#### BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall
Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. 554-5184
Fax No. 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

### MEMORANDUM

# NEIGHBORHOOD SERVICES & SAFETY COMMITTEE SAN FRANCISCO BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

TO: Supervisor David Campos, Chair

Neighborhood Services & Safety Committee

FROM: Derek Evans, Assistant Committee Clerk

DATE: October 24, 2014

SUBJECT: COMMITTEE REPORT, BOARD MEETING

Tuesday, October 28, 2014

The following file should be presented as a **COMMITTEE REPORT** at the Board meeting, Tuesday, October 28, 2014. This item was acted upon at the Neighborhood Service and Safety Committee Special Meeting on Thursday, October 23, 2014, at 1:00 p.m., by the votes indicated.

#### Item No. 1 File No. 141002

Ordinance amending the Police Code to repeal the prohibition on entering or remaining within a 25-foot buffer zone of a reproductive health care facility; to prohibit individuals from following or harassing others within 25 feet of the entrance to such a facility; to prohibit impeding access to the door of such a facility; and to prohibit excessive noise through yelling or amplification of sound within 50 feet of such a facility.

#### AMENDED, AN AMENDMENT OF THE WHOLE BEARING SAME TITLE

Vote: Supervisor David Campos - Aye

Supervisor Eric Mar - Aye Supervisor Norman Yee - Aye

#### RECOMMENDED AS AMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT

Vote: Supervisor David Campos - Aye

Supervisor Eric Mar - Aye Supervisor Norman Yee - Aye

Cc: Board of Supervisors

Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board Rick Caldeira, Legislative Deputy Jon Givner, Deputy City Attorney

## AMENDMENT OF WHOLE IN COMMITTEE 10/23/14

Ordinance amending the Police Code to repeal the prohibition on entering or remaining

within a 25-foot buffer zone of a reproductive health care facility; to prohibit individuals

from following or harassing others within 25 feet of the entrance to such a facility; to

FILE NO. 141002

ORDINANCE NO.

[Police Code - Access to Reproductive Health Care Facilities]

5 6 7

1

2

3

4

8

9

10

11

1213

14

15 16

1718

1920

2122

2324

25

prohibit impeding access to the door of such a facility; and to prohibit excessive noise through yelling or amplification of sound within 50 feet of such a facility.

NOTE: Unchanged Code text and uncodified text are in plain Arial font.

Additions to Codes are in single-underline italics Times New Roman font.

Unchanged Code text and uncodified text are in plain Arial font.
Additions to Codes are in <u>single-underline italics Times New Roman font</u>.
Deletions to Codes are in <u>strikethrough italics Times New Roman font</u>.
Board amendment additions are in <u>double-underlined Arial font</u>.
Board amendment deletions are in <u>strikethrough Arial font</u>.
Asterisks (\* \* \* \*) indicate the omission of unchanged Code subsections or parts of tables.

Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:

Section 1. The Police Code is hereby amended by revising Article 43, Sections 4301, 4302, 4303, 4304, and 4306, to read as follows:

ARTICLE 43: ACCESS TO REPRODUCTIVE HEALTH CARE FACILITIES. SEC. 4301. FINDINGS.

Every person in the City and County of San Francisco ("City") has a fundamental right to privacy protected not only by the United States Constitution, but also explicitly guaranteed in Article I, Section 1 of the California Constitution. This right to privacy includes the right to access all legal health care services, including reproductive health care services.

Maintaining access to reproductive health care services is a matter of critical importance not only to individuals, but also to the health, safety, and welfare of all residents of the City. Efforts to harass, obstruct, or otherwise interfere with individuals seeking

reproductive health care services may deter, delay, and even prevent individuals from obtaining necessary reproductive health care services. These efforts, which often include forcing patients to run a gauntlet of demonstrators near the entrances, exits, and driveways of reproductive health care facilities, or to confront intimidating demonstrators stationed at or near those entrances, exits, and driveways, also disrupt the ability of staff at reproductive health care facilities to devote their full efforts to providing health care services and divert valuable facility resources away from patients. *Pedestrians, including patients and employees* seeking to receive or provide health care, are often blocked or slowed on sidewalks adjacent to reproductive health care facilities by numerous signs lined up in the public right of way, and patients in facility waiting rooms are subjected to loud music and shouting directed inside the facility by demonstrators outside the door. These factors, including difficulty entering and exiting the facility as well as loud noise once inside the facility, can lead to increased patient stress that may affect the efficacy and complication rate of the medical care sought within. Actions that result in such obstruction, delay, and deterrence of patients, and diversion of reproductive health care facilities' staff and resources, undermine the City's interest in maintaining the public health. safety, and welfare, and in preserving its residents' constitutional right to privacy.

Standing on equal footing with the right to access health care services, including reproductive health care services, are the free speech and assembly rights of those who would gather and *raise their voices speak* on matters of public concern. Under this Article, the Board of Supervisors previously attempted to balance these rights by prohibiting harassment, within 100 feet of an exterior wall of a health care facility, of individuals entering, exiting, or seeking services at a health care facility, with harassment defined as "knowingly approach[ing] another person within eight feet of such person, unless such other person consents, for the purpose of passing a leaflet or handbill to, displaying a sign to, or engaging in oral protest, education, or counseling with such other person." *That-After that* prohibition *heav* 

proven proved ineffective:, the Article was amended to create a "buffer zone" that prohibited individuals from remaining within 25 feet of a reproductive health care facility, with certain exceptions. The "buffer zone" was helpful in preventing—Due to the density and space constraints of the City's urban landscape, that prohibition has not adequately prevented harassment, delay, and deterrence of patients seeking vital health care services, and in particular reproductive health care services, nor and adequately prevented distraction and diversion of health care providers from their core mission of providing services in a safe and supportive environment. But in the wake of the United States Supreme Court decision in McCullen v. Coakley (2014) 573 U.S. the validity of such buffer zones has been called into question. In light of the McCullen decision, with the enactment of Ordinance No. , this Article is again amended to balance the right to speak and engage in sidewalk counseling near reproductive health care clinics with the right to access constitutionally protected health care without fear of physical harm, harassment, or delay.

The Board of Supervisors hereby finds that the creation of a buffer zone, as defined in Police Code Section 4302 as amended by Ordinance No. 88-13, and a prohibition on entering or remaining in that buffer zone as specified in Police Code Section 4303 as amended by Ordinance No. 88-13, with certain exceptions, Article 43 is necessary to promote the full exercise of the right to privacy by patients seeking vital reproductive health care services and is also necessary to maintain public health, safety, and welfare within the City. The Board of Supervisors further finds that this Article strikes a lawful and appropriate accommodation between the right to privacy and to access reproductive health care services and the needs of public health, safety, and welfare, on the one hand, and the rights of free speech and association assembly, on the other.

Article 43, as amended by Ordinance No. 88-13, applies only to reproductive health care facilities, no<u>t</u> health care facilities generally. In addition, Article 43, as amended, Ordinance No. 88-13, does not apply to licensed hospitals or to reproductive health care facilities owned or

operated by licensed hospitals. This scope ensures the Article is narrowly tailored to address the significant governmental interests it serves, and leaves other health care facilities and locations available for speech. Individuals attempting to access reproductive health care facilities to obtain reproductive health care services have been subjected to harassing or intimidating activity from extremely close proximity, tending to hamper, delay or deter their access to those facilities and services and thus subverting their legal rights to seek and obtain legal health care services. The Board finds that reproductive health care facilities that are not part of a licensed hospital, and not owned or operated by a licensed hospital, are more vulnerable to such subversion of their patients' rights on account of the layout and design of their facilities and parking areas as well as their staff resources and deployment. Further, reproductive health care facilities not affiliated with hospitals commonly possess fewer resources for providing adequate security and safety to individuals seeking access to reproductive health care services. Thus<sub>Ta</sub> Article 43<sub>T</sub> as amended by Ordinance No. 88-13 imposes provides narrowly tailored, content-neutral restrictions where they are most necessary to further the significant government interests the Article serves.

The Board finds that the modest scope of the buffer zone prohibition on following and harassing individuals, impeding access, and making excessive noise in close proximity to reproductive health care facilities is necessary is sufficient to ensure that patients may gain safe and unimpeded access to reproductive health care services, while allowing speakers to effectively communicate their messages to their intended audience. This prohibition applies equally to all, regardless of the content of their speech.

The Board further finds that <u>intimidating behavior</u>, <u>including excessively loud demonstration</u>

<u>activity</u>, <u>as well as following and harassing patients</u>, <u>staff</u>, <u>and other individuals</u> <u>-obstructions and</u>

<u>demonstrations</u> around the entrances, exits and driveways of reproductive health care facilities can impede pedestrian and vehicle traffic and create safety hazards on the sidewalks and

roadways, and that this buffer zone the limitations this Article imposes on aggressive and intimidating behavior will help promote safe and effective pedestrian and vehicle traffic flow around reproductive health care facilities. In addition, the buffer zone will reduce disputes and confrontations requiring law enforcement services, and will protect property rights.

The Board further finds that <u>loud</u>, harassing, and intimidating activities<u>independent of</u> the content of those activities—conducted around the entrances, exits and driveways of reproductive health care facilities can adversely affect the physical and emotional health and well-being of patients seeking services at a reproductive health care facility. <u>Noise control is</u> particularly important around medical facilities during surgery and recovery periods. As has been noted by the Supreme Court, noise produced by protesters that can be heard within a clinic, may cause stress in the patients; this includes loud, disruptive noise heard during patient intake, surgical procedures and while recuperating in the recovery rooms. The Board finds that this buffer zone Article will provide a protective space for patients and thereby help avoid those adverse health consequences.

The Board finds that this Article imposes content-neutral time, place, and manner restrictions on speech and *association* assembly, which are narrowly tailored to serve significant government interests and leave ample alternative channels of communication.

This Article is not intended to create any limited, designated or general public fora.

Rather it is intended to protect those who seek access to reproductive health care from conduct that violates their rights.

#### SEC. 4302. DEFINITIONS.

For purposes of this Article:

"Buffer zone" refers to the area encompassed by both of the following:

— (1) the area on a public way or sidewalk encompassed by a radius of 25 feet from any portion of an entrance, exit, or driveway of a reproductive health care facility; and

evasive action to avoid physical contact and/or ( $b\underline{2}$ ) placing signs on the sidewalk such that the flow of pedestrian traffic is restricted. This subsection ( $b\underline{e}$ ) shall not prohibit individuals from holding or wearing signs while using the sidewalk; or

(6f) Using violent or threatening gestures toward a person.

"Impede" means to obstruct, block, detain, or render passage impossible, unsafe, or difficult.

"Law Enforcement Official" means a member of a law enforcement agency, including but not limited to a member of a municipal, metropolitan or state police department, sheriffs, or deputy sheriffs.

"Person" refers to any individual, firm, partnership, joint venture, company, corporation, association, social club, fraternal organization, estate, trust, business trust, receiver, trustee, syndicate, or any other group or combination acting as a unit except the United States of America, the State of California, and any political subdivision of either.

"Public Safety Official" means a member of a law enforcement agency, fire department, or other state, federal, or municipal employee charged with protection of public health or safety.

"Reproductive health care facility" refers to a clinic licensed under Chapter 1 (commencing with Section 1200) of Division 2 of the *California* Health and Safety Code, or any other facility or business that provides reproductive health care services, exclusively or in addition to other health care services. Reproductive health care facility does not include a licensed hospital or a clinic or other facility owned or operated by a licensed hospital.

"Reproductive health care services" refers to all medical, surgical, counseling, referral, and informational services related to the human reproductive system.

"Shout" refers to any audible activity not electronically amplified originating from an individual that is beyond that of a conversational speaking voice, including vocalizations that are audible from more than 15 feet away, as well as vocalizations intended to carry from the street or public sidewalk to the inside of a reproductive health care facility.

— (1) Individuals entering or exiting the reproductive health care facility. This exemption allows individuals to enter and pass through the buffer zone only while entering or exiting the reproductive health care facility, and does not permit those individuals to stop or remain in the buffer zone for any purpose, including but not limited to demonstration activity, or to engage in demonstration activity while entering or exiting the reproductive health care facility.

— (2) Employees, agents, or volunteers of the reproductive health care facility, acting within the scope of their employment, agency, or volunteer service. This exemption does not allow these employees, agents or volunteers to engage in demonstration activity within the buffer zone, even if that demonstration activity is within the scope of their employment, agency, or volunteer service.

(3) Law enforcement, emergency medical, firefighting, construction, and utilities personnel and federal, state, and municipal employees, acting within the scope of their employment. This exemption does not allow these individuals to engage in demonstration activity within the buffer zone.

— (4)—Individuals passing temporarily through the buffer zone to reach a destination within or on the other side of the buffer zone. This exemption applies to individuals who enter or pass through the buffer zone, without stopping, either to enter a residence or a business within the buffer zone other than the reproductive health care facility or to reach a destination on the other side of the buffer zone. This exemption does not allow these individuals to engage in demonstration activity while within or passing through the buffer zone. If an individual not subject to the exemptions in subsection (b)(1), (2), or (3) passes through the buffer zone five or more times in an hour, such activity will constitute prima facie evidence that the individual has violated Section 4303(a). The individual may rebut that presumption by presenting evidence that he or she has a legitimate personal or business, non-demonstration activity purpose for passing through the buffer zone.

 $\underline{(b)}$  (c) **Business Hours**. Section 4303(a) applies  $\underline{only}$  during a reproductive health care facility's posted business hours  $\underline{and\ up\ to\ one\ hour\ before\ the\ posted\ business\ hours}$ .

(c) (d) Marking and Written Notice. Section 4303 applies only if the buffer zone is marked by the Department of Public Works ("DPW") and a notice prepared by DPW is posted conspicuously near the buffer zone. A reproductive health care facility that wants its buffer zone marked and a notice posted shall submit a written request to the Department of Public Works ("DPW"). DPW shall measure and mark the buffer zone within 14 calendar days of the request. The DPW Director or designee shall prepare signs to provide to reproductive health care facilities, upon request, for posting. The signs shall provide notice regarding the prohibitions under this Article. The DPW Director or designee may adopt rules and regulations after a public hearing to set standards for marking and posting a notice at a buffer zone-reproductive health care facility, as specified in Section 4303(a).

(d)(e) Other Laws. Nothing in this Article shall preclude the enforcement of other state, federal, or municipal laws inside or outside of the <u>25-foot boundary buffer zone</u>, including but not limited to those related to sidewalk obstruction, <u>aggressive pursuit</u>, <u>or excessive noise</u>.

#### SEC. 4304. ENFORCEMENT.

- (a) Criminal Enforcement. Any person who violates Section 4303 of this Article shall be guilty of a misdemeanor, and upon conviction thereof shall be punished by incarceration in the County Jail, fine, or both. Upon a first conviction for violation of Section 4303, the person shall be incarcerated in the County Jail for up to three months, or fined up to \$500, or both. Upon a subsequent conviction for violation of Section 4303, the person shall be incarcerated in the County Jail for up to six months, or fined up to \$1000, or both.
- (b) Civil Enforcement. An aggrieved person may enforce the provisions of this Article by means of a civil action. An aggrieved person includes any reproductive health care facility whose buffer zone is that is the site of a violation of this Article. Any person who violates any of the provisions of this Article or who aids in the violation of this Article shall be liable to the aggrieved person for special and general damages, but in no case less than \$1000 plus

attorneys' fees and the costs of the action. In addition, punitive damages may be awarded in a proper case.

(c) Dispersal Order. A law enforcement official may order the immediate dispersal of a gathering that continues to violate section 4303 after a written warning. A dispersal order issued pursuant to this section shall include the following statements: (1) the gathering has substantially impeded access to or departure from the reproductive health care facility; (2) each member of the gathering shall, under the penalty of arrest and prosecution, immediately disperse and cease to stand or be located within at least 25 feet of an entrance or a driveway to the reproductive health care facility; and (3) the order shall remain in place for eight hours or until the close of business of the reproductive health facility, whichever is earlier. This subsection (c) shall apply during the business hours of a reproductive health care facility and up to one hour before the posted business hours.

(e) (d) Other Enforcement. Nothing in this Article shall preclude any person from seeking any other remedies, penalties or procedures provided by law.

#### SEC. 4306. ARTICLE ACCOMMODATES COMPETING RIGHTS.

In adopting this *legislation Article*, the Board of Supervisors recognizes both the fundamental constitutional right to assemble peaceably and to demonstrate on matters of public concern, as well as the right to seek and obtain health care. This legislation promotes the full exercise of these rights and strikes an appropriate accommodation between them.

It is not the intention of the Board of Supervisors to interfere with the right to protest, including the right to protest conditions of employment, *outside of the previously defined buffer zone*. Rather it is the intention of the Board of Supervisors to impose reasonable time, place and manner restrictions on all protests, to protect the right to seek and obtain health care. This *ordinance* Article does not prohibit conduct by a party to a labor dispute in furtherance of labor or management objectives in that dispute.

6

11 12

13 14

15

16

17 18

19

20 21

22

23

24

25

Section 2. Effective Date. This ordinance shall become effective 30 days after enactment. Enactment occurs when the Mayor signs the ordinance, the Mayor returns the ordinance unsigned or does not sign the ordinance within ten days of receiving it, or the Board of Supervisors overrides the Mayor's veto of the ordinance.

Section 3. Scope of Ordinance. In enacting this ordinance, the Board of Supervisors intends to amend only those words, phrases, paragraphs, subsections, sections, articles, numbers, punctuation marks, charts, diagrams, or any other constituent parts of the Municipal Code that are explicitly shown in this ordinance as additions, deletions, Board amendment additions, and Board amendment deletions in accordance with the "Note" that appears under the official title of the ordinance.

APPROVED AS TO FORM: DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

By: **Deputy City Attorney** 

n:\legana\as2014\1500087\00957823.doc

#### **LEGISLATIVE DIGEST**

[Police Code - Access to Reproductive Health Care Facilities]

Ordinance amending the Police Code to repeal the prohibition on entering or remaining within a 25-foot buffer zone of a reproductive health care facility; to prohibit individuals from following or harassing others within 25 feet of the entrance to such a facility; to prohibit impeding access to the door of such a facility; and to prohibit excessive noise through yelling or amplification of sound within 50 feet of such a facility.

#### **Existing Law**

Police Code Article 43 sets a fixed protective zone around a reproductive health care facility. This type of law is often known as a "buffer zone" law. Article 43 establishes a buffer zone around reproductive health care facilities within the City and County of San Francisco, encompassed by both of the following: (1) the area on a public way or sidewalk encompassed by a radius of 25 feet from any portion of an entrance, exit, or driveway of a reproductive health care facility; and (2) the area encompassed by extending the outside boundaries of any entrance, exit, or driveway of a reproductive health care facility in straight lines to the point where those lines intersect the sideline of the street or the property line of the health care facility. Article 43 applies only at reproductive health care facilities, and excludes licensed hospitals and facilities owned or operated by licensed hospitals from the definition of a reproductive health care facility.

#### Amendments to Current Law

The proposed ordinance replaces the buffer zone established by Article 43 with three prohibitions: 1) restrictions on individuals following and harassing persons within a 25-foot zone around reproductive health care facilities; 2) a ban on impeding access to a door of such facilities; and 3) prohibitions against amplified sound or shouting within 50 feet of such facilities, with certain exceptions.

#### **Background Information**

The proposed ordinance is modeled on several other state and local laws, which have either been upheld by the courts, or referenced as alternatives to a buffer zone by the United States Supreme Court.

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS Page 1