File No.	160648	Committee Item No.	15
•		Board Item No	20

COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

	AGENDA PACKET CON	TENTS LIST
Committee:	Budget and Finance	Date <u>June 16, 2016</u>
Board of Su	pervisors Meeting	Date 7/19/16
Cmte Boar		*.
	Motion Resolution Ordinance Legislative Digest Budget and Legislative Analyst Youth Commission Report Introduction Form Department/Agency Cover Lett MOU Grant Information Form Grant Budget Subcontract Budget Contract/Agreement Form 126 – Ethics Commission Award Letter Application Public Correspondence	er and/or Report
OTHER	(Use back side if additional spa	ace is needed)
Completed be	oy: Victor Young	Date June 10, 2016 Date 7/6//6

 Resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that services previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services: budget analyst (Board of Supervisors); citywide custodial services (excluding City Hall), citywide security services, and central shops security, convention facilities management (General Services Agency—City Administrator); mainframe system support (General Services Agency—Technology); security services (Human Services Agency); food services for jail inmates (Sheriff); assembly of vote-by-mail envelopes (Department of Elections); security services—1680 Mission Street; and security services—30 Van Ness Avenue (General Services Agency—Public Works).

[Proposition J Contract Certification Specified Contracted-Out Services Previously Approved]

WHEREAS, The Electorate of the City and County of San Francisco passed
Proposition J in November 1976, allowing City and County Departments to contract with
private companies for specific services which can be performed for a lower cost than similar
work by City and County employees (Charter, Section 10.104.15); and

WHEREAS, The City has previously approved outside contracts for the services listed below; and

WHEREAS, The Controller has determined that a Purchaser's award of a contract for the services listed below to a private contractor will continue to achieve substantial cost savings for the City; and

WHEREAS, The City and County of San Francisco must reconcile a projected \$85,500,000 budget deficit for FY2016-2017 with a Charter obligation to enact a balanced budget each fiscal year; and

WHEREAS, The Mayor has determined that the state of the City's budget for FY2016-2017 as indicated herein has created an emergency situation justifying a Purchaser's award of a contract for the following services: budget analyst (Board of Supervisors); assembly of vote-by-mail envelopes (Department of Elections); central shops security, citywide custodial services (excluding City Hall), convention facilities management, and citywide security services (General Services Agency–City Administrator); security services—1680 Mission Street and security services—30 Van Ness Avenue (General Services Agency–Public Works); mainframe system support (General Services Agency–Technology); security services (Human Services Agency); and food services for jail inmates (Sheriff); and

WHEREAS, The Controller's certification, which confirms that said services can be performed at lower costs to the City and County by private contractor than by employees of the City and County, is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 160648, which is hereby declared to be part of this resolution as if set forth fully herein; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors hereby concurs with the Controller's certification, and the Mayor's determination of an emergency situation, and approves the Proposition J Resolution concerning the Purchaser's award of a contract to a private contractor for the services listed below for the period of July 1, 2016, through June 30, 2017.

1		City Cost	Contract Cost		
2	Department/Function	(High)	(High)	SAVINGS	FTEs
3	Board of Supervisors (BOS)				
4	Budget Analyst	2,529,011	2,174,806	354,205	12.5
5	General Services Agency–City Administrator (A	DM)			
6	Central Shops Security Services	279,002	153,556	125,447	3.0
7	Citywide Custodial Services	4,143,313	2,510,889	1,632,424	33.0
8	Citywide Security Services	3,838,183	1,651,493	2,186,690	42.0
9	Convention Facilities Management	36,100,540	29,384,911	6,715,629	236.5
10	General Services Agency-Public Works (DPW)				
11	1680 Mission Street Security Services	144,097	68,450	75,647	1.6
12	30 Van Ness Security Services	297,490	159,992	137,498	3.2
13	General Services Agency–Technology (TIS)	,			
14	Mainframe System Support	1,569,528	909,628	659,900	6.0
15	Human Services Agency (DSS)				
16	Security Services	8,570,435	6,964,000	1,606,435	89.5
17	Sheriff (SHF)				
18	Food Services for Jail Inmates	1,873,942	1,023,040	850,902	17.0
19	Elections (REG)				
20	Assembly of Vote by Mail Ballots	1,452,471	206,500	1,245,971	16.2
21					
22					
23 24					
25 25					



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Honorable Board of Supervisors City Hall, Room 244 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention:

Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board

RE: Budget and Legislative Analyst Services - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Budget and Legislative Analyst services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco has been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met, when comparing contract costs to the high end of comparable City wages and benefits.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst

Human Resources, Employee Relations

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS · **BUDGET & LEGISLATIVE ANALYST SERVICES (1)** FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time				
•		Equivalent	Salary Cost	Benefit Cost	Total Cost	Total Cost
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	(2)	(3) (4)	High	Low
Budget & Legislative Analyst	0955		\$ 219,682	\$ 68,899	288,581	236,637
Policy and Legislative Director	0953	1.00	181,227	61,413	242,640	198,965
Audit, Special Projects, and Budget Director	0953	1.00	181,227	61,413	242,640	198,965
Principal Administrative Analyst	1824	3.00	125,633	46,100	515,199	422,463
Senior Administrative Analyst	1823	4.00	108,548	42,621	604,673	495,832
Manager I	0922	1.00	125,902	50,643	176,546	144,767
Executive Secretary	1450	1.00	78,851	34,503	113,354	92,950
Temporary Salaries	TEMP_M	0.50	73,000	27,000	\$ 50,000	41,000
Holiday Pay (if applicable)			1		-	-
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)		•			-	-
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					3,500.00	3,500.00
Other Pay (if applicable)		•				-
Total Personnel Costs	<u> </u>	12.5			2,237,133	1,835,079
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)						
Operating Expenses (materials and supplies, offi	ce equipme	nt. other expens	es)		86,292	86,292
Space Rental		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	,	٠	171,875	171,875
Data Processing Hardware & Software					33,711	33,711
Total Capital & Operating	!				291,878	291,878
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		1		•	2,529,011	2,126,957
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	7			•	\$ (2,174,806)	\$ (2,174,806)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 354,205	\$ (47,849)
% of Savings to City Cost					. 14%	-2%

- 1. FY 1979 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
- 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 5. Classifications based on current configuration of Budget and Legislative Analyst services.
- 6. Full time equivalent (FTE) positions include 11 managers and analyst staff and 1 administrative staff. The staff level of 11 managers and analysts is based on the number of staff required to provide 16.860 hours of productive service, as well as MOUmandated leave and training hours and other nonproductive administrative hours (staff meetings, performance evaluations, and other administrative hours) consistent with ALGA (Association of Local Government Auditors) standards.
- 7. Any potential seasonal or overtime costs if brought in-house have not been determined.
- 8. Calculations do not include liability for retiree health. Based on the CAFR for year ending June 30, 2011, the City's annual liability for post retirement employee health benefits is \$392.1 million. If the Budget and Legislative Analyst services were provided by City employees, the annual liability for retiree health benefits would be \$217,777 (equal to 0.06 percent of the City's total annual retiree health liability, based on FTE count.)
- 9. Estimated total contract cost includes the 2.25% COLA requested by the contractor. If this COLA is not approved by the Board of Supervisors, the total estimated contract cost would be \$2,126,950 in FY 2016/17. 928



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Naomi Kelly, Director General Services Agency – City Administrator City Hall, Room 362 San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention:

Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Janitorial Services at Various Locations - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for janitorial services at various locations have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely

Controller

Enclosures

General Services Agency - City Administrator, Real Estate
Citywide Custodial Services
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)
FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time			T-4-1 O4	
lab Class Title	Class	Equivalent	Colone Cost (a)	Benefit Cost	Total Cost	Total Coat Lou
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Salary Cost (2)		High	Total Cost Low
Custodian Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2708 2716	31.0 2.0	\$ 60,095 66,131	\$ 29,525 31,128	\$ 2,778,223 194,517	\$ 2,361,489 165,340
Oustodiai Assistant Supervisor	2710	. 2.0	00,101	31,120	104,017	100,040
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					187,932	159,742
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)				*	84,143	71,522
Overtime Pay (if applicable) Other Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Total Personnel Costs		33			3,244,815	2,758,093
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)						
Materials and Supplies					479,360	479,360
Temp Salaries and est. MFB					352,601	299,711
Worker's Comp and SFGH Medical	•				66,537	66,537
Total Capital & Operating				1	898,498	845,608
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					4,143,313	3,603,701
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT CO	OST				(2,510,889)	(2,507,158)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		•			\$ 1,632,424	\$ 1,096,543
% of Savings to City Cost			,		39%	30%

- 1. Salary levels reflect actual salary rates effective July 1, 2016.
- 2. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 3. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 4. Temp employees will be needed primarily for coverage while fulltime staff are on leave.
- 5. The estimated contract cost includes 0.15 FTE for contract monitoring.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Naomi Kelly, Director General Services Agency – City Administrator City Hall, Room 362 San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention:

Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Convention Facilities Management- FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for convention facilities management have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely.

Ben Rosenfield Controller

Enclosures

Administrative Services - Convention Facilities Management COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED P	PERSONNEL	COSTS
-------------	-----------	-------

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS	 	# of Full Time	<u> </u>	l :	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
		Equivalent				
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Salary Cost (2)	Benefit Cost (3) (4)	Total Cost High	Total Cost Low
Manager III	0931	4.0	\$ 145,736	\$ 54,504	\$ 800,962	\$ 680,818
Manager IV	0932	4.0	\$ 156,542	\$ 56,608	\$ 852,601	\$ 724,711
Manager V	0933	1.0	\$ 168,696	\$ 58,974	\$ 227,670	\$ 193,519
Deputy Director IV	0954	. 0.0	\$ 206,073	\$ 66,250	\$ -	\$ -
Department Head V	0965	1.0	\$ 294,383	\$ 83,441	\$ 377,823	\$ 321,150
IS Programmer Analyst IS Programmer Analyst Principal	1062 1064	0.6 0.6	\$ 89,010 \$ 125,929	\$ 37,443 \$ 46,159	\$ 75,872 \$ 103,253	\$ 64,491 \$ 87,765
IS Programmer Analyst - Principal Sr Departmental Personnel Officer	1272	1.0	\$ 125,929 \$ 146,605	\$ 46,159 \$ 54,674	\$ 103,253 \$ 201,279	\$ 87,765 \$ 171,087
Public Relations Officer	1314	1.0	\$ 102,376	\$ 40,985	\$ 143,362	\$ 121,857
Special Assistant XI	1370	3.0	\$ 108,979	\$ 42,735	\$ 455,141	\$ 386,870
Special Assistant XII	1371	4.0	\$ 117,279	\$ 44,369	\$ 646,591	\$ 549,602
Special Assistant IV	1373	1.0	\$ 135,226	\$ 52,458	\$ 187,685	\$ 159,532
Special Assistant XV	1374	1.0	\$ 140,322	\$ 54,848	\$ 195,170	\$ 165,894
Senior Clerk	1406	2.0	\$ 59,690	\$ 29,418	\$ 178,217	\$ 151,485
Principal Clerk	1408	2.0	\$ 78,851	\$ 34,503	\$ 226,708	\$ 192,702
Clerk Typist	1424	1.5	\$ 59,852	\$ 29,461	\$ 133,970	\$ 113,874
Secretary II	1446	4.0	\$ 72,356	\$ 32,780	\$ 420,543	\$ 357,461
Executive Secretary II	1452	1.0	\$ 86,693	\$ 35,790	\$ 122,482	\$ 104,110
Senior Account Clerk	1632	3.0	\$ 71,521	\$ 32,558	\$ 312,236	\$ 265,400
Principal Payroll/Personnel Clerk	1224	1.0	\$ 89,037	\$ 37,207	\$ 126,244	\$ 107,307
Accountant IV	1657	. 1.0	\$ 120,836	\$ 45,150	\$ 165,986	\$ 141,088
Supervising Fiscal Officer	1675	1.0	\$ 143,016	\$ 53,975	\$ 196,991	\$ 167,442
Storekeeper	1934	1.0	\$ 62,978	\$ 30,291	\$ 93,269	\$ 79,278
Senior Purchaser	1956	1.0	\$ 111,242	\$ 43,335	\$ 154,577	\$ 131,391
Supervising Purchaser	1958	1.0	\$ 135,226	\$ 48,002	\$.183,228	\$ 155,744
Registered Nurse Custodian	2320 2708	0.8 96.0	\$ 153,572 \$ 60.095	\$ 53,374 \$ 29,525	\$ 155,210 \$ 8.603.528	\$ 131,928 \$ 7,312,999
Custodial Assistant Supervisor	2716	1.0	\$ 60,095 \$ 66,131	\$ 29,525 \$ 31,128	\$ 8,603,528 \$ 97,259	\$ 7,312,999 \$ 82,670
Cutodial Supervisor	2718	7.0	\$ 72,922	\$ 32,930	\$ 740,963	\$ 629,818
Janitorial Services Supervisor	2720	1.0	\$ 80,387	\$ 34,911	\$ 115,298	\$ 98,003
Environmental Health Inspector	6120	1.0	\$ 114,746	\$ 43,609	\$ 158,354	\$ 134,601
Fire Safety Inspector II	6281	1.5	\$ 139,073	\$ 48,764	\$ 281,756	\$ 239,493
Bldg & Grounds Maint Supervisor	7203	13.5	\$ 112,482		\$ 2,113,294	\$ 1,796,300
Painter Supervisor	7242	1.0	\$ 101,568	\$ 42,724	\$ 144,292	
Operating Engineer, Universal	7328	14.0	\$ 100,355	\$ 43,158	\$ 2,009,189	\$ 1,707,811
Apprentice Stationary Engineer	7333	1.0	\$ 85,884	\$ 37,542	\$ 123,426	\$ 104,912
Carpenter	7344	1.0	\$ 92,109	\$ 39,951	\$ 132,060	\$ 112,251
Electrician	7345	1.0	\$ 103,589	\$ 43,468	\$ 147,057	\$ 124,999
Painter	7346	3.0	\$ 84,806	\$ 38,275	\$ 369,244	\$ 313,858
Plumber	7347	1.0	\$ 107,200	\$ 45,040	\$ 152,240	\$ 129,404
Window Cleaner	7392	3.0	\$ 81,168	\$ 35,118	\$ 348,859	\$ 296,531
Institutional Police Sergeant	8205 .	2.0	\$ 126,630	\$ 47,238	\$ 347,736	\$ 295,576
Building & Grounds Patrol Officer	8207	21.0	\$ 67,101	\$ 31,385	\$ 2,068,209	\$ 1,757,978
Institutional Police Lieutenant	8209	2.0	\$ 145,130	\$ 50,840	\$ 391,940	\$ 333,149
Head Park Patrol Officer	8210	9.0	\$ 83,189 \$ 66.913	\$ 35,655	\$ 1,069,596 \$ 982,474	\$ 909,157
Parking Control Officer Senior Parking Control Officer	8214 8216	10.0 2.0	\$ 66,913 \$ 80,009	\$ 31,335 \$ 34,811		
Senior Operations Manager	9143	2.0				
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	3 140	2.0	ψ 100 ₁ 010	Ψ 30,415	447,377	380,270
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					565,569	480,734
Overtime Pay (if applicable)				*	365,961	311,067
Total Personnel Costs		236.5	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		29,190,840	24,812,214
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)						
Contractual Services		•			5,191,190	5,191,190
Workers' Compensation					1,228,510	1,228,510
Management Fee					490,000	490,000
Total Capital & Operating					6,909,700	6,909,700
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					36,100,540	31,721,914
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COS	т				(29,384,911)	(29,346,255)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 6,715,629	\$ 2,375,659
% of Savings to City Cost					19%	

- FY 1977 was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
 Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective June 30, 2017 and do not include anticipated City employee COLA adjustment as yet to be determined and become effective on July 1, 2017.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- disability, where applicable.

 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Naomi Kelly, Director General Services Agency – City Administrator City Hall, Room 362 San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention:

Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Central Shops Security Services-FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Central Shops security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Røsenfield Contrøller

Enclosures

GSA / City Administrator - Internal Services - Central Shops
Security Guard Services (Unarmed)
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)
FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		T	1		T			***************************************
·		# of Full Time	l		1_		Tatal Conf	T-4-1 O4
lab Olana Tilla	Class	Equivalent Positions	Sal	lary Cost	Ber	nefit Cost	Total Cost	Total Cost
Job Class Title	Class		L	(2)	<u> </u>	(3) (4)	High	Low
Security Guard	8202	. 3.0	\$	55,190	\$	29,555	254,234	216,099
							- •	-
						•	-	_
•	·						-	-
•							-	_
Holiday Pay (if applicable)		•					16,072	13,661
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)							7,196	6,117
Overtime Pay (if applicable)							-	-
Other Pay (if applicable)							· / _	_
Total Personnel Cost	s	3.0					277,502	235,877
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)								
Uniforms		•					1,500	1,500
Total Capital & Operatin	g	•					1,500	1,500
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST							279,002	237,377
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT C	OST						(153,556)	(149,581
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		•					\$ 125,447	\$ 87,796
% of Savings to City Cos	it ·						45%	37%

- 1. These services have been contracted out since 1983.
- 2. Salaries and fringe for City employees reflect actual salary and fringe rates effective June 30, 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs. If a COLA estimate had been added to inflate anticipated City salary and fringe rates effective July 1, 2016, the savings to the City would be higher.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 5. The estimated City cost does not include materials, supplies, and uniforms; if included these costs would increase the estimated savings to the City.
- 6. Contract cost estimates include 0.05 FTE for contract monitoring.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller **Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller**

May 27, 2016

Naomi Kelly, Director General Services Agency - City Administrator City Hall, Room 362 San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attention:

Kenneth Bukowski, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Security Services – FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for security services at various locations have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco has been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Controller

Enclosures

Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst

Human Resources, Employee Relations

GENERAL SERVICES AGENCY - CITY ADMINISTRATOR - REAL ESTATE

SECURITY SERVICES: 1650 MISSION STREET, 1660 MISSION STREET, 25 VAN NESS AVENUE, 30 VAN NESS AVENUE, ONE SOUTH VAN NESS, ALEMANY/UNITED NATIONS PLAZA MARKETS, 196 OTIS STREET, AND

1 NEWHALL - MEDICAL EXAMINER ~

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)

FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time					
	Ì	Equivalent	Sala	ry Cost	Benefit Cost	Total Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	Positions		(2)	(3) (4)	High	Total Cost Low
Security Guard	8202	37.3	\$.5	55,190	\$ 29,555	\$ 3,160,973	\$ 2,686,827
Institutional Police Officer	8204	4.7	\$ 7	78,204	\$ 34,033	\$ 527,514	\$ 448,387
Holiday Pay (if applicable)						53,120	45,152
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)						76,726	65,217
Overtime Pay (if applicable)		•				15,386	13,078
Other Pay (if applicable)						4,465	4,465
Total Personnel Costs		42.0				3,838,183	3,263,125

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)

Total Capital & Operating

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST (1,651,493) (1,644,888)

3,838,183

3,263,125

- 1. These services have been contracted for various times, depending on location.
- 2. Salary levels reflect salary rates effective July 2016.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up, and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 5. The estimated contract cost includes 0.1 FTE for contract monitoring.
- Both the City and contract cost estimates exclude operating costs that would be the same under either scenario. This does not affect the estimated cost savings.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Miguel Gamino, Executive Director Department of Technology 1 South Van Ness Ave. 2nd Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention:

Leo Levenson, Deputy Director, Finance & Administration, CFO/CAO

RE: Mainframe System Support - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Mainframe System Support have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield

Controller

Enclosures

DEPARTMENT OF TECHNOLOGY, Data Center Monitoring

Mainframe System Support

COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)

FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

	T	# of Full Time	T		1	1
		Equivalent		Benefit Cost	Total Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Salary Cost (2)		High	Total Cost Low
Information Systems Manager	0941	0.5	\$ 181,227			\$ 103,716
IS Engineer-Senior	1043	2.0	141,532	50,343	383,751	326,188
IS Engineer-Principal	1044	3.0	152,285	52,557	614,525	522,346
Clerk Typist	1424	0.5	59,852	29,923	44,887	38,154
·.				•		
Standby Pay (10% of regular hour pay for	standby, 2 p	eople at any give	en time		97,814	. 83,142
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)				•	32,980	28,033
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Other Pay (if applicable) (callback + works	perfromed of	during standby ho	ours)		58,571	49,785
Total Personnel Costs		6.0			1,354,548	1,151,365
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)						
Specialized Training					158,400	158,400
Trident OSEM Software Purchase					49,200	49,200
Trident Annual Maintenance	•				7,380	7,380
					0	0
Total Capital & Operating					214,980	214,980
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST		,	•		1,569,528	1,366,345
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST				(909,628)	(864,347)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 659,900	
% of Savings to City Cost					. 42%	37%

- 1. FY 2004-2005 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.
- 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 5. In-house mainframe systems operations required contract services for specialized and as-needed services that could not be met by existing staffing and expertise levels. It is estimated staff will need 6 months training to be able to operate the system independently.
- 6. Trident Services, Inc. provides installation, configuration, maintenance and support of systems, collection of data for billing, and man
- 7. The services are 24 hours/day, 7 days/week that requires employees to standby during the non regular business hours for emergency incidents.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Trent Rhorer, Director
City and Country of San Francisco Human Services Agency
170 Otis Street
San Francisco, CA 94103

Attention: Dave Curto, Director of Contracts and Facilities

RE: HSA Security - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for security services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Controller

Enclosures

HUMAN SERVICES AGENCY
Security Guard Services - Universal Contract (formerly Guardsmark)
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)
FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		T.,	T		$\overline{}$			Т	
	1	# of Full Time						1	
		Equivalent	Sal	ary Cost	Bei	nefit Cost	Total Cost	1	
Job Class Title	Class	Positions		(2)		(3) (4)	High	Tof	tal Cost Lo
Security Guard	8202	89.5	\$	55,190	\$	29,981	\$ 7,622,773	\$	6,479,357
						•	-		-
							-		-
							, -		-
•							-		-
							-		-
Holiday Pay (if applicable)							481,899		409,615
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)							215,763		183,398
Overtime Pay (if applicable)							-		-
Other Pay (if applicable)									
Total Personnel Costs		89.5					8,320,435		7,072,370
	•								
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)									
Added electronic door lock and closed circui	t camera sys	stems					250,000		145,00
·						•	0		(
							0		(
•						•	0		(
Total Capital & Operating		•					250,000		145,000
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST							8,570,435		7,217,37
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT O	OST					,	(6,964,000)		(6,330,46
ESTIMATED SAVINGS							\$ 1,606,435	\$	886,91
% of Savings to City Cost							19%		12

- 1. Guardsmark was bought out by Universal Protection Service. Universal is assuming all obligations under the existing agreement.
- 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective October 10, 2015. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 5. Universal contract ends on January 31, 2018. Continued security guard services will be procured through a formal solicitation process for the duration of FY 17-18 and subsequent years.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Vicki Hennessy City Hall, Room 456 1 Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention:

Mylan Luong

RE: Contracting for Food Service at County Jails - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Food Service at County Jails have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield,

Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst

Human Resources, Employee Relations

Sheriff
Food Service
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)
FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

1 NOOLO 1 LD 1 LNOOMNLL GOOTG				·	·	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
		# of Full Time				
		Equivalent	Salary Cost	Benefit Cost		1
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	(2)	(3) (4)	High	Total Cost Low
Food Service Manager Administrator	2620	.1.0	\$ 89,468	\$ 42,183		\$ 111,903
Senior Food Service Supervisor	2619	4.0	74,323	33,302	430,500	365,925
Food Service Supervisor	2618	4.0	67,425	31,471	395,581	336,244
Cook	2654	6.0	69,769	32,988	616,540	524,059
Assistant Cook	2650	2.0	56,025	29,340	170,731	145,121
Holiday Pay (if applicable) Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)				·	110,316	93,769
Overtime Pay (if applicable) Other Pay (Premium Pay)					18,622	22,637
Total Personnel Costs		17.0			1,873,942	1,599,659
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)	•	,	•			
, ,					-	-
Total Capital & Operating					<u></u>	_
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					1,873,942	1,599,659
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST				(1,023,040)	(1,018,505
ESTIMATED SAVINGS		•			\$ 850,902	\$ 581,154

Comments/Assumptions:

1. These services have been contracted out since 1980.

% of Savings to City Cost

2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.

45%

36%

- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

John Arntz, Director Department of Elections City Hall - 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 48 San Francisco, CA 94102

Attention:

Nataliya Kuzina, Deputy Director

RE: Assembly of Vote By Mail Envelopes (VBM) - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for Assembly of Vote By Mail Envelope (VBM) services have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely

Ben Rosenfield

Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst

Human Resources, Employee Relations

Department of Elections
Assembly of Vote-By-Mail Packets
COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1)
FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS						
		# of Full Time				
·		Equivalent	Salary Cost	Benefit Cost	Total Cost	
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	(2)	(3) (4)	High	Total Cost Low
Junior Clerk	1402	16.0	\$ 52,819	\$ 28,868	\$ 1,306,985	\$ 1,110,937
Chief Clerk	1410	0.1	90,357	37,557	12,791	10,873
Junior Management Assistant	1840	0.1	75,455	33,602	10,906	9,270
				•		
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	•		٠		84,124	71,505
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)				•	37,665	32,015
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					· _	· <u>-</u>
Other Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Total Personnel Costs		16.2			1,452,471	1,234,600
ADDITIONAL ORDA OCOTO (F II I I-)						
ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)					_	
					- -	-
						_
					-	-
Total Capital & Operating					-	-
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST					1,452,471	1,234,600
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT	COST		•		(206,500)	(187,083
ESTIMATED SAVINGS					\$ 1,245,971	\$ 1,047,518

85%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY2007-08 was the first year these services were contracted out.

% of Savings to City Cost

- 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Mohammed Nuru
Director of Public Works
City Hall, Room 348
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4645

Attn: Julia Dawson, Deputy Director for Financial Management and Administration

RE: Contracting for Security at 1680 Mission Street - FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for security services at 1680 Mission Street have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that "work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

Enclosures

Controller

PUBLIC WORKS - INFRASTRUCTURE DESIGN & CONSTRUCTION SECURITY GUARD SERVICES - 1680 MISSION STREET COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

		# of Full Time				
		Equivalent	Salary Cost	Benefit	Total Cost	Total Cost
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	(2)	Cost (3) (4)	High	Low
Security Guard - 1680 Mission	8202	1.5	\$ 55,190	\$ 29,981	\$ 127,756	\$ 108,593
Security Guard as needed - 1680 Mission	8202	0.1	55,190	29,981	4,259	3,620
		,			-	-
"					-	-
					_	-
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					. 8,346	7,094
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)			•		3,737	3,176
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					0	. 0
Other Pay (if applicable)					0	. 0
Total Personnel Costs		1.6			144,097	122,482

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)

	-	-
Total Capital & Operating	-	-
ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	144,097	122,482
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	(68,450)	(67,538)
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 75,647	54,944
% of Savings to City Cost	52%	15%

- 1. FY 95-96 was the first year these services were contracted out.
- 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- 5. The estimated contract cost for annual service is based on the contract's bid for services.

Ben Rosenfield Controller Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller

May 27, 2016

Mohammed Nuru Director of Public Works City Hall, Room 348 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102-4645

Attn: Julia Dawson, Deputy Director for Financial Management and Administration

RE: Contracting for Security at 30 Van Ness Avenue – FY 2016-17

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract for security services at 30 Van Ness Avenue have been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Year 2016-17 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met.

Please contact Theresa Kao at 415-554-5253 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely.

Ben Rosenfield,

Controller

Enclosures

PUBLIC WORKS - BUREAU OF BUILDING DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION SECURITY GUARD SERVICES AT 30 VAN NESS, 3RD,4TH and 5TH FLOORS COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) FISCAL YEAR 2016-17

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

,		# of Full Time				
		Equivalent	Salary	Benefit Cost	Total Cost	Total Cost
Job Class Title	Class	Positions	Cost (2)	(3) (4)	High	Low
Security Guard - 30 Van Ness, 3rd, 4th, and 5th Floor	8202	3.0	\$ 55,190	\$ 29,981	\$ 255,512	\$ 217,185
Security Guard - 30 Van Ness, 3rd & 4th Floor as-needed	8202	0.1	55,190	29,981	8,517	7,027
Security Guard - 30 Van Ness, 5th Floor as-needed	8202	0.1	55,190	29,981	8,517	7,027
	•					
		•				
Holiday Pay (if applicable)					17,230	14,645
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)					7,714	6,557
Overtime Pay (if applicable)					-	· <u>-</u>
Other Pay (if applicable)					-	-
Total Personnel Costs		3.2			297,490	252,441

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS (if applicable)

Total Capita	al & Operating
--------------	----------------

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST

LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST

ESTIMATED SAVINGS

% of Savings to City Cost

291,490	202,441

(159,992) (158,160)

\$ 137,498 \$ 94,281 46% 37%

Comments/Assumptions: 1. FY 98-99 would be/was the first year these services are/were contracted out.

- 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2016. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
- 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability, where applicable.
- 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.

Office of the Mayor San Francisco



EDWIN M. LEE

TO:

Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board of Supervisors

FROM:

Mayor Edwin M. Lee Mu

RE:

Proposition J Contract Certification Specified Contracted-Out Services

Previously Approved

DATE:

May 31, 2016

Attached for introduction to the Board of Supervisors is a resolution concurring with the Controller's certification that services previously approved can be performed by private contractor for a lower cost than similar work performed by City and County employees, for the following services: budget analyst (Board of Supervisors); citywide custodial services (excluding City Hall), citywide security services, and central shops security, convention facilities management (General Services Agency—City Administrator); mainframe system support (General Services Agency—Technology); security services (Human Services Agency); food services for jail inmates (Sheriff); assembly of vote-bymail envelopes (Department of Elections); security services—1680 Mission Street and security services—30 Van Ness Avenue (General Services Agency—Public Works).

I respectfully request that this item be calendared in Budget & Finance Committee on June 16, 2016.

Should you have any questions, please contact Nicole Elliott (415) 554-7940.

2016 HAY 31 PH 1:39