



# SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

---

## Landmark Designation Case Report

*Hearing Date:* March 15, 2017  
*Case No.:* 2016-010894DES  
*Project Address:* 2731, 2733, 2735 Folsom Street  
*Zoning:* RH-2  
*Block/Lots:* 3640/031  
*Property Owner:* Sean Lundy, Carol Wai  
2731-2735 Folsom Street  
San Francisco, CA 94110  
*Staff Contact:* Shannon Ferguson – (415) 575-9074  
shannon.ferguson@sfgov.org  
*Reviewed By:* Tim Frye – (415) 575-6822  
[tim.frye@sfgov.org](mailto:tim.frye@sfgov.org)

1650 Mission St.  
Suite 400  
San Francisco,  
CA 94103-2479

Reception:  
**415.558.6378**

Fax:  
**415.558.6409**

Planning  
Information:  
**415.558.6377**

### PROPERTY DESCRIPTIONS & SURROUNDING LAND USE AND DEVELOPMENT

2731-2735 Folsom Street, known as the Gaughran House, is located on the west side of Folsom Street between 23<sup>rd</sup> and 24<sup>th</sup> streets. 2731-2735 Folsom Street is a three-story, wood frame, three-unit, multi-family, residential building with a rectangular plan. It was designed in the Beaux-Arts style by architect James Francis Dunn (1874-1921) and constructed in 1900 for James Gaughran. The attached Community-Sponsored Article 10 Landmark Designation Application contains a detailed exterior building description on pages 1-15.

The subject property is located in the South Mission neighborhood. This neighborhood was surveyed as part of the South Mission Survey (adopted by the Historic Preservation Commission on November 17, 2011). The subject property is adjacent to the National Register-eligible Shotwell Street Victoriana Historic District, which was identified as resembling an “ideal” Victorian-era suburban neighborhood with mostly high-style architecture and detached, single-family dwellings for the 19th-century middle classes. Located between very early streetcar lines on Howard (South Van Ness Avenue) and Folsom Streets, the area developed as one of the Mission’s early, prototypical residential neighborhoods.

### PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The case before the Historic Preservation Commission is the consideration of the initiation of a Community-Sponsored Article 10 Landmark Designation Application for 2731 Folsom Street as a San Francisco Landmark under Article 10 of the Planning Code, Section 1004.1, and recommending that the Board of Supervisors approve of such designation.

### ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW STATUS

The Planning Department has determined that actions by regulatory agencies for protection of the environment (specifically in this case, landmark designation) are exempt from environmental review, pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15308 (Class Eight - Categorical).

## GENERAL PLAN POLICIES

The Urban Design Element of the San Francisco General Plan contains the following relevant objectives and policies:

OBJECTIVE 2: Conservation of Resources that provide a sense of nature, continuity with the past, and freedom from overcrowding.

POLICY 4: Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.

Designating significant historic resources as local landmarks will further continuity with the past because the buildings will be preserved for the benefit of future generations. Landmark designation will require that the Planning Department and the Historic Preservation Commission review proposed work that may have an impact on character-defining features. Both entities will utilize the Secretary of Interior's *Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties* in their review to ensure that only appropriate, compatible alterations are made.

### SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING CODE SECTION 101.1 – GENERAL PLAN CONSISTENCY AND IMPLEMENTATION

Planning Code Section 101.1 – Eight Priority Policies establishes and requires review of permits for consistency with said policies. On balance, the proposed designation is consistent with the priority policies in that:

- a. The proposed designation will further Priority Policy No. 7, that landmarks and historic buildings be preserved. Designation of 2731-2735 Folsom Street will help to preserve an important historical resource that is significant as a notable work of local master architect James Francis Dunn (1874-1921) and is a fine example of residential Beaux-Arts architecture.

## BACKGROUND / PREVIOUS ACTIONS

The Community-Sponsored Article 10 Landmark Designation Application was prepared by Page & Turnbull and submitted by Sean Lundy and Carol Wai, the property owners, to the Department in October 2016. A final draft of the landmark designation report was received by the Department in February 2017.

2731-35 Folsom Street is included in the 1976 Department of City Planning Architectural Quality Survey (1976 DCP Survey) with a rating of "4". The subject property was also documented as part of the South Mission Historic Resource Survey (adopted November 17, 2011) and given a survey rating of "3CS" meaning the property appears eligible for the California Register as an individual property through survey evaluation.

If the Historic Preservation Commission decides to initiate Article 10 landmark designation of the subject property, the item will be considered again by the Historic Preservation Commission at a subsequent hearing. At that time the Historic Preservation Commission may adopt a resolution recommending that

the Board of Supervisors support the designation. The nomination would then be considered at a future Board of Supervisors hearing for formal Article 10 landmark designation.

## **APPLICABLE PRESERVATION STANDARDS**

### **ARTICLE 10**

Section 1004 of the Planning Code authorizes the landmark designation of an individual structure or other feature or an integrated group of structures and features on a single lot or site, having special character or special historical, architectural or aesthetic interest or value, as a landmark. Section 1004.1 also outlines that landmark designation may be initiated by the Board of Supervisors or the Historic Preservation Commission and the initiation shall include findings in support. Section 1004.2 states that once initiated, the proposed designation is referred to the Historic Preservation Commission for a report and recommendation to the Board of Supervisors to approve, disapprove or modify the proposal.

Pursuant to Section 1004.3 of the Planning Code, if the Historic Preservation Commission approves the designation, a copy of the resolution of approval is transmitted to the Board of Supervisors and without referral to the Planning Commission. The Board of Supervisors shall hold a public hearing on the designation and may approve, modify or disapprove the designation.

In the case of the initiation of a historic district, the Historic Preservation Commission shall refer its recommendation to the Planning Commission pursuant to Section 1004.2(c). The Planning Commission shall have 45 days to provide review and comment on the proposed designation and address the consistency of the proposed designation with the General Plan, Section 101.1 priority policies, the City's Regional Housing Needs Allocation, and the Sustainable Communities Strategy for the Bay Area. These comments shall be sent to the Board of Supervisors in the form of a resolution.

Section 1004(b) requires that the designating ordinance approved by the Board of Supervisors shall include the location and boundaries of the landmark site, a description of the characteristics of the landmark which justify its designation, and a description of the particular features that should be preserved.

Section 1004.4 states that if the Historic Preservation Commission disapproves the proposed designation, such action shall be final, except upon the filing of a valid appeal to the Board of Supervisors within 30 days.

### **ARTICLE 10 LANDMARK CRITERIA**

The Historic Preservation Commission on February 4, 2009, by Resolution No. 001, adopted the National Register Criteria as its methodology for recommending landmark designation of historic resources. Under the National Register Criteria, the quality of significance in American history, architecture, archaeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, feeling, materials, workmanship, and association, and that are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or that are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may

lack individual distinction; or properties that have yielded, or may likely yield, information important in prehistory or history.

### **PUBLIC / NEIGHBORHOOD INPUT**

There is no known public or neighborhood opposition to designation of 2731-2735 Folsom Street as an Article 10 landmark. The Department will provide any public correspondence received after the submittal of this report in the Historic Preservation Commission's correspondence folder.

### **PROPERTY OWNER INPUT**

The property owner is supportive of landmark designation.

### **STAFF ANALYSIS**

The case report and analysis under review was prepared by Department preservation staff. The Department has determined 2731-2735 Folsom Street meets the requirements for Article 10 eligibility as an individual landmark. The justification inclusion is outlined below under the Significance and Integrity sections of this case report.

#### **SIGNIFICANCE**

2731-35 Folsom Street is significant as a notable work of local master architect James Francis Dunn (1874-1921) and is a fine example of residential Beaux-Arts architecture. The building is clearly identifiable as a James Dunn building, especially with its intricately molded balcony topped by an elaborate wrought iron railing – a feature that Dunn frequently used in his apartment building designs. His other signature design preferences are also present, including: a rusticated ground floor, a tripartite composition, molded surrounds, exuberant surface ornamentation, and arched openings and that are also hallmarks of the Beaux-Arts style. In designing 2731-35 Folsom Street, Dunn combined formal compositional elements with playful decorative detailing.

The Community-Sponsored Landmark Designation Application fails to analyze the subject property for its potential significance of being located in an area developed as one of the Mission's early, prototypical residential neighborhoods, or street-car suburb. At the very least, discussion of the development of the Mission neighborhood should be included in the neighborhood development section of the Community-Sponsored Landmark Designation Application.

Staff recommends information from the South Mission Historic Resource Survey and Mission Context Statement on the development of the neighborhood be included in the application and the subject property analyzed for its potential significance of being located in an area developed as one of the Mission's early street-car suburbs.

#### **INTEGRITY**

The building was originally constructed in its current location in 1900. The building has not been moved and retains integrity of location. The building retains integrity of setting because the subject block remains primarily residential. The building retains integrity of feeling as it continues to express itself as a Beaux-Arts residence constructed in 1900, and it retains integrity of association as the majority of character-defining features linking the building to architect James Dunn have been retained. With its

intricately designed decorative details, the primary façade retains its original materials and evidence of workmanship.

The Community-Sponsored Landmark Designation Application states that the secondary facades of the subject property do not retain integrity because they have been altered, but does not offer a complete analysis for this conclusion, nor does the application include drawings from the recent remodel completed by the current owners that could be used for comparison of original and existing conditions. Based on Staff analysis and site visit, the subject property retains sufficient integrity including alterations to secondary elevations. Although the secondary elevations have been altered (likely the windows types and locations as well as siding have been altered), they still retain their original massing and form and are clad in a compatible style of simple-drop siding. Therefore the secondary elevations retain integrity.

Staff recommends that the integrity of secondary facades be analyzed and drawings from the recent remodel be included to compare original and existing conditions.

#### CHARACTER-DEFINING FEATURES

Whenever a building, site, object, or landscape is under consideration for Article 10 landmark designation, the Historic Preservation Commission is required to identify character-defining features of the property. This is done to enable owners and the public to understand which elements are considered most important to preserve the historical and architectural character of the proposed landmark.

The Community-Sponsored Landmark Designation Application lists the character-defining features on page 34. The Application limits the character-defining features to the primary (west) façade of the building and does not include secondary facades. As discussed above, secondary (north, south and east) elevations retain integrity; therefore features on secondary elevations should be included in the character-defining features. "Gold-leaf" and the metal stair railings are also listed as character-defining features in the Community-Sponsored Landmark Designation Application. However, both elements are contemporary features and are not character-defining.

Staff recommends the character-defining features include the massing, form and the style of simple-drop horizontal siding on the secondary elevations. Staff also recommends "gold leaf" and metal stair railings deleted from the character-defining features as these elements are contemporary features.

Based on staff analysis, the character-defining features should be revised as follows:

Character defining features include the form, massing, structure, architectural ornament and materials identified as:

- Three-story building with slightly pitched hip roof
- Asymmetrical primary façade
- Wood shiplap cladding
- Rusticated ground level cladding
- Location, size, and shape of fenestration openings
- Original wood-sash and wood-frame single-hung windows with ogee lugs
- Ground level openings with dentil and rope moldings and keystone cartouches

- Molded belt course with acanthus leaves and geometric details
- Wood stair to first story entries
- Partially glazed doors with transom windows; leaded stained glass window within entry vestibule
- Double-height engaged Corinthian columns; capitals with female masks
- Egg and dart molding above rounded bay transom windows
- Molded balcony with iron railing
- Elongated quatrefoil windows
- Entablature with projecting cornice, acanthus modillions, dentil course, ribbon of textured plaster with x-motifs pinned with florettes, and a thin rope molding
- Double-height rounded bay
- Domed turret above double-height rounded bay
- Form, massing and simple-drop style horizontal siding at secondary (north, south and east) elevations

## BOUNDARIES OF THE LANDMARK SITE

Encompassing all of and limited to Lot 031 on the Assessor's Block 3640 on the east side of Folsom Street, between 23<sup>rd</sup> and 24<sup>th</sup> streets.

## PLANNING DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATION

Based on the Department's analysis, 2731-2735 Folsom Street meets the requirements for Article 10 eligibility as an individual landmark as it embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, and represents the work of a master.

However, it is important to note that the subject property does not meet the Historic Preservation Commission's priorities for designation which are:

1. *The designation of underrepresented Landmark property types including landscapes*

The subject property is a multi-family residence designed in the Beaux-Arts style. Three nearby multi-family residences have been designated as Landmarks (#208 McCormick House located at 4040-4042 17th Street was constructed in 1902 in Queen Anne style; #191 Oakley Residence and Flats located at 200-202 Fair Oaks was constructed in 1886 in the Italianate style, and #206 Howard/26<sup>th</sup> Street Cottages located at 3274-3294 26<sup>th</sup> Street was constructed in 1905 in the Craftsman style), though none in the Beaux-Arts style. There are numerous single family residences designated as landmarks, four in the vicinity of the subject property.

2. *The designation of buildings of Modern design*

The subject building is not a Modern style building.

3. *The designation of buildings located in geographically underrepresented areas*

The subject property is not located in an area that is geographically underrepresented in landmark buildings. There are eight landmarks located in the Mission neighborhood: #245 The New Mission Theater located at 2550 Mission Street; #166, Trinity Presbyterian Church at 3261 23<sup>rd</sup> Street; #234 Mission Branch Library at 3359 24<sup>th</sup> Street; #74 Stone House located at 1348 South

Van Ness Avenue; #125 Havens Mansion & Carriage House located at 1381 South Van Ness Avenue; #206 Howard/26<sup>th</sup> Street Cottages located at 3274-3294 26<sup>th</sup> Street; #191 Oakley Residence and Flats located at 200-202 Fair Oaks Street; and #189 Frank G. Edwards House located at 1366 Guerrero Street.

4. *The designation of properties with strong cultural or ethnic associations.*

The subject building does not appear to have any cultural or ethnic associations.

Although the subject property does not meet the Historic Preservation Commission's priorities for designation, it still meets the eligibility requirements for Article 10 designation as a notable work of local master architect James Francis Dunn and a fine example of residential Beaux-Arts architecture. As a Community-Sponsored and funded Landmark Designation Application, the Department recommends the Historic Preservation Commission initiate Article 10 Landmark designation for 2731-2735 Folsom Street

Under Article 10, The Historic Preservation Commission may recommend approval, disapproval or approval with modifications of the proposed initiation of 2731-2735 Folsom Street landmark designation. If the Historic Preservation Commission approves initiation, a second hearing will be held to consider whether or not to recommend the landmark designation to the Board of Supervisors. A copy of the motion of recommendation is then transmitted to the Board of Supervisors, which will hold a public hearing on the designation and may approve, modify or disapprove the designation (Section 1004.4). If the Historic Preservation Commission disapproves the proposed designation, such action shall be final, except upon the filing of a valid appeal to the Board of Supervisors within 30 days (Section 1004.5).

## ATTACHMENTS

- A. Exhibits
- B. Draft Resolution initiating designation
- C. Draft Ordinance
- D. Landmark Designation Fact Sheet
- E. Historic Landmark Designation Application prepared by Page & Turnbull