File No	<u> 160648</u>	Committee Item No15
		Board Item No

## **COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS**

	AGENDA PACKET CONT	ENTS LIST
Committee:	Budget and Finance	Date <u>June 16, 2016</u>
Board of Su	pervisors Meeting	Date
Cmte Boar		
	Motion Resolution Ordinance Legislative Digest Budget and Legislative Analyst Youth Commission Report Introduction Form Department/Agency Cover Lette MOU Grant Information Form Grant Budget Subcontract Budget Contract/Agreement Form 126 – Ethics Commission Award Letter Application Public Correspondence	
OTHER	(Use back side if additional space	ce is needed)
Completed k		Date June 10, 2016

[Proposition J Contract Certification Specified Contracted-Out Services Previously Approved]

Resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that services previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services: budget analyst (Board of Supervisors); citywide custodial services (excluding City Hall), citywide security services, and central shops security, convention facilities management (General Services Agency–City Administrator); mainframe system support (General Services Agency–Technology); security services (Human Services Agency); food services for jail inmates (Sheriff); assembly of vote-by-mail envelopes (Department of Elections); security services–1680 Mission Street; and security services–30 Van Ness Avenue (General Services Agency–Public Works).

WHEREAS, The Electorate of the City and County of San Francisco passed
Proposition J in November 1976, allowing City and County Departments to contract with
private companies for specific services which can be performed for a lower cost than similar
work by City and County employees (Charter, Section 10.104.15); and

WHEREAS, The City has previously approved outside contracts for the services listed below; and

WHEREAS, The Controller has determined that a Purchaser's award of a contract for the services listed below to a private contractor will continue to achieve substantial cost savings for the City; and

WHEREAS, The City and County of San Francisco must reconcile a projected \$85,500,000 budget deficit for FY2016-2017 with a Charter obligation to enact a balanced budget each fiscal year; and

WHEREAS, The Mayor has determined that the state of the City's budget for FY2016-2017 as indicated herein has created an emergency situation justifying a Purchaser's award of a contract for the following services: budget analyst (Board of Supervisors); assembly of vote-by-mail envelopes (Department of Elections); central shops security, citywide custodial services (excluding City Hall), convention facilities management, and citywide security services (General Services Agency–City Administrator); security services—1680 Mission Street and security services—30 Van Ness Avenue (General Services Agency–Public Works); mainframe system support (General Services Agency–Technology); security services (Human Services Agency); and food services for jail inmates (Sheriff); and

WHEREAS, The Controller's certification, which confirms that said services can be performed at lower costs to the City and County by private contractor than by employees of the City and County, is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 160648, which is hereby declared to be part of this resolution as if set forth fully herein; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors hereby concurs with the Controller's certification, and the Mayor's determination of an emergency situation, and approves the Proposition J Resolution concerning the Purchaser's award of a contract to a private contractor for the services listed below for the period of July 1, 2016, through June 30, 2017.

1		City Cost	Contract Cost		
2	Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
3	Board of Supervisors (BOS)				
4	Budget Analyst	2,529,011	2,174,806	354,205	12.5
5	General Services Agency–City Administrator (A	DM)			
6	Central Shops Security Services	279,002	153,556	125,447	3.0
7	Citywide Custodial Services	4,143,313	2,510,889	1,632,424	33.0
8	Citywide Security Services	3,838,183	1,651,493	2,186,690	42.0
9	Convention Facilities Management	36,100,540	29,384,911	6,715,629	236.5
10	General Services Agency–Public Works (DPW)				
11	1680 Mission Street Security Services	144,097	68,450	75,647	1.6
12	30 Van Ness Security Services	297,490	159,992	137,498	3.2
13	General Services Agency–Technology (TIS)	,			
14	Mainframe System Support	1,569,528	909,628	659,900	6.0
15	Human Services Agency (DSS)				
16	Security Services	8,570,435	6,964,000	1,606,435	89.5
17	Sheriff (SHF)				
18	Food Services for Jail Inmates	1,873,942	1,023,040	850,902	17.0
19	Elections (REG)				
20	Assembly of Vote by Mail Ballots	1,452,471	206,500	1,245,971	16.2
21					
22					

23

24

25

## OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Honorable Board of Supervisors City Hall, Room 244 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention:

Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board

RE: Budget and Legislative Analyst Services - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Budget and Legislative Analyst services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco has been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met, when comparing contract costs to the high end of comparable City wages and benefits.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield

Controller

**Enclosures** 

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
BUDGET & LEGISLATIVE ANALYST SERVICES (1)
FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

#### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

% of Savings to City Cos	t							. 14%		-2%
ESTIMATED SAVINGS							\$	354,205	\$	(47,849)
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	Γ .						\$ (	(2,174,806)	\$ (2	,174,806)
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST								2,529,011	2	,126,957
Total Capital & Operating	1							291,878		291,878
Data Processing Hardware & Software								33,711		33,711
Space Rental			•			•		171,875		171,875
Operating Expenses (materials and supplies, offi	ce equipme	nt, other expens	es)					86,292		86,292
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)										
Total Personnel Costs	<u> </u>	12.5						2,237,133	1	,835,079
Other Pay (if applicable)								<u> </u>		
Overtime Pay (if applicable)								3,500.00		3,500.00
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)		•				ē		· •		-
Holiday Pay (if applicable)		•						. <b>-</b>		-
Temporary Salaries	TEMP_M	0.50		73,000		27,000	\$	50,000		41,000
Executive Secretary	1450	1.00		78,851		34,503		113,354		92,950
Manager I	0922	1.00		125,902		50,643		176,546		144,767
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	4.00		108,548		42,621		604,673		495,832
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824	3.00		125,633		46,100		515,199		422,463
Audit, Special Projects, and Budget Director	0953	1.00		181,227		61,413		242,640		198,965
Policy and Legislative Director	0953	1.00	7	181,227	+	61,413		242,640		198,965
Budget & Legislative Analyst	0955	1.00	\$	219,682	\$	68,899	1	288,581	L	236,637
Job Class Title	Class	Equivalent Positions	Sa	alary Cost	Be	nefit Cost (3) (4)	'	otal Cost High	10	tal Cost Low
		# of Full Time	_		Ŀ		۱.,	*****************	<sub></sub>	4-1-04

- 1. FY 1979 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
- 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 5. Classifications based on current configuration of Budget and Legislative Analyst services.
- 6. Full time equivalent (FTE) positions include 11 managers and analyst staff and 1 administrative staff. The staff level of 11 managers and analysts is based on the number of staff required to provide 16,860 hours of productive service, as well as MOU-mandated leave and training hours and other nonproductive administrative hours (staff meetings, performance evaluations, and other administrative hours) consistent with ALGA (Association of Local Government Auditors) standards.
- 7. Any potential seasonal or overtime costs if brought in-house have not been determined.
- 8. Calculations do not include liability for retiree health. Based on the CAFR for year ending June 30, 2011, the City's annual liability for post retirement employee health benefits is \$392.1 million. If the Budget and Legislative Analyst services were provided by City employees, the annual liability for retiree health benefits would be \$217,777 (equal to 0.06 percent of the City's total annual retiree health liability, based on FTE count.)
- 9. Estimated total contract cost includes the 2.25% COLA requested by the contractor. If this COLA is not approved by the Board of Supervisors, the total estimated contract cost would be \$2,126,950 in FY 2016/17.



Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Naomi Kelly, Director General Services Agency – City Administrator City Hall, Room 362 San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention:

Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Janitorial Services at Various Locations - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for janitorial services at various locations have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely

Ben Rosenfield,

**Enclosures** 

General Services Agency - City Administrator, Real Estate
Citywide Custodial Services
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)
FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

## **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
		# of Full Time				
		Equivalent		Benefit Cost	Total Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Salary Cost (2)		High	Total Cost Low
Custodian	2708	31.0	\$ 60,095	\$ 29,525	\$ 2,778,223	\$ 2,361,489
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	2.0	66,131	31,128	194,517	165,340
		( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( ) ( )				
				•		
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					187,932	159,742
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					84,143	71,522
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					_	-
Other Pay (if applicable)					<b>-</b>	-
Total Personnel Costs		33	•		3,244,815	2,758,093
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)						
Materials and Supplies					479,360	479,360
Temp Salaries and est. MFB					352,601	299.711
Worker's Comp and SFGH Medical	,				66,537	66,537
Total Capital & Operating				,	898,498	845,608
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					4,143,313	3,603,701
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT CO	ST				(2,510,889)	(2,507,158)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS				·	\$ 1,632,424	\$ 1,096,543
% of Savings to City Cost				;	39%	30%
70 01 DET, 111.80 10 DILY 0001					30 70	3070

- 1. Salary levels reflect actual salary rates effective July 1, 2016.
- 2. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 3. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 4. Temp employees will be needed primarily for coverage while fulltime staff are on leave.
- 5. The estimated contract cost includes 0.15 FTE for contract monitoring.

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Naomi Kelly, Director General Services Agency – City Administrator City Hall, Room 362 San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention: Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Convention Facilities Management-FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for convention facilities management have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

**Enclosures** 

Administrative Services - Convention Facilities Management COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

## ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS	· · · · ·	# of Full Time	Γ				Т			
		Equivalent								
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Sala	ary Cost (2)	Ве	nefit Cost (3) (4)	٦	Total Cost High	T	otal Cost Low
Manager III	0931	4.0	\$	145,736	\$	54,504	\$	800,962	\$	680,818
Manager IV	0932	4.0	\$	156,542	\$	56,608	\$	852,601	\$	724,711
Manager V	0933	1.0	\$	168,696	\$	58,974	\$	227,670	\$	193,519
Deputy Director IV	0954	0.0	\$	206,073	\$	66,250	\$	· <del>-</del>	\$	
Department Head V	0965	1.0	\$	294,383	\$	83,441	\$	377,823	\$	321,150
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	0.6	\$	89,010	\$	37,443	\$	75,872	\$	64,491
IS Programmer Analyst - Principal	1064	0.6	\$	125,929	\$	46,159	\$	103,253	\$	87,765
Sr Departmental Personnel Officer	1272	1.0	\$	146,605	\$	54,674	\$	201,279	\$	171,087
Public Relations Officer	1314	1.0	\$	102,376	\$	40,985	\$	143,362	\$	121,857
Special Assistant XI	1370	3.0	\$	108,979	\$	42,735	\$	455,141	\$	386,870
Special Assistant XII	1371	4.0	\$	117,279	\$	44,369	\$	646,591	\$	549,602
Special Assistant IV	1373	1.0	\$	135,226	\$	52,458	\$	187,685	\$	159,532
Special Assistant XV	1374	1.0	\$	140,322	\$	54,848	\$	195,170	\$	165,894
Senior Clerk	1406	2.0	\$	59,690	\$	29,418	\$	. 178,217	\$	151,485
Principal Clerk	1408	2.0	\$	78,851	\$	34,503	\$	226,708	\$	192,702
Clerk Typist	1424	1.5	\$	59,852	\$	29,461	\$	133,970	\$	113,874
Secretary II	1446	4.0	\$	72,356	\$	32,780	\$	420,543	\$	357,461
Executive Secretary II	1452	1.0	\$	86,693	\$	35,790	\$	122,482	\$	104,110
Senior Account Clerk	1632	3.0	\$	71,521	\$	32,558	\$	312,236	\$	265,400
Principal Payroll/Personnel Clerk	1224	1.0	\$	89,037	\$	37,207	\$	126,244	\$	107,307
Accountant IV	1657	. 1.0	\$	120,836	\$	45,150	\$	165,986	\$	141,088
Supervising Fiscal Officer	1675	1.0	\$	143,016	\$	53,975	\$	196,991	\$	167,442
Storekeeper	1934	1.0	\$	62,978	\$	30,291	\$	93,269	\$	79,278
Senior Purchaser	1956	1.0	\$	111,242	\$	43,335	\$	154,577	\$	131,391
Supervising Purchaser	1958	1.0	\$	135,226	\$	48,002	\$	.183,228	\$	155,744
Registered Nurse	2320	0.8	\$	153,572	\$	53,374	\$	155,210	\$	131,928
Custodian	2708	96.0	\$	60,095	\$	29,525	\$		\$	7,312,999
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	1.0	\$	66,131	\$	31,128	\$	97,259	\$	82,670
Cutodial Supervisor	2718	7.0	\$	72,922	\$	32,930	\$	740,963	\$	629,818
Janitorial Services Supervisor	2720	1.0	\$	80,387	\$	34,911	\$	115,298	\$	98,003
Environmental Health Inspector	6120	1.0	\$	114,746	\$	43,609	\$	158,354	\$	134,601
Fire Safety Inspector II	6281	1.5	\$	139,073	\$	48,764	\$	281,756	\$	239,493
Bldg & Grounds Maint Supervisor	7203	13.5	\$	112,482	\$	44,058	\$	2,113,294	\$	1,796,300
Painter Supervisor	7242	1.0	\$	101,568	\$	42,724	\$	•	\$	122,648
Operating Engineer, Universal	7328	14.0	\$	100,355	\$	43,158	\$	2,009,189	\$	1,707,811
Apprentice Stationary Engineer	7333	1.0	\$	85,884	\$	37,542	\$	123,426	\$	104,912
Carpenter	7344	1.0	\$	92,109	\$	39,951	\$	132,060	\$	112,251
Electrician	7345	1.0	\$	103,589	\$	43,468	\$	147,057	\$	124,999
Painter	7346	3.0	\$	84,806	\$	38,275	\$	369,244	\$	313,858
Plumber	7347	1.0	\$	107,200	\$	45,040	\$	•	\$	129,404
Window Cleaner	7392	3.0	\$	81,168	\$	35,118	\$	348,859	\$	296,531
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205	2.0	\$	126,630	\$	47,238	\$	347,736	\$	295,576
Building & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	21.0	\$	67,101	\$	31,385	\$	2,068,209	\$	1,757,978
Institutional Police Lieutenant	8209	2.0	\$	145,130	\$	50,840	\$	391,940	\$	333,149
Head Park Patrol Officer	8210	9.0	\$	83,189	\$	35,655	\$	1,069,596	\$	909,157
Parking Control Officer	8214	10.0	\$	66,913	\$	31,335	\$	•	\$	835,103 195,194
Senior Parking Control Officer Senior Operations Manager	8216 9143	2.0 2.0	\$	80,009 165,813	\$	34,811 58,413		448,450	\$	381,183
	5143	2.0	φ	100,013	φ	50,415	φ	447,377	Ψ	380,270
Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)								565,569		480,734
Overtime Pay (if applicable)								365,961		311,067
Total Personnel Costs		236.5						29,190,840		24,812,214
						············				
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)								E 404 400		E 404 400
Contractual Services Workers' Compensation		•						5,191,190 1,228,510		5,191,190 1,228,510
Management Fee								490,000		490,000
Total Capital & Operating							_	6,909,700		6,909,700
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	'							36,100,540		31,721,914
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	-							(29,384,911)		(29,346,255)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS % of Savings to City Cost							\$	6,715,629 19%	<b>\$</b>	2,375,659 7%
75 -7 -27, mg- 111, -000t								70		- 70

- FY 1977 was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
   Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2017 and do not include anticipated City employee COLA adjustment as yet to be determined and become effective on July 1, 2017.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.



Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Naomi Kelly, Director General Services Agency – City Administrator City Hall, Room 362 San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention:

Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Central Shops Security Services-FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Central Shops security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Røsenffeld, Controller

**Enclosures** 

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst

Human Resources, Employee Relations

GSA / City Administrator - Internal Services - Central Shops Security Guard Services (Unarmed) COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

#### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Sa	lary Cost	Benefit Cost	Total Cost High	Total Cost Low
Security Guard	8202	3.0	\$	55,190	\$ 29,555	254,234	216,099
						<u>.</u>	-
	,				,	-	·
						-	. · · -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)		•				- 16,ḋ72	- 13,661
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)						7,196	6,117
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						7,190	0,117
					•	-	-
Other Pay (if applicable)						<del>-</del>	<del></del>
Total Personnel Costs		3.0				277,502	235,877
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)							
Uniforms			i			1,500	1,500
Total Capital & Operating						1,500	1,500
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST						279,002	237,37
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT CO	ST					(153,556)	(149,58°
ESTIMATED SAVINGS						\$ 125,447	\$ 87,79
% of Savings to City Cost						45%	379

- 1. These services have been contracted out since 1983.
- 2. Salaries and fringe for City employees reflect actual salary and fringe rates effective June 30, 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs. If a COLA estimate had been added to inflate anticipated City salary and fringe rates effective July 1, 2016, the savings to the City would be higher.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 5. The estimated City cost does not include materials, supplies, and uniforms; if included these costs would increase the estimated savings to the City.
- 6. Contract cost estimates include 0.05 FTE for contract monitoring.

## OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Naomi Kelly, Director General Services Agency – City Administrator City Hall, Room 362 San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention:

Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Security Services - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for security services at various locations have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco has been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely.

Ben Rosenfield,

Controller

**Enclosures** 

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst

Human Resources, Employee Relations

GENERAL SERVICES AGENCY - CITY ADMINISTRATOR - REAL ESTATE

SECURITY SERVICES: 1650 MISSION STREET, 1660 MISSION STREET, 25 VAN NESS AVENUE, 30 VAN NESS AVENUE, ONE SOUTH VAN NESS, ALEMANY/UNITED NATIONS PLAZA MARKETS, 196 OTIS STREET, AND 1 NEWHALL - MEDICAL EXAMINER

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)

FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

#### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

#### **PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS**

Total Personnel Costs	<u> </u>	42.0						3,838,183		3,263,125
Other Pay (if applicable)								4,465		4,465
Overtime Pay (if applicable)								15,386		13,078
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)								76,726		65,217
Holiday Pay (if applicable)								53,120		45,152
,			•		•	,	τ.	021,011	•	, , , , , , ,
Institutional Police Officer	8204	4.7	\$	78,204	\$	34,033	\$	527,514	\$	448,387
Security Guard	8202	37.3	\$	-55,190	\$	29,555	\$	3,160,973	\$	2,686,827
Job Class Title	Class	Positions		(2)		(3) (4)		High	Tο	tal Cost Low
		Equivalent	Sa	lary Cost	Ве	nefit Cost		Total Cost		
		# of Full Time							ł	

#### ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)

**Total Capital & Operating** 

**ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST** 

3,263,125

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST

**ESTIMATED SAVINGS** 

3.838.183

(1,651,493)

(1,644,888)

2,186,690 1.618.237 % of Savings to City Cost 57% 50%

- 1. These services have been contracted for various times, depending on location,
- 2. Salary levels reflect salary rates effective July 2016.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up, and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 5. The estimated contract cost includes 0.1 FTE for contract monitoring.
- 6. Both the City and contract cost estimates exclude operating costs that would be the same under either scenario. This does not affect the estimated cost savings.

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Miguel Gamino, Executive Director Department of Technology 1 South Van Ness Ave. 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor San Francisco. CA 94103

Attention:

Leo Levenson, Deputy Director, Finance & Administration, CFO/CAO

RE: Mainframe System Support - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Mainframe System Support have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely.

Ben Rosenfield Controller

**Enclosures** 

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst

Human Resources, Employee Relations

#### DEPARTMENT OF TECHNOLOGY, Data Center Monitoring

Mainframe System Support

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)

FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

#### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

: MOCEO LES : EMOCIMIES COCIO					 				
		# of Full Time							
		Equivalent			nefit Cost	7	Γotal Cost		
Job Class Title	Class	Positions		y Cost (2)	(3) (4)	<u> </u>	High	_	al Cost Low
Information Systems Manager	0941	0.5		181,227	\$ 62,811	\$	122,019	\$	103,716
IS Engineer-Senior	1043	2.0		141,532	50,343		383,751		326,188
IS Engineer-Principal	1044	3.0		152,285	52,557		614,525		522,346
Clerk Typist	<sub>`</sub> 1424	0.5		59,852	29,923		44,887		38,154
				•					
							•		
Otan the Base (400) at a land and the							07.044		00.440
Standby Pay (10% of regular hour pay for s	standby, 2 p	eopie at any give	en time	)			97,814		83,142
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					*		32,980		28,033
Overtime Pay (if applicable)		والمسام والمسام	\				E0 E74		40 705
Other Pay (if applicable) (callback + works	perironiea c	<u> </u>	ours)		 		58,571		49,785
Total Personnel Costs	<u>.</u>	6.0					1,354,548		1,151,365
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)							450 400		450 400
Specialized Training							158,400		158,400
Trident OSEM Software Purchase							49,200		49,200
Trident Annual Maintenance							7,380		7,380
T. 10 ". 10 0 ".							0	_	0
Total Capital & Operating							214,980		214,980
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST							1 560 500		1 200 245
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		•			•		1,569,528		1,366,345
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST			•			(909,628)		(864,347)
ELGG. ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	0001						(303,020)		(004,547)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS						\$	659,900	\$	501,998
% of Savings to City Cost							42%		37%

- 1. FY 2004-2005 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
- 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 5. In-house mainframe systems operations required contract services for specialized and as-needed services that could not be met by existing staffing and expertise levels. It is estimated staff will need 6 months training to be able to operate the system independently.
- 6. Trident Services, Inc. provides installation, configuration, maintenance and support of systems, collection of data for billing, and man
- 7. The services are 24 hours/day, 7 days/week that requires employees to standby during the non regular business hours for emergency incidents.

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Trent Rhorer, Director City and Country of San Francisco Human Services Agency 170 Otis Street San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: Dave Curto, Director of Contracts and Facilities

RE: HSA Security - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield,

,001411 01101

**Enclosures** 

HUMAN SERVICES AGENCY
Security Guard Services - Universal Contract (formerly Guardsmark)
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)
FISCAL YEAR: 2016-17

#### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time								
		Equivalent	Sa	lary Cost	Ben	efit Cost	Total C	Cost		•
Job Class Title	Class	Positions		(2)		(3) (4)	Hig	h	Tot	al Cost Low
Security Guard	8202	89.5	\$	55,190	\$	29,981	\$ 7,622	2,773	\$	6,479,357
						•		-		-
								-		-
										-
								-		-
								_		- -
Holiday Pay (if applicable)								1,899		409,615
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)							21	5,763		183,398
Overtime Pay (if applicable)								-		-
Other Pay (if applicable)										-
Total Personnel Costs		89.5					8,32	0,435		7,072,370
ADDITIONAL OUTLANDER (IC. III.)	-									
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)	4	4		*			0.5	0.000		445.000
Added electronic door lock and closed circuit	t camera sys	stems					25	0,000		145,000
								Ü		U
								0		.0
Total Capital & Operating						,	251	0,000		145,000
Total Capital & Operating		•					250	3,000		145,000
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST						,	8,57	0,435		7,217,370
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT O	OST						(6,96	4,000)		(6,330,460)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS							\$ 1,60	6,435	\$	886,910
% of Savings to City Cost						1		19%		12%

- 1. Guardsmark was bought out by Universal Protection Service. Universal is assuming all obligations under the existing agreement.
- 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective October 10, 2015. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 5. Universal contract ends on January 31, 2018. Continued security guard services will be procured through a formal solicitation process for the duration of FY 17-18 and subsequent years.



## OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Vicki Hennessy City Hall, Room 456 1 Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention:

Mylan Luong

RE: Contracting for Food Service at County Jails - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Food Service at County Jails have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield, Controller

Controller

**Enclosures** 

Sheriff
Food Service
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)
FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

#### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

## PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
	1	# of Full Time				
		Equivalent	Salary Cost	Benefit Cost	Total Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	(2)	(3) (4)	High	Total Cost Low
Food Service Manager Administrator	2620	.1.0	\$ 89,468	•		\$ 111,903
Senior Food Service Supervisor	2619	4.0	74,323	33,302	430,500	365,925
Food Service Supervisor	2618	4.0	67,425	31,471	395,581	336,244
Cook	2654	6.0	69,769	32,988	616,540	524,059
Assistant Cook	2650	2.0	56,025	29,340	170,731	145,121
Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)				·	110,316	93,769
Overtime Pay (if applicable)						
Other Pay (Premium Pay)		•			18,622	22,637
Total Personnel Costs		17.0			1,873,942	1,599,659
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)		,				
	•	•			-	~
Total Capital & Operating					-	
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST			•		1,873,942	1,599,659
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST				(1,023,040)	(1,018,505
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		•	•		\$ 850,902	
% of Savings to City Cost	1				45%	36%

- 1. These services have been contracted out since 1980.
- 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

## OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

John Arntz, Director
Department of Elections
City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 48
San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention:

Nataliya Kuzina, Deputy Director

RE: Assembly of Vote By Mail Envelopes (VBM) - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Assembly of Vote By Mail Envelope (VBM) services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely

Ben Rosenf Controller

**Enclosures** 

Department of Elections
Assembly of Vote-By-Mail Packets
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)
FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

## **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
		# of Full Time				
		Equivalent	Salary Cost	Benefit Cost	Total Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	(2)	(3) (4)	High	Total Cost Low
Junior Clerk	1402	16.0	\$ 52,819	\$ 28,868	\$ 1,306,985	\$ 1,110,937
Chief Clerk	1410	0.1	90,357	37,557	12,791	10,873
Junior Management Assistant	1840	0.1	75,455	33,602	10,906	9,270
	•					
  Holiday Pay (if applicable)	•				84,124	71,505
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					37,665	32,015
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					57,005	32,013
Other Pay (if applicable)						_
Total Personnel Costs		16,2	·		1,452,471	1,234,600
Total Personnel Costs		10.2			1,452,47	1,234,000
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)						
MEDITIONAL OIL COOLS (II applicable)		•			-	_
					-	-
•						<u></u>
					-	. <u>-</u>
Total Capital & Operating				· ·	-	•
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					1,452,471	1,234,600
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST		•		(206,500)	(187,083)
ELGGI EGIMMILD IGIAL GOMINGI	-			,	(200,000)	(101,000)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 1,245,971	\$ 1,047,518

- 1. FY2007-08 was the first year these services were contracted out.
- 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

## OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Mohammed Nuru
Director of Public Works
City Hall, Room 348
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4645

Attn: Julia Dawson, Deputy Director for Financial Management and Administration

RE: Contracting for Security at 1680 Mission Street - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for security services at 1680 Mission Street have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely

Controller

**Enclosures** 

PUBLIC WORKS - INFRASTRUCTURE DESIGN & CONSTRUCTION SECURITY GUARD SERVICES - 1680 MISSION STREET COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

#### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Total Personnel Costs		1.6						144,097		122,482
Other Pay (if applicable)								00		0
Overtime Pay (if applicable)								0		0
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)								3,737		3,176
Holiday Pay (if applicable)								8,346		7,094
										-
•								-		_
								-		-
Security Guard as needed - 1680 Mission	8202	0.1		55,190		29,981		4,259		3,620
Security Guard - 1680 Mission	8202	1.5	\$	55,190	\$	29,981	\$	127,756	\$	108,593
Job Class Title	Class	Positions		(2)	Cos	st (3) (4)	<u> </u>	High		Low
		Equivalent	Sala	ry Cost	Be	enefit	To	otal Cost	To	otal Cost
		# of Full Time								

## ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)

Total Capital & Operating

	TED TOTA	1 OIT	COOT
-SIIMA	1 H 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	4 I I I I I	17181

144,097 122,482

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST

(68,450) (67,538)

## ESTIMATED SAVINGS

\$ 75,647 \$ 54,944 52% 45%

#### Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 95-96 was the first year these services were contracted out.

% of Savings to City Cost

- 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 5. The estimated contract cost for annual service is based on the contract's bid for services.



## OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Mohammed Nuru
Director of Public Works
City Hall, Room 348
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4645

Attn: Julia Dawson, Deputy Director for Financial Management and Administration

RE: Contracting for Security at 30 Van Ness Avenue - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for security services at 30 Van Ness Avenue have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely.

Ben Kosenfield, Controller

**Enclosures** 

PUBLIC WORKS - BUREAU OF BUILDING DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION SECURITY GUARD SERVICES AT 30 VAN NESS, 3RD,4TH and 5TH FLOORS COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

#### **ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:**

#### PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time				
		Equivalent	Salary	Benefit Cost	Total Cost	Total Cost
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Cost (2)	(3) (4)	High	Low
Security Guard - 30 Van Ness, 3rd, 4th, and 5th Floor	8202	3.0	\$ 55,190	\$ 29,981	\$ 255,512	\$ 217,185
Security Guard - 30 Van Ness, 3rd & 4th Floor as-needed	8202	0.1	55,190	29,981	8,517	7,027
Security Guard - 30 Van Ness, 5th Floor as-needed	8202	0.1	55,190	29,981	8,517	7,027
	-					
				•		
,					•	
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					17,230	14,645
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					7,714	6,557
Overtime Pay (if applicable)			•		· · -	´-
Other Pay (if applicable)						
Total Personnel Costs		3.2			297,490	252,441

## ADDITIONAL: CITY COSTS (if applicable)

Total Capital & Operating

## **ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST**

297,490

#### LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST

(159,992) (158,160)

252,441

## ESTIMATED SAVINGS

## % of Savings to City Cost

- 1. FY 98-99 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
- 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

## EDWIN M. LEE

# Office of the Mayor San Francisco



TO:

Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors

FROM:

Mayor Edwin M. Lee Mw

RE:

Proposition J Contract Certification Specified Contracted-Out Services

Previously Approved

DATE:

May 31, 2016

Attached for introduction to the Board of Supervisors is a resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that services previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services: budget analyst (Board of Supervisors); citywide custodial services (excluding City Hall), citywide security services, and central shops security, convention facilities management (General Services Agency—City Administrator); mainframe system support (General Services Agency—Technology); security services (Human Services Agency); food services for jail inmates (Sheriff); assembly of vote-bymail envelopes (Department of Elections); security services—1680 Mission Street and security services—30 Van Ness Avenue (General Services Agency—Public Works).

I respectfully request that this item be calendared in Budget & Finance Committee on June 16, 2016.

Should you have any questions, please contact Nicole Elliott (415) 554-7940.

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

ZOLGHAY 31 PH 1:35