	1,538,373
	20.00			1,207,409	1,000,070
				404 297	482,175
				-	372,596
					854,771
,			•	110,030	004,111
				2,044,302	2,393,144
COST				(1,776,704)	(1,780,104)
				\$ 267,598	\$ 613,040
t			•	13%	26%
	8202 8207 <u>COST</u>	8202 24.0 8207 4.0 	Equivalent       Class     Positions     Bi-Weekh       8202     24.0     1,588       8207     4.0     1,927	Equivalent Positions         Bi-Weekly Rate           8202         24.0         1,588         1,927           8207         4.0         1,927         2,342	Equivalent Positions         Bi-Weekly Rate         Low           8202         24.0         1,588         1,927         994,723           8207         4.0         1,927         2,342         201,179           37,657         33,850         -         -           28.00         1,267,409         -         -           28.00         1,267,409         404,297         372,596           776,893         -         -         -           200         -         -         -           28.00         1,267,409         404,297         372,596           776,893         -         -         -           200         -         -         -           201         -         -         -           24,043,02         -         -         -           2,044,302         -         -         -           31,765,798         -         -         -

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2007 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

John L. Martin Airport Director San Francisco International Airport International Terminal, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Bruce Robertson, Budget Director San Francisco International Airport Terminal 2, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

RE: Airport Security Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Airport Security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year (FY) 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield:

Controller Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

AIRPORT COMMISSION GENERAL AIRPORT SECURITY SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

	<u> </u>	# of Full Time Equivalent	<u></u>			
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	. Bi-Weekl	y Rate	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	24.0	1,588	1,927	994,723	1,207,073
Building and Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	4.0	1,927	2,342	201,179	244,505
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					37,802	45,883
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					33,850	41,087
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					-	
Other Pay (if applicable)					<u> </u>	
Total Salary Costs		28.0			1,267,554	1,538,548
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Variable Fringes (3)		,			425,104	507,430
Fixed Fringes (4)					361,088	361,088
Total Fringe Benefits	· .		7		786,192	868,518
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					2,053,745	2,407,066
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT (	COST				(1,776,579)	(1,780,012)
ESTIMATED SAVING S					\$ 277,166	§ 627,053
% of Savings to City Cost		۱ .			13%	26%

### Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2007 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

AIRPORT COMMISSION GENERAL AIRPORT SECURITY SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

		1			r	
· · ·		# of Full Time				
		Equivalent				
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Week	y Rate	. Low	High
Security Guard	8202	24.0	1,588	1,927	994,723	1,207,073
Building and Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	4.0	1,927	2,342	201,179	244,505
Holiday Pay (if applicable)			•		- 37,657	45,708
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					33,850	41,087
Overtime Pay (if applicable)				•	,	•
Other Pay (if applicable)					· · · ·	-
Total Salary Costs		28.00			1,267,409	1,538,373
FRINGE BENEFITS	,					
Variable Fringes (3)					404,297	482,175
Fixed Fringes (4)		-			372,596	372,596
Total Fringe Benefits			ч. -		776,893	854,771
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					2,044,302	2,393,144
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST		-		(1,776,704)	(1,780,104)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 267,598	\$ 613,040
% of Savings to City Cost					13%	26%
. – –						

#### Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2007 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

John L. Martin Airport Director San Francisco International Airport International Terminal, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Bruce Robertson, Budget Director San Francisco International Airport Terminal 2, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

RE: Airport Security Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Airport Security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year (FY) 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield: Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

AIRPORT COMMISSION GENERAL AIRPORT SECURITY SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

		# of Full Time Equivalent				
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekl	v Rate	Low	High
Security Guard	8202	24.0	1,588	1,927	994,723	1,207,073
Building and Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	4.0	1,927	2,342	201,179	244,505
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					37,802	45,883
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					33,850	41,087
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Other Pay (if applicable)						-
Total Salary Costs		28.0	1		1,267,554	1,538,548
FRINGE BENEFITS	i.					
Variable Fringes (3)					425,104	507,430
Fixed Fringes (4)			·		361,088	361,088
Total Fringe Benefits					786,192	868,518
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					2,053,745	2,407,066
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT C	COST				(1,776,579)	(1,780,012)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 277,166	\$ 627,053
% of Savings to City Cost					13%	26%

### Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2007 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

AIRPORT COMMISSION GENERAL AIRPORT SECURITY SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time Equivalent				
Job Class Títle	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekl	v Bate	. Low	High
Security Guard	8202	24.0	1,588	1,927	994,723	1,207,073
Building and Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	4.0	1,927	2,342	201,179	244,505
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					37,657	45,708
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					33,850	41,087
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	e.				-	-
Other Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Total Salary Costs		28.00			1,267,409	1,538,373
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Variable Fringes (3)					404,297	482,175
Fixed Fringes (4)					372,596	372,596
Total Fringe Benefits					776,893	854,771
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					2,044,302	2,393,144
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST	۰.			(1,776,704)	(1,780,104)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 267,598	\$ 613,040
% of Savings to City Cost				•	13%	26%

#### Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2007 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

John L. Martin Airport Director San Francisco International Airport International Terminal, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Bruce Robertson, Budget Director San Francisco International Airport Terminal 2, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

RE: Airport Parking - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Airport Parking services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year (FY) 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield,

Beh Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

47.7

AIRPORT COMMISSION PARKING OPERATIONS COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time			1	
Job Class Title	Class	Equivalent	Bi-Weekl	v Rate	Low	High
000 01255 1166	01433	Positions	Dr TOCK	yrnaco	LOW	Tuga
Manager IV	0932	1.0	4,278	5,460	111,656	142,506
Manager II	0923	2.0	3,696	4,717	192,931	246,227
Manager 1	0922	1.0	3,446	4,397	89,941	114,762
Contract Compliance Officer I	2992	1.0	3,027	3,679	79,005	96,022
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	3,470	4,218	90,567	110,090
Sr. Managerment Assistant	1844	1.0	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,526	73,576
Clerk	1404	1.0	1,654	2,009	43,169	52,435
Sr. Clerk	1406	6.0	1,714	2,084	268,412	326,354
Principal Clerk	1408	1,0	2,264	2,752	59,090	71,827
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	2,459	2,989	64,180	78,013
Accountant II	1652	1.0	2,478	3,012	64,676	78,613
Collection Supervisor	4366	1.0	2,466	2,997	64,363	78,222
Investigator	4334	2.0	2,752	3,346	143,654	174,661
Customer Service Agent Supervisor	1326	21.0	2,551	3,101	1,398,203	1,699,658
Cashier III		64.5	-		• •	
Electronic Maintenance Technician	4322 7318	1.0	2,063 3,295	2,507 4,006	3,472,957 86,000	4,220,409 104,557
Stationary Engineer	7318	2.5	2,981	2,981	194,510	194,510
Chief Stationary Engr	7205	1.0	3,782	3,782	98,710	98,710
Institutional Police Lieutenant	8209	1.0	3,913	4,991	102,129	130,265
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	2.0	3,411	4,355	178,054	227,331
Bldg & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	68.5	1,927	2,342	3,445,187	4,187,145
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,094	2,545	54,653	66,425
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	3.0	1,899	2,309	148,692	180,795
Custodian	2708	40.0	1,727	2,099	1,802,988	2,191,356
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	2100	40,0	1,121	2,033	391,569	475,209
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					350,638	425,534
Overtime Pary (if applicable)					-	
Other Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Total Salary Costs	•	226.5			13,130,037	15,934,630
FRINGE BE NEFITS						
Variable Fringes (3)					4,287,792	4,822,594
Fixed Fringes (4)					2,952,202	2,952,202
Total Fringe Benefits					7,239,993	7,774,796
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS		·		ν.		
Operating Costs					2,320,158	2,389,763
opolaring o colo					2,020,000	
		κ.			-	-
					. <b>1</b>	-
Total Capital & Operating					2,320,158	2,389,763
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		• •			22,690,188	26,099,189
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT (	COST		i		(18,768,470)	(19,359,276)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 3,921,718	\$ 6,739,913
% of Savings to City Cost					17%	26%
re or odvinge to only cost						20/6

<u>Comments/Assumptions:</u>

1. This service has always been contract out since start of garage operations.

 Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014.
 Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and longterm disability, where applicable.

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Operating costs includes operating expenses & credit card processing fees.

AIRPORT COMMISSION PARKING OPERATIONS COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

FROME COSTS	<u>.                                    </u>	# of Full Time					
Job Class Title	Class		Di Mooki	u Plata	1	High	
JOD Class Title	Class	Equivalent	Bi-Weekl	y nate	Low	High	
L	1000	Positions	1.0772	ا يور و م			
Manager IV	0932	1.0	4,278	5,460	111,656	142,506	
Manager II	0923	2.0	3,696	4,717	192,931	246,227	
Manager I	0922	1.0	3,446	4,397	89,941	114,762	
Contract Compliance Officer I	2992	1.0	3,027	3,67 <del>9</del>	79,005	96,022	
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	3,470	4,218	90,567	110,090	
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	1.0	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419	
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,52 <b>6</b>	73,576	
Clerk _	1404	1.0	1,654	2,009	43,169	52,435	
Sr. Cierk	1406	6.0	1,714	2,084	268,412	326,354	
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	59,090	71,827	
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	2,459	2,989	64,180	78,013	
Accountant II	1652	1.0	2,478	3,012	64,676	78,613	
Collection Supervisor	4366	1.0	2,466	2,997	64,363	78,222	
Investigator	4334	2.0	2,752	3,346	143,654	174,661	
Customer Service Agent Supervisor	1326	21.0	2,551	3,101	1,398,203	1,699,658	
Cashier III	4322	64.5	2,063	2,507	3,472,957	4,220,409	
Electronic Maintenance Technician	7318	1.0	3,295	4,006	86,000	104,557	
Stationary Engineer	7334	2.5	2,981	2,981	194,510	194,510	
Chief Stationary Engr	7205	1.0	3,782	3,782	98,710	98,710	
Institutional Police Lieutenant	8209	1.0	3,913	4,991	102,129	130,265	
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	2.0	3,411	4,355	178,054	227,331	
Bldg & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	68.5	1,927	2,342	3,445,187	4,187,145	
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,094	2,545	54,653	66,425	
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	3.0	1,899	2,309	148,692		
Custodian	2708	40.0				180,795	
	2706	40.0	1,727	2,099	1,802,988	2,191,356	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					393,075	477,037	
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					350,638	425,534	
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					-	-	
Other Pay (if applicable)							
Total Salary Costs		226.5			13,131,543	15,936,458	
FRINGE BENEFITS				,	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
Variable Fringes (3)					4,074,430	4,638,024	
Fixed Fringes (4)					3,054,616	3,054,616	
Total Fringe Benefits					7,129,046	7,692,640	
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS							
Operating Costs					2,389,763	2,461,457	
•					-	-	
					-	-	
Tatal Carillal & Caracting						-	
Total Capital & Operating					2,389,763	2,461,457	
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					22,650,351	26,090,555	
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST				(19,326,573)	(19,933,707)	
COTIMATED O MUNICO					A 0.000	· · ·	
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 3,323,779	\$ 6,156,847	
% of Savings to City Cost	L. C.				15%	24%	

Comments/Assumptions:

1. This service has always been contract out since start of garage operations.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Operating costs includes operating expenses & credit card processing fees.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

John L. Martin Airport Director San Francisco International Airport International Terminal, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Bruce Robertson, Budget Director San Francisco International Airport Terminal 2, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

RE: Airport Parking - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Airport Parking services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year (FY) 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely.

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

FAX 415-554-7466

AIRPORT COMMISSION PARKING OPERATIONS COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2). FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

	ſ · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	# of Full Time	······			
Job Class Title	Class	Equivalent	Bi-Week	v Rate	Low	High
	01235	Positions		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	1011	g.
Manager IV	0932	1.0	4,278	5,460	111,656	142,506
Manager II	0923	2.0	3,696	4,717	192,931	246,227
Manager I	0922	1.0	3,446	4,397	89,941	114,762
Contract Compliance Officer 1	2992	1.0	3,027	3,679	79,005	96,022
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	3,470	4,218	90,567	110,090
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	1.0	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,526	73,576
Clerk	1404	. 1,0	1,654	2,009	43,169	52,435
Sr. Cierk	1406	6.0	1,714	2,084	268,412	326,354
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	59,090	71,827
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	2,459	2,989	64,180	78,013
Accountant II	1652	1.0	2,478	3,012	64,676	78,613
Collection Supervisor	4366	· 1.0	2,466	2,997	64,363	78,222
Investigator	4334	2.0	2,752	3,346	143,654	174,661
-		21.0	2,551	3,101	1,398,203	1,699,658
Customer Service Agent Supervisor	1326		•			
Cashier III	4322	64.5	2,063	2,507	3,472,957	4,220,409
Electronic Maintenance Technician	7318	1.0	3,295	4,006		104,557
Stationary Engineer Chief Stationary Engr	7334 7205	2.5 1.0	2,981 3,782	2,981 3,782	194,510 · 98,710	194,510 98,710
Institutional Police Lieutenant	8209	1.0	3,782	4,991	102,129	130,265
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	2.0	3,411	4,355	178,054	227,331
Bidg & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	68.5	1,927	2,342	3,445,187	4,187,145
5	-	1.0	2,094	2,545		
Custodial Supervisor	2718		-	-	54,653	66,425
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	3.0	1,899	2,309	148,692	180,795
Custodian	2708	40.0	1,727	2,099	1,802,988	2,191,356
Holiday Pay (if applicable)		· ·			391,569	475,209
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable)					350,638	425,534
Other Pay (if applicable)						-
Total Salary Costs		226.5	•		13,130,037	15,934,630
		220,0			10,100,001	10,000 .,000
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Variable Fringes (3)					4,287,792	4,822,594
Fixed Fringes (4)					2,952,202	2,952,202
Total Fringe Benefits					7,239,993	7,774,796
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS					·	
Operating Costs					2,320,158	2,389,763
					-	-
· · ·						-
Total Capital & Operating		• .			2,320,158	2,389,763
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		•			22,690,188	26,099,189
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	TPOST					
LESS: ESTIMATED TUTAL CONTRACT	0031				(18,768,470)	(19,359,276)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	-				\$ 3,921,718	\$ 6,739,913
% of Savings to City Cost					17%	26%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. This service has always been contract out since start of garage operations.

 Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014.
 Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and longterm disability, where applicable.

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Operating costs includes operating expenses & credit card processing fees.

AIRPORT COMMISSION PARKING OPERATIONS COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

PROJECTED FERJORINEL COSTS	1	1		T	·····	1
		# of Full Time	<b>D</b> (1)(- 1)			
Job Class Title	Class	Equivalent	Bi-Weekl	у нате	Low	High
	L	Positions				
Manager IV	0932	1.0	4,278	5,460	111,656	142,506
Manager II	0923	2.0	3,696	4,717	192,931	246,227
Manager I	0922	1.0	3,446	4,397	89,941	114,762
Contract Compliance Officer I	2992	1.0	3,027	3,679	79,005	96,022
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	3,470	4,218	90,567	110,090
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	1.0	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,526	73,576
Clerk	1404	1.0	1,654	2,009	43,169	52,435
Sr. Clerk	1406	6,0	1,714	2,084	268,412	326,354
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	59,090	71,827
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	2,459	2,989	64,180	78,013
Accountant II	1652	1.0	2,478	3,012	64,676	78,613
Collection Supervisor	436 <b>6</b>	1.0	2,466	2,997	64,363	78,222
Investigator	4334	2.0	2,752	3,346	143,654	174,661
Customer Service Agent Supervisor	1326	21.0	2,551	3,101	1,398,203	1,699,658
Cashier III	4322	64.5	2,063	2,507	3,472,957	4,220,409
Electronic Maintenance Technician	7318	1.0	3,295	4,006	86,000	104,557
Stationary Engineer	7334	2.5	2,981	2,981	194,510	194,510
Chief Stationary Engr	7205	1.0	3,782	3,782	98,710	98,710
Institutional Police Lieutenant	8209	1.0	3,913	4,991	102,129	130,265
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	2.0	3,411	4,355	178,054	227,331
Bldg & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	68.5	1,927	2,342	3,445,187	4,187,145
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,094	2,545	54,653	66,425
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	3.0	1,899	2,309	148,692	180,795
Custodian	2708	40.0	1,727	2,099	1,802,988	2,191,356
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					393,075	477,037
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					350,638	425,534
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					-	· •
Other Pay (if applicable)		•		_		-
Total Salary Cost	S	226.5			13,131,543	15,936,458
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Variable Fringes (3)					4,074,430	4,638,024
Fixed Fringes (4)				-	3,054,616	3,054,616
Total Fringe Benefit	ts				7,129,046	7,692,640
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS						
Operating Costs	•		1		2,389,763	2,461,457
					-	-
					•	-
					<u> </u>	-
Total Capital & Operatir	ıg		• •		2,389,763	2,461,457
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					22,650,351	26,090,555
		,			//= ====/`	(
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRAC	TCOST				(19,326,573)	(19,933,707
ESTIMATED SAVINGS						<u>\$ 6,156,847</u>
% of Savings to City Co	st				15%	24%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. This service has always been contract out since start of garage operations.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable,

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Operating costs includes operating expenses & credit card processing fees.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

John L. Martin Airport Director San Francisco International Airport International Terminal, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Bruce Robertson, Budget Director San Francisco International Airport Terminal 2, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

RE: Airport Parking - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Airport Parking services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year (FY) 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield,

Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

AIRPORT COMMISSION PARKING OPERATIONS COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTE D PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time				·· ·
Job Class Title	Class	Equivalent	Bi-Weekl	v Bate	Low	High
		Positions		,		
Manager IV	0932	1.0	4,278	5,460	111.656	142,506
Manager II	0923	2.0	3,696	4,717	192,931	246,227
Manager I	0922	1.0	3,446	4,397	89,941	114,762
Contract Compliance Officer I	2992	1.0	3,027	3,679	79,005	96,022
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	3,470	4,218	90,567	110,09 <b>0</b>
Sr. Managerment Assistant	1844	1.0	2,819	3,426	73,57 <del>6</del>	89,419
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,526	73,576
Clerk	1404	1.0	1,654	2,009	43,169	52,435
Sr. Clerk	1406	6.0	1,714	2,084	268,412	326,354
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	5 <b>9</b> ,0 <b>90</b>	71,827
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	2,459	2,98 <b>9</b>	64,180	78,013
Accountant 11	1652	1.0	2,478	3,012	64,676	78,613
Collection Supervisor	4366	. 1.0	2,466	2,997	64,363	78,222
investigator	4334	2.0	2,752	3,346	143,654	174,661
Customer Service Agent Supervisor	1326	21.0	2,551	3,101	1,398,203	1,699,658
Cashier III	4322	64.5	2,063	2,507	3,472,957	4,220,409
Electronic Maintenance Technician	7318	1.0	3,295	4,006	86,000	104,557
Stationary Engineer	7334	2.5	2,981	2,981	194,510	194,510
Chief Statiomary Engr	7205	1.0	3,782	3,782	98,710	98,710
Institutional Police Lieutenant	8209	1.0	3,913	4,991	102,129	130,265
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	2.0	3,411	4,355	178,054	227,331
Bldg & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	68.5	1,927	2,342	3,445,187	4,187,145
Custodial Supervisor	2718	- 1.0	2,094	2,545	54,653	66,425
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	3.0	1,89 <b>9</b>	2,309	148,692	180,795
Custodian	2708	40.0	1,727	2,09 <b>9</b>	1,802,988	2,191,356
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					391,569	475,209
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					350,638	425,534
Overtime Pary (if applicable)					•	-
Other Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Total Salary Cost	5	226.5			13,130,037	15,934,630
FRINGE BE NEFITS						
Variable Fringes (3)					4,287,792	4,822,594
Fixed Fringes (4)					2,952,202	2,952,202
Total Fringe Benefit	5				7,239,993	7,774,796
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS						
Operating Costs					2,320,158	2,389,763
					-,,	-,,
					-	-
					<u> </u>	
Total Capital & Operating	3				2,320,158	2,389,763
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					22,690,188	26,099,189
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST				(18,768,470)	(19,359,276)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	•				\$ 3,921,718	\$ 6,739,913

Comments/Assumptions:

1. This service has always been contract out since start of garage operations.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Operating costs includes operating expenses & credit card processing fees.

AIRPORT COMMISSION PARKING OPERATIONS COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

FROJECTED FERSONNEL COSTS	1	# of Full Time	·	r	<u>r</u>	————· 1	
I-1- 01 701-			Bi-Weekly Rate		1.000	112-6	
Job Class Title	Class	Equivalent	BI-Meeki	унате	Low	High	
		Positions	·				
Manager IV	0932	1.0	4,278	5,460	111,656	142,506	
Manager II	0923	2.0	3,696	4,717	192,931	246,227	
Manager I	0922	1.0	3,446	4,397	89,941	114,762	
Contract Compliance Officer I	2992	1.0	3,027	3,67 <del>9</del>	79,005	96,022	
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	3,470	4,218	90,567	110,090	
Sr. Management Assistant	1844	1.0	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419	
Sr. Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,526	73,576	
Cierk	1404	1.0	1,654	2,009	43,169	52,435	
Sr. Clerk	1406	6.0	1,714	2,084	268,412	326,354	
Principal Clerk	1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	59,090	71,827	
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	2,459	2,98 <del>9</del>	64,180	78,013	
Accountant II	1652	1.0	2,478	3,012	64,676	78,613	
Collection Supervisor	43 <b>66</b>	1.0	2,466	2,997	64,363	78,222	
Investigator	4334	2.0	2,752	3,346	143,654	174,661	
Customer Service Agent Supervisor	1326	21.0	2,551	3,101	1,398,203	1,699,658	
Cashier III	4322	64.5	2,063	2,507	3,472,957	4,220,409	
Electronic Maintenance Technician	7318	1.0	3,295	4,006	86,000	104,557	
Stationary Engineer	7334	2.5	2,981	2,981	194,510	194,510	
Chief Stationary Engr	7205	1.0	3,782	3,782	98,710	98,710	
Institutional Police Lieutenant	8209	1.0	3,913	4,991	102,129	130,265	
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	2.0	3,411	4,355	178,054	227,331	
Bldg & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	68.5	1,927	2,342	3,445,187	4,187,145	
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,094	2,545	54,653	66,425	
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	3.0	1,899	2,309	148,692	180,795	
Custodian	2708	40.0	1,727	2,099	1,802,988	2,191,356	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)			.,		393,075	477,037	
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					350,638	425,534	
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						.20,004	
Other Pay (if applicable)						_	
Total Salary Cost	s	226.5	•		13,131,543	15,936,458	
	•	21.0.0			10,101,010	10,000,400	
FRINGE BENEFITS							
Variable Fringes (3)					4,074,430	4,638,024	
Fixed Fringes (4)					3,054,616	3,054,616	
Total Fringe Benefit	·e				7,129,046	7,692,640	
Total Finge Deren					7,123,040	7,032,040	
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS							
Operating Costs					2,389,763	2,461,457	
Operating Obsis					2,003,100	2,301,301	
					-		
					•	_	
Total Capital & Operatin					2,389,763	2,461,457	
	ig .				2,369,703	2,401,437	
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					22,650,351	26,090,555	
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	T COST				(19,326,573)	(19,933,707	
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 3,323,779	\$ 6,156,847	
% of Savings to City Co	st				15%	24%	
<b>•</b> •• •• <b>•</b>							

Comments/Assumptions;

1. This service has always been contract out since start of garage operations.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Operating costs includes operating expenses & credit card processing fees.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

John L. Martin Airport Director San Francisco International Airport International Terminal, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

Attention: Bruce Robertson, Budget Director San Francisco International Airport Terminal 2, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

RE: Airport Shuttle Bus Service - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for airport shuttle bus services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year (FY) 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield Controller Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

AIRPORT COMMISSION AIRPORT SHUTTLE BUS SERVICE COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES(1)(2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Job Class Title Transit Operator Transit Supervisor Transit Manager II Automotive Mechanic Transit Car Cleaner Manager IV, Municipal Transportation Agency Total Salary Costs Holiday Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla Other Pay (if applicable)		# of Fu Equiv Posit	alent	Bi-Week \$ 1,488 2,786 3,714 3,289 3,012 1,918 3,989		\$	Low 3,262,291 363,573 96,935 85,843 314,453 100,120 104,113 0 0 0 0 128,206 122,485	\$	High 5,178,449 442,004 117,815 104,348 314,453 121,730 132,849 0 0 0 0 384,363 181,482 908,495
Transit Operator Transit Supervisor Transit Manager II Transit Manager I Automotive Mechanic Transit Car Cleaner Manager IV, Municipal Transportation Agency Total Salary Costs Holiday Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla	9163 9139 9141 9140 7381 9102 9174	· · ·	tions 84.0 5.0 1.0 1.0 4.0 2.0 1.0	\$ 1,488 2,786 3,714 3,289 3,012 1,918	\$2,362 3,387 4,514 3,998 3,012 2,332	\$	3,262,291 363,573 96,935 85,843 314,453 100,120 104,113 0 0 0 128,206 122,485	\$	5,178,449 442,004 117,815 104,348 314,453 121,730 132,849 0 0 0 384,363 181,482
Transit Operator Transit Supervisor Transit Manager II Transit Manager I Automotive Mechanic Transit Car Cleaner Manager IV, Municipal Transportation Agency Total Salary Costs Holiday Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla	9163 9139 9141 9140 7381 9102 9174		84.0 5.0 1.0 1.0 4.0 2.0 1.0	\$ 1,488 2,786 3,714 3,289 3,012 1,918	\$2,362 3,387 4,514 3,998 3,012 2,332	\$	3,262,291 363,573 96,935 85,843 314,453 100,120 104,113 0 0 0 128,206 122,485	\$	5,178,449 442,004 117,815 104,348 314,453 121,730 132,849 0 0 0 384,363 181,482
Transit Supervisor Transit Manager II Transit Manager I Automotive Mechanic Transit Car Cleaner Manager IV, Municipal Transportation Agency Total Salary Costs Holiday Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla	9139 9141 9140 7381 9102 9174		5.0 1.0 1.0 4.0 2.0 1.0	2,786 3,714 3,289 3,012 1,918	3,387 4,514 3,998 3,012 2,332	·	363,573 96,935 85,843 314,453 100,120 104,113 0 0 0 0 128,206 122,485	• •	442,004 117,815 104,348 314,453 121,730 132,849 0 0 0 384,363 181,482
Transit Manager II Transit Manager I Automotive Mechanic Transit Car Cleaner Manager IV, Municipal Transportation Agency Total Salary Costs Holiday Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla	9141 9140 7381 9102 9174	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	1.0 1.0 4.0 2.0 1.0	3,714 3,289 3,012 1,918	4,514 3,998 3,012 2,332		96,935 85,843 314,453 100,120 104,113 0 0 0 0 128,206 122,485		117,815 104,348 314,453 121,730 132,849 0 0 0 384,363 181,482
Transit Manager I Automotive Mechanic Transit Car Cleaner Manager IV, Municipal Transportation Agency Total Salary Costs Holiday Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla	9140 7381 9102 9174		1.0 4.0 2.0 1.0	3,289 3,012 1,918	3,998 3,012 2,332		85,843 314,453 100,120 104,113 0 0 0 0 128,206 122,485		104,348 314,453 121,730 132,849 0 0 0 384,363 181,482
Automotive Mechanic Transit Car Cleaner Manager IV, Municipal Transportation Agency Total Salary Costs Holiday Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla	9102 9174		4.0 2.0 1.0	3,012 1,918	3,012 2,332		314,453 100,120 104,113 0 0 0 128,206 122,485		314,453 121,730 132,849 0 0 384,363 181,482
Manager IV, Municipal Transportation Agency Total Salary Costs Holiday Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job c	9174 asses	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	2.0 1.0	1,918	2,332		100,120 104,113 0 0 0 128,206 122,485		121,730 132,849 0 0 384,363 181,482
Manager IV, Municipal Transportation Agency Total Salary Costs Holiday Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job c	asses						104,113 0 0 128,206 122,485		132,849 0 0 384,363 181,482
Total Salary Costs Holiday Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job cla Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job c		·	98.0	-			0 0 128,206 122,485		0 0 384,363 181,482
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job of							128,206 122,485		384,363 181,482
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job of							122,485		181,482
							606,065 0		500,490
Total Salary Costs		[		1		<b></b>	5,184,084	T-	7,885,988
FRINGE BENEFITS Variable Fringes(3) Fixed Fringes(4) Total Fringe Benefits							1,713,273 1,380,192 3,093,465		2,569,310 1,380,192 3,949,502
<u>ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS</u> (if applicable) Vehicle Operating Costs (same as contractor) Utilities (same as contractor) Worker's Compensation (same as contractor)		. ·					1,925,815 25,055 293,232		1,925,815 25,055 293,232
Total Capital & Operating							2,244,102		2,244,102
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST				•			10,521,651		14,079,593
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST						(1	10,343,085)	) (	10,345,866)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS % of Savings to City Cost						\$	178,566 2%	_	3,733,727 27%

#### Comments/Assumptions:

1. This service has been contracted out since 1975.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Estimated City capital and operating costs are included in the estimated total contract cost.

6. The Estimated Contract Cost for annual service is based upon estimated 2% annual increase in operating costs,

7. Shuttle Bus contract renewed December 1, 1012

AIRPORT COMMISSION AIRPORT SHUTTLE BUS SERVICE COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES(1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

#### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		4 .	ull Time ivalent								
Job Class Title	Class		sitions		Bi-Wee	klv	Rate		Low		High
Transit Operator	9163	<u> </u>	84.0	\$		_	2,362	\$	3,262,291	\$	5,178,449
Transit Supervisor	9139		5.0		2,786	•	3,387	•	363,573		442,004
Transit Manager II	9141		1.0		3,714		4.514		96,935		117,815
Transit Manager I	9140		1.0		3,289		3,998		85,843		104,348
Automotive Mechanic	7381		4.0		3,012		3,012		314,453		314,453
Transit Car Cleaner	9102		2.0		1,918		2,332		100,120		121,730
Manager IV, Municipal Transportation Agency	9174		1.0		3,989		5,090		104,113		132,849
									0		0
									0		0
									0		0
Holiday Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 job	classes								128,206		192,182
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)							·		122,485		181,482
Overtime Pay for 9163, 9139, 9102, and 7381 jo	b classes								606,065		908,495
Other Pay (if applicable)				-					0		0
Total Salary Costs			98.0					L	5,184,084		7,693,806
FRINGE BENEFITS											•
Variable Fringes (3)	•		· .						1,637,977		2,457,748
Fixed Fringes(4)			· ·						1,425,822		1,425,822
Total Fringe Benefits									3,063,799	-	3,883,569
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)			•								
Vehicle Operating Costs (same as contractor)									1,964,331		1,964,331
Utilities (same as contractor)									25,556		25,556
Worker's Compensation (same as contractor)									299,096		299,096
Total Capital & Operating									2,288,983		2,288,983
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST									10,536,866		13,866,359
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COS	iT							\$	(10,425,910)	\$	(10,428,071
ESTIMATED SAVINGS									110,956		3,438,288
% of Savings to City Cost	t								1%		25%
				,							307

#### Comments/Assumptions:

1. This service has been contracted out since 1975.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Estimated City capital and operating costs are included in the estimated total contract cost.

6. The Estimated Contract Cost for annual service is based upon estimated 2% annual increase in operating costs.

7. Shuttle Bus contract renewed December 1, 2012



# **OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

## Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: Parking Citation Processing and Collection Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for parking citation processing and collection services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees. This is based on an analysis of the best available cost estimates, should the City perform the services instead of a contractor.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely.

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodiett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

FAX 415-554-7466

FISCAL YEAR 2014-15 CITATION PROCESSING AND COLLECTIONS COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS		H of Full Time		<u> </u>		·7
		# of Full Time				
Joh Close Title	Close	Equivalent	Di Maak		Low	Llich
Job Class Title INTERSTATE & SPECIAL COLLECTIONS:	Class	Positions	Bi-Week		Low   \$ - \$	High
	1052	2.00	\$3,263	\$3,597	170,329	187,763
IS Business Analyst Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	1.00	\$3,203 3,117	3,78 <b>8</b>	81,354	98,867
Senior Administrative Anaryst	1023	1.00	3,117	3,700	01,004	30,007
OPERATING SYSTEM & APPLICATION SC		MAINTENANCE				
IS Administrator III	1094	1.00	3,256	3,957	84,982	103,278
IS Engineer - Senior	1043	1.00	3,928	4,939	102,521	128,908
IS Engineer - Principal	1044	1.00	4,225	5,722	110,273	149,344
- · ·	1044	1.00			64,441	
IS Programmer Analyst			2,469	3,106	-	81,067
IS Programmer Analyst - Senior	1063	1.00	2,999	3,777	78,274	98,580
IS Programmer Analyst - Principal	1064	1.00	3,492	4,394	91,141	114,683
IS Project Director	1070	1.00	4,225	5,722	110,273	149,344
OF ATION PROGRAMMO & COLLECTION						
CITATION PROCESSING & COLLECTION:						
Clerk	1404	1.00	1,654	2,009	43,169	52,435
Principal Clerk	1408	1.00	2,264	2,752	59,090	71,827
Account Clerk	1630	3,00	1,773	2,156	138,826	168,815
Principal Account Clerk	1634	1.00	2,319	2,819	60,526	73,576
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.00	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419
Cashier II	4321	27.00	1,840	2,236	1,296,648	1,575,709
Cashier III	4322	3.00	2,063	2,507	161,533	196,298
Manager II	9172	1.00	3,433	4,381	89,601	114,344
	· · ·	•				
Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Other Pay (if applicable)	-					
Total Salary Costs		48.0		r	2,816,555	3,454,257
	····	1			2,010,000 1	0,,0,,207
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Fringe at 47%					1,572,196	1,710,603
				_		
Total Fringe Benefits				_	1,572,196	1,710,603
÷						
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)						
Software/Data Conversion					574,006	574,0001
CADITAL COSTS						
CAPITAL COSTS					231,886	001 000
Handheld Units Workstations						231,886
					42,000	42,000
Computers					8,400	8,400
Toughbooks					2,500	2,500
Printers	×.				3,500	3,500
Customer Service Windows					84,000	84,000
Space Rental					375,000	375,000
Postage					673,608	673,608
Tickets/Envelopes					42,612	42,612
Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees					681,243	681,243
Mobil License Recognition Cameras				·	75,320	75,320
Total Capital & Operating					2,794,069	2,794,069
Program Overnead			Self-self-self-self-self-self-self-self-s		521.005	

#### ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

8,104,425 8,880,534

#### LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST

Contract Monitoring Cost

		(8,	102,295)	(8,112,496)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		\$	2,130 \$	768,037
% of Savings to City Cost		<u> </u>	0%	9%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1998 was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary rates as posted in DHR website at June 30, 2014 Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs. On classes and FTEs identified.:

For the SFMTA to provide this service utilizing city staff it will require the utilization of a broad range of IT classes. These classes would have distinct roles that will need to be provided. The rapid advancement of technology and cost saving opportunities that are associated with those advancements necessitates a dedicated technology team to this effort.

The shown 1823 and 1052 Analysts will be needed to map the business requirements to process design and software requirments for the development team. This is an iterative process that continues for the life of the system.

The shown 109x System administrators and 104x System Engineers would be required to perform the maintenance and oversee operation the citations system. The number of staff is representative for the critical business function this system provides to the SFMTA.

The shown 106x Programmer analysts would be need to implement a software solution to meet the needs of the SFMTA citation unit. The number of developers is potentially understated for the initial ramp up of getting a base application in place for this business need. The 1070 Is Project Director would manage and direct this team.

The shown Citations & Processing class would be need to perform operational tasks of citations issuance, mailing, late notices (various:late fees, tow, collections activity, etc.), account assignments, payments receiptt, payment processing, payment application, research, responding to inquiries, manual input and tracking of manual citations, and account audit.

FISCAL YEAR 2015-2016 CITATION PROCESSING AND COLLECTIONS COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

		# of Full Time	······		<u> </u>	
		Equivalent				
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Week	lv Rate	Low	High
INTERSTATE & SPECIAL COLLECTION					\$ -	\$ -
IS Business Analyst	1052	2.00	\$3,263	\$3,597	170,329	187,763
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	1.00	3,117	3,788	81,354	98,867
OPERATING SYSTEM & APPLICATIO	N SOFTWARE	MAINTENANCE:				
IS Administrator III	1094	1.00	3,256	3,957	84,982	103,278
IS Engineer - Senior	1043	1.00	3,928	4,939	102,521	128,908
IS Engineer - Principal	1044	1.00	4,225	5,722	110,273	149,344
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	1.00	2,469	3,106	64,441	81,067
IS Programmer Analyst - Senior	1063	1.00	2,999	3,777	78,274	98,580
IS Programmer Analyst - Principal	1064	1.00	3,492	4,394	91,141	114,683
IS Project Director	1070	1.00	4,225	5,722	110,273	149,344
CITATION PROCESSING & COLLEC	TION:					
Cierk	1404	1.00	1,654	2,009	43,169	52,435
Principal Clerk	1408	1.00	2,264	2,752	59,090	71,827
Account Clerk	1630	3.00	1,773	2,156	138,826	168,815
Principal Account Clerk	1634	1.00	2,319	2,819	60,526	73,576
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.00	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419
Cashier II	4321	27.00	1,840	2,236	1,296,648	1,575,709
Cashier III	4322	3.00	2,063	2,507	161,533	196,298
Manager II	9172	1.00	3,433	4,381	89,601	114,344
Holiday Pay (if applicable)						
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)						
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					0	0
Other Pay (if applicable)					0	. 0
Total Salary C	osts	48.0			2,816,555	3,454,257
FRINGE BENEFITS						5.
Fringe at 50%					1,545,547	1,678,929
Total Fringe Ben	efits				1,545,547	1,678,929
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicat	ole)					
Solfware/Data Cosversion					574,000	574,00
CAPITAL COSTS						
Handheld Units			•		238.843	238.843

Handheid Units	238,843	238,843
Workstations	43,260	42,000
Computers	8,652	8,400
Toughbooks	2,575	2,500
Printers	3,605	3,500
Customer Service Windows	86,520	84,000
Space Rental	386,250	375,000

Postage Tickets/Envelopes	673,608 43,831	673,608 42,554
Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees	681,243	681,243
Mobile License Recognition Cameras	75,320	75,320
Total Capital & Operating	2,817,707	2,800,968
Program Overhead	21 515	92 (00.5)
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	8,101,414	8,855,758
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST Contract Monitoring Cost		
	(8,016,082)	(8,026,148)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 85,332	\$ 829,611
% of Savings to City Cost	1%	9%

#### Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY XXXX would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary rates as posted in DHR website at June 30, 2014 Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

÷÷

Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

<List any other comments or assumptions>



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

## Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: Parking Citation Processing and Collection Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for parking citation processing and collection services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees. This is based on an analysis of the best available cost estimates, should the City perform the services instead of a contractor.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst. Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

City Hall • 1 Dr. Cariton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

CITATION PROCESSING AND COLLECTIONS COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

#### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECIED PERSONNEL COSIS		# of Full Time				
	0	Equivalent	Di Mend	h. Data	1	1.0-6
Job Class Title INTERSTATE & SPECIAL COLLECTIONS:	Class	Positions	Bi-Week	ly Rate	Low 5 -	High \$ -
IS Business Analyst	1052	2.00	\$3,263	\$3,597	ء 170,329	187,763
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	1.00	3,117	3,78 <b>8</b>	81,354	98,867
Centor Administrative Analysi	1020	1.00	0,117	0,700	01,004	30,007
OPERATING SYSTEM & APPLICATION SC	DETWARE	MAINTENANCE				
IS Administrator III	1094	1.00	3,256	3,957	84,982	103,278
IS Engineer - Senior	1043	1.00	3,928	4 <b>,</b> 939,	102,521	128,908
IS Engineer - Principal	1044	1.00	4,225	5,722	110,273	149,344
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	1.00	2,46 <del>9</del>	3,106	64,441	81,067
IS Programmer Analyst - Senior	1063	1.00	2,9 <b>99</b>	3,777	78,274	98,580
IS Programmer Analyst - Principal	1064	1.00	3,492	4,394	91,141	114,683
IS Project Director	1070	1.00	4,225	5,722	110,273	149,344
CITATION PROCESSING & COLLECTION						1. A.
Clerk	1404	1.00	1,654	2,009	43,169	52,435
Principal Clerk	1408	1.00	2,264	2,752	59,090	71,827
Account Clerk	1630	3.00	1,773	2,156	138,826	168,815
Principal Account Clerk	1634	1.00	2,319	2,819	60,526	73,576
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.00	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419
Cashier II	4321	27,00	1,840	2,236	1,296,648	1,575,709
Cashier III	4322	3.00	2,063	2,507	161,533	196,298
Manager II	9172	1.00	3,433	4,381	89,601	114,344
Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Other Pay (if applicable) Total Salary Costs		48.0			2,816,555	3,454,257
						•
FRINGE BENEFITS Fringe at 47%			,		1,572,196	1,710,603
Total Fringe Benefits					1,572,196	1,710,603
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)						
Software/Data Conversion					574,000	574,000
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·						
CAPITAL COSTS						
Handheld Units					231,886	231,886
Workstations			,		42,000	42,000
Computers					8,400	8,400
Toughbooks					2,500	2,500
Printers					3,500	3,500
Customer Service Windows					84,000	84,000
Space Rentai					375,000	375,000
Postage					673,608	673,608
Tickets/Envelopes					42,612	42,612
Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees					681,243 75 220	681,243
Mobil License Recognition Cameras Total Capital & Operating					75,320	75,320
i otal Capital a Operating					2,794,009	2,794,069
Program Overnead					921605	921 5051

#### ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

8,104,425 8,880,534

#### LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST

Contract Monitoring Cost			(8,102,295)	(8,112,496)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	· ·	\$	2,130 \$	768,037
% of Savings to City Cost			0%	9%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1998 was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary rates as posted in DHR website at June 30, 2014 Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs. On classes and FTEs identified .:

For the SFMTA to provide this service utilizing city staff it will require the utilization of a broad range of IT classes. These classes would have distinct roles that will need to be provided. The rapid advancement of technology and cost saving opportunities that are associated with those advancements necessitates a dedicated technology team to this effort.

The shown 1823 and 1052 Analysts will be needed to map the business requirements to process design and software requirments for the development team. This is an iterative process that continues for the life of the system.

The shown 109x System administrators and 104x System Engineers would be required to perform the maintenance and oversee operation the citations system. The number of staff is representative for the critical business function this system provides to the SFMTA.

The shown 106x Programmer analysts would be need to implement a software solution to meet the needs of the SFMTA citation unit. The number of developers is potentially understated for the initial ramp up of getting a base application in place for this business need. The 1070 Is Project Director would manage and direct this team.

The shown Citations & Procesing class would be need to perform operational tasks of citations issuance, mailing, late notices (various:late fees, tow, collections activity, etc.), account assignments, payments receiptt, payment processing, payment application, research, responding to inquiries, manual input and tracking of manual citations, and account audit.

FISCAL YEAR 201 5-2016

CITATION PROCESSING AND COLLECTIONS

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

FILOSEOTED F ENCOUNCE COOTO		# of Full Time	·····		·····	
•		Equivalent				•
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Week	lv Rate	Low	High .
INTERSTATE & SPECIAL COLLECTIO		1		y nano	\$ -	<u>\$</u> -
IS Business Analyst	1052	2.00	\$3,263	\$3,597	170,329	187,763
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	1.00	3,117	3,788	81,354	98,867
			-, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	-,		
OPERATING SYSTEM & APPLICATIO	N SOFTWARE	MAINTENANCE:				
IS Administrator III	1094	1.00	3,256	3,957	84,982	103,278
IS Engineer - Senior	1043	1.00	3,928	4,939	102,521	128,908
IS Engineer - Principal	1044	1.00	4,225	5,722	110,273	149,344
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	1.00	2,469	3,106	64,441	81,067
IS Programmer Analyst - Senior	1063	1.00	2,999	3,777	78,274	98,580
IS Programmer Analyst - Principal	1064	1.00	3,492	4,394	91,141	114,683
IS Project Director	1070	1.00	4,225	5,722	110,273	149,344
CITATION PROCESSING & COLLECT	ION:					
Clerk	1404 -	1.00	1,654	2,009	43,169	52,435
Principal Clerk	1408	1.00	2,264	2,752	59,090	71,827
Account Clerk	1630	3.00	1,773	2,156	138,826	168,815
Principal Account Clerk	1634	1.00	2,319	2,819	60,52 <b>6</b>	73,576
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.00	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419
Cashier II	4321	27.00	1,840	2,236	1,296,648	1,575,709
Cashier III	4322	3.00	2,063	2,507	161,533	196,298
Manager II	9172	1.00	3,433	4,381	89,601	114,344
-						•
Helidey Dev (if en plineble)						
Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)						
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					0	C
Other Pay (if applicable)	•				0	- 0
Total Salary Co	sts	48.0		1	2,816,555	3,454,257
					2,0,0,000	
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Fringe at 50%					1,545,547	1,678,929
						<u> </u>
Total Fringe Bene	fits				1,545,547	1,678,929
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable	le)					
Software/Data Conversion					574,000	574.00
CAPITAL COSTS		1				
Handheld Units		•	•		238,843	238,843
Workstations					43,260	42,000
Computers					8,652	42,000
Toughbooks	•				2,575	2,500
Printers					3,605	2,500
Customer Service Windows					96 520	84.000

Printers Customer Service Windows Space Rental

1126

86,520

386,250

84,000

375,000

Destance	673,608	673,608
Postage Talata/Envaluence	43.831	42,554
Tickets/Envelopes	,	,
Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees	681,243	681,243
Mobile License Recognition Cameras	75,320	75,320
Total Capital & Operating	2,817,707	2,800,968
······································		, ,
Program Overhead,	221.605	<b>921</b> 10.1
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	8,101,414	8,855,758
		•
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		
Contract Monitoring Cost		
	(8,016,082)	(8,026,148)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 85,332 5	
% of Savings to City Cost	1%	9%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY XXXX would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary rates as posted in DHR website at June 30, 2014 Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

<List any other comments or assumptions>



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

## Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: Parking Citation Processing and Collection Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for parking citation processing and collection services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees. This is based on an analysis of the best available cost estimates, should the City perform the services instead of a contractor.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely.

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

FAX 415-554-7466

FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

CITATION PROCESSING AND COLLECTIONS

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

# ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title         Class         Equivalent Positions         Bi-Weekly Rate         Low         High           INTERSTATE & SPECIAL_COLLECTIONS: IS Business Analyst         1052         2.00         \$3,263         \$3,597         170,329         187,763           Senior Administrative Analyst         1052         2.00         \$3,263         \$3,597         170,329         187,763           Senior Administrative Analyst         1094         1.00         3,256         3,957         64,982         103,278           IS Administrator III         1094         1.00         3,226         4,939         102,521         128,908           IS Engineer - Senior         1043         1.00         3,226         4,939         106,64,441         1149,344           IS Programmer Analyst - Senior         1062         1.00         2,499         3,177         78,274         98,580           IS Project Director         1070         1.00         4,225         5,722         110,273         149,344           Citak         4004         1.00         1,654         2,009         43,169         52,455           Principal Account Clerk         1630         3,000         1,773         2,156         138,826         168,915           Principal	PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS		# of Full Time	· <u>····</u>	<u></u>	l	
Jab Class Title         Class         Positions         Bi-Weekly Rate         Low         High           NITERSTATE & SPECIAL_COLLECTIONS:         052         2.00         \$3,263         \$5,3,697         \$7,329         \$177,329         \$177,329         \$187,253           Senior Administrative Analyst         1823         1.00         3,117         3,788         \$51,354         \$98,867           OPERATING SYSTEM & APPLICATION SOFTWARE MAINTENANCE:         Item and the second seco							
SB Sunieres Analyst       1052       2.00       \$3,263       \$3,567       170.29       187,768         Senior Administrative Analyst       1823       1.00       3,117       3,788       81,354       98,867         OPERATING SYSTEM & APPLICATION SOFTWARE MAINTENANCE:       IS       IS       1004       1.00       3,256       3,957       84,982       103,278         IS Engineer - Senior       1043       1.00       3,256       3,957       84,982       103,273         IS Engineer - Senior       1043       1.00       3,228       4,939       102,251       128,908         IS Programmer Analyst - Senior       1062       1.00       2,469       3,106       64,441       110,834         IS Programmer Analyst - Principal       1064       1.00       3,492       4,394       91,141       114,834         IS Programmer Analyst - Principal       1064       1.00       1,654       2,009       71,327       149,344         CITATION PROCESSING & COLLECTION:       Clark       1002       1,624       2,752       59,090       71,327         Account Clerk       1630       3,000       1,773       2,168       138,268       108,515         Account Clerk       1630       1.000       2,2	Job Class Title	Class		Bi-Week	ly Rate	Low	High
Senior Administrative Analyst         1823         1.00         3,117         3,788         81,354         96,867           OPERATING SYSTEM & APPLICATION SOFTWARE MAINTENANCE:         IS Administrator III         1094         1.00         3,256         3,957         84,982         103,278           IS Engineer - Senior         1043         1.00         3,228         4,399         102,521         128,903           IS Engineer - Principal         1044         1.00         4,225         5,722         110,273         149,344           IS Programmer Analyst - Senior         1063         1.00         2,469         3,166         64,441         81,067           IS Project Director         1070         1.00         4,422         5,722         110,273         149,344           CITATION PROCESSING & COLLECTION:         1.00         1,654         2,009         43,169         52,435           Principal Account Clerk         1404         1.00         2,319         2,816         38,826         168,815           Principal Account Clerk         1634         1.00         2,819         3,426         73,576         39,419           Cashier II         4321         27.00         1,404         2,261         2,567         151,533         196,2						Ŧ	•
OPERATING SYSTEM & APPLICATION SOFTWARE MAINTENANCE:           IS Administrator III         1094         1.00         3,256         3,957         84,982         103,278           IS Engineer - Senior         1043         1.00         3,228         4,339         110,2521         128,038           IS Engineer - Principal         1044         1.00         3,228         4,339         100,2521         128,038           IS Programmer Analyst - Senior         1063         1.00         2,499         3,106         64,441         81,067           IS Programmer Analyst - Principal         1064         1.00         3,492         4,394         91,141         114,683           IS Project Director         1070         1.00         4,225         5,722         110,273         149,344           CITATION PROCESSING & COLLECTION:         Clerk         1630         3.00         1,773         2,156         138,826         138,576         89,907         71,827           Account Clerk         1630         3.00         1,773         2,156         138,826         136,575         3,576           Senior Management Assistant         1844         1.00         2,819         3,428         1,575,709         3,157         53,576         89,419         Ca	IS Business Analyst			• - •			
IS Administrator III 1094 1.00 3.256 3.957 8.4982 103.278 128.908 102.521 128.908 1S Engineer - Senior 1043 1.00 3.028 4.393 102.521 128.908 IS Engineer - Principal 1044 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Programmer Analyst - Principal 1064 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.348 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.348 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 1.226 1.286 4.1575.709 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 3.433 4.381 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 3.433 4.381 IS Project Director 114.344 IS Project Director	Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	1.00	3,117	3,788	81,354	98,867
IS Engineer - Senior 1043 1.00 3.928 4.939 102.521 128.908 IS Engineer - Principal 1044 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149,344 IS Programmer Analyst - Senior 1063 1.00 2.469 3.106 64,441 81.067 IS Programmer Analyst - Principal 1064 1.00 3.422 4.394 91,141 114.683 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110,273 149,344 CITATION PROCESSING & COLLECTION; Clerk 1404 1.00 1.654 2.009 43,169 52,435 Principal Clerk 1404 1.00 2.264 2.752 59,090 71.827 Account Clerk 1630 3.00 1.773 2.156 138,826 168,815 Senior Management Assistant 1844 1.00 2.819 3.426 73,576 89,419 Cashier II 4321 27.00 1,840 2.236 12,3576 89,419 Cashier II 4321 27.00 1,843 4,381 89,601 114,344 Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Cherr Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) CAPITAL COSTS Handheld Units 221,896 44.00 42,000	OPERATING SYSTEM & APPLICATION SC	DETWARE	MAINTENANCE				
IS Engineer - Principal 1044 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 IS Programmer Analyst 5 enior 1063 1.00 2.469 3.106 64.441 81.067 IS Programmer Analyst - Principal 1064 1.00 3.492 4.394 91,141 114.634 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 CITATION PROCESSING & COLLECTION; Clerk 1404 1.00 1.654 2.009 43.169 52.435 Principal Clerk 1408 1.00 2.264 2.752 59.090 71.827 Account Clerk 1630 3.00 1.773 2.156 138.826 168.815 Principal Account Clerk 1634 1.00 2.319 2.819 60.525 73.576 Senior Management Assistant 1844 1.00 2.819 3.426 73.576 89.419 Cashier II 4321 27.00 1.840 2.236 1.295.648 1.575.709 Cashier II 4322 3.00 2.063 2.507 161.533 196.298 Manager II 9172 1.00 3.433 4.381 89.601 114.344 Holiday Pay (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Software/Data Conversion 4.200 2.500 2	IS Administrator III			-	•	-	
IS Programmer Analyst 1062 1.00 2.469 3.106 64.441 81.067 IS Programmer Analyst - Sanlor 1063 1.00 2.999 3.777 78.274 96.580 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4.225 5.722 110.273 149.344 <u>CITATION PROCESSING &amp; COLLECTION:</u> Clerk 1404 1.00 1.654 2.009 43.169 52.435 Principal Clerk 1408 1.00 2.264 2.752 59.050 71.827 Account Clerk 1630 3.00 1.773 2.156 138.826 166.815 Senior Management Assistant 1844 1.00 2.819 3.426 73.576 89.419 Cashier II 4321 27.00 1.840 2.236 12.996.648 1.575.709 Cashier II 4322 3.00 2.063 2.507 161.533 196.288 Manager II 9172 1.00 3.433 4.381 89.601 114.344 Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Total Fringe Benefits 1.572.196 1.710.603 ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable) Software/Data Genversion 42.000 42.000 42.000 42.000 Cashier IS Serior Service Windows 8.400 8.400 Space Rental 9.200 43.000 8.400 Space Rental 9.200 42.000 42.000 42.000 Capturers 8.400 8.400 8.4000 Space Rental 9.75.000 3.75.00 3.500 Printers 2.500 2.500 2.500 2.500 2.500 Printers 2.500 2.500 2.500 2.500 Printers 2.500 2.500 2.500 2.500 Printers 2.500 2.500 2.500 2.500 Printers 2.500 2.500	-					•	
IS Programmer Analyst - Senior 1063 1.00 2.999 3,777 78,274 98,580 IS Programmer Analyst - Principal 1064 1.00 3,492 4,394 91,141 114,683 IS Programmer Analyst - Principal 1064 1.00 4,225 5,722 110,273 149,344 <u>CITATION PROCESSING &amp; COLLECTION;</u> Clerk 1404 1.00 1,654 2,009 43,169 52,435 Principal Clerk 1408 1.00 2,264 2,752 59,090 71,827 Principal Account Clerk 1533 3,00 1,773 2,156 138,826 156,815 Principal Account Clerk 1534 1.00 2,819 3,426 73,576 89,419 Cashier II 4321 27,00 1,840 2,236 1,296,648 1,575,709 Cashier II 4322 3,00 2,063 2,507 161,533 196,298 Manager II 9172 1.00 3,433 4,381 89,601 114,344 Holiday Pay (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Other Pay (if applicable) Total Salary Costs 48.0 2,516 1,772,196 1,710,603 <u>Total Fringe Benefits 1,572,196 1,710,603</u> <u>ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)</u> Software/Data Conversion 8,400 8,400 Toughbooks 2,500 2,500 3,50					•	•	
IS Programmer Analyst - Principal 1064 1.00 3,492 4,394 91,141 114,683 IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4,225 5,722 110,273 149,344 CITATION PROCESSING & COLLECTION; CIerk 1404 1.00 1,654 2,009 43,169 52,435 Principal Clerk 1408 1.00 2,264 2,752 59,090 71,827 Account Clerk 1630 3.00 1,773 2,156 138,826 168,815 Principal Account Clerk 1634 1.00 2,819 3,426 73,576 89,419 Cashier II 4321 27.00 1,840 2,236 1,296,648 1,575,709 Cashier II 4322 3.00 2,053 2,507 161,533 196,298 Manager II 9172 1.00 3,433 4,381 89,601 114,344 Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Software/Diff Conversion 52,507 161,533 196,298 Manager II 9172 1.00 3,433 4,381 89,601 114,344 Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Software/Diff Conversion 52,507 5,50 5,574,009 574,009							
IS Project Director 1070 1.00 4,225 5,722 110,273 149,344 CITATION PROCESSING & COLLECTION; Clerk 1404 1.00 1,654 2,009 43,169 52,435 Principal Clerk 1630 3.00 1,773 2,156 138,826 168,815 Principal Clerk 1630 3.00 1,773 2,156 138,826 168,815 Principal Account Clerk 1634 1.00 2,319 2,819 60,526 73,576 Senior Management Assistant 1844 1.00 2,819 3,426 73,576 89,419 Cashier II 4321 27.00 1,840 2,236 1,296,648 1,575,709 Cashier II 4322 3.00 2,063 2,507 161,533 196,298 Manager II 9172 1.00 3,433 4,381 89,601 114,344 Holiday Pay (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Total Salary Costs 48.0 2,816,555 3,454,257 FRINGE BENEFITS Fringe at 47% 1,572,196 1,710,603 Total Fringe Benefits 1,572,196 1,710,603 CAPITAL COSTS Handheld Units 2,150 42,000 42,000 Computers 42,000 42,000 Computers 8,400 8,400 8,400 Toughbooks Printers 3,510 3,500 3,500 Customer Service Windows 8,4,000 84,000 Space Rental 75,000 375,000 Space Rental 75,300 73,608 673,608 673,608 Total Capital & Operating 2,794,069 2,794,069					•		
CITATION PROCESSING & COLLECTION: Clerk         1404         1.00         1.654         2,009         43,169         52,435           Principal Clerk         1404         1.00         2,264         2,752         59,090         71,827           Account Clerk         1634         1.00         2,319         2,816         138,826         166,815           Principal Account Clerk         1634         1.00         2,319         2,819         60,526         73,576           Senior Management Assistant         1844         1.00         2,819         3,426         73,576         89,419           Cashier II         4321         27,00         1,840         2,236         1,296,648         1,575,709           Cashier II         4322         3,00         2,063         2,507         161,533         196,298           Manager II         9172         1.00         3,433         4,381         89,601         114,344           Holiday Pay (if applicable)         Other Pay (if applicable)         1,572,196         1,710,603         1,572,196         1,710,603           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         Total Fringe Benefits         1,572,196         1,710,603         574,000         574,000         2,600         42,000         2,00				•			
Clerk         1404         1.00         1,654         2,009         43,169         52,435           Principal Clerk         1403         1.00         2,264         2,752         59,090         71,827           Account Clerk         1630         3.00         1,773         2,156         133,826         73,576         89,419           Cashier II         4321         27.00         1,640         2,236         1,296,648         1,575,790           Cashier III         4322         3.00         2,063         2,507         161,553         196,298           Manager II         9172         1.00         3,433         4,381         89,601         114,344           Holiday Pay (if applicable)         Overtime Pay (if applicable)         0         2,816,555         3,454,257           FRINGE BENEFITS         Total Salary Costs         48.0         1,572,196         1,710,603           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         574,000         574,000         42,000         42,000           Software/Data Convertacion         231,886         231,886         231,886         231,886         231,886           CAPITAL COSTS         Indheld Units         2,500         2,500         2,500         2,500         2,500	IS Project Director	1070	1.00	4,225	5,722	110,273	149,344
Principal Clerk 1408 1.00 2,264 2,752 59,090 71,827 Account Clerk 1630 3.00 1,773 2,156 138,826 168,815 Principal Account Clerk 1634 1.00 2,819 3,426 73,576 89,419 Cashier II 4321 27.00 1,840 2,236 1,296,648 1,575,709 Cashier III 4322 3.00 2,063 2,507 161,533 196,298 Manager II 9172 1.00 3,433 4,381 89,601 114,344 Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shitt Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Night / Shitt Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Total Salary Costs 48.0 2,816,555 3,454,257 FRINGE BENEFITS Fringe at 47% 1,572,196 1,710,603 ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable) Software/Data Conversion 574,000 574,000 42,000 Computers 2,500 42,000 42,000 42,000 Computers 8,400 8,400 8,400 Toughbooks 2,500 3,500 3,500 Customer Sarvice Windows 8,400	CITATION PROCESSING & COLLECTION	1					· · · ·
Account Clerk 1630 3.00 1,773 2,156 138,826 168,816 Principal Account Clerk 1634 1.00 2,319 2,156 138,826 168,816 Principal Account Clerk 1634 1.00 2,319 3,426 73,576 89,419 Cashier II 4321 27.00 1,840 2,236 1,296,648 1,575,709 Cashier II 4322 3.00 2,063 2,507 161,533 196,298 Manager II 9172 1.00 3,433 4,381 89,601 114,344 Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Other Pay (if applicable) Cher Pay (if applicable) Total Salary Costs 48.0 2,816,555 3,454,257 FRINGE BENEFITS Fringe Benefits 1,572,196 1,710,603 ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable) Software/Data Conversion 42,000 42,000 Computers 42,000 42,000 Computers 42,000 42,000 Computers 44,000 84,000 Customer Service Windows 44,000 84,000 Space Rental 53,500 3,500 Customer Service Windows 3,500 3,500 Customer Service Windows 44,000 84,000 Postage 673,608 673,608 Tickels/Envelopes 42,512 42,612 42,612 Pay-by-Dhone/8000/Pay-Online Fees 42,612 42,612 42,612 Mobil License Recognition Cameras 75,320 Total Capital & Operating 2,794,069 2,794,069	Clerk	1404	1.00	1,654	2,009	43,169	52,435
Principal Account Clerk       1634       1.00       2,319       2,819       60,526       73,576         Senior Management Assistant       1844       1.00       2,819       3,426       73,576       89,419         Cashier II       4321       27.00       1,840       2,236       1,296,648       1,575,709         Cashier III       4322       3.00       2,063       2,507       161,533       196,298         Manager II       9172       1.00       3,433       4,381       89,601       114,344         Holiday Pay (if applicable)       Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)       0vertime Pay (if applicable)       1,572,196       1,710,603         Overtime Pay (if applicable)       Total Salary Costs       48.0       2,816,555       3,454,257         FRINGE BENEFITS       Fringe at 47%       1,572,196       1,710,603       1,572,196       1,710,603         ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)       574,000       574,000       574,000       574,000         Software/Date Conversion       8,400       8,400       8,400       8,400       8,400       8,400       8,400       8,400       8,400       8,400       8,400       8,400       8,400       8,400       8,400       8,400       8,400 <t< td=""><td>Principal Clerk</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>2,752</td><td></td><td></td></t<>	Principal Clerk				2,752		
Senior Management Assistant         1844         1.00         2,819         3,426         73,576         89,419           Cashier II         4321         27,00         1,840         2,236         1,296,648         1,575,70           Cashier III         4322         3,00         2,063         2,507         161,533         196,298           Manager II         9172         1.00         3,433         4,381         89,601         114,344           Holiday Pay (if applicable)         Overtime Pay (if applicable)         Overtime Pay (if applicable)         0         2,816,555         3,454,257           FRINGE BENEFITS         Total Salary Costs         48.0         2,816,555         3,454,257           Fringe Benefits         1,572,196         1,710,603         1,710,603           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         574,000         574,000         574,000           Software/Data Conversion         231,886         231,886         231,886           Workstations         42,000         42,000         42,000           Conjubros         3,500         3,500         3,500           Graphices         3,500         3,500         3,500           Oroughbooks         84,000         84,000         84,000     <	Account Clerk	1630					
Cashier II         4321         27.00         1,840         2,236         1,296,648         1,575,709           Cashier III         4322         3.00         2,063         2,507         161,533         196,298           Manager II         9172         1.00         3,433         4,381         89,601         114,344           Holiday Pay (if applicable)         Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)         Vertime Pay (if applicable)         2,816,555         3,454,257           FRINGE BENEFITS         Total Salary Costs         48.0         2,816,555         3,454,257           Fringe at 47%         1,572,196         1,710,603         1,572,196         1,710,603           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         574,000         574,000         574,000           Software/Data Conversion         8,400         8,400         8,400           Computers         3,500         3,500         3,500         3,500           Computers         3,500         3,750,00         3,750	Principal Account Clerk	1634					•
Cashier III       4322       3.00       2,063       2,507       161,533       196,298         Manager II       9172       1.00       3,433       4,381       89,601       114,344         Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Total Salary Costs       48.0       2,816,555       3,454,257         FRINGE BENEFITS Fringe at 47%       1,572,196       1,710,603         Total Fringe Benefits       1,572,196       1,710,603         ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)       574,000       574,000         Software/Data Conversion       574,000       574,000         CAPITAL COSTS       48,00       42,000         Handheid Units       231,886       231,886         Workstations       42,000       42,000         Computers       8,400       8,400         Total Solutions       2,500       2,500         Customer Service Windows       8,400       84,000         Space Rental       375,000       375,000         Postage       673,608       673,608         Tickets/Envelopes       42,612       42,612         Pay-by-hone/800#/Pay-Online Fees       681,243       681,243         Mobil License Recognition Cameras       75,320<	Senior Management Assistant						
Manager II         9172         1.00         3,433         4,381         89,601         114,344           Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Other Pay (if applicable) Other Pay (if applicable)         0         2,816,555         3,454,257           FRINGE BENEFITS Fringe at 47%         1,572,196         1,710,603           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         1,572,196         1,710,603           Software/Data Conversion         574,000         574,000           Software/Data Conversion         874,000         574,000           CAPITAL COSTS Handheid Units         231,886         231,886         231,886           Workstations Computers         2,500         2,500         2,500           Vorgene Service Windows         3,400         8,400         8,400           Space Rental         375,000         375,000         375,000           Postage         673,608         673,608         673,608           Tickets/Envelopes         42,612         42,612         42,612           Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees         681,243         681,243           Mobil License Recognition Cameras         75,320         75,320           Total Capital & Operating         2,794,069         2,794,069         2,794,069	Cashier II	4321			2,23 <b>6</b>	1,296,648	1,575,709
Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Total Salary Costs 48.0 2,816,555 3,454,257 FRINGE BENEFITS Fringe at 47% 1,572,196 1,710,603 Total Fringe Benefits 1,572,196 1,710,603 ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable) Software/Data Conversion CAPITAL COSTS Handheld Units 231,886 231,886 231,886 Vorkstations 42,000 42,000 Computers 4,000 8,400 8,400 Toughbooks 2,500 2,500 2,500 Printers 3,500 3,500 Customer Service Windows 84,000 84,000 Space Rental 375,000 375,000 Postage 104,200 42,612 Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees 681,243 681,243 Mobil License Recognition Cameras 75,320 75,320 Total Capital & Operating 2,794,069 2,794,069	Cashier III				•		-
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)         Overtime Pay (if applicable)         Total Salary Costs       48.0         2,816,555       3,454,257         FRINGE BENEFITS         Fringe at 47%       1,572,196       1,710,603         Total Fringe Benefits       1,572,196       1,710,603         ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)       574,000       574,000         Software/Data Conversion       574,000       574,000         CAPITAL COSTS       42,000       42,000         Handheld Units       231,886       231,886         Workstations       42,000       42,000         Computers       8,400       8,400         Printers       3,500       3,500         Ousphooks       2,500       2,500         Printers       3,500       3,500         Space Rental       375,000       375,000         Postage       673,608       673,608         Tickets/Envelopes       42,612       42,612         Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees       681,243       681,243         Mobil License Recognition Cameras       75,320       75,320         Total Capital & Operating       2,794,069       2,794,069	Manager II	9172	1.00	3,433	4,381	89,601	114,344
FRINGE BENEFITS         1,572,196         1,710,603           Total Fringe Benefits         1,572,196         1,710,603           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         574,000         574,000           Software/Data Conversion         574,000         574,000           CAPITAL COSTS         Handheld Units         231,886         231,886           Workstations         242,000         42,000           Computers         8,400         8,400           Toughbooks         2,500         2,500           Printers         3,500         3,500           Customer Service Windows         84,000         84,000           Space Rental         673,608         673,608           Postage         673,608         673,608           Tickets/Envelopes         42,612         42,612           Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees         681,243         681,243           Mobil License Recognition Cameras         75,320         75,320           Total Capital & Operating         2,794,069         2,794,069	Night / Shift Differential (if applicable) Overtime Pay (if applicable) Other Pay (if applicable)		(20)			0.010.555	0.454.057
Fringe at 47%       1,572,196       1,710,603         Total Fringe Benefits       1,572,196       1,710,603         ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)       574,000       574,000         Software/Data Conversion       574,000       574,000         CAPITAL COSTS       574,000       574,000         Handheld Units       231,886       231,886         Workstations       42,000       42,000         Computers       8,400       8,400         Toughbooks       2,500       2,500         Printers       3,500       3,500         Customer Service Windows       84,000       84,000         Space Rentai       375,000       375,000         Postage       673,608       673,608         Tickets/Envelopes       42,612       42,612         Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees       681,243       681,243         Mobil License Recognition Cameras       75,320       75,320         Total Capital & Operating       2,794,069       2,794,069	l otal Salary Costs		48.0	<u>-</u>	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	2,816,555	3,454,257
Total Fringe Benefits         1,572,196         1,710,603           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         574,000         574,000         574,000           Software/Data Conversion         574,000         574,000         574,000           CAPITAL COSTS         Handheld Units         231,886         231,886         231,886           Workstations         42,000         42,000         42,000           Computers         8,400         8,400         8,400           Toughbooks         2,500         2,500         2,500           Printers         3,500         3,500         3,500           Customer Service Windows         84,000         84,000         84,000           Space Rentai         375,000         375,000         375,000           Postage         673,608         673,608         673,608           Tickets/Envelopes         42,612         42,612         42,612           Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees         681,243         681,243         681,243           Mobil License Recognition Cameras         75,320         75,320         75,320           Total Capital & Operating         2,794,069         2,794,069         2,794,069	FRINGE BENEFITS						
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         574,000         574,000           Software/Data Conversion         574,000         574,000           CAPITAL COSTS	Fringe at 47%					1,572,196	1,710,603
Software/Data Conversion         574,000         570,000         570,00	Total Fringe Benefits					1,572,196	1,710,603
Software/Data Conversion         574,000         570,000         570,00	ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)						
CAPITAL COSTS         Handheld Units       231,886       231,886         Workstations       42,000       42,000         Computers       8,400       8,400         Toughbooks       2,500       2,500         Printers       3,500       3,500         Customer Service Windows       84,000       84,000         Space Rental       375,000       375,000         Postage       673,608       673,608         Tickets/Envelopes       42,612       42,612         Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees       681,243       681,243         Mobil License Recognition Cameras       75,320       75,320         Total Capital & Operating       2,794,069       2,794,069						574.000	47/4 00 h
Handheld Units       231,886       231,886       231,886         Workstations       42,000       42,000         Computers       8,400       8,400         Toughbooks       2,500       2,500         Printers       3,500       3,500         Customer Service Windows       84,000       84,000         Space Rental       375,000       375,000         Postage       673,608       673,608         Tickets/Envelopes       42,612       42,612         Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees       681,243       681,243         Mobil License Recognition Cameras       75,320       75,320         Total Capital & Operating       2,794,069       2,794,069						***********************************	
Handheld Units       231,886       231,886       231,886         Workstations       42,000       42,000         Computers       8,400       8,400         Toughbooks       2,500       2,500         Printers       3,500       3,500         Customer Service Windows       84,000       84,000         Space Rental       375,000       375,000         Postage       673,608       673,608         Tickets/Envelopes       42,612       42,612         Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees       681,243       681,243         Mobil License Recognition Cameras       75,320       75,320         Total Capital & Operating       2,794,069       2,794,069	CAPITAL COSTS						
Workstations         42,000         42,000           Computers         8,400         8,400           Toughbooks         2,500         2,500           Printers         3,500         3,500           Customer Service Windows         84,000         84,000           Space Rental         375,000         375,000           Postage         673,608         673,608           Tickets/Envelopes         42,612         42,612           Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees         681,243         681,243           Mobil License Recognition Cameras         75,320         75,320           Total Capital & Operating         2,794,069         2,794,069						231.886	231.886
Computers         8,400         8,400           Toughbooks         2,500         2,500           Printers         3,500         3,500           Customer Service Windows         84,000         84,000           Space Rentai         375,000         375,000           Postage         673,608         673,608           Tickets/Envelopes         42,612         42,612           Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees         681,243         681,243           Mobil License Recognition Cameras         75,320         75,320           Total Capital & Operating         2,794,069         2,794,069	Workstations						
Toughbooks         2,500         2,500           Printers         3,500         3,500           Customer Service Windows         84,000         84,000           Space Rental         375,000         375,000           Postage         673,608         673,608           Tickets/Envelopes         42,612         42,612           Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees         681,243         681,243           Mobil License Recognition Cameras         75,320         75,320           Total Capital & Operating         2,794,069         2,794,069	Computers						
Printers         3,500         3,500           Customer Service Windows         84,000         84,000           Space Rentai         375,000         375,000           Postage         673,608         673,608           Tickets/Envelopes         42,612         42,612           Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees         681,243         681,243           Mobil License Recognition Cameras         75,320         75,320           Total Capital & Operating         2,794,069         2,794,069	Toughbooks						
Space Rental         375,000         375,000           Postage         673,608         673,608           Tickets/Envelopes         42,612         42,612           Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees         681,243         681,243           Mobil License Recognition Cameras         75,320         75,320           Total Capital & Operating         2,794,069         2,794,069	Printers	•					
Space Rental         375,000         375,000           Postage         673,608         673,608           Tickets/Envelopes         42,612         42,612           Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees         681,243         681,243           Mobil License Recognition Cameras         75,320         75,320           Total Capital & Operating         2,794,069         2,794,069	Customer Service Windows						
Tickets/Envelopes         42,612         42,612           Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees         681,243         681,243           Mobil License Recognition Cameras         75,320         75,320           Total Capital & Operating         2,794,069         2,794,069	Space Rental			· · · · ·			
Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees         681,243         681,243           Mobil License Recognition Cameras         75,320         75,320           Total Capital & Operating         2,794,069         2,794,069	Postage						
Mobil License Recognition Cameras75,32075,320Total Capital & Operating2,794,0692,794,069	Tickets/Envelopes						
Total Capital & Operating 2,794,069 2,794,069	Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees					-	
Program Overnead	Total Capital & Operating	•				2,794,069	2,794,069
	Hrogram Gvernead					921-60 <b>4</b>	931 605

#### ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

8,104,425 8,880,534

#### LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST

Contract Monitoring Cost

	(	(8,102,295)	(8,112,496)	
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$	2,130	\$ 768,037	
% of Savings to City Cost		0%	9%	

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1998 was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

2. Salary rates as posted in DHR website at June 30, 2014 Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs. On classes and FTEs identified.:

For the SFMTA to provide this service utilizing city staff it will require the utilization of a broad range of IT classes. These classes would have distinct roles that will need to be provided. The rapid advancement of technology and cost saving opportunities that are associated with those advancements necessitates a dedicated technology team to this effort.

The shown 1823 and 1052 Analysts will be needed to map the business requirements to process design and software requirements for the development team. This is an iterative process that continues for the life of the system.

The shown 109x System administrators and 104x System Engineers would be required to perform the maintenance and oversee operation the citations system. The number of staff is representative for the critical business function this system provides to the SFMTA.

The shown 106x Programmer analysts would be need to implement a software solution to meet the needs of the SFMTA citation unit. The number of developers is potentially understated for the initial ramp up of getting a base application in place for this business need. The 1070 is Project Director would manage and direct this team.

The shown Citations & Processing class would be need to perform operational tasks of citations issuance, mailing, late notices (various:late fees, tow, collections activity, etc.), account assignments, payments receiptt, payment processing, payment application, research, responding to inquiries, manual input and tracking of manual citations, and account audit.

FISCAL YEAR 2015-2016

CITATION PROCESSING AND COLLECTIONS

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)

### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

Space Rental

### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time		1	[	
		Equivalent				
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Week	ly Rate	Low	High
INTERSTATE & SPECIAL COLLECTION	<u>DNS:</u>	·····			\$ - 3	ē -
IS Business Analyst	1052	2.00	\$3,263	\$3,597	170,329	187,763
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	1.00	3,117	3,788	81,354	98,867
OPERATING SYSTEM & APPLICATIO	N SOFTWARE	MAINTENANCE:				
IS Administrator III	1094	1.00	3,256	3,957	84,982	103,278
IS Engineer - Senior	1043	1.00	3,928	4,939	102,521	128,908
IS Engineer - Principal	1044	1.00	4,225	5,722	110,273	149,344
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	1.00	2,469	3,106	64,441	81,067
IS Programmer Analyst - Senior	1063	1.00	2,999	3,777	78,274	98,580
IS Programmer Analyst - Principal	1064	1.00	3,492	4,394	91,141	114,683
IS Project Director	1070	1.00	4,225	5,722	110,273	149,344
CITATION PROCESSING & COLLECT						
Clerk	1404	1.00	1,654	2,009	43,169	52,435
Principal Clerk	1408	1.00	2,264	2,752	59,090	71,827
Account Clerk	1630	3.00	1,773	2,156	138,826	168,815
Principal Account Clerk	1634	1.00	2,319	2,819	60,526	73,576
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.00	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419
Cashier II	4321	27.00	1,840	2,236	1,296,648	1,575,709
Cashler III	4322	3.00	2,063	2,507	161,533	196,298
Manager II	9172	1.00	3,433	4,381	89,601	114,344
			•			
				•		
Holiday Pay (if applicable)						
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)						
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					0	0
Other Pay (if applicable)	aatal	48.0		1	0	0
Total Salary C		48.0	······		2,816,555	3,454,257
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Fringe at 50%					1,545,547	1,678,929
Total Fringe Ben	efits			•	1,545,547	1,678,929
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicat	ole)					
Software/Data Conversion					574,000	
CAPITAL COSTS						
Handheld Units			· . ·		238,843	238,843
Workstations					43,260	42,000
Computers					8,652	8,400
Toughbooks					2,575	2,500
Printers					3,605	3,500
Customer Service Windows					86,520	84,000
Croce Desta)					00,020	070 000

386,250

375,000

Postage Tickets/Envelopes Pay-by-phone/800#/Pay-Online Fees	673,608 43,831 681,243	673,608 42,554 681,243
Mobile License Recognition Cameras Total Capital & Operating	<u>75,320</u> 2,817,707	75,320 2,800,968
Program Overhead:	72.685	921-001
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	8,101,414	8,855,758
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST Contract Monitoring Cost		
	(8,016,082)	(8,026,148)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS % of Savings to City Cost	<u>\$ 85,332 5</u> 1%	829,611 9%

Comments/Assumptions:

FY XXXX would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
 Salary rates as posted in DHR website at June 30, 2014 Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

<List any other comments or assumptions>.....



# **OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: Towing, Storage, and Disposal Contract - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for towing, storage, and disposal services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Bén Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

FAX 415-554-7466

SFMTA-FINANCE TOWING SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNIEL COSTS

PHOJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS		# of Full Time	····	T		
		Equivalent				-
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Week	y Rate	Low	High
Management & Administration		٠			· .	
MIS Administrator III	1023	1.0	3,256	3,957	84,982	103,278
Senior Payroli & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,526	73,576
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	3,470	4,539	90,567	118,468
Senior Administrative Ana lyst	1823	1.0	3,117	3,788	81,354	98,867
Dispatch & Customer Processing						
Clerk	1404	3.0	1,654	2,009	129,508	157,305
Account Clerk	1630	3.0	1,773	2,156	138,826	168,815
Principal Account Clerk	1634	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,526	73,576
Senior Accountant	1652	1.0	2,478	3,012	64,676	78,613
Communications Dispatch er I	1704	7.0	1,827	2,221	333,793	405,777
Communications Dispatch er II	1705	1.0	2,023	2,459	52,800	64,180
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.0	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419
Cashier II	4321	7.0	1,840	2,236	336,168	408,517
Cashier III	4322	3.0	2,063	2,507	161,533	196,298
Collection Supervisor	4366	3.0	2,466	2,997	193,088	234,665
Vehicle Storage & Disposal						۰.,
Sr Materials & Supplies Supervisor	1926	2.0	1,862	2,264	97,196	118,181
Storekeeper	1934	10.0	1,809	2,199	472,149	573,939
Senior Storekeeper	1936	3.0	1,927	2,342	150,884	183,379
Assistant Materials Coordinator	1942	1.0	3,041	3,696	79,370	96,466
Purchaser	1952	2.0	2,627	3,193	137,129	166,675
Security Guard	8202	4.0	1,588	2,342	165,787	244,505
Towing Services						
Truck Driver	7355	50.0	2,387	3,041	3,115,035	3,968,505
Automobile Mechanic-Asst Supvsr (3)	7382	1.0	3,629	3,629	94,717	94,717
Automobile Mechanic (3)	7381	5.0	3,012	3,012	393,066	393,066
Holiday Pay (if applicable)		· · · · · ·				
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for	estimated 1	/3 of employees)			185,886	229,576
Overtime Pay (if applicable)				•	0	0
Other Pay (if applicable)		112.00		г	0	0
Total Salary Costs		1 112.00 ]			6,753,142	8,340,360
FRINGE BENEFITS					· .	
Variable					2,183,588	2,618,661
Fixed					1,577,754	1,577,754
Total Benefits					3,761,342	4,196,415
ADDITIONAL CITY COST'S (if applicable)						. · ·
Capital and Operations;						
Postage+supplies+uniforms Rent - 7th St and Bayshore; office					66,172	66,172
fumiture/computers					2,611,243	2,611,243
Specialized Software					368,168	368,168
Fuel (assume 10mi/gal)					225,000	225,000
Communications (handheld devices)					15,000	15,000
Utilities					42,000	42,000
Truck & Lift Repair & Maintenance					90,000	90,000
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·					-1	

Trucks	,000	870,000
	4,287,582	4,287,582
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	14,802,066	16,824,357
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	(14,027,675)	(14,027,967)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	<u>\$ 774,391</u>	\$ 2,796,390
% of Savings to Clty Cost	5%	17%

Comments/Assumptions: 1. FY 2005 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary rates as posted in DHR website, rates at June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

SFMTA-FINANCE TOWING SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

THOULD I LITOONNEL OODIO	T	# of Full Time				· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
		Equivalent				
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	BI-Weeki	y Rate	Low	High
					\$-	\$-
Management & Administration						
MIS Administrator III	1023	1.0	3,256	3,957	84,982	103,278
Senior Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,526	73,576
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	3,470	4,539	90,567	118,468
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	1.0	3,117	3,788	81,354	98,867
Dispatch & Customer Processing						
Clerk	1404	3.0	1,654	2,009	129,508	157,305
Account Clerk	1630	3.0	1,773	2,156	138,826	168,815
Principal Account Clerk	1634	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,526	73,576
Senior Accountant	1652	1.0	2,478	3.012	64,676	78,613
Communications Dispatcher I	1704	7.0	1,827	2,221	333,793	405,777
Communications Dispatcher II	1705	1.0	2,023	2,459	52,800	64,180
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.0	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419
Cashier II	4321	7.0	1,840	2,236	336,168	408,517
Cashier III	4322	3.0	2,063	2,507	161,533	196,298
Collection Supervisor	4366	3.0	2,003	2,997	193,088	234,665
	4000	0.0	2,400	2,931	190,000	204,000
Vehicle Storage & Disposal	-					
Sr Materials & Supplies Supervisor	1926	2.0	1,862	2,264	97,196	118,181
Storekeeper	1934	10.0	1,809	2,1 <del>99</del>	472,149	573,939
Senior Storekeeper	1936	3.0	1,927	2,342	150,884	183,379
Assistant Materials Coordinator	1942	1.0	3,041	3,696	79,370	96,466
Purchaser	1952	2.0	2,627	3,193	137,129	166,675
Security Guard	8202	4.0	1,588	2,342	165,787	244,505
Towing Services						
Truck Driver	7355	50.0	2,387	3,041	3,115,035	3,968,505
Automobile Mechanic-Asst Supvsr (3)	7382	1.0	3,629	3,629	94,717	94,717
Automobile Mechanic (3)	7381	5.0	3,012	3,012	393,066	393,066
Holiday Pay (if applicable)						
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for	r estimated 1	/3 of employees)			185,886	229,576
Overtime Pay (if applicable)			,		00,000	220,070
Other Pay (if applicable)					i o	C
Total Salary Costs		112.00			6,753,142	8,340,360
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		• • • • • • • •			••	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
FRINGE BENEFITS	-					
Variable					2,086,985	2,502,309
Fixed			•		1,633,415	1,633,415
					0 700 400	A 495 79A
Total Benefits		•			3,720,400	4,135,724
Total Benefits ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)		*			3,720,400	4,130,724

Capital and Operations: Postage+supplies+uniforms

66,172

66,172

Rent - 7th St and Bayshore; office		
fumiture/computers	2,611,243	2,611,243
Specialized Software	368,168	368,168
Fuel (assume 10mi/gal)	225,000	225,000
Communications (handheld devices)	15,000	15,000
Utilities	368,168	368,168
Truck & Lift Repair & Maintenance	90,000	90,000
Trucks	870,000	870,000
	4,613,750	4,613,750
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	15,087,291	17,089,834
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	(14,548,211)	(14,548,501)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 539,080	\$ 2,541,332
% of Savings to City Cost	4%	15%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2005 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary rates as posted in DHR website, rates at June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.



# **OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

## Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: Towing, Storage, and Disposal Contract - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for towing, storage, and disposal services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Bén Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

SFMTA-FINANCE TOWING SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS		- <u></u>		<u> </u>		
		# of Full Time				
Job Class Title	Class	Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekl	v Bate	Low	High
	01400		01110010	1100		
Management & Administration						
MIS Administrator III	1023	1.0	3,256	3,957	84,982	103,278
Senior Payroll & Personne I Clerk	1222	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,52 <b>6</b>	73,57 <b>6</b>
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	3,470	4,539	90,567	118,468
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	. 1.0	3,117	3,788	81,354	98,867
Dispatch & Customer Processing						
Clerk	1404	3.0	1,654	2,009	129,508	157,305
Account Clerk	1630	3.0	1,773	2,156	138,826	168,815
Principal Account Clerk	1634	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,52 <b>6</b>	73,576
Senior Accountant	1652	1.0	2,478	3,012	64,676	78,613
Communications Dispatch er I	1704	7.0	1,827	2,221	33 <b>3,793</b>	405,777
Communications Dispatch er II	1705	1.0	2,023	2,459	52,800	64,180
Senior Management Assis tant	1844	-1.0	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419
Cashier II	4321	7.0	1,840	2,236	336,168	408,517
Cashier III	4322	3.0	2,063	2,507	161,533	196,298
Collection Supervisor	4366	3.0	2,466	2,997	193,088	234,665
Vehicle Storage & Disposal						
Sr Materials & Supplies Supervisor	1926	2.0	1,862	2,264	97,196	118,181
Storekeeper	1934	10.0	1,809	2,199	472,149	573,939
Senior Storekeeper	1936	3.0	1,927	2,342	150,884	183,379
Assistant Materials Coord inator	1942	1.0	3,041	3,696	79,370	96,466
Purchaser	1952	2.0	2,627	3,193	137,129	166,675
Security Guard	8202	4.0	1,588	2,342	165,787	244,505
Towing Services						
Truck Driver	7355	50.0	2,387	3,041	3,115,035	3,968,505
Automobile Mechanic-Asst Supvsr (3)	7382	1.0	3,629	3,629	94,717	94,717
Automobile Mechanic (3)	7381	5.0	3,029	3,029	393,066	393,066
Holiday Pay (if applicable)						
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for	estimated <sup>-</sup>	1/3 of employees)			185,886	229,576
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					0	0
Other Pay (if applicable)					0	0
Total Salary Costs		112.00			6,753,142	8,340,360
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Variable	1			•	2,183,588	2,618,661
Fixed					1,577,754	1,577,754
Total Benefits				•	3,761,342	4,196,415
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)						
· · ·			· .			
Capital and Operations: Postage+supplies+uniforms					66,172	66,172
Rent - 7th St and Baysho re; office						
furniture/computers					2,611,243	2,611,243
Specialized Software					368,168	368,168
Fuel (assume 10mi/gal)					225,000	225,000
Communications (handheld devices)					15,000	15,000
Utilities					42,000	42,000
Truck & Lift Repair & Mai Intenance					90,000	90,00 <b>0</b>

Trucks	,000	870,000
	4,287,582	4,287,582
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	14,802,066	16,824,357
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	(14,027,675)	(14,027,967)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	<b>\$</b> 774,391	\$ 2,796,390
% of Savings to Clty Cost	5%	17%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2005 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary rates as posted in DHR website, rates at June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-

# Please Fill Out Highlighted Areas Only.

SFMTA-FINANCE TOWING SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSIS	· · · ·	<u> </u>				·····i		
		# of Full Time						
lah Class Title	Close	Equivalent Positions	BI-Weekl	v Boto		Low	Hig	h
Job Class Title	Class	FUSHIONS	DI-VVERKI	y nale	\$	LOW	<u> </u> ⊓ıy \$	<u>, 11</u>
Management & Administration					φ	-	Ψ	
MIS Administrator III	1023	1.0	3,256	3,957		84.982	10	3.278
Senior Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	2,319	2,819		60,526		3,576
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	3,470	4,539		90,567		8,468
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	1.0	3,117	3,788		81,354		8,867
Dispatch & Customer Processing								
Clerk	1404	3.0	1,654	2,009		129,508	15	57,305
Account Clerk	1630	3.0	1,773	2,156		138,826	16	8,815
Principal Account Clerk	1634	1.0	2,319	2,819		60,526		3,576
Senior Accountant	1652	1.0	2,478	3,012		64,676		78,613
Communications Dispatcher I	1704	7.0	1,827	2,221		333,793		5,777
Communications Dispatcher II	1705	1.0	2,023	2,459		52,800	6	54,180
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.0	2,819	3,426		73,576		39,419
Cashier II	4321	7.0	1,840	2,236		336,168		8,517
Cashier III	4322	3.0	2,063	2,507		161,533		96,298
Collection Supervisor	4366	3.0	2,466	2,997		193,088		34,665
Vehicle Storage & Disposal				•				
Sr Materials & Supplies Supervisor	1926	2.0	1,862	2,264		97,196	1.	18,18
Storekeeper	1934	10.0	1,809	2,199		472,149		73,939
Senior Storekeeper	1936	3.0	1,927	2,342		150,884		33,379
Assistant Materials Coordinator	1942	1.0	3,041	3,696		79,370		96,460
Purchaser	1952	2.0	2,627	3,193		137,129	16	56,67
Security Guard	8202	4.0	1,588	2,342		165,787		14,50
Towing Services						•		
Truck Driver	7355	50.0	2,387	3,041		3,115,035		5 <b>8,</b> 509
Automobile Mechanic-Asst Supvsr (3)	7382	1.0	3,629	3,629		94,717		94,717
Automobile Mechanic (3)	7381	5.0	3,012	3,012		393,066	39	93,066
Holiday Pay (if applicable)								
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for	estimated	1/3 of employees)	)			185,886	27	29,57
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						0		(
Other Pay (if applicable)	1	110.00			r	0		(
Total Salary Costs	l	112.00			L	6,753,142	8,3	40,36
FRINGE BENEFITS							-	
Variable						2,086,985		02,309
Fixed						1,633,415		33,41
Total Benefits						3,720,400	4,1	35,724

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)

Capital and Operations: Postage+supplies+uniforms

66,172 66,172

Rent - 7th St and Bayshore; office furniture/computers Specialized Software Fuel (assume 10mi/gal) Communications (handheld devices) Utilities Truck & Lift Repair & Maintenance Trucks	2,611,243 368,168 225,000 15,000 368,168 90,000 <u>870,000</u> 4,613,750	2,611,243 368,168 225,000 15,000 368,168 90,000 870,000 4,613,750
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	<b>15,087,291</b> (14,548,211)	<b>17,089,834</b> (14,548,501)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS % of Savings to City Cost		<u>\$ 2,541,332</u> 15%

## Comments/Assumptions;

1. FY 2005 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary rates as posted in DHR website, rates at June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: Towing, Storage, and Disposal Contract - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for towing, storage, and disposal services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

FAX 415-554-7466

## Please Fill Out Highlighted Areas Only.

SFMTA-FINANCE TOWING SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

## PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
		# of Full Time				
	0	Equivalent	Di Maral I			(Park
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekl	y Hate	Low	High
Management & Administration						
MIS Administrator III	1023	1.0	3,256	3,957	84,982	103,278
Senior Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1222	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,52 <b>6</b>	73,576
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	3,470	4,539	90,567	118,468
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	1.0	3,117	3,788	81,354	98,867
			•			
Dispatch & Customer Processing					· · ·	
Clerk	1404	3.0	1,654	2,009	129,508	157,305
Account Clerk	1630	3.0	1,773	2,156	138,826	168,815
Principal Account Clerk	1634	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,52 <b>6</b>	73,576
Senior Accountant	1652	1.0	2,478	3,012	64,676	78,613
Communications Dispatch er I	1704	7.0	1,827	2,221	333,7 <b>93</b>	405,777
Communications Dispatch er II	1705	1.0	2,023	2,45 <del>9</del>	52,800	64,180
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.0	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419
Cashier II	4321	7.0	1,840	2,236	336,168	408,517
Cashier III	4322	3.0	2,063	2,507	161,533	196,298
Collection Supervisor	4366	3.0	2,466	2,997	193,088	234,665
Vehicle Storage & Dispos al					07.100	
Sr Materiais & Supplies Supervisor	1926	2.0	1,862	2,264	97,196	118,181
Storekeeper	1934	10.0	1,809	2,199	472,149	573,939
Senior Storekeeper	1936	3.0	1,927	2,342	150,884	183,379
Assistant Materials Coordinator	1942	1.0	3,041	3,696	79,370	96,466
Purchaser	1952	2.0	2,627	3,193	137,129	166,675
Security Guard	8202	4.0	1,58 <b>8</b>	2,342	165,787	244,505
Towing Services						
Truck Driver	7355	50.0	2,387	3,041	3,115,035	3,968,505
Automobile Mechanic-Asst Supvsr (3)	7382	1.0	3,629	3,629	94,717	94,717
Automobile Mechanic (3)	7381	5.0	3,012	3,012	393,066	393,066
Holiday Pay (if applicable)						
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for	estimated 1	(3 of employees)			185,886	229,576
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	connated	no or employees;			00,000	0
Other Pay (if applicable)					ő	ő
Total Salary Costs	l	112.00			6,753,142	8,340,360
FRINGE BENEFITS						0.040.004
Variable					2,183,588	2,618,661
Fixed Tatal Bar after					1,577,754	1,577,754
Total Benefits					3,761,342	4,196,415
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)		•		•		
Capital and Operations:						
Postage+supplies+uniforms		•		•	66,172	66,172
Rent - 7th St and Bayshore; office	· ·					
furniture/computers					2,611,243	2,611,243
Specialized Software	· •				368,168	368,168
Fuel (assume 10mi/gal)					225,000	225,000
Communications (handheld devices)					15,000	15,000
Utilities					42,000	42,000
Truck & Lift Repair & Maintenance					90,000	90,000

1148

Trucks	-		,000	870,000
			4,287,582	4,287,582
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		·	14,802,066	16,824,357
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		·	(14,027,675)	(14,027,967)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		<u>s</u>	774,391	\$ 2,796,390
% of Savings to City Cost			5%	17%

<u>Comments/Assumptions:</u> 1. FY 2005 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary rates as posted in DHR website, rates at June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-

## Please Fill O ut Highlighted Areas Only.

SFMTA-FINANCE TOWING SERVIC ES COMPARATIVE C OSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

### PROJECTED PERISONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED PERISONNEL COSTS	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	T				
	.	# of Full Time				
		Equivalent		<b>_</b> .		
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekl	y Rate	Low	High
Management R. Asteriotection		•			\$-	\$ -
Management & Ad ministration MIS Administrator III	1023	10	2 056	3,957	04.000	103 070
Senior Payroll & Personnel Clerk	1023	1.0 1.0	3,256 2,319	2,819	84,982 60,526	103,278 73,576
Accountant IV	1657	1.0	3,470		90,567	118,468
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	1.0	3,470	4,539 3,788	90,367 81,354	98,867
Senior Administrative Analyst	1020	1.0	0,117	3,700		30,007
Dispatch & Customer Processing						
Clerk	1404	3.0	1,654	2,009	129,508	157,305
Account Clerk	1630	3.0	1,773	2,156	138,826	168,815
Principal Account Clerk	1634	1.0	2,319	2,819	60,52 <b>6</b>	73,576
Senior Accountant	1652	1.0	2,478	3,012	64,676	78,613
Communications Dispatcher 1	1704	7.0	1,827	2,221	333,793	405,777
Communications Dispatcher II	1705	1.0	2,023	2,459	52,800	64,180
Senior Management Assistant	1844	1.0	2,819	3,426	73,576	89,419
Cashier II	4321	7.0	1,840	2,236	336,168	408,517
Cashier III	4322	3.0	2,063	2,507	161,533	196,298
Collection Supervisor	4366	3.0	2,466	2,997	193,088	234,665
Vehicle Storage & Disposal						
Sr Materials & Supplies Supervisor	1926	2,0	1,862	2,264	97,196	118,181
Storekeeper	1934	10.0	1,809	2,199	472,149	573,939
Senior Storekeeper	1936	3.0	1,927	2,342	150,884	183,379
Assistant Materials Coordinator	1942	1.0	3,041	3,696	79,370	96,466
Purchaser	1952	2.0	2,627	3,193	137,129	166,675
Security Guard	8202	4.0	1,588	2,342	165,787	244,508
Towing Services	<b>_</b> ,					
Truck Driver	7355	50.0	2,387	3,041	3,115,035	3,968,505
Automobile Mechanic-Asst Supvsr (3)	7382	1.0	3,629	3,629	94,717	94,717
Automobile Mechanic (3)	7381	5.0	3,012	3,012	393,066	393,066
Holiday Pay (if applicable)						·.
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for	estimated 1	1/3 of employees)		•	185,886	229,576
Overtime Pay (if a pplicable)					0	(
Other Pay (if applicable)					0	(
Total Salary Costs	[	112.00			6,753,142	8,340,360
FRINGE BENEFITS	,					
Variable	•				2,086,985	2,502,30
					£,000,000	
Fixed					1,633,415	1,633,419

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)

Capital and Operations:

Postage+supplies+uniforms

66,172

66,172

Rent - 7th St and Bayshore; office		
furniture/computers	2,611,243	2,611,243
Specialized Software	368,168	368,168
Fuel (assume 10mi/gal)	225,000	225,000
Communications (handheld devices)	15,000	15,000
Utilities	368,168	368,168
Truck & Lift Repair & Maintenance	90,000	90,000
Trucks	870,000	870,000
	4,613,750	4,613,750
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	15,087,291	17,089,834
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	(14,548,211)	(14,548,501)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 539,080	\$ 2,541,332
% of Savings to City Cost	4%	15%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2005 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary rates as posted in DHR website, rates at June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

## Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: SFMTA Paratransit Services Contract - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Paratransit Services Contract have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield. Controller Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

### Please Fill Out High lighted Areas C.r.v.

## SFMTA - ADMINISTRATION

PARATRANSIT SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS			·····				
		# of Full Time					
		Equivalent					
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekly			Low	High
Transit Operators	9163	148.0	\$ 1,488	\$ 2,362		5,747,846 \$	9,123,934
Chauffeur (5)	7312	231.0	\$ 1,190	\$ 1,890	\$	.7,177,041 \$	11,392,587
Auto Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382	2.0	\$ 3,629	\$ 3,629		189,434 \$	189,434
Auto Mechanic	7381	12.0	\$ 3,012	\$ 3,012	\$	943,358 \$	943,358
Auto Service Worker	7410	8.0	\$ 2,009	\$ 2,442	\$	419,479 \$	509,890
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	7.0	\$ 1,918	\$ 2,332	\$	350,419 \$	426,056
Transit Supervisor	9139	2.0	\$ 2,786	\$ 3,387	\$	145,429 \$	176,801
Transit Manager I	9140	4.0	\$ 3,289	\$ 3,998	\$	343,372 \$	417,391
Passenger Services Specialist	9135	14.0	\$ 2,110	\$ 2,564	\$	770,994 \$	936,886
Senior Clerk Typist	1426	6.0		\$ 2,292		295,348 \$	358,927
Senior Eligibility Worker	2905	5.0		\$ 2,862		307,197 \$	373,491
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, ap	nlicable class	e) .				344,467	514,837
Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimate						458,514	682,657
Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$30 O/person/year)	a no or emp	0,000,				44,400	44,400
Other Pay: 7312 (Uniform \$30 O/person/year)						69,300	69,300
Other Pay: 7410 (Shoes \$250/person/year)						2,000	2,000
Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$550/person/year)						7,700	7,700
-							
FY20 11-12 Projected Trips FY20 14-15 Projected Trips	1,106,377 860,213						
% Change in Projected Passe riger Trips (6)	-22%	(97.7)				(3,919,548)	(5,822,632)
Total Salary Costs		341.3	•		\$	13,696,749 \$	20,347,019
		041.0			Ψ		20,011,010
FRINGE BENEFITS							
Variable Fringes (3)						6,820,001	9,892,768
Fixed Fringes (4)						4,070,469	4,070,469
Fringe on Overtime/Premium				7.9%	\$	63,436	94,602
% Change in Projected Passe riger Trips (6)	-22%					(2,437,196)	(3,127,807)
Total Fringe Benefits						8,516,710	10,930,032
Capital and Operating Costs							
Estimated Capital Costs		Quantity	Unit cost				
Sedans, 4-door midsize		200	\$ 28,000			5,600,000	5,600,000
Vans, Type A, lift equipped		49	\$ 56,000			2,744,000	2,744,000
Vans, Type B, lift equipped		64	\$ 60,000			3,840,000	3,840,000
Vans, ramp-equipped		25	\$ 45,000			1,125,000	1,125,000
		338	\$ 45,000			16,900	16,900
2-way radios	-22%	330	\$ 50				
% Change in Projected Passe riger Trips (6)	-22%	Ó	¢ cc.000			(2,964,954)	(2,964,954)
Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned			\$ 56,000			0 -	0
Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss		0	\$ 56,000			0	U
Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned		(61)	\$ 60,000			(3,660,000)	(3,660,000
Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss		61	\$ 60,000	. *		3,660,000	3,660,000
Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned		(6)	\$ 45,000			(270,000)	(270,000
Vans, ramp-equipped – Lease Revenue loss		6	\$ 45,000			270,000	270,000
						10,360,946	10,360,946
Total Capital Costs (	Straight line	tepreciation ov	er 4 years)			2,590,237	2,590,237
Estimated Operating Costs Fuel (Estimiles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip &		•					
							1 607 676
\$3.10 per gallon						1,597,576	1,597,576
Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle)						610,739	010,739
Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost:							
2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added			•				
exposure in paratransit)						635,192	635,192
Total Operating Costs						2,843,507	2,843,507
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST						27,647,202	36,710,794
						21,041,202	. 00,110,194
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST						(20,524,139)	(20,495,569)
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$	(20,524,139) 7,123,063 \$	(20,495,569) 16,215,224
· · · · · ·					\$		

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY84 was the first year these services were contracted out.

.

2. Biweekly salary rates: FY1415 rates based on June 2014 rates. FY1516 assumed no salary rate increase.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability,

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Classification has been abolished; this analysis assumes the class would be reestablished with a compensation rate equivalent to related

6. Passenger trip projections have decreased 22% from FY1112; this reduction has been applied to Staff, Capital and Operating cost included in

### Please Fill Out Highlighted Areas On.

SFMTA - ADMINISTRATION PARATRANSIT SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS			·		,	
	i l	# of Full Time				
	1	Equivalent	1			
Inh Clare Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekly	( Bate //I	Low	High
Job Class Title						
Transit Operators	9163	148.0	\$ 1,488	\$ 2,362	\$ 5,769,869	\$ 9,158,891
Chauffeur (5)	7312	231.0	\$ 1,190	\$ 1,890	\$ 7,204,539	\$ 11,435,237
Auto Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382	2.0	\$ 3,629	\$ 3,629	\$ 190,160	\$ 190,160
Auto Mechanic	7381	12.0				\$ 946,973
				• • • • • •		
Auto Service Worker	7410	8.0		\$ 2,442		\$511,843
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	7.0	\$ 1,918	\$ 2,332	\$ 351,761	\$ 427,689
Transit Supervisor	9139	2.0	\$ 2,786	\$ 3,387	\$ 145,986	\$ 177,479
	9140	4,0		\$ 3,998		
Transit Manager I						
Passenger Services Specialist	9135	14.0	\$ 2,110	\$ 2,564	\$ 773,948	\$ 940,475
Senior Clerk Typist	1426	6.0	\$ 1,886	\$ 2,292	\$ 296,479	\$ 360,302
Senior Eligibility Worker	2905	5.0	\$ 2,354	\$ 2,862		\$ 374,922
Setilor Englowity Worker	2905	0.0	φ 2,004	φ 2,002	φ 300,374	¢ 314,322
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estima Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$300/person/year) Other Pay: 7312 (Uniform \$300/person/year) Other Pay: 7410 (Shoes \$250/person/year) Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$550/person/year)	ted 1/3 of emp		· ·		344,467 460,270 44,400 69,300 2,000 7,700	514,837 685,273 44,400 69,300 2,000 7,700
FY2011-12 Projected Trips	1,106,377					
FY2015-16 Projected Trips						
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (6)	-22%	(97.7)			(9 004 167)	(5 944 207)
% Change in Projected Passenger rinps (6)	*££%a	(97.7)			(3,934,167)	(5,844,397)
			-		<u></u>	
<ul> <li>Total Salary Costs</li> </ul>		341.3			13,747,833	20,423,075
FRINGE BENEFITS	•					
					0 500 040	0445440
Variable Fringes (3)					6,582,813	9,145,113
Fixed Fringes (4)					4,199,157	4,199,157
Fringe on Overtime/Premium				7.9%	63,735	95,049
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (6)	-22%				(2,413,121)	
Total Fringe Benefits						
TOTER I HUBE DELICING				•	8,432,583	10,449,130
,						
Capital and Operating Costs						
Estimated Capital Costs		Quantity	Unit cost			
Sedans, 4-door midsize (200 Count)		200	\$ 28,000		5,600,000	5,600,000
Vans, Type A, lift equipped		49	\$ 56,000		2,744,000	2,744,000
Vans, Type B, lift equipped		64	\$ 60,000		3,840,000	3,840,000
Vans, ramp-equipped		25	\$ 45,000		1,125,000	1,125,000
2-way radios		338	\$ 50		16,900	16,900
	-22%	000	φ 00			
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (8)	-22%				(2,964,954)	(2,964,954)
Vans, Type A, Ifft equipped - MTA Owned	l i	0	\$ 56,000		0	0
Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss		0	\$ 56,000		0	0
		(61)			-	
Vans, Type B, Ilft equipped - MTA Owner		• •	\$ 60,000		(3,660,000)	
Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss		61	\$.60,000		3,660,000	3,660,000
Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned	1	(6)	\$ 45,000		(270,000)	(270,000)
Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss		6	\$ 45,000		270,000	270,000
		•	0,000			
the second se	(Obs. 1.1.1)	d			10,360,946	10,360,946
Total Capital Costs	; (Straight line	depreciation of	ver 4 years)	ł	2,590,237	2,590,237
% Change In Projected Passenger Trips (6) Estimated Operating Costs						
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip &						
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip &					1.507 576	1.597.576
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per galion					1,597,576	1,597,576
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per galion Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI =	3%				1,597,576 629,061	1,597,576 629,061
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per galion						
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost:						
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added			· .		629,061	629,061
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit)	3%		· .		629,061	629,061
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added	3%		. <u>.</u>		629,061	629,061
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit)	3%		· .		629,061	629,061
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit)	3%	· ·	· .		629,061	629,061
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3,10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit) Total Operating Costs	3%				629,061 637,185 2,863,822	629,061 897,519 3,124,156
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit)	3%	•	· .		629,061	629,061
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit) Total Operating Cost ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	3%	•	· .		629,061 	629,061 897,519 3,124,156 36,586,598
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3,10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit) Total Operating Costs	3%		· .		629,061 637,185 2,863,822	629,061 897,519 3,124,156 36,586,598
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit) Total Operating Cost ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	3%	•	· .		629,061 	629,061 897,519 3,124,156 36,586,598
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit) Total Operating Cost ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	3%		· .		629,061 <u>637,185</u> 2,863,822 <u>27,634,475</u> <u>(21,144,601</u> )	629,061 897,519 3,124,156 36,586,598 ) (21,116,844)
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3,10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit) Total Operating Cost ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST ESTIMATED SAVINGS	3% S		· .		629,061 637,185 2,863,822 27,634,475 (21,144,601) \$ 6,489,874	629,061 897,519 3,124,156 36,586,598 ) (21,116,844) \$ 15,469,753
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI = Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit) Total Operating Cost ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	3% S		· . ,		629,061 <u>637,185</u> 2,863,822 <u>27,634,475</u> <u>(21,144,601</u> )	629,061 897,519 3,124,156 36,586,598 ) (21,116,844) \$ 15,469,753

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY84 was the first year these services were contracted out.

 Biweekly salary rates: FY1415 rates based on June 2014 rates. FY1516 assumed no salary rate increase.
 Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

 Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
 Classification has been abolished; this analysis assumes the class would be reestablished with a compensation rate equivalent to
 Passenger trip projections have decreased 22% from FY1112; this reduction has been applied to Staff, Capital and Operating cost included in this estimate.

7. Assumed 3% CPI adjustment for FY1516 automotive parts.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: SFMTA Paratransit Services Contract - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Paratransit Services Contract have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Beh Rosenfield, Controller Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

## Please Fill Out Hig hlighted Areas Univ.

SFMTA - ADMINISTRATION

PARATRANSIT SERVICES

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED FERSONNEL COOTS								
		# of Full Time						
		Equivalent				1		
Joh Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Maskh	Bate (7)	{	Low		High
Job Class Title	Class		Bi-Weekly		<u>ل</u> م		¢.	
Transit Operators	9163	148.0		\$ 2,362	\$		\$	9,123,934
Chauffeur (5)	7312	231.0		\$ 1,890	\$		\$	11,392,587
Auto Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382	2.0	\$ 3,629	\$ 3,629	\$	189,434	\$	189,434
Auto Mechanic	7381	12.0	\$ 3,012	\$ 3,012	\$	943.358	S	943,358
Auto Service Worker	7410	8.0		\$ 2,442	ŝ		ŝ	509,890
						•		
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	7.0		\$ 2,332	\$	350,419		426,056
Transit Supervisor	9139	2.0	\$ 2,786	\$ 3,387	\$	145,429		176,801
Transit Manager I	9140	4.0	\$ 3,289	\$ 3,998	\$	343,372	\$	417,391
Passenger Services Specialist	9135	14.0	\$ 2,110	\$ 2,564	\$	770,994	\$	936,886
					ŝ	7 -	ŝ	
Senior Clerk Typist	1426	6.0		\$ 2,292	•			358,927
Senior Eligibility Worker	2905	5.0	\$ 2,354	\$ 2,862	\$	307,197	\$	373,491
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, a Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimat Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$300/person/year) Other Pay: 7312 (Uniform \$300/person/year) Other Pay: 7410 (Shoes \$250/person/year) Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$550/person/year) FY2011-12 Projected Trips	ed 1/3 of empl		·	• •		344,467 458,514 44,400 69,300 2,000 7,700		514,837 682,657 44,400 69,300 2,000 7,700
FY2D 14-15 Projected Trips								
		(07.7)				(0.010 F40)		(5.900.000)
% Change In Projected Passeinger Trips (6)	-22%	(97.7)				(3,919,548)		(5,822, <del>6</del> 32)
			-					
Total Salary Costs		341.3			\$	13,696,749	Ś	20,347,019
FRINGE BENEFITS								,
						6 P20 001		0 900 769
Variable Fringes (3)						6,820,001		9,892,768
Fixed Fringes (4)						4,070,469		4,070,469
Fringe on Overtime/Premium				7.9%		63,436		94,602
% Change in Projected Passeinger Trips (6)	-22%					(2,437,196)		(3,127,807)
Total Fringe Benefits						8,516,710		10,930,032
						-,,		/-,
Conital and Operating Costs								
Capital and Operating Costs								
Estimated Capital Costs		Quantity	Unit cost					
Sedans, 4-door midsize		200	\$ 28,000			5,600,000		5,600,000
Vans, Type A, lift equipped		49	\$ 56,000			2,744,000		2,744,000
		64				•		
Vans, Type B, lift equipped			\$ 60,000			3,840,000		3,840,000
Vans, ramp-equipped		25	\$ 45,000			1,125,000		1,125,000
2-way radios		338	\$ 50			16,900		16,900
% Change in Projected Passernger Trips (6)	-22%					(2,964,954)		(2,964,954)
Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned		0	\$ 56,000			0		0
						-		-
Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss		0	\$ 56,000			0		0.
Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned		(61)	\$ 60,000			(3,660,000)		(3,660,000)
Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss		61	\$ 60,000			3,660,000		3,660,000
Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned		(6)	\$ 45,000			(270,000)		(270,000)
						270,000		
Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss		6	\$ 45,000					270,000
						10,360,946		10,360,946
Total Capital Costs	(Straight line	depreciation ov	er 4 years)			2,590,237		2,590,237
Estimated Operating Costs								
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip &								
\$3.10 per galion						1,597,576		1,597,576
Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicte)						610,739		610,739
Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost:								
2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added								
exposure in paratransit)						635,192		635,192
Total Operating Costs						2,843,507		2,843,507
i oral operating costs						2,040,007		2,040,007
					•			
FOTHATED TOTAL OT COOT						07.047.000		00 710 704
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY CO ST						27,647,202		36,710,794
				•				/
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST						(20,524,139)		(20,495,569)
					*	7 400 000		
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					5	7,123,063	\$	16,215,224
% of Savings to City Cost						26%		44%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY84 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Biweekly salary rates: FY14.15 rates based on June 2014 rates. FY1516 assumed no salary rate increase.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability,

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Classification has been abolished; this analysis assumes the class would be reestablished with a compensation rate equivalent to related

6. Passenger trip projections have decreased 22% from FY1112; this reduction has been applied to Staff, Capital and Operating cost included in

#### Please Fill Out Highlighted Areas Only,

SFMTA - ADMINISTRATION PARATRANSIT SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED PERSONNEL CUSTS	<del> </del>				γ···	·····
	i i	# of Full Time			}	
		Equivalent				
I-h Class Title	Class	Positions	Di Maakh	· Data (a)	Loui	Lint
Job Class Title	Class		Bi-Weekh		Low	High
Transit Operators	9163	148.0	\$ 1,488	\$ 2,362	\$ 5,769,869	\$ 9,158,891
Chauffeur (5)	7312	231.0	\$ 1,190	\$ 1,890	\$ 7,204,539	\$ 11,435,237
Auto Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382	2.0	\$ 3,629	\$ 3,629	\$ 190,160	\$ 190,160
Auto Mechanic	7381	12.0	\$ 3,012			
					•	
Auto Service Worker	7410	8.0		\$ 2,442	\$ 421,086	
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	7.0	\$ 1,918	\$ 2,332	\$ 351,761	\$ 427,689
Transit Supervisor	9139	2.0	\$ 2,786	\$ 3,387	\$ 145,986	\$ 177,479
Transit Manager I	9140	4.0		\$ 3,998	\$ 344,687	
Passenger Services Specialist	. 9135	14.0	\$ 2,110	\$ 2,564	\$ 773,948	
Senior Clerk Typist	1426	6.0	\$ 1,886	\$ 2,292	\$ 296,479	\$ 360,302
Senior Eligibility Worker	2905	5.0	\$ 2,354	\$ 2,862	\$ 308,374	\$ 374,922
Soluci Englority in shift			•	+	+ +++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++	• • • • • • • •
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estima Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$300/person/year) Other Pay: 7312 (Uniform \$300/person/year) Other Pay: 73410 (Shoes \$250/person/year) Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$550/person/year)	ted 1/3 of emp		·	•	344,467 460,270 44,400 69,300 2,000 7,700	69,300 2,000
FY2011-12 Projected Trips	1,106,377					
FY2015-16 Projected Trips						
		(0			10 004 407	(= 0.1 ( 0.07)
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (6)	-22%	(97.7)			(3,934,167	) (5,844,397)
Total Salary Costs	1	341.3			13,747,833	20,423,075
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Variable Fringes (3)					6,582,813	
Fixed Fringes (4)					4,199,157	4,199,167
Fringe on Overtime/Premium				7.9%	63,735	
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (6)	-22%			,	(2,413,121	
Total Fringe Banefits	;			•	8,432,583	10,449,130
Capital and Operating Costs						
Estimated Capital Costs		Quantity	Unit cost			
		200			F 600 000	5,600,000
Sedans, 4-door midsize (200 Count)			\$ 28,000		5,600,000	
Vans, Type A, lift equipped	•	49	\$ 56,000		2,744,000	2,744,000
Vans, Type B, lift equipped		64	\$ 60,000		3,840,000	3,840,000
Vans, ramp-equipped		25	\$ 45,000		1,125,000	
		338				
2-way radios		000	\$ 50		16,900	
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (8)	-22%				(2,964,954	) (2,964,954)
Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned	۰ ۱	0	\$ 56,000		0	0
		õ	\$ 56,000		Ċ	
Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss						-
Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned		(61)	\$ 60,000		(3,660,000	) (3,660,000)
Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss	5	61	\$ 60,000		3,660,000	3,660,000
Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned		(6)	\$ 45,000		(270,000	
Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue lose	5	6	\$ 45,000		270,000	
					10,360,946	10,360,946
Total Capital Costs	s (Straight line	depreciation or	ver 4 vears	)	2,590,237	2,590,237
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (5)			•			
Estimated Operating Costs						
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip &	L					
\$3.10 per gallon					1,597,576	1,597,576
Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI =	3%	•			629,061	
	576				023,00	, 023,001
Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost:						
2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added						
exposure in paratransil)					637,18	5 897,519
Total Operating Cost	9				2,863,82	
i oral oportuning obor	-	· · · ·			2,000,00	
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					27,634,47	5 36,586,598
	•					
I FOR FOTUNTED TOTAL CONTRACT COOT					101	
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST					(21,144,60	1) (21,116,844)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 6.489.87	4 \$ 15,469,763
N						M Inc.
% of Savings to City Cos	it				23	% 42%

Comments/Assumptions: 1. FY84 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Biweekly salary rates: FY1415 rates based on June 2014 rates. FY1516 assumed no salary rate increase.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Classification has been abolished; this analysis assumes the class would be reestablished with a compensation rate equivalent to 6. Passenger trip projections have decreased 22% from FY1112; this reduction has been applied to Staff, Capital and Operating cost

included in this estimate.

7 Assumed 3% CPI adjustment for FY1516 automotive parts.



## OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

## Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

## RE: SFMTA Paratransit Services Contract – FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Paratransit Services Contract have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield. Controller Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

## Please Fill Out Hig Inlighted Areas \_...ly.

# SFMTA - ADMINISTRATION PARATRANSIT SERVICES

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS	<del>,</del>		T							
1 ·	1	# of Full Time	t				ł			1
		Equivalent	1				L.			1
	01			52 1.84		ata (11	P .	1		Hink
Job Class Title	Class	Positions		3i-Week			<u> </u>	Low		High
Transit Operators	9163	148.0	\$	1,488	\$	2,362	\$	5,747,846	\$	9,123,934
Chauffeur (5)	7312	231.0	\$	1,190	\$	1,890	\$	7,177,041	\$	11,392,587
Auto Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382	2.0	\$	3,629	\$	3,629	S	189,434	Ś	189,434
							\$		ŝ	•
Auto Mechanic	7381	12.0	\$	3,012		3,012		943,358		943,358
Auto Service Worker	7410	8.0	\$	2,009	\$	2,442	\$	419,479	\$	509,890
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	7.0	\$	1,918	\$	2,332	s	350,419	\$	426,056
Transit Supervisor	9139	2.0	\$	2,786		3,387	\$	145,429	\$	176,801
				•		•	ŝ			
Transit Manager I	9140	4.0	\$	3,289		3,998	•	343,372	ş	417,391
Passenger Services Specialist	9135	14.0	\$	2,110	\$	2,564	·\$	770,994	\$	936,886
Senior Clerk Typist	1426	6.0	\$	1,886	\$	2,292	\$	295,348	\$	358,927
	2905		ŝ	2,354		2,862		307,197	-	
Senior Eligibility Worker	2900	5.0	9	2,004	\$	2,002	9	007,187	.φ.	373,491
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, a Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimat Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$300/person/year) Other Pay: 7312 (Uniform \$300/person/year) Other Pay: 7410 (Shoes \$250/person/year) Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$550/person/year)								344,467 458,514 44,400 69,300 2,000 7,700		514,837 682,657 44,400 69,300 2,000 7,700
FY2O 11-12 Projected Trips	1,106,377									
FY2O 14-15 Projected Trips	860,213									
% Change In Projected Passeinger Trips (6)	-22%	(97.7)						(3,919,548)		(5,822,632)
								· · · · ·		
Total Salary Costs		341.3	~				ŝ	13,696,749	\$	20,347,019
·····, ····							-			
	· · · ·									
FRINGE BENEFITS										
Variable Fringes (3)								6,820,001		9,892,768
Fixed Fringes (4)		•						4.070.469		4,070,469
Fringe on Overtime/Premium						7.9%		63,436		94,602
-	-22%							(2,437,196)		(3,127,807)
% Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6)										
Total Fringe Benefits						· ·		8,516,710		10,930,032
Capital and Operating Costs										
Capital and Operating Costs		Quantity	1.6	nit cost						
Estimated Capital Costs		Quantity		nit cost						
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize		200	\$	28,000				5,600,000		5,600,000
Estimated Capital Costs			\$					5,600,00 <b>0</b> 2,744,000		5,600,000 2,744,000
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped		200 49	\$ \$	28,000 56,000				2,744,000		2,744,000
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped		200 49 64	\$ \$ \$	28,000 56,000 60,000				2,744,000 3,840,000		2,744,000 3,840,000
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped		200 49 64 25	\$ \$ \$ \$	28,000 56,000 60,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios		200 49 64	\$ \$ \$	28,000 56,000 60,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped	-22%	200 49 64 25	\$ \$ \$ \$	28,000 56,000 60,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6)		200 49 64 25 338	\$\$\$\$ \$ \$	28,000 56,000 60,000 45,000 50				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954)		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954)
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change In Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned	1.1	200 49 64 25 338 0	\$\$ \$\$ \$\$ \$\$ \$\$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$	28,000 56,000 60,000 45,000 50 56,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change In Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss	· 1	200 49 64 25 338 0 0	\$\$\$\$\$\$ \$	28,000 56,000 60,000 45,000 50 56,000 56,000	•			2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change In Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned	· 1	200 49 64 25 338 0	\$\$\$\$\$\$ \$	28,000 56,000 60,000 45,000 50 56,000	•			2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change In Projected Passe nger Trips (9) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned	· 1	200 49 64 25 338 0 0	\$\$\$\$\$\$\$	28,000 56,000 60,000 45,000 50 56,000 56,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss	. 1	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61	<b>"~~</b>	28,000 56,000 45,000 50 56,000 56,000 60,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned	. 1	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6)	<b>"</b> "	28,000 56,000 60,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000)		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000)
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss	. 1	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61	<b>"</b> "	28,000 56,000 45,000 50 56,000 56,000 60,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss	. I	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,948		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned	. I	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Total Capital Costs	. I	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000			· ·	2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,948		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Total Capital Costs Estimated Operating Costs	. I	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,948		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Total Capital Costs Estimated Operating Costs Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip &	. I	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Total Capital Costs Fuei (Est miles per gai 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon	. I	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss State Costs Total Capital Costs Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicte)	. I	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Total Capital Costs Fuei (Est miles per gai 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon	. I	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Strang-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Strang-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Statistic Cost (Less Revenue loss Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Statistic Cost (Less Revenue loss Revenue loss Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Revenue l	. I	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss String Costs Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehict e) Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added	1	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 270,000 270,000 270,000 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Strain Costs Estimated Operating Costs Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehict e) Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attomey/.5% added exposure in paratransit)	(Straight line	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,578 610,739		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,576 610,739 635,192
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss String Costs Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehict e) Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital costs 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added	(Straight line	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 270,000 270,000 270,000 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237	<u>.</u>	2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Strain Costs Estimated Operating Costs Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehict e) Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attomey/.5% added exposure in paratransit)	(Straight line	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,578 610,739		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,576 610,739 635,192
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Strain Costs Estimated Operating Costs Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehict e) Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attomey/.5% added exposure in paratransit)	(Straight line	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,578 610,739		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,576 610,739 635,192
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Stranger Costs Estimated Operating Costs Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2.324 per vehict e) Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit) Total Operating Costs	(Straight line	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 270,000) 270,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,578 610,739 <u>635,192</u> 2,843,507		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 2,70,000) 2,70,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,576 610,739 <u>635,192</u> 2,843,507
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Strain Costs Estimated Operating Costs Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehict e) Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attomey/.5% added exposure in paratransit)	(Straight line	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,578 610,739		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,576 610,739 635,192
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Strait Capital Costs Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehict e) Claims (Est at \$2,39% of salaries and capital costs 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit) Total Operating Costs ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	(Straight line	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,578 610,739 <u>635,192</u> 2,843,507 27,647,202		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,576 610,739 635,192 2,843,507 36,710,794
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Stranger Costs Estimated Operating Costs Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2.324 per vehict e) Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit) Total Operating Costs	(Straight line	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 270,000) 270,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,578 610,739 <u>635,192</u> 2,843,507		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 2,70,000) 2,70,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,576 610,739 <u>635,192</u> 2,843,507
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, ramp-equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe nger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Strat Capital Costs Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehict e) Claims (Est at \$2,324 per vehict e) Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital costs 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit) Total Operating Costs ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	(Straight line	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,578 610,739 <u>635,192</u> 2,843,507 27,647,202		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,576 610,739 635,192 2,843,507 36,710,794
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe riger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Strate Coperating Costs Fuei (Est miles per gai 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gailon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehict e) Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attomey/.5% added exposure in paratransit) Total Operating Costs ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	(Straight line	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 270,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,578 610,739 635,192 2,843,507 27,647,202 (20,524,139)		2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 2,70,000) 2,70,000 (2,70,000) 2,70,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,576 610,739 635,192 2,843,507 36,710,794 (20,495,569)
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change In Projected Passe riger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss String Costs Fuel (Est miles per gai 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehict e) Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added exposure in paratransit) Total Operating Costs ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY CO ST LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST ESTIMATED SAVINGS	(Straight line	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 3,660,000 (270,000) 270,000 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,578 610,739 <u>635,192</u> 2,843,507 27,647,202 (20,524,139) 7,123,063	\$	2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 2,70,000) 2,70,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,576 610,739 635,192 2,843,507 36,710,794 (20,495,569) 16,215,224
Estimated Capital Costs Sedans, 4-door midsize Vans, Type A, lift equipped Vans, Type B, lift equipped 2-way radios % Change in Projected Passe riger Trips (6) Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss Strate Coperating Costs Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip & \$3.10 per gallon Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehict e) Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost: 2.5% payout/.9% City Attomey/.5% added exposure in paratransit) Total Operating Costs ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	(Straight line	200 49 64 25 338 0 0 (61) 61 (6) 6	សេសស <sub>ស</sub> សង់សលស	28,000 56,000 45,000 56,000 56,000 60,000 60,000 45,000 45,000				2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 16,900 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 270,000 (270,000) 270,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,578 610,739 635,192 2,843,507 27,647,202 (20,524,139)	69	2,744,000 3,840,000 1,125,000 (2,964,954) 0 0 (3,660,000) 2,70,000) 2,70,000 (2,70,000) 2,70,000 10,360,946 2,590,237 1,597,576 610,739 635,192 2,843,507 36,710,794 (20,495,569)

<u>Comments/Assumptions:</u>

 FY84 was the first year these services were contracted out.
 Biweekly salary rates: FY14 15 rates based on June 2014 rates. FY1516 assumed no salary rate increase.
 Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability,

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage,

5. Classification has been aboli shed; this analysis assumes the class would be reestablished with a compensation rate equivalent to related 6. Passenger trip projections have decreased 22% from FY1112; this reduction has been applied to Staff, Capital and Operating cost included in

#### Please Fill Out Highlighted Areas Only.

SFMTA - ADMINISTRATION COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED	DEBSONNEL	COSTS
PHUJECIED	PERSONNEL	Cuara

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS		# of Full Time	·				-	
		Equivalent						
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekly	Rate (2)		Low	ĺ	High
Transit Operators	9163	148.0		5 2,362	\$ 5	5,769,869	Ş	9,158,891
Chauffeur (5)	7312	231.0	\$ 1,190 \$	1,890	\$ ;	7,204,539	\$	11,435,237
Auto Mechanic Assistant Supervisor	7382	2.0	\$ 3,629 5	5 3,629	\$	190,160	\$	190,160
Auto Mechanic	7381	12.0	\$ 3,012 \$	5 3,012	\$	946,973	\$	946,973
Auto Service Worker	7410	8.0	\$ 2,009 \$	5 2,442	\$	421,086	\$	511,843
Transit Car Cleaner	9102	7.0	\$ 1,918 \$	2,332	\$	351,761	\$	427,689
Transit Supervisor	9139	2.0	\$ 2,786	5 3,387	\$	145,986	\$	177,479
Transit Manager i	9140	4.0	\$ 3,289 \$	3,998	\$	344,687	\$	418,990
Passenger Services Specialist	9135	14.0	\$ 2,110 \$	2,564	\$	773,948	\$	940,475
Senior Clerk Typist	1426	6.0	\$ 1,886 \$	2,292	s	296,479	ŝ	360,302
Seniar Eligibility Worker	2905	5.0		2,862	\$	308,374	\$	374,922
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, a Night / Shift Differential (8.25% of salary for estimat Other Pay: 9163 (Uniform \$300/person/year) Other Pay: 7312 (Uniform \$300/person/year) Other Pay: 7314 (Shoes \$250/person/year) Other Pay: 7381 and 7382 (Tool \$550/person/year)	ted 1/3 of emp					344,467 460,270 44,400 69,300 2,000 7,700		514.837 685,273 44,400 69,300 2,000 7,700
			•					
FY2011-12 Projected Trips								
FY2015-16 Projected Trips								-
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (6)	-22%	(97.7)	)		(	3,934,167)	l I	(5,844,397)
Total Salary Costs		341.3	-		-ī:	3,747,833		20,423,075
FRINGE BENEFITS								•
Variable Fringes (3)						6,582,813		9,145,113
Fixed Fringes (4)						4,199,157		4,199,157
Fringe on Overtime/Premium				7.9%		63,735		95,049
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (6)	-22%			1.210		2,413,121)		(2,990,189)
Total Fringe Benefits						8,432,583		10,449,130
Capital and Operating Costs								•
Estimated Capital Costs	•	Quantity	Unit cost					
Sedans, 4-door midsize (200 Count)		200	\$ 28,000			5,600,000		5,600,000
Vans, Type A, lift equipped		49	\$ 56,000			2,744,000		2,744,000
Vans, Type B, lift equipped		64	\$ 60,000	'		3,840,000		3,840,000
Vans, ramp-equipped		25	\$ 45,000			1,125,000		1,125,000
2-way radios		338	\$ 50			16,900		16,900
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (8)	-22%				(	2,964,954)	)	(2,964,954)
Vans, Type A, lift equipped - MTA Owned	1	0	\$ 56,000			0		0
Vans, Type A, lift equipped - Lease revenue loss		0	\$ 56,000			0		0
Vans; Type B, lift equipped - MTA Owned		(61)	\$ 60,000		ſ	3,660,000		(3,660,000)
Vans, Type B, lift equipped - Lease Revenue loss		61	\$ 60,000			3,660,000	•	3,660,000
Vans, ramp-equipped - MTA Owned		(6)	\$ 45,000			(270,000		(270,000)
Vans, ramp-equipped - Lease Revenue loss		6	\$ 45,000			270,000		270,000
vizio, ramp equipped could revenue rote	•	0	<b>0</b> 40,000	· .	. 1	0,360,946		10,360,946
Total Capital Costs	s (Straight line	depreciation o	ver 4 vears)			2,590,237		2,590,237
% Change in Projected Passenger Trips (6) Estimated Operating Costs			·····			_,,_,		
Fuel (Est miles per gal 6.61 at 3.96 miles per trip &	L							
\$3.10 per gallon						1,597,576	I.	1,597,576
Parts (Est at \$2,324 per vehicle) (7) CPI =	3%					629,061		629,061
Claims (Est at 3.9% of salaries and capital cost:								•
2.5% payout/.9% City Attorney/.5% added								
exposure in paratransit)						637,185	į.	897,519
Total Operating Cost	3	• .				2,863,822		3,124,156
FORMATED TOTAL CITY COST						7 694 475		28 894 500
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					2	27,634,475		36,586,598
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST					_(2	21,144,601	)	(21,116,844)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$	6,489,874	1 8	5 15,469,763
% of Savings to City Cos	t					239	_	42%

<u>Comments/Assumptions;</u> 1. FY84 was the first year these services were contracted out. 2. Biweekly salary rates: FY1415 rates based on June 2014 rates, FY1516 assumed no salary rate increase. 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Classification has been abolished; this analysis assumes the class would be reestablished with a compensation rate equivalent to 8. Passenger trip projections have decreased 22% from FY1112; this reduction has been applied to Staff, Capital and Operating cost included in this estimate.

7. Assumed 3% CPI adjustment for FY1516 automotive parts.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: SFMTA Parking Meter Payment Collection Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for parking meter payment collection services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

FAX 415-554-7466

Ç

## SFMTA - FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOLOU

Con Collection, Counting and Data Management Services COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CO INTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES <sup>(1)(2)</sup> FISCAL YEAR 2015

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL CO-STS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	· .	Bi-Wee	kiy F	late		Low		High
Collections		_								
Manager IV	9174	0.75	•	3,989		5,090		78,085		99,637
Analyst	1824	0.25	\$	3,608	\$	4,385		23,542		28,612
Transit Revenue Supervisor	9118	2.00	\$		\$	3,527		151,484		184,109
Principal Fare Collections Receiver	9117 .	2.00	\$	2,793		3,396		145,795		177;271
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116	. 8.00	\$	2,221	S	2,700	\$	463,745		563,760
Fare Collections Receiver	9110	24.00	\$	1,918	\$	2,332	\$	1,201,435	\$	1,460,765
Counting										
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116			2,221	•	2,700	\$	57,968		70,470
Fare Collections Receiver	9110	3.00	\$	1,918	\$	2,332	\$	150,179	\$	182,596
Holiday Pay (if applicable)							\$	-	\$	-
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)							\$	-	\$	-
Overtime Pay (if applicable)							\$	-	\$	-
Other Pay (if applicable)							\$	-	\$	
Total Salary Costs		41.0					\$	2,170,607	<u>\$</u>	2,638,971
FRINGE BENEFITS										
Variable Fringes (3)					•			557,920		679,418
Fixed Fringes (4)	1. The second						\$	532,765	\$	532,765
Total Fringe Benefits							\$	1,090,685	\$	1,212,183
Total Personnel Costs								3,261,292		3,851,154
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if a pplicable)		· · · · · · ·	:		. ·	·				****
Rent							Ş	84,000	\$	84,000
Utilities							ŝ	24,000		24,000
Uniform				•			\$	40,000	\$	40,000
Vehicles							š	108,000		108,000
Radios							é	18,000		18,000
Gas							ф с	43,200		43,200
							ŝ			
Total City Additional Costs								317,200	<u> </u>	317,200
Outpatient of	•						~	0 570 100	•	4 400 054
Subtotal							\$	3,578,492	\$	4,168,354
							<u>\$</u>	-	\$	
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST							\$	3,578,492	-	4,168,354

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	 (3,498,993)	(3,512,649)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 79,49 <del>9</del> \$	655,705
% of Savings to City Cost	 2%	16%

#### Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1978-1979 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary levelsare as posted on DHR website salary rates effective June 30,2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

#### SFMTA - FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOLC

Con Collection, Counting and Data Management Services

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2016

#### \_STIMATED CITY COSTS:

## PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title		Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions		Bi-Wee	kiy Ra	ite		Low		High
Collections	,										
Manager IV		9174	0.75	\$	3,989	\$	5,090		78,085		99,637
Analyst		1824	0.25	\$	3,608	\$	4,385		23,542		28,612
Transit Revenue Supervisor		9118	2.0	\$	2,902		3,527		151,484	•	184,109
Principal Fare Collections Receiver		9117	2.0	\$	2,793	\$	3,396		145,795	\$	177,271
Senior Fare Collections Receiver		9116	8.0	\$	2,221	\$	2,700		463,745		563,760
Fare Collections Receiver		9110	24.0	\$	1,918	\$	2,332	\$	1,201,435	\$	1,460,765
Counting Senior Fare Collections Receiver		9116	1.0	*	2,221	¢.	0 700	۴	F7 000	*	70 470
Fare Collections Receiver		9110	3.0	\$ \$	1,918		2,700 2,332		57,968		70,470
		8110	3.0	\$	1,910	à	2,332	ц Ф	150,179	\$	182,596
Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)								¢ ¢	• ·	\$ \$	~
Overtime Pay (if applicable)								ф Ф	•	е Ф	-
Other Pay (if applicable)								ф с	-	ф ф	· •
Other Fay (it applicable)	Total Salary Costs		41.0					¢ Ý	2,272,233	Տ	2,767,220
	Totar basary obsis				······································		<u> </u>	-	2,212,233	4	2,101,220
FRINGE BENEFITS											
Variable Fringes <sup>(3)</sup>									COF 407	•	ana a 17
								\$	525,427		639,847
Fixed Fringes (4)								\$	551,162		551,162
	Total Fringe Benefits							\$	1,076,589	\$	1,191,009
	Total Personnel Costs								3,348,823		3,958,229
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable	e)										
	Rent		•					s	86,520	s	86,520
	Utilities							\$	24,720	ŝ	24,720
×	Uniform							ŝ	41,200	ŝ	41,200
	Vehicles							Ŝ.	108,000	ŝ	108,000
	Radios							\$	18,540	ŝ	18,540
· · · ·	Gas								44,496	\$	44,496
Tota	I City Additional Costs							<u>\$</u> \$	323,475		323,476
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·							<u> </u>		<u> </u>	
	Cubber							•		•	
	Subtotal							\$	3,672,299	\$ .	4,281,705
								<u>\$</u>		\$	<u> </u>
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST								\$	3,672,299	Ş	4,281,705
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRAC	CT COST								(3,498,788)	•	(3,514,127)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	· ·							\$	173,511	_	767,578
%	of Savings to City Cost							يسبغد	5%		18%
	····									-	

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1978-1979 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable,



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: SFMTA Parking Meter Payment Collection Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for parking meter payment collection services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

## SFMTA - FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOLO

Con Collection, Counting and Data Management Services

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)(2) FISCAL YEAR 2015

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title		Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Wee	kly F	lat <del>o</del>	Low		High
Collections									
Manager IV		9174	0.75	\$ 3,989	\$	5,090	\$ 78,085	\$	99,637
Analyst	· · ·	1824	0.25	\$ 3,608	\$	4,385	\$ 23,542	\$	28,612
Transit Revenue Supervisor		9118	2.00	\$ 2,902	\$	3,527	\$ 151,484	\$	184,109
Principal Fare Collections Receiver		9117	2.00	\$ 2,793	\$	3,396	\$ 145,795	\$	177,271
Senior Fare Collections Receiver		9116	8.00	\$ 2,221	\$	2,700	\$ 463,745	\$	563,760
Fare Collections Receiver		9110	. 24.00	\$ 1,918	\$	2,332	\$ 1,201,435	\$	1,460,765
Counting	•								
Senior Fare Collections Receiver		9116	1.00	\$ 2,221	Ş	2,700	\$ 57,968	\$	70,470
Fare Collections Receiver		9110	3.00	\$ 1,918	\$	2,332	\$ 150,179	\$	182,596
Holiday Pay (if applicable)							\$ -	\$	-
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)							\$ -	S	· –
Overtime Pay (if applicable)							\$ -	\$	-
Other Pay (if applicable)							\$ , <u> </u>	\$	•
	Total Salary Costs		41.0	 			\$ 2,170,607	\$	2,638,971
FRINGE BENEFITS		· · · · · · · ·		 			 		

Variable Fringes <sup>(3)</sup>		557,920		679,418
Fixed Fdnges <sup>(4)</sup>	\$	532,765	\$	532,765
Total Fringe Benefits	\$	1,090,685	\$	1,212,183
Total Personnel Costs		3,261,292		3,851,154
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)				· · ·.
Rent	\$	84,000	\$	84,000
Utilities	\$	24,000	Ş	24,000
Uniform	\$	40,000	\$	40,000
Vehicles	\$	108,000	\$	108,000
Radios	\$	18,000	\$	18,000
Gas	\$	43,200	\$	43,200
Total City Additional Costs	\$	317,200	\$	317,200
Subtotal	\$	3,578,492	\$	4,168,354
	\$	-	\$	-
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	ş	3,578,492	\$	4,168,354
		)		•
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST		(3,498,993)		(3,512,649)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$	79,499	\$	655,705
% of Savings to City Cost		2%		16%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1978-1979 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary levelsare as posted on DHR website salary rates effective June 30,2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

#### SFMT A - FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOL

Con Collection, Counting and Data Management Services

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES <sup>(1)(2)</sup> FISCAL YEAR 2016

,

10000 100112010

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title		Class	# of Full Time Equivalent		Bi-Wee		e		Low		High
Collections			Positions	L							
Manager IV		9174	0.75	\$	3,98 <b>9</b>	\$	5,090	\$	78,085	S	99.637
Analyst		1824	0.25	\$	3,608	\$	4,385	\$	23,542	\$	28,612
Transit Revenue Supervisor		9118	2.0	\$	2,902	\$	3,527	\$	151,484	\$	184,109
Principal Fare Collections Receiver		9117	2.0	\$	2,793	\$	3,396	\$	145,795	\$	177,271
Senior Fare Collections Receiver		9116	8.0	\$	2,221	\$	2,700	\$	463,745	\$	563,760
Fare Collections Receiver		9110	24.0	\$	1,918	\$	2,332	\$	1,201,435	\$	1,460,765
Counting											
Senior Fare Collections Receiver		9116	1.0	\$	2,221	<b>Ş</b>	2,700	\$	57,968	\$	70,470
Fare Collections Receiver		9110	3.0	\$	1,918	\$	2,332	\$	150,179	\$	182,596
Holiday Pay (if applicable)							•	\$	• .	\$	-
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)			. •					\$	-	\$	-
Overtime Pay (if applicable)								\$	-	\$	-
Other Pay (if applicable)								\$	-	\$	-
	I Salary Costs		41.0					\$	2,272,233	\$	2,767,220
FRINGE BENEFITS								-			
Variable Fringes (3)								\$	525,427		639,847
Fixed Fringes (4)								\$	551,162	\$	551,162
Total F	ringe Benefits							\$	1,076,589	\$	1,191,009
Total Pe	ersonnel Costs								3,348,823		3,958,229
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)										<u> </u>	
	Rent		:		•			\$	86,520	s	86,520
	Utilities							\$	24,720	ŝ	24,720
-	Uniform	•						\$	41,200	\$	41,200
	Vehicies							\$	108,000	\$	108,000
	Radios							\$	18,540	\$	18,540
• •	Gas						•	\$	44,496		44,496
Total City A	dditlonal Costs							\$	323,476		323,476
	Subtotal							\$	3,672,299	\$.	4,281,705
								<u>\$</u>	-	\$	
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST								\$	3,672,299	\$	4,281,705
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COS	T								(3,498,788	<b>`</b>	(3,514,127)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	•							\$	173,511	_	767,578
	igs to City Cost							- <b></b>	5%		18%
									,		1076

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1978-1979 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable,



## **OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: SFMTA Parking Meter Payment Collection Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for parking meter payment collection services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

## SFMTA - FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOLO( Con Collection, Counting and Data Management Services COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES <sup>(1) (2)</sup>

FISCAL YEAR 2015

EDINICE BENEETS

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL CO STS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Wee	kiy F	lat <del>o</del>	Low	High
Collections							
Manager IV	9174	0.75	\$ 3,989	\$	5,090	\$ 78,085	\$ 99,637
Analyst	1824	. 0.25	\$ 3,608	\$	4,385	\$ 23,542	\$ 28,612
Transit Revenue Supervisor	9118	2.00	\$ 2,902	\$	3,527	\$ 151,484	\$ 184,109
Principal Fare Collections Receiver	9117	2.00	\$ 2,793	\$	3,396	\$ 145,795	\$ 177,271
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116	8.00	\$ 2,221	S.	2,700	\$ 463,745	\$ 563,760
Fare Collections Receiver	9110	24.00	\$ 1,918	\$	2,332	\$ 1,201,435	\$ 1,460,765
Counting							
Senior Fare Collections Receiver	9116	1.00	\$ 2,221	\$	2,700	\$ 57,968	\$ 70,470
Fare Collections Receiver	9110	3.00	\$ 1,918	\$	2,332	\$ 150,179	\$ 182,596
Holiday Pay (if applicable)						\$ -	\$ -
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)						\$ -	\$ -
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						\$ -	\$ -
Other Pay (if applicable)						\$ · •	\$ -
Tot	al Salary Costs	41.0	 			\$ 2,170,607	\$ 2,638,971

FHINGE BENEFITS						
Variable Fringes <sup>(3)</sup>				557,920		679,418
Fixed Fringes (4)		•	S	532,765	\$	532,765
	<b>Total Fringe Benefits</b>		\$	1,090,685	\$	1,212,183
	Total Personnel Costs	*		3,261,292		3,851,154
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if a pplicable)	n el el compositor de la c					• • •
······································	Rent		\$	84,000	\$	84,000
	Utilities		\$	24,000	\$	24,000
	Uniform		\$	40,000	\$	40,000
	Vehicles	•	\$	108,000	\$	108,000
	Fadios		\$	18,000	\$	18,000
*. · · ·	Gas	· .	\$	43,200	\$	43,200
Tota	al City Additional Costs		\$	317,200	\$	317,200
	Subtotal		\$	3,578,492	s	4,168,354
			ŝ		s	
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST			\$	3,578,492	\$	4,168,354
						•
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST			(3,498,993)	_	(3,512,649)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS			\$	79,499	\$	655,705
%	of Savings to City Cost		·	2%		16%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1978-1979 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary levelsare as posted on DHR website salary rates effective June 30,2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

#### SFMTA - FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOL

Con Collection, Counting and Data Management Services

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2016

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

THOUGHT			# of Full Time.	T-							·····
Job Class Title		Class	# of Puil Time. Equivalent Positions		Bi-Weel	kiy Ra	ite :		Low		High
Collections											
Manager IV	•	9174	0.75	\$	3,989	\$	5,090		78,085		99,637
Analyst		1824	0.25	\$	3,608	\$	4,385		23,542		28,612
Transit Revenue Supervisor		9118	2.0	\$	2,902	\$	3,527			\$	184,109
Principal Fare Collections Receiver		9117	2.0	\$	2,793	\$		\$	145,795	\$	177,271
Senior Fare Collections Receiver		9116	8.0	\$	2,221	\$	2,700		463,745	\$	563,760
Fare Collections Receiver Counting		9110	24.0	\$	1,918	\$	2,332	\$	1,201,435	\$	1,460,765
Senior Fare Collections Receiver		9116	1.0	\$	2,221	\$	2,700	\$	57,968	\$	70,470
Fare Collections Receiver		9110	3.0	\$	1,918	\$	2,332	\$	150,179	\$	182,596
Holiday Pay (if applicable)								\$	•	\$	<b>_</b> :
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	1							\$	-	\$	-
Overtime Pay (if applicable)								\$	-	\$	•
Other Pay (if applicable)								\$	-	\$	-
	Total Salary Costs		41.0					\$	2,272,233	\$	2,767,220
FRINGE BENEFITS											•
Variable Fringes (3)			· .					S	525,427	¢	639,847
								•			
Fixed Fringes <sup>(4)</sup>	· :								551,162		551,162
· ·	Total Fringe Benefits Total Personnel Costs		۰						1,076,589 3,348,823	<u> </u>	1,191,009 3,958,229
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (If applic	ahla)										
ADDITIONAL OFFT ODDIO (II applic	Rent			•				~	86,520	~	00 500
	Utilities							\$ .\$	24,720		86,520 24,720
	Uniform							• ⊅ \$	41,200		41,200
	Vehicles							ф С	108,000		108,000
	Radios							φ e			18,540
								3	18,540		
-	Gas							\$	44,496		44,496
I	otal City Additional Costs		•					<u> </u>	323,476	\$	323,476
	Subtotal							\$	3,672,299	\$	4,281,705
								\$		\$	· -
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST								\$	3,672,299	\$	4,281,705
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONT	PACT COST								(3,498,788	n	(3,514,127
	naur cuar							-		· · · ·	
ESTIMATED SAVINGS								<u>*</u>	173,511		767,578
	% of Savings to City Cost								. 59	, •	18%

Comments/Assumptions;

1. FY 1978-1979 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

## Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: SFMTA Comprehensive Facility Security Service Contract - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for comprehensive facility security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield Controller Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

FAX 415-554-7466

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED CIVIL SERVANT PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time				
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weeki		Low	High
Client Manager	8229	1.0	\$ 2,533	\$ 3,080	\$ 66,111	\$ 80,388
ADA Observer	8202	3.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 124,340	\$ 150,884
Courier	8202	1.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 41,447	\$ 50,295
Badging Clerk	1406	1.0	1,714	2,084	\$ 44,735	\$ 54,392
Administrative Support	1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	\$ 59,090	\$ 71,827
Video Surveillance Supervisor	1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	\$ 59,090	\$ 71,827
Video Surveillance Assistants	1408	13.0	2,264	2,752	\$ 768,175	\$ 933,754
Security Operations Coordinator	8202	1.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 41,447	\$ 50,295
Field Supervisor	8202	16.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 663,149	\$ 804,715
Armed Security Guards	8202	15.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 621,702	\$ 754,421
Assistant Client Manager	2785	1.0	2,274	2,764	\$ 59,351	\$ 72,140
Unarmed Security Guards	8202	46.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 1,906,553	\$ 2,313,556
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class) (4)			1		87,143	105,784
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees) (5)					113,886	138,246
Overtime Pay (if applicable)		•				
Other Pay (if applicable)						é a
Total Salary Cost	s	100			4,656,221	5,652,525
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Variable Fringes <sup>(6)</sup>					1,094,415	1,328,591
Fixed Fringes <sup>(7)</sup>					1,300,096	1,300,096
Overtime / Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employ	ees)			7.9%	15,881	19,278
Total Fringe Benefit:	s		•		2,410,392	2,647,966
Total Personnel Costs					7,066,613	8,300,490
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)		•				
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					7,066,613	8,300,490
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	•				6,316,572	6,316,572
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 750,041	\$ 1,983,918
% of Savings to City Cos	it.				11%	24%
% of Savings to city cos	SC.				11%	22

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2008 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. In order to better reflect the function and wage of Cypress Security contractors, we included some job classifications outside of SFMTA (for example: Classification 8229 – Manager Museum Security Services, Classification 8202 – Security Guard, and Classification 2785 – Assistant General Services Manager.

3. Salary levels are as posted in DHR websited at June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs and based on each employee working 40 hours per week. The 'Low' reflects step 1 and the 'High' reflects step 5.

4. Holiday pay is calculated based on the following assumption: 11 days of holiday pay at a rate of time and a half for eight hours. The following number of Cypress employees work holidays in accordance with the contract: Assistant Client Manager (1), Video Surveillance Supervisor (1), Video Surveillance Assistants (13), Field Supervisors (16), Armed Security Guards (14), Unarmed Security Guards (46), and Security Operations Coordinator (1).

5, Night /Shift Differential is calculated the same as previous years: the sum of personnel costs times 2.7%. This is to account for the fact that not all employees would be obtaining this rate differential.

6. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

7. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

8. The estimated cost does not include materials, weapons, services, vehicle and capital.

### STIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### ROJECTED CIVIL SERVANT PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full				1.1	
		Time					
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Week		Low		ligh
Client Manager	8229	1.0	\$ 2,533	\$ 3,080	\$ 66,111	\$	80,388
ADA Observer	8202	3.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 124,340	\$	150,884
Courier	8202	1.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 41,447	\$	50,295
Badging Clerk	1406	1.0	1,714	2,084	\$ 44,735	\$	54,392
Administrative Support	1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	\$ 59,090	\$	71,827
Video Surveillance Supervisor	1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	\$ 59,090	\$	71,827
Video Surveillance Assistants	1408	13.0	2,264	2,752	\$ 768,175	\$	933,754
Security Operations Coordinator	8202	1.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 41,447	\$	50,295
Field Supervisor	8202	16.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 663,149	\$	804,715
Armed Security Guards	8202	15.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 621,702	\$	754,421
Assistant Client Manager	2785	1.0	2,274	2,764	\$ 59,351	\$	72,140
Unarmed Security Guards	8202	46.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 1,906,553	\$ 3	2,313.556
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class) (4)					87,143		105,784
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees) (5)	•				113,886		138,246
Overtime Pay (if applicable)		· · · · · ·		· ·	•		
Other Pay (if applicable)							
Total Salary Co	osts	100			4,656,221		5,652,525
FRINGE BENEFITS						·	
Variable Fringes <sup>(8)</sup>					1,030,706		1.251,250
Fixed Fringes (7)					1,345,280		1,345,280
Overtime / Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 of em	olovees)			7.9%	•		19,278
Total Fringe Ben					2.391.867		2,615,808
Total Personnel Costs					7,048,088		8,268,333
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)							
							•
TIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					7,048,088		8,268,33

TIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	7,048,088	8,268,333
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	6,316,572	6,316,572
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 731,516	\$ 1,951,761
% of Savings to City Cost	10%	24%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2008 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. In order to better reflect the function and wage of Cypress Security contractors, we included some job classifications outside of SFMTA (for example; Classification 8229 – Manager Museum Security Services, Classification 8202 – Security Guard, and Classification 2785 – Assistant General Services Manager.

3. Salary levels are as posted in DHR websited at June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs and based on each employee working 40 hours per week. The 'Low' reflects step 1 and the 'High' reflects step 5.

4. Holiday pay is calculated based on the following assumption: 11 days of holiday pay at a rate of time and a half for eight hours. The following number of Cypress employees work holidays in accordance with the contract: Assistant Client Manager (1), Video Surveillance Supervisor (1), Video Surveillance Assistants (13), Field Supervisors (16), Armed Security Guards (14), Unarmed Security Guards (46), and Security Operations Coordinator (1).

5. Night /Shift Differential is calculated the same as previous years: the sum of personnel costs times 2.7%. This is to account for the fact that not all employees would be obtaining this rate differential.

6. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

7. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

8. The estimated cost does not include materials, weapons, services, vehicle and capital.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Żmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: SFMTA Comprehensive Facility Security Service Contract - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for comprehensive facility security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

### PROJECTED CIVIL SERVANT PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full						
		Time			•			
lob Class Title	Class	Positions	BI-Week		Lov			igh
Client Manager	8229	1.0	\$ 2,533	\$-3,080		66,111	\$	80,388
ADA Observer	8202	3.0	1,588	1,927		24,340	\$	150,884
Courier	8202	1.0	1,588	1,927		41,447	\$	50,295
Badging Clerk	1406	1.0	1,714	2,084	-	44,735	\$	54,392
Administrative Support	1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	\$	59,090	\$	71,827
Video Surveillance Supervisor	1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	\$	59,09 <b>0</b>	\$	71,827
Video Surveillance Assistants	1408	13.0	2,264	2,752		68,175	\$	933,754
Security Operations Coordinator	8202	1.0	1,588	1,927	\$	41,447	\$	50,295
Field Supervisor	8202	16.0	1,588	1,927		63,149	\$	804,715
Armed Security Guards	8202	15.0	1,588	1,927	\$6	521,702	\$	754,421
Assistant Client Manager	2785	1.0	2,274	2,764	\$	59,351	\$	72,140
Unarmed Security Guards	8202	46.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 1,9	06,553	\$ 3	2,313,558
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class) <sup>(4)</sup>						87,143		105,784
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employee	s) <sup>(5)</sup>				•	13,886		138,246
Overtime Pay (if applicable)								
Other Pay (if applicable)								
Total Sala	ary Costs	100			4,6	56,221		5,652,525
FRINGE BENEFITS								
Variable Fringes <sup>(6)</sup>					1,0	94,415		1,328,591
Fixed Fringes (7)						300,09 <b>6</b>		1,300,096
Overtime / Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 o				7.9%		15,881		19,278
Total Fringe	Benefits					10,392		2,647,966
Total Personnel Costs					7,0	066,613		8,300,490
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)	•	•						
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					7,0	066,613		8,300,490
					• •			-,,/
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST					6,	316,572		6,316,572
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					<u> </u>	750,041	\$	1,983,918
% of Savings to	City Cost					11%		249

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2008 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. In order to better reflect the function and wage of Cypress Security contractors, we included some job classifications outside of SFMTA (for example: Classification 8229 – Manager Museum Security Services, Classification 8202 – Security Guard, and Classification 2785 – Assistant General Services Manager.

3. Salary levels are as posted in DHR websited at June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs and based on each employee working 40 hours per week. The 'Low' reflects step 1 and the 'High' reflects step 5.

4. Holiday pay is calculated based on the following assumption: 11 days of holiday pay at a rate of time and a half for eight hours. The following number of Cypress employees work holidays in accordance with the contract: Assistant Client Manager (1), Video Surveillance Supervisor (1), Video Surveillance Assistants (13), Field Supervisors (16), Armed Security Guards (14), Unarmed Security Guards (46), and Security Operations Coordinator (1).

5. Night /Shift Differential is calculated the same as previous years: the sum of personnel costs times 2.7%. This is to account for the fact that not all employees would be obtaining this rate differential.

6. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

7. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

8. The estimated cost does not include materials, weapons, services, vehicle and capital.

### TIMATED CITY COSTS:

### PROJECTED CIVIL SERVANT PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED CIVIL SERVANT PERSONNEL C	OSTS						
		1	# of Full				
		}	Time				
Job Class Title		Class	Positions	Bi-Week	ly Rate	Low	High
Client Manager		8229	1.0	\$ 2,533	\$ 3,080	\$ 66,111	\$ 80,388
ADA Observer		8202	3.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 124,340	\$ 150,884
Courier		8202	1.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 41,447	\$ 50,295
Badging Clerk		1406	1.0	1,714	2,084	\$ 44,735	\$ 54,392
Administrative Support		1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	\$ 59,090	\$ 71,827
Video Surveillance Supervisor		1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	\$ 59,090	\$ 71,827
Video Surveillance Assistants		1408	13.0	2,264	2,752	\$ 768,175	\$ 933,754
Security Operations Coordinator		8202	1.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 41,447	\$ 50,295
Field Supervisor		8202	16.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 663,149	\$ 804,715
Armed Security Guards		8202	15.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 621,702	\$ 754,421
Assistant Client Manager		2785	1.0	2,274	2,764	\$ 59,351	\$ 72,140
Unarmed Security Guards		8202	46.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 1,906,553	\$ 2,313,556
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday p						87,143	105,784
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estin	nated 1/3 of employees) (5)		1			113,886	138,246
Overtime Pay (if applicable)							
Other Pay (if applicable)	-						
l	Total Salary Cost	5	100			4,656,221	5,652,525
FRINGE BENEFITS							
Variable Fringes <sup>(8)</sup>						1,030,706	1,251,250
Fixed Fringes (7)						1,345,28 <b>0</b>	1,345,280
Overtime / Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of sal	• •	• •			7.9%	15,881	19,278
	Total Fringe Benefit	5			-	2,391,867	2,615,808
Total Personnel Costs						7,048,088	8,268,333
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)							
•							
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·					-		
TIMATED TOTAL CITY COST						7,048,088	8,268,333
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COS	т ·		•			6,316,572	6,316,572
	-				•		
ESTIMATED SAVINGS				· .	-	\$ 731,516	\$ 1,951,761
	% of Savings to City Cos	it i			-	10%	24%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2008 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. In order to better reflect the function and wage of Cypress Security contractors, we included some job classifications outside of SFMTA (for example: Classification 8229 – Manager Museum Security Services, Classification 8202 – Security Guard, and Classification 2785 – Assistant General Services Manager.

3. Salary levels are as posted in DHR websited at June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs and based on each employee working 40 hours per week. The 'Low' reflects step 1 and the 'High' reflects step 5.

4. Holiday pay is calculated based on the following assumption: 11 days of holiday pay at a rate of time and a half for eight hours. The following number of Cypress employees work holidays in accordance with the contract: Assistant Client Manager (1), Video Surveillance Supervisor (1), Video Surveillance Assistants (13), Field Supervisors (16), Armed Security Guards (14), Unarmed Security Guards (46), and Security Operations Coordinator (1).

5. Night /Shift Differential is calculated the same as previous years: the sum of personnel costs times 2.7%. This is to account for the fact that not all employees would be obtaining this rate differential.

6. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

7. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

8. The estimated cost does not include materials, weapons, services, vehicle and capital.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: SFMTA Comprehensive Facility Security Service Contract - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for comprehensive facility security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

### PROJECTED CIVIL SERVANT PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full						
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		Time						
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	BI-Week			w .		ligh
Client Manager	8229	1.0	\$ 2,533	\$ 3,080	\$	66,111	s	80,388
ADA Observer	8202	3.0	1,588	1,927	\$	124,340	\$	150.884
Courier	8202	1.0	1,588	1,927	Ş	41,447	\$	50,295
Badging Clerk	1406	1.0	1,714	2,084	\$	44,735	\$	54,392
Administrative Support	1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	5	59,0 <b>90</b>	\$	71,827
Video Surveillance Supervisor	1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	\$	59,09 <b>0</b>	\$	71,827
Video Surveillance Assistants	1408	13.0	2,264	2,752	\$	768,175	\$	933,754
Security Operations Coordinator	82 <b>02</b>	1.0	1,58 <b>8</b>	1,927	\$	41,447	5	50,295
Field Supervisor	8202	16.0	∶ 1,58 <b>8</b>	1,927	· \$	663,149	\$	804,715
Armed Security Guards	8202	15.0	1,588	1,927	\$	621,702	\$	754,421
Assistant Client Manager	2785	1.0	2,274	2,764	\$	59,351	\$	72,140
Unarmed Security Guards	8202	46.0	1,588	1,927	<b>\$</b> 1	,906,55 <b>3</b>	\$	2,313,556
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class) (4)						87,143		105,784
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees) (5)						113,886		138,246
Overtime Pay (if applicable)								
Other Pay (if applicable)								
Total Salary Costs		100			4	,656,221		5,652,525
FRINGE BENEFITS								
Variable Fringes <sup>(8)</sup>					1	,094,415		1,328,591
Fixed Fringes <sup>(7)</sup>		•			. 1	,300,096		1,300,096
Overtime / Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employe	es)			7.9%		15,881		19,278
Total Fringe Benefits					2	,410,392		2,647,966
Total Personnel Costs					7	,066,613		8,300,490
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)								
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					7	,966,613		8,300,490
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST					6	,316,572		6,316,572
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$	750,041	\$	1,983,918
% of Savings to City Cost						11%		249

#### Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2008 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. In order to better reflect the function and wage of Cypress Security contractors, we included some job classifications outside of SFMTA (for example: Classification 8229 – Manager Museum Security Services, Classification 8202 – Security Guard, and Classification 2785 – Assistant General Services Manager.

3. Salary levels are as posted in DHR websited at June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs and based on each employee working 40 hours per week. The 'Low' reflects step 1 and the 'High' reflects step 5.

4. Holiday pay is calculated based on the following assumption: 11 days of holiday pay at a rate of time and a half for eight hours. The following number of Cypress employees work holidays in accordance with the contract: Assistant Client Manager (1), Video Surveillance Supervisor (1), Video Surveillance Assistants (13), Field Supervisors (16), Armed Security Guards (14), Unarmed Security Guards (46), and Security Operations Coordinator (1).

5. Night /Shift Differential is calculated the same as previous years: the sum of personnel costs times 2.7%. This is to account for the fact that not all employees would be obtaining this rate differential.

6. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

7. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

8. The estimated cost does not include materials, weapons, services, vehicle and capital.

### TIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED CIVIL SERVANT PERSONNEL COSTS

	# of Full					
	1 1					
			all a second	and the second secon	_	High
						80,388
	3.0				\$	150,884
	1.0		1,927	\$ 41,447	\$	50,295
1406	. 1.0	1,714	2,084	\$ 44,735	\$	54,392
1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	\$ 59,090	\$	71,827
1408	1.0	2,264	2,752	\$ 59,090	\$	71,827
1408	13.0	2,264	2,752	\$ 768,175	\$	933,754
8202	1.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 41,447	\$	50,295
8202	16.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 663,149	\$	804,715
8202	15.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 621,702	\$	754,42
2785	1.0	2,274	2,764	\$ 59,351	\$	· 72,14
8202	46.0	1,588	1,927	\$ 1,906,553	\$	2,313,55
				87,143		105,78
				113,886		138,24
•						
	100			4,656,221		5,652,52
				1,030,708		1,251,25
				1,345,280		1,345,28
e <del>e</del> s)			7.9%	15,881		19,27
			-	2,391,867		2,615,80
			-	7.048.088		8,268,33
	1408 1408 8202 8202 8202 2785	Time           Class         Positions           8229         1.0           8202         3.0           8202         1.0           1406         1.0           1408         1.0           1408         1.0           1408         1.0           1408         1.0           1408         1.0           8202         1.0           8202         1.0           8202         16.0           2785         1.0           8202         46.0	Time         Bi-Week           8229         1.0         \$ 2,533           8202         3.0         1,588           8202         1.0         \$ 2,633           8202         3.0         1,588           1406         1.0         1,714           1408         1.0         2,264           1408         13.0         2,264           8202         1.0         1,588           8202         16.0         1,588           8202         15.0         1,588           2785         1.0         2,274           8202         46.0         1,588	Time         Bi-Weekly Rate           8229         1.0         \$ 2,533         \$ 3,080           8202         3.0         1,588         1,927           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927           8202         1.0         1,714         2,084           1406         1.0         2,264         2,752           1408         1.0         2,264         2,752           1408         13.0         2,264         2,752           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927           8202         16.0         1,588         1,927           8202         15.0         1,588         1,927           2785         1.0         2,274         2,764           8202         46.0         1,588         1,927	Time Positions         Bi-Weekly Rate         Low           8229         1.0         \$ 2,533         \$ 3,080         \$ 66,111           8202         3.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 124,340           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 124,340           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 41,447           1406         1.0         1,714         2,084         \$ 44,735           1408         1.0         2,264         2,752         \$ 59,090           1408         1.0         2,264         2,752         \$ 59,090           1408         13.0         2,264         2,752         \$ 768,175           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 41,447           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 663,149           8202         15.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 621,702           2785         1.0         2,274         2,764         \$ 59351           8202         46.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 1,906,553           8202         46.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 1,030,706           1,345,280 <t< td=""><td>Time         Bi-Weekly Rate         Low         I           8229         1.0         \$ 2,533         \$ 3,080         \$ 66,111         \$           8202         3.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 124,340         \$           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 124,340         \$           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 41,447         \$           1406         1.0         1,714         2,084         \$ 44,735         \$           1408         1.0         2,264         2,752         \$ 59,090         \$           1408         1.0         2,264         2,752         \$ 768,175         \$           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 41,447         \$           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 663,149         \$           8202         16.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 663,149         \$           8202         15.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 663,149         \$           8202         15.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 663,149         \$           8202         46.0         1,588</td></t<>	Time         Bi-Weekly Rate         Low         I           8229         1.0         \$ 2,533         \$ 3,080         \$ 66,111         \$           8202         3.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 124,340         \$           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 124,340         \$           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 41,447         \$           1406         1.0         1,714         2,084         \$ 44,735         \$           1408         1.0         2,264         2,752         \$ 59,090         \$           1408         1.0         2,264         2,752         \$ 768,175         \$           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 41,447         \$           8202         1.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 663,149         \$           8202         16.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 663,149         \$           8202         15.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 663,149         \$           8202         15.0         1,588         1,927         \$ 663,149         \$           8202         46.0         1,588

STIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	7,048,088	8,268,333
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	6,316,572	6,316,572
ESTIMATED SAVINGS % of Savings to City Cost	<u>\$ 731,516</u> 10%	<b>\$ 1,951,761</b> 24%

### Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2008 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. In order to better reflect the function and wage of Cypress Security contractors, we included some job classifications outside of SFMTA (for example: Classification 8229 – Manager Museum Security Services, Classification 8202 – Security Guard, and Classification 2785 – Assistant General Services Manager.

3. Salary levels are as posted in DHR websiled at June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs and based on each employee working 40 hours per week. The 'Low' reflects step 1 and the 'High' reflects step 5.

4. Holiday pay is calculated based on the following assumption: 11 days of holiday pay at a rate of time and a half for eight hours. The following number of Cypress employees work holidays in accordance with the contract: Assistant Client Manager (1), Video Surveillance Supervisor (1), Video Surveillance Assistants (13), Field Supervisors (16), Armed Security Guards (14), Unarmed Security Guards (46), and Security Operations Coordinator (1).

5. Night /Shift Differential is calculated the same as previous years: the sum of personnel costs times 2.7%. This is to account for the fact that not all employees would be obtaining this rate differential.

6. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

7. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

8. The estimated cost does not include materials, weapons, services, vehicle and capital.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

# Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

# RE: Transit Shelter Maintenance and Advertising Contract - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for transit shelter maintenance and advertising services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben/Rosenfield. Controller

Enclosures

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

FAX 415-554-7466

## SFMTA FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY TRANSIT SHELTER MAINTENANCE & ADVERTISING SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 20 14-15

# ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

## **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

		1	F*****		r			
		# of Full Time					[	· · · ·
		Equivalent						,
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Week	ly Rate		Low	<u> </u>	-High
General Laborer	7514	1.5	\$ 1,951	\$2,371	\$	76,382	\$	92,825
Track Maintenance Worker	7540	1.5	1,970	2,395		77,126	)	93,764
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of ho	liday pay, a	pplicable class	)			3,247		5,921
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary f	or estimate	d 1/3 of employ	/ees)			4,345		5,281
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						0		0
Other Pay (if applicable)			. · · ·			0	,	0
Total Salary Costs		3.0				161,099		197,791
FRINGE BENEFITS							. •	
Variable				•		55,247		60,156
Fixed						40,125	-	40,125
Total Fringe Benefits						95,372		100,281
					· .			
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable	<del>)</del> )							
Materials & Supplies (5)						140,000		140,000
Safety Equipment (6)						5,000		5,000
Vehicle Maintenance (7)						1,00 <b>0</b>		1,000
Total Capital & Operating						146,000		146,000
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST						402,472		444,072
								•
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRAC	T COST (8	)				360,266		363,889
Contract Monitoring						10,634		13,852
Total Contract Cost						370,900		377,741
· · ·								
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		· · ·			\$	31,572	\$	66,331
% of Savings to City Cost						. 8%		15%

### Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2007-08 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Materials and supplies would be the costs for the cleaning materials, glass, protective film for the glass, paint for railing, etc.

6. Safety equipment is personal protective gear for the workers.

7. Vehicle maintenance is the usual type of maintenance for City vehicles.

## SFMTA FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY TRANSIT SHELTER MAINTENANCE & ADVERTISING SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

## **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

## **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

		# of Full Time Equivalent		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Week	dy Rate		Low		High
General Laborer	7514	1.5	\$ 1.951	\$2,371	\$	76,382	\$	92,825
Track Maintenance Worker	7540	1.5	1,970	2,395	Ψ	77,126	Ψ	93,764
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of ho				2,000		3.247		5,921
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary 1		• •	•			4,345		5,281
Overtime Pay (if applicable)			,			0		0
Other Pay (if applicable)						0		Ő
Total Salary Costs		3.0	1			161,099		197,791
		-	•					
FRINGE BENEFITS								
Variable						52,668		57,488
Fixed						41,424		41,424
Total Fringe Benefits						94,092		98,912
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable	e)			•				
Materials & Supplies (5)	-)					140,000		140,000
Safety Equipment (6)						5.000		5,000
Vehicle Maintenance (7)						1,000		1,000
	:							
Total Capital & Operating		•				146,000		146,000
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST						401,192		442,703
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRAC		).				367,471		371,167
Contract Monitoring		, ,				10,624		13.824
Total Contract Cost						378,095		384,991
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$	23,097	\$	57,712
% of Savings to City Cost				· ,		6%	_	13%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2007-08 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Materials and supplies would be the costs for the cleaning materials, glass, protective film for the glass, paint for railing, etc.

6. Safety equipment is personal protective gear for the workers.

7. Vehicle maintenance is the usual type of maintenance for City vehicles.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

# Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: Transit Shelter Maintenance and Advertising Contract – FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for transit shelter maintenance and advertising services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben/Rosenfield, Controller

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

# SFMTA FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY TRANSIT SHELTER MAINTENANCE & ADVERTISING SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS: -

# PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Lob Class TitleClassEquivalent PositionsBi-Weekly RateLowHighGeneral Laborer75141.5\$ 1,951\$2,371\$ 76,382\$ 92,Track Maintenance Worker75401.5\$ 1,9702,39577,12693,Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)3,2475,Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)4,3455,Overtime Pay (if applicable)00Other Pay (if applicable)00Total Salary Costs3.0161,099197,FRINGE BENEFITS3.0161,099197,Variable55,24760,Fixed40,12540,Total Fringe Benefits95,372100,ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)140,000140,Safety Equipment (6)5,0005,Vehicle Maintenance (7)1,0001,Total Capital & Operating146,000146,ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST402,472444,LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)360,266363,Contract Monitoring10,63413,	TRODEDIEDI ERCOMMEE OODIO		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		r	·		·····
Job Class Title         Class         Positions         Bi-Weekly Rate         Low         High           General Laborer         7514         1.5         \$ 1,951         \$2,371         \$ 76,382         \$ 92,           Track Maintenance Worker         7540         1.5         1,970         2,395         77,126         93,           Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)         3,247         5,           Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)         4,345         5,           Overtime Pay (if applicable)         0         0         0           Other Pay (if applicable)         0         0         0           Other Pay (if applicable)         0         0         0           Total Salary Costs         3.0         161,099         197,           FRINGE BENEFITS         55,247         60,         40,125         40,           Variable         5,5247         100,         140,000         140,           Safety Equipment (6)         5,000         5,         5,000         5,           Vehicle Maintenance (7)         1,000         1,000         1,000         1,           Total Capital & Operating         146,000         146,         360,266			# of Full Time						
General Laborer         7514         1.5         \$ 1,951         \$2,371         \$ 76,382         \$ 92, 77,126           Track Maintenance Worker         7540         1.5         1,970         2,395         77,126         93, 3,247         5, 9,000           Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)         3,247         5, 3,247         5, 9,247         5, 9,00         0           Other Pay (if applicable)         0         0         0         0         0         0           FRINCE BENEFITS         3.0         161,099         197, 40,125         40, 95,372         100, 95,372         100, 95,372         100, 140,000         140, 95,372         100, 140,000         140, 95,372         100, 140,000         140,000         140, 95,000         5, 9,000         5, 9,000         5, 9,000         5, 9,000         5, 9,000         1,900         1, 9,000         1, 9,000         1, 9,000         1, 9,000         1, 9,000         146,         146,000         146,           ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST         402,472         444,         128, 10,634         13,         360,266         363,			Equivalent						
Track Maintenance Worker       7540       1.5       1,970       2,395       77,126       93,         Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)       3,247       5,         Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)       4,345       5,         Overtime Pay (if applicable)       0       0         Other Pay (if applicable)       0       0         Total Salary Costs       3.0       161,099       197,         FRINGE BENEFITS       3.0       161,099       197,         Variable       55,247       60,         Fixed       40,125       40,         Total Fringe Benefits       95,372       100,         ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)       140,000       140,         Materials & Supplies (5)       140,000       140,         Safety Equipment (6)       5,000       5,         Vehicle Maintenance (7)       1,000       1,         Total Capital & Operating       146,000       146,         ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST       402,472       444,         LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)       360,266       363,         Contract Monitoring       10,634       13,	Job Class Title					·			High
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of holiday pay, applicable class)         3,247         5,           Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)         4,345         5,           Overtime Pay (if applicable)         0         0           Other Pay (if applicable)         0         0           Other Pay (if applicable)         0         0           Total Salary Costs         3.0         161,099         197,           FRINGE BENEFITS         0         40,125         40,           Variable         55,247         60,         40,125         40,           Fixed         40,125         40,         100,         140,         125         40,           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         140,000         140,         140,000         140,         Safety Equipment (6)         5,000         5,         140,000         140,         Safety Equipment (6)         5,000         5,         Vehicle Maintenance (7)         1,000         1,         Total Capital & Operating         146,000         146,         146,000         146,         146,000         146,         146,000         146,         146,000         146,         146,000         146,         146,000         146,         146,000         146,         146,000 <td>General Laborer</td> <td>7514</td> <td>1.5</td> <td>\$ 1,951</td> <td>\$2,371</td> <td>\$</td> <td>76,382</td> <td>\$</td> <td>92,825</td>	General Laborer	7514	1.5	\$ 1,951	\$2,371	\$	76,382	\$	92,825
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for estimated 1/3 of employees)         4,345         5,           Overtime Pay (if applicable)         0         0           Other Pay (if applicable)         0         0           Total Salary Costs         3.0         161,099         197,           FRINGE BENEFITS         3.0         161,099         197,           Variable         55,247         60,           Fixed         40,125         40,           Total Fringe Benefits         95,372         100,           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         140,000         140,           Materials & Supplies (5)         140,000         140,           Safety Equipment (6)         5,000         5,           Vehicle Maintenance (7)         1,000         1,           Total Capital & Operating         146,000         146,           ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST         402,472         444,           LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)         360,266         363,           Contract Monitoring         10,634         13,					2,395	•	-		93,764
Overtime Pay (if applicable)         0           Other Pay (if applicable)         0           Total Salary Costs         3.0         161,099         197,           FRINGE BENEFITS         3.0         161,099         197,           Variable         55,247         60,           Fixed         40,125         40,           Total Fringe Benefits         95,372         100,           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         140,000         140,           Materials & Supplies (5)         140,000         140,           Safety Equipment (6)         5,000         5,           Vehicle Maintenance (7)         1,000         1,           Total Capital & Operating         146,000         146,           ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST         402,472         444,           LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)         360,266         363,           Contract Monitoring         10,634         13,	Overtime pay during holidays (50% of hol	liday pay, a	applicable class	)			3,247		5,921
Other Pay (if applicable)         0           Total Salary Costs         3.0         161,099         197,           FRINGE BENEFITS         Variable         55,247         60,           Variable         55,247         60,           Fixed         40,125         40,           Total Fringe Benefits         95,372         100,           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         140,000         140,           Materials & Supplies (5)         140,000         140,           Safety Equipment (6)         5,000         5,           Vehicle Maintenance (7)         1,000         1,           Total Capital & Operating         146,000         146,           ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST         402,472         444,           LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)         360,266         363,           Contract Monitoring         10,634         13,	Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary for	or estimate	d 1/3 of employ	'ees)			4,345		5,281
Total Salary Costs         3.0         161,099         197,           FRINGE BENEFITS         Variable         55,247         60,         40,125         40,           Fixed         40,125         40,         95,372         100,         100,         100,         140,000         146,         140,000         146,         140,000         146,         140,2,472	Overtime Pay (if applicable)						0		0
FRINGE BENEFITS           Variable         55,247         60,           Fixed         40,125         40,           Total Fringe Benefits         95,372         100,           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         140,000         140,           Materials & Supplies (5)         140,000         140,           Safety Equipment (6)         5,000         5,           Vehicle Maintenance (7)         1,000         1,           Total Capital & Operating         146,000         146,           ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST         402,472         444,           LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)         360,266         363,           Contract Monitoring         10,634         13,	Other Pay (if applicable)						0		0
FRINGE BENEFITS         Variable       55,247       60,         Fixed       40,125       40,         Total Fringe Benefits       95,372       100,         ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)       140,000       140,         Materials & Supplies (5)       140,000       140,         Safety Equipment (6)       5,000       5,         Vehicle Maintenance (7)       1,000       1,         Total Capital & Operating       146,000       146,         ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST       402,472       444,         LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)       360,266       363,         Contract Monitoring       10,634       13,	Total Salary Costs		3.0				161,099		197,791
Variable         55,247         60,           Fixed         40,125         40,           Total Fringe Benefits         95,372         100,           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         140,000         140,           Materials & Supplies (5)         140,000         140,           Safety Equipment (6)         5,000         5,           Vehicle Maintenance (7)         1,000         1,           Total Capital & Operating         146,000         146,           ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST         402,472         444,           LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)         360,266         363,           Contract Monitoring         10,634         13,		-				•	· .		
Fixed         40,125         40, 95,372         40, 100,           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         95,372         100,           Materials & Supplies (5)         140,000         140,           Safety Equipment (6)         5,000         5,           Vehicle Maintenance (7)         1,000         1,           Total Capital & Operating         146,000         146,           ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST         402,472         444,           LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)         360,266         363,           Contract Monitoring         10,634         13,							55 947		60,156
Total Fringe Benefits         95,372         100,           ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         140,000         140,           Materials & Supplies (5)         140,000         140,           Safety Equipment (6)         5,000         5,           Vehicle Maintenance (7)         1,000         1,           Total Capital & Operating         146,000         146,           ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST         402,472         444,           LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)         360,266         363,           Contract Monitoring         10,634         13,				· .					40,125
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)         Materials & Supplies (5)         Safety Equipment (6)         Safety Equipment (6)         Vehicle Maintenance (7)         Total Capital & Operating         146,000     <									100,281
Materials & Supplies (5)       140,000       140,         Safety Equipment (6)       5,000       5,         Vehicle Maintenance (7)       1,000       1,         Total Capital & Operating       146,000       146,         ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST       402,472       444,         LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)       360,266       363,         Contract Monitoring       10,634       13,	rotal Fringe benefits						90,072		100,201
Materials & Supplies (5)       140,000       140,         Safety Equipment (6)       5,000       5,         Vehicle Maintenance (7)       1,000       1,         Total Capital & Operating       146,000       146,         ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST       402,472       444,         LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)       360,266       363,         Contract Monitoring       10,634       13,	ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable	)	-						•.
Vehicle Maintenance (7)         1,000         1,           Total Capital & Operating         146,000         146,           ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST         402,472         444,           LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)         360,266         363,           Contract Monitoring         10,634         13,							140,000		140,000
Total Capital & Operating         146,000         146,           ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST         402,472         444,           LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)         360,266         363,           Contract Monitoring         10,634         13,	Safety Equipment (6)						5,000		5,000
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST         402,472         444,           LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)         360,266         363,           Contract Monitoring         10,634         13,	Vehicle Maintenance (7)						1,000		1,000
LESS:         ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)         360,266         363,           Contract Monitoring         10,634         13,	Total Capital & Operating					<del></del>	146,000		146,000
LESS:         ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (8)         360,266         363,           Contract Monitoring         10,634         13,	ESTIMATED TOT AL CITY COST		•				102 172		444,072
Contract Monitoring 10,634 13,	ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST						402,472		444,072
•	LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRAC	T COST (8	) .				360,266		363,889
Total Contract Cost         370,900         377,	Contract Monitoring						10,634	<u> </u>	13,852
	Total Contract Cost			,			370,900		377,741
ESTIMATED SAVINGS \$ 31,572 \$ 66,	ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$	31,572	\$	66,331
% of Savings to City Cost 8%	% of Savings to City Cost					<u></u>			15%

### Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2007-08 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Materials and supplies would be the costs for the cleaning materials, glass, protective film for the glass, paint for railing, etc.

6. Safety equipment is personal protective gear for the workers.

7. Vehicle maintenance is the usual type of maintenance for City vehicles.

## SFMTA FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY TRANSIT SHELTER MAINTENANCE & ADVERTISING SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

## PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		T		·				
· ·		# of Full Time		•				
		Equivalent		•				
Job Class Title	Class	Positions_	Bi-Weel	dy Rate		Low		High
General Laborer	7514	1.5	\$ 1,951	\$2,371	\$	76,382	\$	92,825
Track Maintenance Worker	7540	1.5	1,970	2,395		77,126		93,764
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of ho	liday pay, a	pplicable class	)			3,247		5,921
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary f	or estimate	d 1/3 of employ	vees)			4,345		5,281
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						0		0
Other Pay (if applicable)	_			· ·		0		0
Total Salary Costs		3.0	r			161,099		197,791
FRINGE BENEFITS						50.000		
Variable						52,668		57,488
Fixed					<u> </u>	41,424		41,424
Total Fringe Benefits						94,092		98,912
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable	e)							
Materials & Supplies (5)	- /					140,000		140,000
Safety Equipment (6)						5,000		5,000
Vehicle Maintenance (7)						1,000		1,000
······································	•					•		· · · ·
Total Capital & Operating						146,000		146,000
				•				
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST						401,192		442,703
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRAC	CT COST (8	3				367,471		371,167
Contract Monitoring		<i>''</i>				10,624		13,824
Total Contract Cost						378,095		384,991
total contract cont					~	010,000		
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$	23,097	<b>\$</b> `	57,712
% of Savings to City Cost						6%		13%
· · · · ·								

# Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2007-08 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Materials and supplies would be the costs for the cleaning materials, glass, protective film for the glass, paint for railing, etc.

6. Safety equipment is personal protective gear for the workers.

7. Vehicle maintenance is the usual type of maintenance for City vehicles.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation Municipal Transportation Agency One South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

# Attention: Sonali Bose, Chief Financial Officer Municipal Transportation Agency

RE: Transit Shelter Maintenance and Advertising Contract - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for transit shelter maintenance and advertising services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben/Rosenfield,

cc: Severin Campbell, Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Martin Gran, Human Resources, Employee Relations Kate Howard, Mayor's Budget Office

# SFMTA FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY TRANSIT SHELTER MAINTENANCE & ADVERTISING SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

## **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

# PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		1	<u> </u>			·····	r	
		# of Full Time					l	
		Equivalent					[	1
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Week	dy Rate		Low		High
General Laborer	7514	1.5	\$ 1,951	\$2,371	\$	76,382	\$	92,825
Track Maintenan ce Worker	7540	1.5	1,970	2,395		77,126		93,764
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of ho	liday pay, a	pplicable class	)			3,247		5,921
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary f	or estimate	d 1/3 of employ	/ees)			4,345		5,281
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						0		0
Other Pay (if applicable)						0		0
Total Salary Costs		3.0		<u> </u>		161,099		197,791
FRINGE BENEFITS								
Variable				· .		55,247		60,156
Fixed						40,125		40,125
Total Fringe Benefits			•			95,372		100,281
	· · ·							
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable	e)					4 4 9 9 9 9		1 10 000
Materials & Supplies (5)				•		140,000		140,000
Safety Equipment (6)						5,000		5,000
Vehicle Maintenance (7)						1,000		1,000
Total Capital & Operating						146,000		146,000
termineter a spring								
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST						402,472		444,072
LEGO, FOTMATED TOTAL CONTRAC	TOODT					000 000		000.000
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRAC	1 COST (8	) .				360,266		363,889
Contract Monitoring						10,634		13,852
Total Contract Cost					·	370,900		377,741
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$	31,572	\$	66,331
% of Savings to City Cost					<u> </u>	8%		15%
to or darings to only cost						070		1070

### Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2007-08 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Materials and supplies would be the costs for the cleaning materials, glass, protective film for the glass, paint for railing, etc.

6. Safety equipment is personal protective gear for the workers.

7. Vehicle maintenance is the usual type of maintenance for City vehicles.

# SFMTA FINANCE & INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY TRANSIT SHELTER MAINTENANCE & ADVERTISING SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COOTS		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				··		
		# of Full Time						
		Equivalent						
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Week	ly Rate		Low		High
General Laborer	7514	1.5	\$ 1,951	\$2,371	\$	76,382	\$	92,825
Track Maintenance Worker	7540	1.5	1,970	2,395		77,126		93,764
Overtime pay during holidays (50% of ho	liday pay, a	pplicable class	}			3,247		5,921
Night / Shift Differential (8.5% of salary f	ior estimate	d 1/3 of employ	/ees)			4,345		5,281
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						0		0
Other Pay (if applicable)			-			. 0		0
Total Salary Costs		3.0	<u> </u>	···		161,099		197,791
FRINGE BENEFITS	•					ED 660		E7 400
Fixed						52,668 41,424		57,488
Total Fringe Benefits					·	94.092		<u>41,424</u> 98,912
rotari finge Denema						34,032		30,912
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable	e)							
Materials & Supplies (5)	,					140,000		140,000
Safety Equipment (6)						5,000		5,000
Vehicle Maintenance (7)						1,000		1,000
						-		
Total Capital & Operating		•			H	146,000		146,000
	•							
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST						401,192		442,703
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRAC	CT COST (8	3				367,471		371,167
Contract Monitoring		,				10,624		13,824
Total Contract Cost						378,095		384,991
					·			
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$	23,097	\$	57,712
% of Savings to City Cost					=	6%	,;	13%
,						• / •		

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 2007-08 was the first year these services were contracted out.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Materials and supplies would be the costs for the cleaning materials, glass, protective film for the glass, paint for railing, etc.

6. Safety equipment is personal protective gear for the workers.

7. Vehicle maintenance is the usual type of maintenance for City vehicles.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Monique Moyer Executive Director Port of San Francisco Pier 1, The Embarcadero San Francisco, CA 94111

Attention: Meghan Wallace, Budget Manager Port of San Francisco Pier 1, The Embarcadero San Francisco, CA 94111

RE: Security Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Port security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years (FY) 2012-13 and FY 2013-14 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield. Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

FAX 415-554-7466

100

### PORT OF SAN FRANCISCO EXECUTIVE DIVISION-HOMELAND SECURITY FOR SECURITY SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time Equivalent				
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Week	ty Rate	Low	High
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	1.0	\$ 3,411	\$4,355	\$ 89,027	\$ 113,666
Institutional Police Officer	8204	2.0	2,247	2,732	117,293	142,610
Security Guard	8202	8.0	1,588	2,342	331,574	489,010
Buildings & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	4.0	1,927	2,342	201,179	244,505
Night Shift & Overtime Differential					32,043	38,874
Overtime for Contingency/Fire Watch (7)					. 0	77,747
Holiday Pay		1	÷		18,195	22,069
Premium Pay		•			16,293	19,762
Total Salary Co	sts	15.0	L	·	805,605	1,148,242
FRINGE BENEFITS				•		
Variable Fringes (3)			· .		256,992	341,518
Fixed Fringes (4)					194,014	194,014
Total Fringe Bener	fits				451,006	535,532
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					1,256,611	1,683,774

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	

# % of Savings to City Cost

#### .

Comments/Assumptions:

1. Services have been contracted out since 1976.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2013. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

(706, 837)

549,774

44%

(708, 208)

975,566

58%

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. The estimated City cost does not include vehicles, equipment, materials and other supplies required to provide services. If included, these costs would even further increase the estimated savings to CCSF, as the external contract includes these costs.

6. The estimated contract cost for annual service is based upon the contract and includes 0.05 FTE for contract monitoring

7. Contingency/Fire watch equal up to 20% of total hours and is used for unanticipated security needs that require 24-hour fixed post presence due to unanticipated situations.

### PORT OF SAN FRANCISCO EXECUTIVE DIVISION-HOMELAND SECURITY FOR SECURITY SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

## **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

		# of Full Time Equivalent				
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	BI-Week	lv Rate	Low	High
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	1.0	\$ 3,565	\$4,551	\$ 93,047	\$ 118,781
Institutional Police Officer	8204	2.0	2,348	2,856	122,566	149,083
Security Guard	8202	8.0	1,659	2,447	346,399	510,934
Buildings & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	4.0	2,013	2,447	210,157	255,467
Night Shift & Overtime Differential					32,043	38,874
Overtime for Contingency/Fire Watch (7)					0	77,747
Holiday Pay					18,195	22,069
Premium Pay			-		 16,293	 19,762
Total Salary Costs		15.0			838,699	1,192,717
FRINGE BENEFITS		,				
Variable Fringes (3)					254,829	338,307
Fixed Fringes (4)					200,325	 200,325
Total Fringe Benefits					 455,154	538,632
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					 1,293,853	1,731,349
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT O	COST				 (754,314)	 (755,667)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 539,539	\$ 975,682
% of Savings to City Cost					 42%	 56%

### Comments/Assumptions:

1. Services have been contracted out since 1976.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2012. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. The estimated City cost does not include vehicles, equipment, materials and other supplies required to provide services. If included, these costs would even further increase the estimated savings to CCSF, as the external contract includes these costs.

6. The estimated contract cost for annual service is based upon the contract and includes 0.05 FTE for contract monitoring

7. Contingency/Fire watch equal up to 20% of total hours and is used for unanticipated security needs that require 24-hour fixed post presence due to unanticipated situations.



# **OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**

# Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Monique Moyer Executive Director Port of San Francisco Pier 1, The Embarcadero San Francisco, CA 94111

Attention: Meghan Wallace, Budget Manager Port of San Francisco Pier 1, The Embarcadero San Francisco, CA 94111

RE: Security Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Port security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years (FY) 2012-13 and FY 2013-14 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely.

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

### PORT OF SAN FRANCISCO EXECUTIVE DIVISION-HOMELAND SECURITY FOR SECURITY SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time Equivalent					
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weeki	v Rate		Low	High
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	1.0	\$ 3,411	\$4,355	\$	89,027	\$ 113,666
Institutional Police Officer	8204	2.0	2,247	2,732		117,293	142,610
Security Guard	8202	8.0	1,588	2,342		331,574	489,010
Buildings & Groun ds Patrol Officer	8207	4.0	1,927	2,342		201,179	24 <b>4</b> ,505
Night Shift & Overtime Differential						32,043	38,874
Overtime for Contingency/Fire Watch (7)						0	77,747
Holiday Pay			· ·			18,195	22,069
Premium Pay						16,293	19,762
Total Salary Costs		15.0	l			805,605	1,148,242
FRINGE BENEFITS							
Variable Fringes (3)						256.992	341,518
Fixed Fringes (4)						194,014	194,014
Total Fringe Benefits					·	451,006	 535,532
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST						1,256,611	 1,683,774
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT C	OST		•		• <del></del>	(706,837)	 (708,208)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$	549,774	\$ 975,566

## % of Savings to City Cost

### Comments/Assumptions:

1. Services have been contracted out since 1976.

2. Salary levels re-flect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2013. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

44%

58%

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. The estimated City cost does not include vehicles, equipment, materials and other supplies required to provide services. If included, these costs would even further increase the estimated savings to CCSF, as the external contract includes these costs.

6. The estimated contract cost for annual service is based upon the contract and includes 0.05 FTE for contract monitoring

7. Contingency/Fire watch equal up to 20% of total hours and is used for unanticipated security needs that require 24-hour fixed post presence due to unanticipated situations.

### PORT OF SAN FRANCISCO EXECUTIVE DIVISION-HOMELAND SECURITY FOR SECURITY SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FJSCAL YEAR 2015-16

### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

#### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

		# of Full Time Equivalent					
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	BI-Week	lv Rate	Low	ł	High
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	1.0	\$ 3,565	\$4,551	\$ 93,047	5	118,781
Institutional Police Officer	8204	2.0	2,348	2,856	122,566	5	149,083
Security Guard	8202	8.0	1,659	2,447	346,399	)	510,934
Buildings & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	4.0	2,013	2,447	210,157	•	255,467
Night Shift & Overtime Differential					32,043	L	38,874
Overtime for Contingency/Fire Watch (7)	)				(	)	77,747
Holiday Pay					18,195	5 ·	22,069
Premium Pay					16,293	<u>}</u> .	19,762
Total Salary Co	sts	15.0	<u> </u>		838,699		1,192,717
FRINGE BENEFITS							
Variable Fringes (3)					254,829	9	338,307
Fixed Fringes (4)					200,32	5	200,325
Total Fringe Bene	fits				455,15	4	538,632
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					1,293,85	3	1,731,349
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRAC	CT COST			•	(754,31	4)	(755,667)

ESTIMATED SAVINGS \$ 539,539 \$ % of Savings to City Cost 42%

### Comments/Assumptions:

1. Services have been contracted out since 1976.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2012. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

975,682

56%

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. The estimated City cost does not include vehicles, equipment, materials and other supplies required to provide services. If included, these costs would even further increase the estimated savings to CCSF, as the external contract includes these costs.

6. The estimated contract cost for annual service is based upon the contract and includes 0.05 FTE for contract monitoring

7. Contingency/Fire watch equal up to 20% of total hours and is used for unanticipated security needs that require 24-hour fixed post presence due to unanticipated situations.



# **OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Monique Moyer Executive Director Port of San Francisco Pier 1, The Embarcadero San Francisco, CA 94111

Attention: Meghan Wallace, Budget Manager Port of San Francisco Pier 1, The Embarcadero San Francisco, CA 94111

RE: Security Services – FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Port security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years (FY) 2012-13 and FY 2013-14 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

### PORT OF SAN FRANCISCO EXECUTIVE DIVISION-HOMELAND SECURITY FOR SECURITY SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		·····	_						
		# of Full Time	э						
· · · · ·		Equivalent							
Job Class Title	Class	Positions		Bi-Week	ly Rate		Low		High
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	1.0	)	\$ 3,411	\$4,355	\$	89,027	\$	113,666
Institutional Police Officer	8204	2.0	)	2,247	2,732		117,293		142,610
Security Guard	8202	8.0	)	1,588	2,342		331,574		489,010
Buildings & Groun ds Patrol Officer	8207	. 4.0	)	1,927	2,342		201,179		244,505
Night Shift & Overtime Differential							32,043		38,874
Overtime for Contingency/Fire Watch (7)							0		77,747
Holiday Pay							18,195		22,069
Premium Pay							16,293	_	19,762
Total Salary Costs		15.0	ภ				805,605		1,148,242
FRINGE BENEFITS									
Variable Fringes (3)							256,992		341,518
Fixed Fringes (4)							194,014		194,014
Total Fringe Benefits							451,006		535,532
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	•					<b>.</b>	1 256 644		1,683,774
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					•		1,256,611		1,003,774
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT C	OST						(706,837)		(708,208
ESTIMATED SAVINGS						\$	549,774	\$	975,566
% of Savings to City Cost							44%		58%

#### Comments/Assumptions:

1. Services have been contracted out since 1976.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2013. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and longterm disability, where applicable.

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. The estimated City cost does not include vehicles, equipment, materials and other supplies required to provide services. If included, these costs would even further increase the estimated savings to CCSF, as the external contract includes these costs.

6. The estimated contract cost for annual service is based upon the contract and includes 0.05 FTE for contract monitoring

7. Contingency/Fire watch equal up to 20% of total hours and is used for unanticipated security needs that require 24-hour fixed post presence due to unanticipated situations.

### PORT OF SAN FRANCISCO EXECUTIVE DIVISION-HOMELAND SECURITY FOR SECURITY SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

		# of Full Time						
		Equivalent						
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	BI-Week	ly Rate		Low		High
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	1.0	\$ 3,565	\$4,551	\$	93,047	\$	118,781
Institutional Police Officer	8204	2.0	2,348	2,856		122,566	•	149,083
Security Guard	8202	8.0	1,659	2,447		346,399		510,934
Buildings & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	4.0	2,013	2,447		210,157		255,467
Night Shift & Overtime Differential						32,043		38,874
Overtime for Contingency/Fire Watch (7)						0		77,747
Holiday Pay						18,195		22,069
Premium Pay			_			16,293		19,762
Total Salary Costs		15.0	L			838,699		1,192,717
FRINGE BENEFITS								
Variable Fringes (3)	•					254,829		338.307
Fixed Fringes (4)						200,325		200,325
Total Fringe Benefits						455,154		538,632
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		•				1,293,853		1,731,349
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST					(754,314)		(755,667
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					<u>\$</u>			975,682
% of Savings to City Cost	-					42%		56%

## Comments/Assumptions:

1. Services have been contracted out since 1976.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2012. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. The estimated City cost does not include vehicles, equipment, materials and other supplies required to provide services. If included, these costs would even further increase the estimated savings to CCSF, as the external contract includes these costs.

6. The estimated contract cost for annual service is based upon the contract and includes 0.05 FTE for contract monitoring

7. Contingency/Fire watch equal up to 20% of total hours and is used for unanticipated security needs that require 24-hour fixed post presence due to unanticipated situations.



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Monique Moyer Executive Director Port of San Francisco Pier 1, The Embarcadero San Francisco, CA 94111

Attention: Meghan Wallace, Budget Manager Port of San Francisco Pier 1, The Embarcadero San Francisco, CA 94111

RE: Janitorial Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Port janitorial services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years (FY) 2012-13 and FY 2013-14 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

415-554-7500

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

FAX 415-554-7466

### PORT, REAL ESTATE DIVISION JANITORIAL SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

# ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time Equivalent				
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekl	y Rate	Low	High
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,094	2,545	54,653	66,425
Custodian	2708	4.0	1,727	2,099	180,299	219,136
Porter	2736	1.0	1,727	2,099	45,075	54,784
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					8,885	10,799
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					7,926	9,633
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					-	
Other Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Total Salary Costs		6.0			296,839	360,777
FRINGE BENEFITS			· .		-	
Variable Fringes (3)					97,630	109,072
Fixed Fringes (4)					78,422	78,422
Total Fringe Benefits					176,052	187,494
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					472,891	548,271

 LESS:
 ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST
 (297,495)
 (300,105)

 ESTIMATED SAVINGS
 \$ 175,395
 \$ 248,166

 % of Savings to City Cost
 37%
 45%

### Comments/Assumptions:

1. Services have been contracted out since 1997.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Estimated City cost does not include vehicles, equipment, materials and other supplies required to provide services. If

6. The estimated contract cost for annual service is based upon the contract and includes 0.1 FTE for contract monitoring

#### PORT, REAL ESTATE DIVISION JANITORIAL SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

## PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time				
	0	Equivalent	D: 147 11		, i	1.11.1
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekl		Low	High
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,094	2,545	54,653	66,425
Custodian	2708	4.0	1,727	2,099	180,299	219,136
Porter	2736	1.0	1,727	2,099	45,075	54,784
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					8,885	10,799
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					7,926	9,633
Overtime Pay (if applicable)		•			· •	-
Other Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Total Salary Costs		6.0	]		296,839	360,777
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Variable Fringes (3)					94,674	112,742
Fixed Fringes (4)				·	80,935	80,935
Total Fringe Benefits					175,609	193,677
					•	
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					472,448	554,454
LEAD FOTHERTED TOTAL CONTRACT	OCT				(205 000)	(202.400)
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT O	.031				(305,892)	(308,466)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 166,556	\$ 245,987
% of Savings to City Cost					35%	44%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. Services have been contracted out since 1997.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Estimated City cost does not include vehicles, equipment, materials and other supplies required to provide services. If



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Monique Moyer Executive Director Port of San Francisco Pier 1, The Embarcadero San Francisco, CA 94111

Attention: Meghan Wallace, Budget Manager Port of San Francisco Pier 1, The Embarcadero San Francisco, CA 94111

RE: Janitorial Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Port janitorial services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years (FY) 2012-13 and FY 2013-14 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

FAX 415-554-7466

#### PORT, REAL ESTATE DIVISION JANITORIAL SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

# ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time Equivalent			·	
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekl	v Rate	Low	High
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,094	2,545	54,653	66,425
Custodian	2708	4.0	1,727	2,099	180,299	219,136
Porter	2736	1.0	1,727	2,09 <del>9</del>	45,075	54,784
Holiday Pay (if app licable)					8,885	10,799
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					7,926	9,633
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					-	· -
Other Pay (if applicable)					-	
Total Salary Costs	L	6.0			296,839	360,777
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Variable Fringes (3)			•		97,630	109,072
Fixed Fringes (4)					78,422	78,422
Total Fringe Benefits					176,052	187,494
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		, ·	,		472,891	548,271
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT O	OST				(297,495)	(300,105)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 175,395	\$ 248,166
% of Savings to City Cost					37%	45%

#### Comments/Assumptions:

1. Services have been contracted out since 1997.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-

4. Fixed fringe ben efits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Estimated City cost does not include vehicles, equipment, materials and other supplies required to provide services. If

#### PORT, REAL ESTATE DIVISION JANITORIAL SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

## PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time				1		
-		Equivalent						
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekh	Rate		Low	High	
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,094	2,545		54,653	66,	425
Custodian	2708	4.0	1,727	2,099		180,299	219,	136
Porter	2736	1,0	1,727	2,09 <b>9</b>		45,075	54,	784
Holiday Pay (if applicable)						8,885	10,	799
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)						7,926	9,	633
Overtime Pay (if applicable)		•				-		-
Other Pay (if applicable)						-		-
Total Salary Costs		6.0				296,839	360,	777
							۰.	
FRINGE BENEFITS Variable Fringes (3)	-					94,674	112,	710
Fixed Fringes (4)						80,935		935
Total Fringe Benefits						175,609	193.	and the second second
Total Thinge Denents					•	173,009	. 193,	011
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					<u> </u>	472,448	554	454
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST	. •				(305,892)	(308,	,466)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$	166,556	\$ 245,	,987
% of Savings to City Cost	L .					35%		44%

# Comments/Assumptions:

1. Services have been contracted out since 1997.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

Estimated City cost does not include vehicles, equipment, materials and other supplies required to provide services. If



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Monique Moyer Executive Director Port of San Francisco Pier 1, The Embarcadero San Francisco, CA 94111

Attention: Meghan Wallace, Budget Manager Port of San Francisco Pier 1, The Embarcadero San Francisco, CA 94111

RE: Janitorial Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Port janitorial services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years (FY) 2012-13 and FY 2013-14 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield.

Controller Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

## PORT, REAL ESTATE DIVISION JANITORIAL SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time Equivalent	-			
Job Class Title	Class	_Positions	Bi-Weekl	y Rate	Low	High
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,094	2,545	54,653	66,425
Custodian	2708	4.0	1,727	2,099	180,299	219,136
Porter	2736	1.0	1,727	2,099	45,075	54,784
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					8,885	10,799
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					7,926	9,633
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					. <u>-</u>	-
Other Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Total Salary Costs		6,0	<u> </u>		296,839	360,777
FRINGE BENEFITS			· .			
Variable Fringes (3)					97,630	109,072
Fixed Fringes (4)					78,422	78,422
Total Fringe Benefits					176,052	187,494

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	 (297,495)	(300,105)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 175,395 \$	248,166
% of Savings to City Cost	 37%	45%

472,891

548.271

#### Comments/Assumptions:

1. Services have been contracted out since 1997.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014

3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-

4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Estimated City cost does not include vehicles, equipment, materials and other supplies required to provide services. If

## PORT, REAL ESTATE DIVISION JANITORIAL SERVICES COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

# ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time				- T	
		Equívalent					
Job Class Title	Class	<ul> <li>Positions</li> </ul>	Bi-Weekl	y Rate	Lov	N	High
Custodial Supervisor	2718	1.0	2,094	2,545	5	4,653	66,425
Custodian	2708	4.0	1,727	2,099	18	0,299	219,136
Porter	2736	1.0	1,727	2,09 <b>9</b>	4	5,075	54,784
Holiday Pay (if applicable)						8,885	10,799
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)						7,926	9,633
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	,					-	-
Other Pay (if applicable)							-
Total Salary Costs		6.0	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		29	6,839	360,777
FRINGE BENEFITS							,
Variable Fringes (3)			-		ç	4,674	112,742
Fixed Fringes (4)					8	30,935	80,935
Total Fringe Benefits					17	75,609	193,677
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST			•			72,448	554,454
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT C	OST				(30	05,892)	(308,466)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					<b>\$</b> 16	56,556	\$ 245,987
% of Savings to City Cost		÷				35%	44%
							-

Comments/Assumptions:

1. Services have been contracted out since 1997.

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2014. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

5. Estimated City cost does not include vehicles, equipment, materials and other supplies required to provide services. If



**OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER** 

# Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Todd Rydstrom, AGM Business Services & CFO San Francisco Public Utilities Commission 525 Golden Gate Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Carlos Jacobo, Budget Director San Francisco Public Utilities Commission 525 Golden Gate Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102

RE: Security Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Public Utilities Commission security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years (FY) 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

## Wastewater Enter prise Security Services COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

		# of Full Time Equivalent				
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekly Rat	<b>∋</b> [·	Low	High
Institutional Police Officer (Full-time)	8204	1.0	\$ 2,247 \$2,7	32 \$	58,647	\$ 71,305
Institutional Police Officer (As-needed)	8204	0.5	2,247 2,7	32	29,323	35,653
Institutional Police Officer (Full-time)	8204	2.0	\$ 2,247 \$2,7	32	117,293	142,610
Institutional Police Officer (As-needed)	8204	0.5	2,247 2,7	32	29,323	35,653
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	N/A		·		0	0
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	•				6,640	8,073
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					0	0
Other Pay (if applicable) Total Salary Costs		4.0		<b></b>	241,227	293,294
		4.0		<u> </u>	241,221	293,294
FRINGE BENEFITS						
Variable Fringes (3)					74,012	89,987
Fixed Fringes (4)	• •				51,584	51,584
Total Fringe Benefits					125,596	141,571
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					366,823	434,865
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST			·	(153,347)	(153,446)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS				\$	213,476	\$ 281,419
% of Savings to City Cost					58%	65%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. Salary levels reflect Classification, Compensation and Collective Bargaining Agreements for 8204 Institutional Police Officer Effective March 29, 2014 to July 1, 2014.

2. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

Wastewater Enterprise Security Services COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

# ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

	01	# of Full Time Equivalent			
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate	Low	High
Institutional Police Officer (Full-time)	8204	1.0	\$ 2,247 \$2,732		
Institutional Police Officer (As-needed)	8204	0.5	2,247 2,732	29,323	35,653
Institutional Police Officer (Full-time)	8204	2.0	\$ 2,247 \$2,732	117,293	142,610
Institutional Police Officer (As-needed)	8204	0.5	2,247 2,732	29,323	35,653
		•		· .	
			• •		
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	N/A			0	0
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)				6,640	8,073
Overtime Pay (if applicable)				. 0	0
Other Pay (if applicable)			-	0	. 0
Total Salary Costs		4.0	L	241,227	293,294
FRINGE BENEFITS					
Variable Fringes (3)		•		69,930	85,024
Fixed Fringes (4)				53,228	53,228
Total Fringe Benefits			· ·	123,158	138,252
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST				364,385	431,546
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST			(153,347)	(153,446)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	۰,	• .		\$ 211,038	\$ 278,100
% of Savings to City Cost			· ·	58%	64%

#### Comments/Assumptions:

1. Salary levels reflect Classification, Compensation and Collective Bargaining Agreements for 8204 Institutional Police Officer Effective March 29, 2014 to July 1, 2014.

2. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

April 29, 2014

Todd Rydstrom, AGM Business Services & CFO San Francisco Public Utilities Commission 525 Golden Gate Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Carlos Jacobo, Budget Director San Francisco Public Utilities Commission 525 Golden Gate Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102

#### RE: Security Services - FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Public Utilities Commission security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years (FY) 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

City Hall • 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place • Room 316 • San Francisco CA 94102-4694

FAX 415-554-7466

Wastewater Enterprise Security Services COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time						
		Equivalent						
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Week	ly Rate	1 ·	Low		High
Institutional Police Officer (Full-time)	8204	1.0	\$ 2,247	\$2,732	\$	58,647	\$	71,305
Institutional Police Officer (As-needed)	8204	0.5	2,247	2,732		29,323		35,653
Institutional Police Officer (Full-time)	8204	2.0	\$ 2,247	\$2,732	-	117,293		142,610
Institutional Police Officer (As-needed)	8204	0.5	2,247	2,732		29,323		35,653
		•						
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	N/A					0		0
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)						6,640		8,073
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						0		0
Other Pay (if applicable)	•		1		<b></b>	0		. 0
Total Salary Costs		4,0	L			241,227	L	293,294
FRINGE BENEFITS								
Variable Fringes (3)						74,012		89,987
Fixed Fringes (4)						51,584		51,584
Total Fringe Benefits						125,596		141,571
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST						366,823		434,865
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST					(153,347)		(153,446
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$	213,476	\$	281,419
% of Savings to City Cost						58%		65%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. Salary levels reflect Classification, Compensation and Collective Bargaining Agreements for 8204 Institutional Police Officer Effective March 29, 2014 to July 1, 2014.

2. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

## Wastewater Enterprise Security Services COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

		# of Full Time Equivalent					
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate	L	Low		High
Institutional Police Officer (Full-time)	8204	1.0	\$ 2,247 \$2,732	\$	58,647	\$	71,305
Institutional Police Officer (As-needed)	8204	0.5	2,247 2,732		29,323		35,653
Institutional Police Officer (Full-time)	8204	2.0	\$ 2,247 \$2,732	•	117,293		142,610
Institutional Police Officer (As-needed)	8204	0.5	2,247 2,732		.29,323		35,653
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	N/A				0		0
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	IN/A				6,640		8,073
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					0,0-0		0,073
Other Pay (if applicable)					0 0		0
Total Salary Costs	J	4.0	1		241,227		293,294
FRINGE BENEFITS							
Variable Fringes (3)	•				69,930		85,024
Fixed Fringes (4)					53,228		53,228
Total Fringe Benefits		•			123,158		138,252
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		,			364,385		431,546
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST				(153,347)	)	(153,446)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS				\$	211,038	\$	278,100
% of Savings to City Cost					58%	, ,	64%

Comments/Assumptions;

1. Salary levels reflect Classification, Compensation and Collective Bargaining Agreements for 8204 Institutional Police Officer Effective March 29, 2014 to July 1, 2014.

2. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

ŝ



# **OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER**

# Ben Rosenfield Controller

Monique Zmuda Deputy Controller

#### April 29, 2014

Todd Rydstrom, AGM Business Services & CFO San Francisco Public Utilities Commission 525 Golden Gate Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention: Carlos Jacobo, Budget Director San Francisco Public Utilities Commission 525 Golden Gate Avenue San Francisco, CA 94102

#### RE: Security Services – FY 2014-15 and FY 2015-16

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Public Utilities Commission security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco" have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years (FY) 2014-15 and FY 2015-16 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Your department does not need to take further action for Board of Supervisors' approval because this determination will become part of the FY 2014-15 budget approval process. Following that legislative approval, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-6626 if you have any guestions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst Human Resources, Employee Relations

## Wastewater Enterprise Security Services COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2014-15

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time			
		Equivalent			
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate	Low	High
Institutional Police Officer (Full-time)	8204	1.0	\$ 2,247 \$2,732	\$ 58,647	\$ 71,305
Institutional Police Officer (As-needed)	8204	0.5	2,247 2,732	29,323	35,653
Institutional Police Officer (Full-time)	8204	2.0	\$ 2,247 \$2,732	117,293	142,610
Institutional Police Officer (As-needed)	8204	0.5	2,247 2,732	29,323	35,653
				. •	
		а 			
				•	-
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	N/A			0	0
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	•	•		6,640	8,073
Overtime Pay (if applicable)				0	0
Other Pay (if applicable)	ŀ		1	0	0
Total Salary Costs		4.0	·	241,227	293,294
FRINGE BENEFITS					·
Variable Fringes (3)			· ·	74,012	89,987
Fixed Fringes (4)				51,584	51,584
Total Fringe Benefits		· · · ·	•	125,596	141,571
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST				366,823	434,865
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST			(153,347)	(153,446)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS				<u>\$ 213,476</u>	\$281,419
% of Savings to City Cost				58%	65%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. Salary levels reflect Classification, Compensation and Collective Bargaining Agreements for 8204 Institutional Police Officer Effective March 29, 2014 to July 1, 2014.

2. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

Wastewater Enterprise Security Services COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2) FISCAL YEAR 2015-16

#### ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

					·				
	ĺ		# of Full Time						
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		Equivalent			1			
Job Class Title		Class	Positions	Bi-Weel	ly Rate		Low		High
Institutional Police O	fficer (Full-time)	8204	1.0	\$ 2,247	\$2,732	\$	58,647	\$	71,305
Institutional Police O	fficer (As-needed)	8204	0.5	2,247	2,732		29,323		35,653
Institutional Police O	fficer (Full-time)	8204	,2.0	\$ 2,247	\$2,732	-	117,293		142,610
Institutional Police O	fficer (As-needed)	8204	0.5	2,247	2,732		29,323		35,653
			. •						
									,
									•
Holiday Pay (if appli	cable)	N/A					0		0
Night / Shift Differen	tial (if applicable)						6,640		8,073
Overtime Pay (if app	licable)						0		0
Other Pay (if applica				_			0		0
	Total Salary Costs	·	4.0				241,227	<u> </u>	293,294
FRINGE BENEFITS							•		
Variable Fringes (3)	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·						69,930		85,024
Fixed Fringes (4)							53,228		53,228
	Total Fringe Benefits				•		123,158		138,252
ESTIMATED TOTAL							364,385		431,546
LESS: ESTIMATED	TOTAL CONTRACT	COST					(153,347)	1	(153,446
ESTIMATED SAVIN	IGS	•				\$	211,038	\$	278,100
% of	Savings to City Cost						58%	)	64%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. Salary levels reflect Classification, Compensation and Collective Bargaining Agreements for 8204 Institutional Police Officer Effective March 29, 2014 to July 1, 2014.

2. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.

OFFICE OF THI SAN FRANCIS	黒い 黒喉喉喉(細)
TO:	Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors
FROM: FO	L Mayor Edwin M. Lee St
RE:	Proposition J Contract/Certification of Specified Contracted-Out Services Previously Approved
DATE:	May 1, 2014

COUNT

Attached for introduction to the Board of Supervisors is the resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that services previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services: information booths, security, parking operations, and shuttle bus (Airport); citations processing, towing, paratransit, parking meter, security, and transit shelter (MTA); security and janitorial (Port); security (PUC).

I request that this item be calendared in Budget and Finance Committee.

Should you have any questions, please contact Jason Elliott (415) 554-5105.

1 DR. CARLTON B. GOODLETT PLACE, ROOM 200 SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94102-4681 TELEPHONE**1(2)356** 554-6141

140487