

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. 554-5184
Fax No. 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

## MEMORANDUM

# RULES COMMITTEE SAN FRANCISCO BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

TO: Supervisor Katy Tang, Chair

**Rules Committee** 

FROM: Derek Evans, Assistant Clerk

DATE: July 18, 2016

SUBJECT: **COMMITTEE REPORT, BOARD MEETING** 

Tuesday, July 19, 2016

The following file should be presented as a **COMMITTEE REPORT** at the Board Meeting on Tuesday, July 19, 2016. This item was acted upon at the Rules Committee Meeting on Thursday, July 14, 2016, at 11:00 a.m., by the votes indicated.

Item No. 79 File No. 160781

#### [Charter Amendment - Public Advocate]

Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to: 1) create the Office of the Public Advocate; 2) set the Public Advocate's powers and duties; 3) authorize the Public Advocate to review the administration of City programs, including programs for transmitting information to the public, and to receive, investigate, and attempt to resolve complaints regarding City services and programs; 4) authorize the Public Advocate to receive and investigate specified whistleblower complaints; 5) provide for the Public Advocate's election, removal, and salary; and, 6) set City policy regarding sufficient funding and minimum staffing for the Office of the Public Advocate; and setting an operative date, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

RECOMMENDED AS A COMMITTEE REPORT

Vote: Supervisor Katy Tang - Aye Supervisor Eric Mar - No Supervisor Malia Cohen - Aye

Board of Supervisors
 Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board
 Alisa Somera, Acting Legislative Deputy Director
 Jon Givner, Deputy City Attorney

File No. <u>160781</u>	Committee Item No. 7 Board Item No. 79						
COMMITTE	COMMITTEE/BOARD OF SUPERVISORS						
AGEN	AGENDA PACKET CONTENTS LIST						
Committee: Rules Committee	<u>Date</u> <u>July 14, 2016</u>						
Board of Supervisors Meeting DateJuly 19, 2016							
Cmte Board							
Motion							
Resolution Ordinance							
x x Legislative Dig	gest						
	egislative Analyst Report						
Legislative An	·						
Youth Commis	orm (for hearings)						
	gency Cover Letter and/or Report						
MOU	jeney cover zouer ana, er nopen						
Grant Informa	tion Form						
Grant Budget							
Subcontract E	udget						

X	X	Charter Amendment (Second Draft)

(Use back side if additional space is needed)

Contract/Agreement

**Public Correspondence** 

**Award Letter Application** 

OTHER

Form 126 - Ethics Commission

Completed by: Derek Evans Date July 8, 2016 **Date** July 18, 2016 Completed by: Derek Evans

# AMENDED IN COMMITTEE 7/6/2016

FILE NO. 160781

(SECOND DRAFT)

1	[Charter Amendment - Public Advocate]			
2				
3	Describing and setting forth a proposal to the voters, at an election to be held on			
4	November 8, 2016, to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to:			
5	1) create the Office of the Public Advocate; 2) set the Public Advocate's powers and duties			
6	3) authorize the Public Advocate to review the administration of City programs, including			
7	programs for transmitting information to the public, and to receive, investigate, and			
8	attempt to resolve complaints regarding City services and programs; 4) authorize the			
9	Public Advocate to receive and investigate specified whistleblower complaints; 5) provide			
10	for the Public Advocate's election, removal, and salary; and, 6) set City policy regarding			
11	sufficient funding and minimum staffing for the Office of the Public Advocate; and setting			
12	an operative date.			
13				
14	Section 1. The Board of Supervisors hereby submits to the qualified voters of the City			
15	and County, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016, a proposal to amend the Charter of			
16	the City and County by revising Sections 6.100, 10.104, 13.101, 13.101.5, 13.102, 15.105,			
17	A8.409-1, F1.102, F1.107, and F1.114, adding Sections 6.107 and 8C.101 through 8C.106, and			
18	deleting Section F1.108, to read as follows:			
19	NOTE: Unchanged Charter text and uncodified text are in plain font.			
20	Additions are <u>single-underline italics Times New Roman font</u> .  Deletions are <u>strike-through italics Times New Roman font</u> .			
21	<b>Asterisks (* * * *)</b> indicate the omission of unchanged Charter subsections.			
22				
23	1 1 1			
24	1 1 1			
25	1 1 1			

#### SEC. 6.100. DESIGNATION OF OTHER ELECTIVE OFFICERS.

In addition to the officers required to be elected under other Articles of this Charter, the following shall constitute the elective officers of the City and County: the Assessor-Recorder, City Attorney, District Attorney, Public Defender, Sheriff, *and* Treasurer, *and Public Advocate*. Each such officer shall be elected for a four-year term and shall serve full time.

The City Attorney shall be licensed to practice law in all courts of the State of California and shall have been so licensed for at least ten years next preceding his or her election. The District Attorney and Public Defender shall each be licensed to practice law in all courts of the State of California and shall have been so licensed for at least five years next preceding his or her election. Such officers shall not engage in the private practice of law during the period they serve as elective officers of the City and County.

Subject to the powers and duties set forth in this Charter, the officers named in this section shall have such additional powers and duties prescribed by state laws for their respective office. The terms of office in effect for these officers on the date this Charter is adopted shall continue.

#### SEC. 6.107. PUBLIC ADVOCATE.

- (a) There shall be a Public Advocate for the City and County of San Francisco. The functions, powers, and duties of the Public Advocate are set forth in Article VIIIC.
- (b) The Public Advocate shall appoint a Chief Deputy Public Advocate and at least two Assistant Public Advocates, who shall serve at the pleasure of the Public Advocate, and may have such other staff as provided according to the budgetary and fiscal provisions of the Charter. The position of Chief Deputy Public Advocate shall be exempt from competitive civil service selection, appointment, and removal procedures under Section 10.104(2), and the position of Assistant Public Advocate shall be exempt under Section 10.104(14).

- (c) The City Attorney shall be the attorney for the Public Advocate.
- (d) The Public Advocate shall have an office in City Hall.
- (e) During his or her tenure, the Public Advocate shall not contribute to, solicit contributions to, publicly endorse or oppose or urge the endorsement of or opposition to or otherwise participate in a campaign for a candidate for City elective office, other than himself or herself, or be an officer, director, or employee of or hold a policy-making position in an organization that makes political endorsements regarding candidates for City elective office.
- (f) No person shall serve as Public Advocate for more than two successive terms. There shall be no limit on the number of non-successive terms that a person may serve as Public Advocate. A part of a term that exceeds two years shall count as full term for these purposes, but the term of the first Public Advocate elected to a shortened term to expire at noon on January 8, 2021 under Section 13.101(b)(6) shall not be deemed to be a full term.
- (g) No person shall be eligible to serve as Public Advocate who in the last four years held the office of Mayor, member of the Board of Supervisors, City Attorney, District Attorney, Treasurer, Sheriff, Assessor-Recorder, or Public Defender.

# ARTICLE VIIIC: OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC ADVOCATE SEC. 8C.101. PUBLIC ADVOCATE—GENERAL POWERS AND DUTIES.

(a) Access to City Records. Except as provided below, the Public Advocate shall have timely access to all records in the possession of City officers and agencies that the Public Advocate deems necessary to complete the investigations, inquiries, and reviews required of him or her by the Charter or other City law, and if necessary may issue subpoenas to enforce his or her right of access to such records. The Public Advocate shall not have a right of access to records the disclosure of which is forbidden by state or federal law, or records protected from disclosure by privileges under federal, state, or local law, or other confidentiality provisions the

existence of which is derived from some source of state law other than the Public Records Act, including, but not limited to, criminal investigation and prosecution files. The Public Advocate may not disclose records that the City officer or agency possessing the records may decline to disclose under the Public Records Act and the Sunshine Ordinance, as amended, or any successor legislation, if the officer or agency declines to disclose such records.

- (b) Access to Third-Party Witnesses and Records. In performing his or her duties, the Public Advocate may administer oaths, take testimony, and, if necessary to complete the investigations, inquiries, and reviews required of him or her by the Charter, issue subpoenas to require witnesses to appear and produce evidence. The Public Advocate may seek enforcement of such subpoenas in the manner prescribed by law.
- (c) Introduce Legislation. The Public Advocate may introduce legislation at the Board of Supervisors to address any matter within the Public Advocate's jurisdiction. The Public Advocate may not introduce legislation addressing specific contract or personnel decisions unless those contracts or personnel decisions involve the Office of the Public Advocate.
- (d) Non-Interference. The Public Advocate shall not have any power or authority over, nor shall the Public Advocate dictate, suggest or interfere with any appointment, promotion, compensation, disciplinary action, contract or requisition for purchase or other administrative actions or recommendations of an elected official, the Controller, or the City Administrator, or of department heads under the Mayor, the City Administrator or under a board or commission. The Public Advocate shall not have any power or authority over, nor shall the Public Advocate dictate, suggest, or interfere with, any criminal investigation or prosecution.
- (e) Hearings. The Public Advocate may hold public hearings in the course of fulfilling the requirements of this Article VIIIC.
- (f) Confidentiality of Records. The Public Advocate may, to the extent permitted by state law, designate the records of any investigation, including but not limited to information that

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

1

would reveal the identity of complainants and witnesses, as confidential information. It shall be official misconduct for any person to disclose information about any such investigation, except as necessary to conduct the investigation, or with proper authorization, or as required by law or lawful process. The Public Advocate may disclose confidential information to the District Attorney to initiate or assist in a criminal investigation or prosecution. The unauthorized release of confidential information shall be sufficient grounds for the termination of any employee.

- (g) Reports. The Public Advocate may issue reports relating to the operations or activities of any City officer or agency, including recommendations for administrative or legislative changes. The Public Advocate may, to the extent permitted by state law, designate any portion of any draft, preliminary, or final report as confidential information. Before making public any portion of any draft, preliminary, or final report, the Public Advocate shall send a copy of the report to any officer, and to the head of any agency, discussed in such report and provide the officer and agency, in writing, with a reasonable deadline for their review and response. The Public Advocate shall include in any report, or portion thereof, that is made public a copy of all such officer and agency responses, after redacting any information contained in such responses that is confidential under state law.
- (h) Annual Report. Not later than December 1 of each year, the Public Advocate shall present to the Board of Supervisors, the Mayor, the City Administrator, and the Controller a report on the activities of the office during the preceding fiscal year. The report may include:
- (1) A statistical summary of the complaints received during such fiscal year, categorized by agency, type of complaint, agency response, mode of resolution, and such other factors as the Public Advocate deems appropriate;

- (2) An analysis of recurring complaints and complaints raising systemic or citywide issues and the Public Advocate's recommendations for administrative, legislative, or budgetary actions to resolve the underlying problems causing the complaints;
- (3) A summary of the findings and recommendations of the agency program reviews conducted during the fiscal year and a summary of each agency's responses to such findings and recommendations; and
- (4) Legislative proposals to improve the provision of City services and programs.

  The Public Advocate may include in this report an assessment of the fiscal implications of any recommendations presented in the report.
- (i) Outside Experts. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Charter or any ordinance or regulation of the City, the Public Advocate may contract with outside, independent experts to assist in performing the requirements of this Article VIIIC. In doing so, the Public Advocate shall make good faith efforts to comply with the provisions of Chapters 12 et seq. of the Administrative Code, as amended, or any successor legislation, but shall not be subject to the approval processes of other City agencies. The Public Advocate shall submit an annual report to the Board of Supervisors summarizing any contracts issued pursuant to this Section and discussing the Public Advocate's compliance with Chapters 12 et seq. Contracts issued by the Public Advocate pursuant to this Section shall be subject to the requirements of Sections 6.102 and 9.118.

No outside expert or firm shall be eligible to participate or assist in an audit or investigation of any issue, matter, or question as to which that expert or firm has previously rendered compensated advice or services to any individual, corporation, or other entity, or City official or department. The Public Advocate shall adopt appropriate written regulations implementing this prohibition, and shall incorporate this requirement in all written contracts with outside experts and firms utilized pursuant to this subsection (i).

#### SEC. 8C.102. PUBLIC ADVOCATE—REVIEW OF CITY PROGRAMS.

- (a) The Public Advocate may review the administration of City programs by City agencies. Such reviews may include, but not be limited to, evaluations of: (1) the distribution of City programs and services throughout the City; (2) the effectiveness of the public information and service complaint programs of City agencies; and (3) the responsiveness of City agencies to individual and group requests for data or information regarding the agencies' structure, activities, and operations. The Public Advocate shall submit any reports documenting or summarizing such reviews to the Board of Supervisors, the Mayor, and the appropriate agency, and shall include in such reports his or her recommendations for addressing the problems identified and, if appropriate, the fiscal implications of such recommendations.
- (b) The Public Advocate may review the management and employment practices of City officers and departments, including City policies and MOU provisions, that promote or impede the effective and efficient operation of City government, including management of workers' compensation claims and overtime expenditures.
- (c) The Public Advocate may review the City's contracting procedures and compliance with contracting rules and standards.
- (d) The Public Advocate may conduct performance audits of City departments, services, programs, and other activities. Nothing in this Section 8C.102 shall affect the powers or duties of the Controller acting as City Services Auditor under Charter Section F1.104, and the Public Advocate may coordinate with the City Services Auditor when both officers decide to conduct a performance audit of the same City department, service, program, or activity.

. . .

# SEC. 8C.103. PUBLIC ADVOCATE—INDIVIDUAL COMPLAINTS.

- (a) The Public Advocate may receive, investigate, and attempt to resolve complaints from members of the public concerning City services, programs, or activities, except for those that:
  - (1) another City agency is required by law to adjudicate;
- (2) may be resolved through a grievance mechanism established by collective bargaining agreement or contract; or,
- (3) involve allegations of conduct that may constitute a violation of criminal law.

  If the Public Advocate receives a complaint that involves conduct of a City employee that could lead to discipline, the Public Advocate shall consult with and, where appropriate, refer the matter to, the Department of Human Resources. If the Public Advocate receives a complaint that is subject to a procedure described in items (1) or (2) of this subsection (a), the Public Advocate shall advise the complainant of the appropriate procedure for the resolution of such complaint. If the Public Advocate receives a complaint of the type described in item (3) of this subsection, the Public Advocate shall promptly refer the matter in accordance with subsection (c).
- (b) The Public Advocate shall establish procedures for receiving and processing complaints, responding to complainants, conducting investigations, and reporting findings, and shall inform the public about such procedures. Upon an initial determination that a complaint may be valid or that the Public Advocate is not in a position to judge whether it may be valid, the Public Advocate shall refer the complaint to the appropriate agency for resolution. If such agency does not resolve the complaint in a manner that is satisfactory to the Public Advocate within a reasonable time, the Public Advocate may conduct an investigation and make specific recommendations to the agency for resolution of the complaint. If, within a reasonable time after the Public Advocate has completed an investigation and submitted recommendations to the agency, such agency has failed to respond to the recommendations in a manner that is

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

1

satisfactory to the Public Advocate, the Public Advocate may issue a report to the Board of

Supervisors, the Mayor, and the agency. Such report shall describe the conclusions of the

investigation and make such recommendations for administrative, legislative, or budgetary

action, together with their fiscal implications, as the Public Advocate deems necessary to resolve

the complaint or to address the underlying problems discovered in the investigation. In

exercising its functions under this subsection (b), the Public Advocate may treat related

complaints together.

(c) If the Public Advocate receives a complaint alleging conduct that may constitute a violation of conflict of interest or governmental ethics laws, he or she shall promptly refer the complaint to the Ethics Commission and the City Attorney. If the Public Advocate receives a complaint alleging conduct that may constitute a violation of criminal law, he or she shall promptly refer the complaint and information in his or her possession regarding the alleged violation to the District Attorney.

If during the conduct of any investigation, inquiry, or review authorized by this section, the Public Advocate discovers that the matter involves conduct that may constitute a violation of conflict of interest or governmental ethics laws, he or she shall take no further action but shall promptly refer the matter to the Ethics Commission and the City Attorney. If during the conduct of any investigation, inquiry, or review authorized by this section, the Public Advocate discovers that the matter involves conduct that may constitute a violation of criminal law, he or she shall take no further action but shall promptly refer the matter and information in his or her possession to the District Attorney.

Before making a determination whether alleged conduct may constitute a violation of conflict of interest or governmental ethics laws, the Public Advocate shall consult with the City Attorney. Before making a determination whether alleged conduct may constitute a violation of criminal law, the Public Advocate shall consult with the District Attorney.

#### SEC. 8C.104. PUBLIC ADVOCATE—WHISTLEBLOWERS.

- (a) The Public Advocate shall have the authority to receive complaints by members of the public concerning: incorrect, unreasonable, or unfair decisions or rulings of City officers or agencies; inconsistent enforcement, or failure to enforce, laws, rules or regulations; poor or inadequate service delivery or treatment; poor communication, including unreasonably long response or wait times and unreasonable response delays; or inequitable or inefficient provision of City services. The Public Advocate shall investigate and otherwise attempt to resolve such individual complaints except for those that:
  - (1) another City agency is required by federal, state, or local law to adjudicate,
- (2) may be resolved through a grievance mechanism established by collective bargaining agreement or contract.
  - (3) involve allegations of conduct that may constitute a violation of criminal law,
  - (4) are assigned to the Controller under Section F1.107; or
- (5) are subject to an investigation by the District Attorney, the City Attorney, or the Ethics Commission, where either official or the Commission states in writing that investigation by the Public Advocate would substantially impede or delay his, her, or its own investigation of the matter.

If the Public Advocate receives a complaint described in items (1), (2), (3), or (4) of this subsection (a), the Public Advocate shall advise the complainant of the appropriate procedure for the resolution of such complaint.

(b) If the Public Advocate receives a complaint alleging conduct that may constitute a conflict of interest or governmental ethics law, he or she shall promptly refer the complaint to the Ethics Commission and the City Attorney. If the Public Advocate receives a complaint alleging conduct that may constitute a violation of criminal law, he or she shall promptly refer

 $\begin{array}{c|cc}
1 & \underline{th} \\
2 & \underline{in} \\
3 & \underline{cr} \\
\end{array}$ 

the complaint and information regarding the alleged violation to the District Attorney. Nothing in this Section 8C.104 shall preclude the Public Advocate from investigating whether any alleged criminal conduct also violates any civil or administrative law, statute, ordinance, resolution, or regulation.

Within 10 working days after receipt of the complaint and information, the City Attorney or the District Attorney shall inform the Public Advocate in writing regarding whether either office has initiated or intends to pursue an investigation of the matter. If either office informs the Public Advocate in writing that the office will pursue the case, the Public Advocate shall suspend its own investigation.

Before making a determination whether alleged conduct may constitute a violation of conflict of interest or governmental ethics laws, the Public Advocate shall consult with the City Attorney. Before making a determination whether alleged conduct may constitute a violation of criminal law, the Public Advocate shall consult with the District Attorney.

### SEC. 8C. 105. PUBLIC ADVOCATE—CUSTOMER SERVICE PLANS.

The Public Advocate shall assess the progress of City departments' compliance with Charter Section 16.120 and any implementing ordinances requiring City departments to prepare effective customer service plans. The Public Advocate shall make recommendations to departments to improve the effectiveness of such plans, or to the Mayor and the Board of Supervisors regarding improvements in such plans generally. The Public Advocate shall report to the Board of Supervisors and Mayor the failure of any department to comply substantially with the Public Advocate's recommendations regarding customer service plans.

1 1 1

#### SEC. 8C.106. PUBLIC ADVOCATE—POLICY REGARDING FUNDING AND STAFFING.

The voters declare that it shall be the policy of the City and County of San Francisco to provide sufficient funding and administrative support for the Office of the Public Advocate to perform its functions, and recommend that the Office have at least one staff member per Supervisorial district to perform constituent services and at least one staff member per Supervisorial district to perform investigations. The Public Advocate may request a determination from the Ethics Commission whether the Office's funding is sufficient for these purposes.

#### SEC. 10.104. EXCLUSIONS FROM CIVIL SERVICE APPOINTMENT.

All employees of the City and County shall be appointed through competitive examination unless exempted by this Charter. The following positions shall be exempt from competitive civil service selection, appointment and removal procedures, and the person serving in the position shall serve at the pleasure of the appointing authority:

\* \* \* \*

- 2. All elected officers of the City and County and their chief deputies or chief assistants;
- 14. The law librarian, assistant law librarians, bookbinder of the Law Library, purchaser, curators, Assistant Sheriff, Deputy Port Director, Chief of the Bureau of Maritime Affairs, Director of Administration and Finance of the Port, Port Sales Manager, Port Traffic Manager, Chief Wharfinger, Port Commercial Property Manager, Actuary of the *Employees'* Employee's Retirement System, Director of the Zoo, Chief Veterinarian of the Zoo, Director of the Arboretum and Botanical Garden, Director of Employee Relations, Health Service Administrator, Executive Assistant to the Human Services Director, Assistant Public Advocate, and any other positions designated as exempt under the 1932 Charter, as amended;

9

6

12 13

14

151617

19

20

18

2122

23

2425

#### SEC. 13.101. TERMS OF ELECTIVE OFFICE.

- (a) Except in the case of an appointment or election to fill a vacancy, the term of office of each elected officer shall commence at  $\frac{12:00}{0}$  noon on the eighth day of January following the date of the election.
- (b) Subject to the applicable provisions of Section 13.102, the elected officers of the City and County shall be elected as follows:
- (1) At the general municipal election in 1995 and every fourth year thereafter, a Mayor, a Sheriff and a District Attorney shall be elected.
- (2) At the general municipal election in 1996 and every fourth year thereafter, four members of the Board of Education and four members of the Governing Board of the Community College District shall be elected.
- (3) At the general municipal election in 2013, and at the general municipal election in 2015 and every fourth year thereafter, a City Attorney and a Treasurer shall be elected. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Charter including Section 6.100, the term of office for the person elected City Attorney or Treasurer at the general municipal election in 2013 shall be two years.
- (4) At the general municipal election in 2006 and every fourth year thereafter, an Assessor-Recorder and Public Defender shall be elected.
- (5) At the general municipal election in 1998 and every fourth year thereafter, three members of the Board of Education and three members of the Governing Board of the Community College District shall be elected.
- (6) At the first Citywide general or special municipal election occurring after January 1, 2017, a Public Advocate shall be elected. Thereafter, at the general municipal

election in 2020 and every fourth year thereafter, the Public Advocate shall be elected.

Notwithstanding any other provision of this Charter including Section 6.100, the term of office for the person elected Public Advocate at the first Citywide general or special municipal election after January 1, 2017, shall expire at noon on January 8, 2021.

(7) (6) The election and terms of office of members of the Board of Supervisors shall be governed by Section 13.110.

#### **SEC. 13.101.5. VACANCIES.**

- (a) If the office of Assessor-Recorder, City Attorney, District Attorney, Public Defender, Sheriff, Treasurer, or Member of the Board of Supervisors, Board of Education, or Governing Board of the Community College District becomes vacant because of death, resignation, recall, permanent disability, or the inability of the respective officer to otherwise carry out the responsibilities of the office, the Mayor shall appoint an individual qualified to fill the vacancy under this Charter and state laws. If the office of Public Advocate becomes vacant because of death, resignation, recall, permanent disability, or the inability of the incumbent to otherwise carry out the responsibilities of the office, the Chief Deputy Public Advocate shall serve as Public Advocate until a successor is selected pursuant to subsection (c).
- (b) If the Office of Mayor becomes vacant because of death, resignation, recall, permanent disability, or the inability to carry out the responsibilities of the office, the President of the Board of Supervisors shall become Acting Mayor and shall serve until a successor is appointed by the Board of Supervisors *by motion*.
- (c) Any person filling a vacancy pursuant to subsection (a) or (b) of this Section shall serve until a successor is selected at the next election occurring not less than 120 days after the vacancy, at which time an election shall be held to fill the unexpired term, provided that (1) if an election for the vacated office is scheduled to occur less than one year after the vacancy, the

appointee shall serve until a successor is selected at that election or (2) if an election for any seat on the same board as the vacated seat is scheduled to occur less than one year but at least 120 days after the vacancy, the appointee shall serve until a successor is selected at that election to fill the unexpired term.

(d) If no candidate receives a majority of the votes cast at an election to fill a vacated office, the two candidates receiving the most votes shall qualify to have their names placed on the ballot for a municipal runoff election at the next regular or otherwise scheduled election occurring not less than five weeks later. If an instant runoff election process is enacted for the offices enumerated in this Section, that process shall apply to any election required by this Section.

# SEC. 13.102. INSTANT RUNOFF ELECTIONS; *RANKED-CHOICE VOTING ELECTIONS*.

- (a) For the purposes of this <u>Section section</u>: (1) a candidate shall be deemed "continuing" if the candidate has not been eliminated <u>from further rounds of tabulation</u>; (2) a ballot shall be deemed "continuing" if it is not exhausted; and (3) a ballot shall be deemed "exhausted," and not <u>included eounted</u> in further stages of the tabulation, if all of the choices have been eliminated or there are no more choices indicated on the ballot. If a ranked-choice ballot gives equal rank to two or more candidates, the ballot shall be declared exhausted when such multiple rankings are reached. If a voter casts a ranked-choice ballot but skips a rank, the voter's vote shall be transferred to that voter's next ranked choice.
- (b) The Mayor, Sheriff, District Attorney, City Attorney, Treasurer, Assessor-Recorder, Public Defender, <u>Public Advocate</u>, and members of the Board of Supervisors shall be elected using a ranked-choice, <u>or "instant runoff,"</u> ballot. The ballot shall allow voters to rank a number of choices in order of preference equal to the total number of candidates for each office;

provided, however, *that* if the voting system, vote tabulation system, or similar or related equipment used by the City and County cannot feasibly accommodate choices equal to the total number of candidates running for each office, then the Director of Elections may limit the number of choices a voter may rank to no fewer than three. The ballot shall in no way interfere with a voter's ability to cast a vote for a write-in candidate.

- (c) If a candidate receives a majority of the first choices, that candidate shall be declared elected. If no candidate receives a majority, the candidate who received the fewest first choices shall be eliminated *from further rounds of tabulation* and each vote cast for that candidate shall be transferred to the next ranked candidate on that voter's ballot. If, after this transfer of votes, any candidate has a majority of the votes from the continuing ballots, that candidate shall be declared elected.
- (d) If no candidate receives a majority of votes from the continuing ballots after a candidate has been eliminated *from further rounds of tabulation* and his or her votes have been transferred to the next-ranked candidate, the continuing candidate with the fewest votes from the continuing ballots shall be eliminated *from further rounds of tabulation*. All votes cast for that candidate shall be transferred to the next-ranked continuing candidate on each voter's ballot. This process of eliminating candidates *from further rounds of tabulation* and transferring their votes to the next-ranked continuing candidates shall be repeated until a candidate receives a majority of the votes from the continuing ballots.
- (e) If the total number of votes of the two or more candidates credited with the lowest number of votes is less than the number of votes credited to the candidate with the next highest number of votes, those candidates with the lowest number of votes shall be eliminated <u>from</u> <u>further rounds of tabulation</u> simultaneously and their votes transferred to the next-ranked continuing candidate on each ballot in a single counting operation.
  - (f) A tie between two or more candidates shall be resolved in accordance with State law.

- (g) The Department of Elections shall conduct a voter education campaign to familiarize voters with the ranked-choice *or*, *"instant runoff,"* method of voting.
- (h) Any voting system, vote tabulation system, or similar or related equipment acquired by the City and County shall have the capability to accommodate this system of ranked-choice, or "instant runoff," balloting.
- (i) Ranked choice, or "instant runoff," balloting shall be used for the general municipal election in November 2002 and all subsequent elections. If the Director of Elections certifies to the Board of Supervisors and the Mayor no later than July 1, 2002 that the Department will not be ready to implement ranked-choice balloting in November 2002, then the City shall begin using ranked-choice, or "instant runoff," balloting at the November 2003 general municipal election.

If ranked-choice, or "instant runoff," balloting is not used in November of 2002, and no candidate for any elective office of the City and County, except the Board of Education and the Governing Board of the Community College District, receives a majority of the votes cast at an election for such office, the two candidates receiving the most votes shall qualify to have their names placed on the ballot for a runoff election held on the second Tuesday in December of 2002.

#### SEC. 15.105. SUSPENSION AND REMOVAL.

(a) ELECTIVE AND CERTAIN APPOINTED OFFICERS. Any elective officer <u>other</u> <u>than the Mayor</u>, and any member of the Airport Commission, Asian Art Commission, Civil Service Commission, Commission on the Status of Women, Golden Gate Concourse Authority Board of Directors, Health Commission, Human Services Commission, Juvenile Probation Commission, Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors, Port Commission, Public Utilities Commission, Recreation and Park Commission, Fine Arts Museums Board of Trustees,

Taxi Commission, War Memorial and Performing Art Center Board of Trustees, Board of Education or Community College Board is subject to suspension and removal for official misconduct as provided in this section. Such officer may be suspended by the Mayor and the Mayor shall appoint a qualified person to discharge the duties of the office during the period of suspension. Upon such suspension, the Mayor shall immediately notify the Ethics Commission and Board of Supervisors thereof in writing and the cause thereof, and shall present written charges against such suspended officer to the Ethics Commission and Board of Supervisors at or prior to their next regular meetings following such suspension, and shall immediately furnish a copy of the same to such officer, who shall have the right to appear with counsel before the Ethics Commission in his or her defense.

The Ethics Commission shall hold a hearing not less than five days after the filing of written charges. After the hearing, the Ethics Commission shall transmit the full record of the hearing to the Board of Supervisors with a recommendation as to whether the charges should be sustained. If, after reviewing the complete record, the charges are sustained by not less than a three-fourths vote of all members of the Board of Supervisors, the suspended officer shall be removed from office; if not so sustained, or if not acted on by the Board of Supervisors within 30 days after the receipt of the record from the Ethics Commission, the suspended officer shall thereby be reinstated.

Notwithstanding any other provision of this Section 15.105, the Mayor may file written charges of official misconduct against the Public Advocate and those charges shall be heard and acted on by the Ethics Commission and the Board of Supervisors in the same manner as other charges of official misconduct, but the Mayor shall have no power to suspend the Public Advocate prior to the determination of those charges by the Board of Supervisors.

\* \* \* \*

789

10

11121314

15161718

192021

2223

24

25

#### SEC. A8.409-1. EMPLOYEES COVERED.

\* \* \* \*

Except as otherwise provided by this Charter, the Civil Service Commission shall set the wages and benefits of all elected officials of the City and County of San Francisco as follows: The Commission shall conduct a salary survey of the offices of chief executive officer, county counsel, district attorney, public defender, assessor-recorder, treasurer, and sheriff, in the counties of Alameda, Contra Costa, Marin, San Mateo, and Santa Clara. The Commission shall then average the salaries for each of those offices to determine respectively the base five-year salaries for the Mayor, City Attorney, District Attorney, Public Defender, Assessor-Recorder, Treasurer, and Sheriff.

If any of the aforementioned counties do not have an office of public defender, that county shall be omitted from the salary survey for purposes of determining the base five-year salary of the Public Defender. Among the aforementioned counties, any freestanding county assessor's office or any county office in which the assessor's function is combined with other county functions, shall be deemed comparable to the office of Assessor-Recorder for purposes of determining the base five-year salary of the Assessor-Recorder. If any of the aforementioned counties do not have a comparable county office of treasurer, the county office whose functions most closely resemble the Treasurer's functions in San Francisco shall be deemed comparable to the office of Treasurer for purposes of determining the base five-year salary of the Treasurer.

The initial base five-year salary determination for the respective salaries of the Mayor, City Attorney, District Attorney, Public Defender, Assessor-Recorder, Treasurer, and Sheriff shall apply to the period from July 1, 2007 through June 30, 2012. Subsequent base five-year salary determinations for those offices shall apply to subsequent five-year periods, for example, July 1, 2012 through June 30, 2017.

For the second, third, fourth, and fifth years of the period for which any base five-year salary has been set, the Commission shall annually adjust the respective salaries of the Mayor, City Attorney, District Attorney, Public Defender, Assessor-Recorder, Treasurer, and Sheriff, to account for upward annual movement in the Consumer Price Index during the prior calendar year; provided, that whenever the upward movement in the Consumer Price Index during the prior calendar year exceeds 5%, the cost-of-living adjustment shall not be the actual increase in the Consumer Price Index for the prior calendar year but instead shall be 5%. The annual cost-of-living adjustment shall take effect July 1 of the second, third, fourth, and fifth years of the period for which the base five-year salary has been set.

The Civil Service Commission shall set the salary of the Public Advocate every five years

based on a salary survey of comparable offices, or using such other methodology as the

Commission deems appropriate.

Except as noted below, in setting the initial and subsequent base five-year salary determinations for the offices of Mayor, City Attorney, District Attorney, Public Defender, Assessor-Recorder, Treasurer, and Sheriff, the Commission may not reduce the respective salaries of any of those offices. If implementation of the process for setting the base five-year salary would otherwise result in a salary reduction for any of those offices, the base five-year salary for the affected office or offices shall be the existing salary for the office.

If the City and County of San Francisco and employee organizations agree to amend the compensation provisions of existing memoranda of understanding to reduce costs, the Commission shall review and amend the respective salaries of the Mayor, City Attorney, District Attorney, Public Defender, Assessor-Recorder, Treasurer, *and* Sheriff, *and Public Advocate* as necessary to achieve comparable cost savings in the affected fiscal year or years.

The Commission shall annually set the benefits of elected officials, to take effect July 1 of each year. Benefits of elected officials may equal but may not exceed those benefits provided

to any classification of miscellaneous officers and employees as of July 1 of each year, except, after January 7, 2012, the City and County shall not pay the required employee contributions of said officials into the San Francisco Employees' Retirement System trust fund or into the Retiree Health Care Trust Fund.

In addition, subject to the approval or disapproval of the Board of Supervisors, the Mayor may create, for employees designated as management, a management compensation package that recognizes and provides incentives for outstanding managerial performance contributing to increased productivity and efficiency in the work force. In formulating such a package, the Mayor shall take into account data developed in conjunction with the civil service commission regarding the terms of executive compensation in other public and private jurisdictions.

#### F1.102. STREET, SIDEWALK, AND PARK CLEANING AND MAINTENANCE.

- (a) The Services Audit Unit shall conduct annually a performance audit of the City's street, sidewalk, and public park maintenance and cleaning operations. The annual audit shall:
- (1) Include quantifiable, measurable, objective standards for street, sidewalk, and park maintenance, to be developed in cooperation and consultation with the Department of Public Works and the Recreation and Park Department;
- (2) Based upon such measures, report on the condition of each geographic portion of the City;
- (3) To the extent that standards are not met, assess the causes of such failure and make recommendations of actions that will enhance the achievement of those standards in the future;
- (4) Ensure that all bond funds related to streets, parks and open space are spent in strict accordance with the stated purposes and permissible uses of such bonds, as approved by the voters.

Outside of the audit process, the City departments charged with cleaning and maintaining streets, sidewalks, and parks shall remain responsible for addressing individual complaints regarding specific sites, although the Controller may receive and investigate such complaints under Section F1.107.

(b) In addition, all City agencies engaged in street, sidewalk, or park maintenance shall establish regular maintenance schedules for streets, sidewalks, parks and park facilities, which shall be available to the public and on the department's website. Each such department shall monitor compliance with these schedules, and shall publish regularly data showing the extent to which the department has met its published schedules. The City Services Audit Unit shall audit each department's compliance with these requirements annually, and shall furnish recommendations for meaningful ways in which information regarding the timing, amount and kind of services provided may be gathered and furnished to the public.

#### F1.107. CITIZENS' COMPLAINTS; WHISTLEBLOWERS.

- (a) The Controller shall have the authority to receive <u>and investigate</u> individual complaints concerning: the misuse of City funds by officers or employees; the use of City equipment or time for personal purposes; the purchase of unneeded supplies or equipment; nonperformance, or inadequate performance of, contractually-required services; or, improper or wasteful activities by City officers or employees. the quality and delivery of government services, wasteful and inefficient City government practices, misuse of City government funds, and improper activities by City government officers and employees. When appropriate, the Controller shall investigate and otherwise attempt to resolve such individual complaints except for those which:
  - (1) another City agency is required by federal, state, or local law to adjudicate,

- (2) may be resolved through a grievance mechanism established by collective bargaining agreement or contract,
- (3) involve allegations of conduct which may constitute a violation of criminal law,

#### (4) are assigned to the Public Advocate under Section 8C.104; or

(5) (4) are subject to an existing, ongoing investigation by the District Attorney, the City Attorney, or the Ethics Commission, where either official or the Commission states in writing that investigation by the Controller would substantially impede or delay his, her, or its own investigation of the matter.

If the Controller receives a complaint described in items (1), (2), (3), or (4) of this paragraph, the Controller shall advise the complainant of the appropriate procedure for the resolution of such complaint.

- (b) If the Controller receives a complaint alleging conduct that may constitute a violation of criminal law or a governmental ethics law, he or she shall promptly refer the complaint regarding criminal conduct to the District Attorney or other appropriate law enforcement agency and shall refer complaints regarding violations of governmental ethics laws to the Ethics Commission and the City Attorney. Nothing in this Section shall preclude the Controller from investigating whether any alleged criminal conduct also violates any civil or administrative law, statute, ordinance, or regulation.
- (c) Notwithstanding any provision of this Charter, including, but not limited to Section C3.699-11, or any ordinance or regulation of the City and County of San Francisco, the Controller shall administer a whistleblower and citizen complaint hotline telephone number and website and, *together with the Public Advocate*, publicize the hotline and website through press releases, public advertising, and communications to City employees. The Controller shall receive and track calls and emails related to complaints about the quality and delivery of

3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

23

24

25

1

2

government services, wasteful and inefficient City government practices, misuse of government funds and improper activities by City government officials, employees and contractors and shall route these complaints to the appropriate agency subject to subsection (a) of this Section. The Board of Supervisors shall enact and maintain an ordinance protecting the confidentiality of whistleblowers, and protecting City officers and employees from retaliation for filing a complaint with, or providing information to, the Controller, Ethics Commission, District Attorney, City Attorney or a City department or commission about improper government activity by City officers and employees. The City may incorporate all whistleblower functions set forth in this Charter or by ordinances into a unified City call center, switchboard, or information number at a later time, provided the supervision of the whistleblower function remains with the Controller and its responsibilities and function continue unabridged.

(d) The Controller shall on a quarterly basis prepare summaries of all complaints received by the Controller's whistleblower program and transmit those summaries to the Public Advocate. The Public Advocate shall review the summaries by complaint type, department involved, and other factors to identify trends in complaints and prepare recommendations for the improvement of City controls and services. To the extent permitted by state law, the City shall keep these summaries confidential.

(e) The Public Advocate and the Controller may from time to time and by written agreement shift between themselves jurisdictional responsibilities for investigation and reporting types of whistleblower complaints established in the Charter. The Public Advocate and the Controller shall submit a copy of any such agreement to the Mayor and the Board of Supervisors, and make the agreement available to the public.

1 1 1

#### F1.108. CUSTOMER SERVICE PLANS.

The Controller shall assess the progress of City departments' compliance with Charter Section 16.120 and any implementing ordinances requiring City departments to prepare effective customer service plans. The Controller shall make recommendations to departments to improve the effectiveness of such plans. The Controller shall report to the Board of Supervisors and Mayor the failure of any department to comply substantially with the Controller's recommendations regarding customer service plans.

#### SEC. F1.114. *OPERATIVE DATE*; SEVERABILITY.

(a) This charter amendment shall be operative on July 1, 2004. This amendment shall not affect the term or tenure of the incumbent Controller.

(b) If any section, subsection, provision or part of this <u>Appendix F</u> charter amendment or its application to any person or circumstances is held to be unconstitutional or invalid, the remainder of <u>Appendix F</u> the amendment, and the application of such provision to other persons or circumstances, shall not be affected.

Section 2. Except for the provisions relating to the election of the Public Advocate which shall become operative on the effective date of the charter amendment, the provisions of this charter amendment shall become operative at the date and time that the first Public Advocate takes office.

APPROVED AS TO FORM: DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

24 By:

THOMAS J. OWEN
Deputy City Attorney

n:\legana\as2016\1600489\01118809.docx

#### LEGISLATIVE DIGEST

(Second Draft, dated 7/6/2016)

[Charter Amendment - Public Advocate]

Describing and setting forth a proposal to the voters, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016, to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to: 1) create the Office of the Public Advocate; 2) set the Public Advocate's powers and duties; 3) authorize the Public Advocate to review the administration of City programs, including programs for transmitting information to the public, and to receive, investigate, and attempt to resolve complaints regarding City services and programs; 4) authorize the Public Advocate to receive and investigate specified whistleblower complaints; 5) provide for the Public Advocate's election, removal, and salary; and, 6) set City policy regarding sufficient funding and minimum staffing for the Office of the Public Advocate; and setting an operative date.

#### **Existing Law**

The City currently does not have a particular official or central office responsible for overseeing how City departments interact with the public. The City has a whistleblower program under the Controller.

#### Amendments to Current Law

The proposal is a charter amendment that would create the Office of the Public Advocate.

The Public Advocate would review the administration of City programs, including the distribution of programs and services throughout the City, the effectiveness of the public information and service complaint programs of City agencies, and the responsiveness of City agencies to individual and group requests for data or information regarding the agencies' structure, activities, and operations. The Public Advocate would also review the management and employment practices of City officers and departments, including City policies and MOU provisions, that promote or impede the effective and efficient operation of City government, and would review the City's contracting procedures and practices. And the Public Advocate would investigate and attempt to resolve complaints from members of the public concerning City services and programs.

The Public Advocate could introduce legislation at the Board of Supervisors to address any matter within the Public Advocate's jurisdiction.

The proposal would authorize the Public Advocate to receive and investigate confidential whistleblower complaints concerning: incorrect, unreasonable, or unfair decisions or rulings of City officers or agencies; inconsistent enforcement, or failure to enforce, laws, rules or regulations; poor or inadequate service delivery or treatment; poor communication, including unreasonably long response or wait times and unreasonable response delays; or inequitable or inefficient provision of City services. The Controller would continue to receive and investigate confidential whistleblower complaints concerning: the misuse of City funds by officers or employees; the use of City equipment or time for personal purposes; the purchase of unneeded supplies or equipment; nonperformance, or inadequate performance of, contractually-required services; or, improper or wasteful activities by City officers or employees.

The Public Advocate could not interfere with specific contract or personnel decisions or other administrative actions, or with criminal investigations or prosecutions. And during his or her tenure, the Public Advocate could not contribute to, or publicly endorse or oppose, a candidate for City elective office, or be an officer, director, or employee of an organization that makes political endorsements regarding candidates for City elective office.

The Public Advocate would be elected at a Citywide election, using ranked-choice voting, and serve a four-year term. The first Public Advocate would be elected at the first general or special municipal election occurring after January 1, 2017, and would serve a shortened term. Then, beginning with the general municipal election in 2020, the Public Advocate would be elected every four years. No person could serve as Public Advocate for more than two successive terms. And no person could serve as Public Advocate who in the last four years held the office of Mayor, member of the Board of Supervisors, City Attorney, District Attorney, Treasurer, Sheriff, Assessor-Recorder, or Public Defender.

The Mayor could file written charges of official misconduct against the Public Advocate and those charges would be heard and acted on by the Ethics Commission and the Board of Supervisors in the same manner as other charges of official misconduct, but the Mayor would have no power to suspend the Public Advocate prior to the determination of those charges by the Board of Supervisors.

The Civil Service Commission would set the salary of the Public Advocate every five years based on a salary survey of comparable offices, or using such other methodology as the Commission deemed appropriate.

The proposal would make it City policy to provide sufficient funding and administrative support for the Office of the Public Advocate to perform its functions, and to authorize the Office to have at least one staff member per Supervisorial district to perform constituent services and at least one staff member per Supervisorial district to perform investigations. The Public Advocate could request an advisory opinion from the Ethics Commission whether the City was providing the Office with sufficient funding to perform its duties.

n:\legana\as2016\1600489\01119557.docx

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS Page 2

Ben Rosenfield Controller

**Todd Rydstrom Deputy Controller** 

June 29, 2016

Ms. Angela Calvillo Clerk of the Board of Supervisors 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place Room 244 San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

RE: File 160583 – Charter amendment establishing an elected Office of the Public Advocate

Dear Ms. Calvillo,

Should the proposed charter amendment be approved by the voters, in my opinion, it would result in a significant increase in the cost of government.

Beginning in fiscal year 2017-18, there would be a new cost of approximately \$2.4 million annually under a budget set-aside required to fund a new Office of the Public Advocate, and this cost would increase or decrease at the same rate as the City budget going forward.

The proposed amendment would also move three existing functions from other City departments and place them under the Public Advocate. These are; the Office of Citizen Complaints which investigates citizen complaints regarding the Police, the Office of Labor Standards Enforcement which enforces and investigates complaints regarding violations of the City's wage and other labor laws, and the Controller's Whistleblower Program which investigates complaints regarding any misuse of public resources. Taken together, these functions are now budgeted at approximately \$12.8 million. The overall budget for the Office of the Public Advocate including the new set-aside and the budget requirements based on existing functions would be approximately \$15.2 million annually.

The proposed amendment requires a citywide special election in November 2017 at which the Public Advocate would be elected for an initial two year term. Thereafter, the Office of the Public Advocate would be included in the citywide four year election cycle beginning in November 2020 and would serve four year terms. The additional citywide special election would have a one-time cost of approximately \$4 million in the fiscal year 2017-18 budget.

The new required budget set-aside for the Public Advocate is set at three one-hundreths of one percent (0.03%) of the City budget, approximately \$2.4 million as of fiscal year 2016-2017. The amendment also reduces the existing budget set-aside of the Controller's City Services Auditor approved by voters in 2003 from two tenths of one percent (0.2%) to (0.1914%), a change equal to approximately \$688,000 as of the current budget.

The proposed new Office of the Public Advocate would have a variety of powers to review, investigate and make recommendations regarding the City's public information programs, complaint resolution processes, and it's management, contracting and employment practices. The authority and responsibility to perform these functions currently exists in various City departments. The proposed amendment does not substantially change these existing responsibilities. The Public Advocate would have the authority to introduce legislation.

The salary for the new Public Advocate would be set at the average of the other citywide elected officials—approximately \$216,000 annually based on current rates.

This proposed amendment is not in compliance with a non-binding, voter-adopted city policy regarding set-asides. The policy seeks to limit set-asides which reduce General Fund dollars that could otherwise be allocated by the Mayor and the Board of Supervisors in the annual budget process.

Note that the proposed amendment would change the budget, powers and duties of the Controller's Office, which has prepared this statement.

Sincerely,

Ben Rosenfield Controller Note: This analysis reflects our understanding of the proposal as of the date shown. At times further information is provided to us which may result in revisions being made to this analysis before the final Controller's statement appears in the Voter Information Pamphlet.



City Hall

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. 554-5184
Fax No. 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

June 2, 2016

File No. 160583

Sarah Jones Environmental Review Officer Planning Department 1650 Mission Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Dear Ms. Jones:

On May 24, 2016, Supervisors Campos introduced legislation for the following proposed Charter Amendment for the November 8, 2016, Election:

#### File No. 160583 Charter Amendment - Public Advocate

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to: 1) create the Office of the Public Advocate; 2) set the Public Advocate's powers and duties; 3) authorize the Public Advocate to review the administration of City programs, including programs for transmitting information to the public, and to receive, investigate, and attempt to resolve complaints regarding City services and programs; 4) place the Public Advocate in charge of the Office of Labor Standards Enforcement (OLSE), the Office of Citizen Complaints (OCC), and the Controller's whistleblower program; 5) call a special election for November 7, 2017, to elect the first Public Advocate; 6) provide for the Public Advocate's election, removal, and salary; and 7) establish a set-aside of 0.03% of the City's budget, as well as the amounts previously budgeted to OLSE, OCC, and the whistleblower program, to fund the Office of the Public Advocate, and setting an operative date, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

This legislation is being transmitted to you for environmental review.

Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board

By: Derek Evans, Assistant Clerk Rules Committee

Attachment

c: John Rahaim, Director, Planning Department AnMarie Rodgers, Planning Department Aaron Starr, Planning Department Joy Navarrete, Environmental Planner Jeanie Poling, Environmental Planner Not defined as a project under CEQA Guidelines Sections 15378 and 15060(c)(2) because it does not result in a physical change in the environment.



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. 554-5184
Fax No. 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

June 2, 2016

File No. 160583

Sarah Jones Environmental Review Officer Planning Department 1650 Mission Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94103

Dear Ms. Jones:

On May 24, 2016, Supervisors Campos introduced legislation for the following proposed Charter Amendment for the November 8, 2016, Election:

#### File No. 160583 Charter Amendment - Public Advocate

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to: 1) create the Office of the Public Advocate; 2) set the Public Advocate's powers and duties; 3) authorize the Public Advocate to review the administration of City programs, including programs for transmitting information to the public, and to receive, investigate, and attempt to resolve complaints regarding City services and programs; 4) place the Public Advocate in charge of the Office of Labor Standards Enforcement (OLSE), the Office of Citizen Complaints (OCC), and the Controller's whistleblower program; 5) call a special election for November 7, 2017, to elect the first Public Advocate; 6) provide for the Public Advocate's election, removal, and salary; and 7) establish a set-aside of 0.03% of the City's budget, as well as the amounts previously budgeted to OLSE, OCC, and the whistleblower program, to fund the Office of the Public Advocate, and setting an operative date, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

This legislation is being transmitted to you for environmental review.

Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board

By: Derek Evans, Assistant Clerk Rules Committee

Attachment

c: John Rahaim, Director, Planning Department AnMarie Rodgers, Planning Department Aaron Starr, Planning Department Joy Navarrete, Environmental Planner Jeanie Poling, Environmental Planner



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. 554-5184
Fax No. 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

## MEMORANDUM

TO:

Nicole Elliott, Mayor's Office

Jon Givner, Office of the City Attorney

John Arntz, Director, Department of Elections Joyce Hicks, Office of Citizen Complaints

Patrick Mulligan, Office of Labor Standards Enforcement

Toney Chaplin, Police Department George Gascon, District Attorney LeeAnn Pelham, Ethics Commission

FROM: VI

Derek Evans, Clerk, Rules Committee

Board of Supervisors

DATE:

June 2, 2016

SUBJECT:

CHARTER AMENDMENT INTRODUCED

November 8, 2016, Election

The Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee has received the following Charter Amendment for the November 8, 2016, Election, introduced by Supervisor Campos on May 24, 2016. This matter is being referred to you in accordance with Rules of Order 2.22.4.

#### File No. 160583 Charter Amendment - Public Advocate

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to: 1) create the Office of the Public Advocate; 2) set the Public Advocate's powers and duties; 3) authorize the Public Advocate to review the administration of City programs, including programs for transmitting information to the public, and to receive, investigate, and attempt to resolve complaints regarding City services and programs; 4) place the Public Advocate in charge of the Office of Labor Standards Enforcement (OLSE), the Office of Citizen Complaints (OCC), and the Controller's whistleblower program; 5) call a special election for November 7, 2017, to elect the first Public Advocate; 6) provide for the Public Advocate's election, removal, and salary; and 7) establish a set-aside of 0.03% of the City's budget, as well as the amounts previously budgeted to OLSE, OCC, and the whistleblower program, to fund the Office of the Public Advocate, and setting an operative date, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

Please review and submit any reports or comments you want to include with the legislative file.

If you have any questions or concerns, please call me at (415) 554-7702 or email: <a href="mailto:derek.evans@sfbgov.org">derek.evans@sfbgov.org</a>. To submit documentation, please forward to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.

c: Donna Levitt, Office of Labor Standards Enforcement Christine Fountain, Police Department Rachael Kilshaw, Police Department Shaista Shaikh, Ethics Commission



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. 554-5184
Fax No. 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

## MEMORANDUM

TO:

Ben Rosenfield, City Controller

FROM:

08

Derek Evans, Clerk, Rules Committee

**Board of Supervisors** 

DATE:

June 2, 2016

SUBJECT:

LEGISLATION INTRODUCED - CHARTER AMENDMENT

The Board of Supervisors Rules Committee has received the following legislation, introduced by Supervisor Campos on May 24, 2016. This matter is being referred to you in accordance with Rules of Order 2.22.3.

#### File No. 160583 Charter Amendment - Public Advocate

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to: 1) create the Office of the Public Advocate; 2) set the Public Advocate's powers and duties; 3) authorize the Public Advocate to review the administration of City programs, including programs for transmitting information to the public, and to receive, investigate, and attempt to resolve complaints regarding City services and programs; 4) place the Public Advocate in charge of the Office of Labor Standards Enforcement (OLSE), the Office of Citizen Complaints (OCC), and the Controller's whistleblower program; 5) call a special election for November 7, 2017, to elect the first Public Advocate; 6) provide for the Public Advocate's election, removal, and salary; and 7) establish a set-aside of 0.03% of the City's budget, as well as the amounts previously budgeted to OLSE, OCC, and the whistleblower program, to fund the Office of the Public Advocate, and setting an operative date, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

Please review and submit your written statement pursuant to the Charter to be included with the legislative file.

If you have any questions or concerns please call me at (415) 554-7702 or email <a href="mailto:derek.evans@sfgov.org">derek.evans@sfgov.org</a>. To submit documentation, please forward to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.

c: Todd Rydstrom, Office of the City Controller Maura Lane, Office of the City Controller

From:

pmonette-shaw <Pmonette-shaw@earthlink.net>

Sent:

Tuesday, July 05, 2016 4:50 PM

To: Cc: Tang, Katy (BOS); Mar, Eric (BOS); Cohen, Malia (BOS); Evans, Derek Farrell, Mark (BOS); Peskin, Aaron (BOS); Breed, London (BOS); Kim, Jane (BOS); Yee, Norman (BOS); Wiener, Scott; Campos, David (BOS); Avalos, John (BOS); Calvillo, Angela

(BOS)

Subject:

Support for Public Advocate Charter Change

July 5, 2016

**Rules Committee** 

San Francisco Board of Supervisors

The Honorable Katy Tang, Supervisor, San Francisco Board of Supervisors, Chair, Rules Committee

The Honorable Eric Mar, Supervisor, San Francisco Board of Supervisors, Member, Rules Committee

The Honorable Malia Cohen, Supervisor, San Francisco Board of Supervisors, Member, Rules Committee

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102

Re: Support for Public Advocate Charter

# **Change**

## Dear Rules Committee Members,

I urge the Rules Committee to unanimously forward a recommendation to the full Board of Supervisors to place the Public Advocate Charter change on November's ballot.

It's high time San Francisco join cities like New York City, Portland, Toronto and Seattle, along with other jurisdictions around the world, to create a Public Advocate position to serve as an Ombudsperson for everyday San Franciscans. Aren't we supposed to be a City that takes the lead in these sort of endeavors?

If New York City's Public Advocate saved \$170 million in 2015 alone, I'm sure a public Advocate in San Francisco could accomplish similar results here.

As a writer who has focused on public accountability from City Hall for a good number of years, I strongly support creating a Public Advocate position in San Francisco to counteract the lack of accountability and transparency from San Francisco's career politicians.

I am especially supportive of the provision in this Charter change to have the Public Advocate appoint the director of the Office of Citizens Complaints, something that is desperately needed to remove OCC from out of the complete control of SFPD.

My hope is that if Supervisors Kim, Mar and Cohen are not already co-sponsors of this proposed ballot measure, that each of them will quickly sign on to be a co-sponsor.

Please advance this out of Rules with a recommendation to the full Board to support this Charter change, and help the full Board place it on the ballot. Let the voters to decide on the merits at the ballot box regarding whether this is a step in the direction they want to see the City adopt to become a more transparent government.

Respectfully submitted,

# **Patrick Monette-Shaw**

Columnist/Reporter

Westside Observer Newspaper



# UNITED ASSOCIATION OF JOURNEYMEN AND APPRENTICES OF THE PLUMBING AND PIPE FITTING INDUSTRY

LOCAL UNION NO. 38

1621 MARKET STREET . SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94103

June 21, 2016

Supervisor Katy Tang Rules Committee Member 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244 San Francisco, CA 94102

Supervisor Eric Mar Rules Committee Member 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244 San Francisco, CA 94102

Supervisor Malia Cohen Rules Committee Member 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244 San Francisco, CA 94102

RE: Proposal for Position of Public Advocate & Future of Office of Labor Standards Enforcement (OLSE)

Dear Rules Committee Members,

UA Local 38 Plumbers and Pipefitters Union has recently learned more about the proposal for the creation of the position of Public Advocate. After doing so, I felt the need to write to you to explain my concerns.

I feel the creation of a Public Advocate position would create an unnecessary new layer of Government, and the cost to fund such a position will come at the expense of Public Employees, as its funding would come from the General Fund.

To further complicate this idea is the plan to move the Office of Labor Standards Enforcement under the direction of the Public Advocate. As you may or may not know, it was the San Francisco Building Trades Council that was directly responsible for the inception of the (OLSE) to deal with prevailing wage enforcement. To move this office would be a <u>bad idea</u>, as its funding, future and Director would all be in jeopardy.

Once again, I see this as an unnecessary maneuver and I urge you to <u>not support</u> the Public Advocate, as UA Local 38 stands firmly against the proposal.

Sincerely,

LARRY MAZZOLA, JR

Bus.Mgr. & Fin.Secty-Treas.

cc:

Mayor Ed Lee
Naomi Kelly, City Administrator
Hon. Tom Ammiano
Mike Casey, President of SFLC
Mike Theriault, SFBTC
Tim Paulson, SFLC
All Board of Supervisor Members
Pat Mulligan, Director of OLSE
Bob Muscat, Local 21/PEC



# United Brotherhood of Carpenters and Joiners of America LOCAL UNION NO. 22

June 29, 2016

San Francisco Board of Supervisors
Katy Chang, Chair
Malia Cohen
Eric Mar
Rules Committee, San Francisco Board of Supervisors
1 Dr. Cartlon B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

**Dear Supervisors:** 

Carpenters Local Union 22 has serious concerns with the recently proposed charter amendment which would create the new office of the Public Advocate. In addition, to general questions we share regarding potential budget impacts, expanded bureaucracy and diminished authority of the Mayor and Board of Supervisors, we are principally concerned with the inclusion of the Office of Labor Standards Enforcement within the oversight of this proposed newly elected position.

Sixteen years ago Carpenters Local Union 22 and the San Francisco Building Trades Council aggressively lobbied for the creation of the Office of Labor Standards Enforcement to provide protection to San Francisco workers and to ensure fair and equitable compliance of local labor laws. Since its inception, we have been particularly engaged in the mission of this office, and not coincidentally, all three of its directors have hailed from within our community of trade unions.

It is the opinion of Carpenters Local Union 22 that matters of labor compliance should neither be politicized nor diminished by an electoral process. Worker protections are far too important to allow for potential compromise. With this in mind, we respectfully request that the Office of Labor Standards Enforcement be removed from this charter amendment proposal, such that it would not fall within the purview of the potentially new Public Advocate position.

Thank you for your consideration regarding this matter.

\_\_\_

Senior Field Representative

₩illiams

cc:

Supervisor Malia Cohen Supervisor Eric Mar

Supervisor London Breed, Board President

San Francisco Board of Supervisors

Mayor Ed Lee

sko/opeiu-3-afl-cio (38)

2085 3RD STREET • SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94107 TELEPHONE: (415) 355-1322 • FAX: (415) 355-1422



# San Francisco Building and

1188 FRANKLIN STREET • SUITE 203 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109 EMAIL: mike@sfbctc.org



# Construction Trades Council

TEL. (415) 345-9333

www.sfbuildingtradescouncil.org

A Century of Excellence in Craftsmanship

LARRY MAZZOLA President MICHAEL THERIAULT Secretary - Treasurer JOHN DOHERTY VICTOR PARRA Vice Presidents

28 June 2016

Katy Tang, Chair Malia Cohen Eric Mar Rules Committee, San Francisco Board of Supervisors 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place City Hall, Room 244 San Francisco, California 94102

Dear Supervisors:

The Board of Business Representatives of the San Francisco Building and Construction Trades Council at its meeting this morning discussed the proposed charter amendment to create a new office of a Public Advocate. They have tasked me with writing to express their concerns.

First, we do not see the necessity or even the utility of such an office. In the current tripartite structure of City government, lines of responsibility and so of accountability are clear. To our understanding, a Public Advocate would constitute a kind of shadow executive branch, and muddle these lines. Moreover, one of the key purposes of district election of Supervisors is to ensure that residents have local advocates who understand their needs. It has long been held up to us as a central principle that district elections are necessary because citywide elections allow for the greater influence of moneyed interests, and so we are entitled to be puzzled and concerned by a proposal for an additional citywide office. For whom, ultimately, will the Public Advocate advocate?

Second, funding for an additional office and its staff will draw resources from other needs of the City. These needs require no enumeration here. We would prefer funding of any of a legion of chronically underfunded but important City functions to the creation of a new bureaucracy.

Finally, and most importantly, we object to placing the Office of Labor Standards Enforcement (OLSE) under the control of the Public Advocate. Sixteen years ago this Council demanded and obtained creation of the OLSE to protect San Francisco workers and ensure fair enforcement of labor laws. I was personally involved in providing it the case that established its effectiveness. We have remained engaged with the office and its mission, and – not coincidentally – all three of its directors have come from our ranks. The effect of removal of the OLSE from the executive branch may ironically be to free a mayor from accountability for worker protection. We ask at minimum that jurisdiction over the OLSE be withdrawn from the proposal for a Public Advocate.

Respectfully yours,

Michael Thériault

cc: Affiliates

Board of Supervisors

Мауот



From:

Evans, Derek

Sent:

Thursday, June 02, 2016 6:35 PM

To:

Rosenfield, Ben (CON)

Cc:

Rydstrom, Todd (CON); Lane, Maura (CON)

Subject:

BOS Referral - File No. 160583 - Charter Amendment - Public Advocate

**Attachments:** 

160583 - Referral - CTRL.pdf

Hello,

On May 24, 2016, Supervisor Campos introduced legislation for the following proposed Charter Amendment for the November 8, 2016, Election. This matter is being referred to you in accordance with Rules of Order 2.22.4.

File No. 160583

**Charter Amendment - Public Advocate** 

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to: 1) create the Office of the Public Advocate; 2) set the Public Advocate's powers and duties; 3) authorize the Public Advocate to review the administration of City programs, including programs for transmitting information to the public, and to receive, investigate, and attempt to resolve complaints regarding City services and programs; 4) place the Public Advocate in charge of the Office of Labor Standards Enforcement (OLSE), the Office of Citizen Complaints (OCC), and the Controller's whistleblower program; 5) call a special election for November 7, 2017, to elect the first Public Advocate; 6) provide for the Public Advocate's election, removal, and salary; and 7) establish a set-aside of 0.03% of the City's budget, as well as the amounts previously budgeted to OLSE, OCC, and the whistleblower program, to fund the Office of the Public Advocate, and setting an operative date, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

Please review and submit your written statement pursuant to the Charter to be included with the legislative file.

Regards,

#### Derek K. Evans

Assistant Clerk, Board of Supervisors 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, City Hall, Room 244 San Francisco, CA 94102 Phone: (415) 554-7702 | Fax: (415) 554-5163

Phone: (415) 554-7702 | Fax: (415) 554-5163 | Derek.Evans@sfgov.org | www.sfbos.org



Click here to complete a Board of Supervisors Customer Service Satisfaction form.

The Legislative Research Center provides 24-hour access to Board of Supervisors legislation, and archived matters since August 1998.

Disclosures: Personal information that is provided in communications to the Board of Supervisors is subject to disclosure under the California Public Records Act and the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance. Personal information provided will not be redacted. Members of the public are not required to provide personal identifying information when they communicate with the Board of Supervisors and its committees. All written or oral communications that members of the public submit to the Clerk's Office regarding pending legislation or hearings will be made available to all members of the public for inspection and copying. The Clerk's Office does not redact any information from these submissions. This means that personal information—including names, phone numbers, addresses and similar information that a member of the public elects to submit to the Board and its committees—may appear on the Board of Supervisors website or in other public documents that members of the public may inspect or copy.

From:

Evans, Derek

Sent:

Thursday, June 02, 2016 6:35 PM

To:

Jones, Sarah (CPC)

Cc:

Rahaim, John (CPC); Rodgers, AnMarie (CPC); Starr, Aaron (CPC); Navarrete, Joy (CPC);

Poling, Jeanie (CPC)

Subject:

BOS Referral - File No. 160583 - Charter Amendment - Public Advocate (Environmental

Review)

Attachments:

160583 - Referral - CEQA.pdf

Hello,

On May 24, 2016, Supervisor Campos introduced legislation for the following proposed Charter Amendment for the November 8, 2016, Election.

File No. 160583

**Charter Amendment - Public Advocate** 

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to: 1) create the Office of the Public Advocate; 2) set the Public Advocate's powers and duties; 3) authorize the Public Advocate to review the administration of City programs, including programs for transmitting information to the public, and to receive, investigate, and attempt to resolve complaints regarding City services and programs; 4) place the Public Advocate in charge of the Office of Labor Standards Enforcement (OLSE), the Office of Citizen Complaints (OCC), and the Controller's whistleblower program; 5) call a special election for November 7, 2017, to elect the first Public Advocate; 6) provide for the Public Advocate's election, removal, and salary; and 7) establish a set-aside of 0.03% of the City's budget, as well as the amounts previously budgeted to OLSE, OCC, and the whistleblower program, to fund the Office of the Public Advocate, and setting an operative date, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

This legislation is being transmitted to you for environmental review.

#### Derek K. Evans

Assistant Clerk, Board of Supervisors

1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, City Hall, Room 244
San Francisco, CA 94102

Phone: (415) 554-7702 | Fax: (415) 554-5163 <u>Derek.Evans@sfgov.org</u> | <u>www.sfbos.org</u>



Click here to complete a Board of Supervisors Customer Service Satisfaction form.

The Legislative Research Center provides 24-hour access to Board of Supervisors legislation, and archived matters since August 1998.

Disclosures: Personal information that is provided in communications to the Board of Supervisors is subject to disclosure under the California Public Records Act and the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance. Personal information provided will not be redacted. Members of the public are not required to provide personal identifying information when they communicate with the Board of Supervisors and its committees. All written or oral communications that members of the public submit to the Clerk's Office regarding pending legislation or hearings will be made available to all members of the public for inspection and copying. The Clerk's Office does not redact any information from these submissions. This means that personal information—including names, phone numbers, addresses and similar information that a member of the public elects to submit to the Board and its committees—may appear on the Board of Supervisors website or in other public documents that members of the public may inspect or copy.

From:

Evans, Derek

Sent:

Thursday, June 02, 2016 6:35 PM

To:

Elliott, Nicole (MYR); Givner, Jon (CAT); Arntz, John (REG); Hicks, Joyce (OCC); Mulligan, Pat (ECN); Chaplin, Toney (POL); Gascon, George (DAT); Pelham, LeeAnn (ETH)

Cc:

'Levitt, Donna (ADM)'; Fountain, Christine (POL); Kilshaw, Rachael (POL); Shaikh, Shaista

(ETH)

Subject:

BOS Referral - File No. 160583 - Charter Amendment - Public Advocate

Attachments:

160583 - Referral - Mandated.pdf

Hello,

On May 24, 2016, Supervisor Campos introduced legislation for the following proposed Charter Amendment for the November 8, 2016, Election. This matter is being referred to you in accordance with Rules of Order 2.22.4.

#### File No. 160583

#### **Charter Amendment - Public Advocate**

Charter Amendment (First Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to: 1) create the Office of the Public Advocate; 2) set the Public Advocate's powers and duties; 3) authorize the Public Advocate to review the administration of City programs, including programs for transmitting information to the public, and to receive, investigate, and attempt to resolve complaints regarding City services and programs; 4) place the Public Advocate in charge of the Office of Labor Standards Enforcement (OLSE), the Office of Citizen Complaints (OCC), and the Controller's whistleblower program; 5) call a special election for November 7, 2017, to elect the first Public Advocate; 6) provide for the Public Advocate's election, removal, and salary; and 7) establish a set-aside of 0.03% of the City's budget, as well as the amounts previously budgeted to OLSE, OCC, and the whistleblower program, to fund the Office of the Public Advocate, and setting an operative date, at an election to be held on November 8, 2016.

Please review and submit any reports or comments you wish to be included with the legislative file.

Regards,

#### Derek K. Evans

Assistant Clerk, Board of Supervisors 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, City Hall, Room 244 San Francisco, CA 94102

Phone: (415) 554-7702 | Fax: (415) 554-5163 Derek.Evans@sfgov.org | www.sfbos.org



Click here to complete a Board of Supervisors Customer Service Satisfaction form.

The Legislative Research Center provides 24-hour access to Board of Supervisors legislation, and archived matters since August 1998.

Disclosures: Personal information that is provided in communications to the Board of Supervisors is subject to disclosure under the California Public Records Act and the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance. Personal information provided will not be redacted. Members of the public are not required to provide personal identifying information when they communicate with the Board of Supervisors and its committees. All written or oral communications that members of the public submit to the Clerk's Office regarding pending legislation or hearings will be made available to all members of the public for inspection and copying. The Clerk's Office does not redact any information from these submissions. This means that personal information—including names, phone numbers, addresses and similar information that a member of the public elects to submit to the Board and its committees—may appear on the Board of Supervisors website or in other public documents that members of the public may inspect or copy.

**Print Form** 

# **Introduction Form**

By a Member of the Board of Supervisors or the Mayor

I here	by submit the following item for introduction (select only one):	Time stamp or meeting date		
	1. For reference to Committee. (An Ordinance, Resolution, Motion, or Charter Amendmen	t)		
	2. Request for next printed agenda Without Reference to Committee.			
	3. Request for hearing on a subject matter at Committee.			
	4. Request for letter beginning "Supervisor	inquires"		
	5. City Attorney request.			
	6. Call File No. from Committee.			
	7. Budget Analyst request (attach written motion).			
	8. Substitute Legislation File No.			
	9. Reactivate File No.			
	10. Question(s) submitted for Mayoral Appearance before the BOS on			
Please check the appropriate boxes. The proposed legislation should be forwarded to the following:				
	☐ Small Business Commission ☐ Youth Commission ☐ Ethics Commi	_		
	☐ Planning Commission ☐ Building Inspection Commission	i		
Note: I	For the Imperative Agenda (a resolution not on the printed agenda), use a Imperative I	Form.		
Sponsor	r(s):			
Campo	os, Avalos, Kim, Mar			
Subject	t:			
Public .	Advocate			
The text is listed below or attached:				
Signature of Sponsoring Supervisor:				
For Cl	lerk's Use Only:			