BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Rm 244 San Francisco 94102-4689 Tel. No. 554-5184 Fax No. 554-5163 TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

May 18, 2018

Sharon Page Ritchie Commission Secretary, Arts Commission 401 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 325 San Francisco, CA 94102

Re: Board of Supervisors Resolution No. 135-18

Dear Ms. Ritchie,

On May 1, 2018 the Board of Supervisors for the City and County of San Francisco adopted Resolution No. 135-18 (Supporting the Removal of the Pioneer Monument's "Early Days" Sculpture - Urging the Board of Appeals to Rehear the Appeal Regarding the Pioneer Monument), which was enacted on May 9, 2018.

The Board of Supervisors directs the Clerk of the Board to forward the following document to the Arts Commission's attention:

One certified copy of Resolution No. 135-18 (File No.180431)

If you have any questions or require additional information, please contact the Office of the Clerk of the Board at (415) 554-5184, or by e-mail: board.of.supervisors@sfgov.org.

Sincerely,

Angela Calvillo Clerk of the Board

 c. Supervisors Aaron Peskin, Jane Kim, Sandra Lee Fewer, and Hillary Ronen Tom DeCaigny, Arts Commission Susan Pontious, Arts Commission Rebekah Krell, Arts Commission



City and County of San Francisco Certified Copy

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Resolution

180431

[Supporting the Removal of the Pioneer Monument's "Early Days" Sculpture - Urging the Board of Appeals to Rehear the Appeal Regarding the Pioneer Monument]

Sponsors: Peskin; Kim, Fewer and Ronen.

Resolution supporting the San Francisco Arts Commission's (SFAC) determination to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group of the Pioneer Monument and the Historic Preservation Commission's (HPC) approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness under Article 10 of the Planning Code for such removal; urging the Board of Appeals to hear the rehearing requests of the SFAC and HPC; and directing the Clerk of the Board to transmit this Resolution to the Board of Appeals, Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission upon final passage.

5/1/2018 Board of Supervisors - ADOPTED

Ayes: 11 - Breed, Cohen, Fewer, Kim, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Sheehy, Stefani, Tang and Yee

5/9/2018 Mayor - APPROVED

STATE OF CALIFORNIA CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

CLERK'S CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution is a full, true, and correct copy of the original thereof on file in this office.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed the offical seal of the City and County of San Francisco.

May 18, 2018

Date

Angela Caivillo

Clerk of the Board

11

22 23 25 Resolution supporting the San Francisco Arts Commission's (SFAC) determination to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group of the Pioneer Monument and the Historic Preservation Commission's (HPC) approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness under Article 10 of the Planning Code for such removal; urging the Board of Appeals to hear the rehearing requests of the SFAC and HPC; and directing the Clerk of the Board to transmit this Resolution to the Board of Appeals, Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission upon final passage.

[Supporting the Removal of the Pioneer Monument's "Early Days" Sculpture - Urging the

Board of Appeals to Rehear the Appeal Regarding the Pioneer Monument]

WHEREAS, On October 2, 2017, at a meeting of the full San Francisco Arts Commission (SFAC), Commissioners voted unanimously to pass Resolution No. 1002-17-251, which initiated the review process to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group from the Pioneer Monument, and which is hereby declared to be a part of this resolution as if set forth fully herein; and

WHEREAS, At a hearing of the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) on February 21, 2018, Commissioners voted unanimously to pass Case No. 2017-015491COA, approving the Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the "Early Days" sculptural group from the Pioneer Monument, finding it consistent with Article 10 of the Planning Code, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the General Plan, contingent on placement of a plaque explaining the removal at the site, and which is hereby declared to be a part of this resolution as if set forth fully herein; and

WHEREAS, On March 5, 2018, at a meeting of the full SFAC, Commissioners voted unanimously (12-0) to pass Resolution No. 035-18-057, authorizing the removal and placement in storage of the "Early Days" sculptural group upon determination that removal of

the artwork is appropriate under the Guidelines based on the criteria of "significant adverse public reaction over a consistent and extended period of time"; and

WHEREAS, The SFAC Guidelines define "consistent" as "five years or more", and calls for the removal of the "Early Days" sculpture date back to at least 2007 at the Human Rights Commission, among other formal public policy conversations; and

WHEREAS, The SFAC heard extensive public comment demanding the removal of the "Early Days" sculpture over the course of its public hearings, and is in receipt of a petition to remove signed by over 1,000 San Francisco residents; and

WHEREAS, The "Early Days" sculptural grouping has been a decades' long point of concern for the community, including extensive debates at the Arts Commission, the Planning Commission, and the Library Commission back in 1990-1996 when the Pioneer Monument was relocated to its current site in order to make way for the construction of the new Main Library; and

WHEREAS, Mayor Edwin M. Lee supported the removal the "Early Days" sculptural group in a 2017 KQED interview before his passing, saying, "Certainly on the streets of San Francisco, there ought to be symbols that don't oppress people or remind them of oppression. That symbol continues to be a symbol that bothers [Native Americans], and it bothers all of us if it bothers them"; and

WHEREAS, Frear Stephen Schmid, a Petaluma-based attorney, appealed the Historic Preservation Commission's decision, on the grounds that the decision was inconsistent with the city's standards for removing or altering historic artifacts; and

WHEREAS, On April 18, 2018, at a meeting of the Board of Appeals, the Board Members voted unanimously to uphold Mr. Schmid's appeal, in contravention of the Board's mandate to reverse acts of manifest injustice and uphold just decisions; and

WHEREAS, The SFAC and HPC have filed a request to have the Board of Appeals rehear the appeal of the HPC determination; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco supports the SFAC's determination to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group of the Pioneer Monument, as well as the HPC's approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for such removal under Article 10 of the Planning Code, based on the facts that the removal of the sculpture will not change the Pioneer Monument's historic character and that the general public have demonstrated significant and extended opposition to the offensive nature of the sculpture's representation of Native Americans; and, be it

FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco urges the Board of Appeals to hear the re-hearing requests of the Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission; and, be it

FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors directs the Clerk of the Board to transmit this Resolution to the Board of Appeals, Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission upon final passage.



City and County of San Francisco Tails

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Resolution

File Number: 1

180431

Date Passed: May 01, 2018

Resolution supporting the San Francisco Arts Commission's (SFAC) determination to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group of the Pioneer Monument and the Historic Preservation Commission's (HPC) approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness under Article 10 of the Planning Code for such removal; urging the Board of Appeals to hear the rehearing requests of the SFAC and HPC; and directing the Clerk of the Board to transmit this Resolution to the Board of Appeals, Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission upon final passage.

May 01, 2018 Board of Supervisors - ADOPTED

Ayes: 11 - Breed, Cohen, Fewer, Kim, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Sheehy, Stefani, Tang and Yee

File No. 180431

I hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution was ADOPTED on 5/1/2018 by the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco.

> Angela Calvillo Clerk of the Board

Mark E. Farrell Mayor

Marle 4.

Date Approved

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Rm 244 San Francisco 94102-4689 Tel. No. 554-5184 Fax No. 554-5163 TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

May 18, 2018

Cynthia Goldstein Executive Director, Board of Appeals 1650 Mission Street, Suite 304 San Francisco, CA 94103

Re: Board of Supervisors Resolution No. 135-18

Dear Ms. Goldstein,

On May 1, 2018 the Board of Supervisors for the City and County of San Francisco adopted Resolution No. 135-18 (Supporting the Removal of the Pioneer Monument's "Early Days" Sculpture - Urging the Board of Appeals to Rehear the Appeal Regarding the Pioneer Monument), which was enacted on May 9, 2018.

The Board of Supervisors directs the Clerk of the Board to forward the following document to the Board of Appeals' attention:

• One certified copy of Resolution No. 135-18 (File No.180431)

If you have any questions or require additional information, please contact the Office of the Clerk of the Board at (415) 554-5184, or by e-mail: board.of.supervisors@sfgov.org.

Sincerely,

Angela Calvillo
Clerk of the Board

c. Supervisors Aaron Peskin, Jane Kim, Sandra Lee Fewer, and Hillary Ronen Gary Cantara, Board of Appeals



City and County of San Francisco Certified Copy

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Resolution

180431

[Supporting the Removal of the Pioneer Monument's "Early Days" Sculpture - Urging the Board of Appeals to Rehear the Appeal Regarding the Pioneer Monument]

Sponsors: Peskin; Kim, Fewer and Ronen.

Resolution supporting the San Francisco Arts Commission's (SFAC) determination to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group of the Pioneer Monument and the Historic Preservation Commission's (HPC) approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness under Article 10 of the Planning Code for such removal; urging the Board of Appeals to hear the rehearing requests of the SFAC and HPC; and directing the Clerk of the Board to transmit this Resolution to the Board of Appeals, Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission upon final passage.

5/1/2018 Board of Supervisors - ADOPTED

Ayes: 11 - Breed, Cohen, Fewer, Kim, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Sheehy, Stefani, Tang and Yee

5/9/2018 Mayor - APPROVED

STATE OF CALIFORNIA CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

CLERK'S CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution is a full, true, and correct copy of the original thereof on file in this office.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed the offical seal of the City and County of San Francisco.

May 18, 2018

Date

Angela Caivillo

Clerk of the Board

11

22 23 25 Resolution supporting the San Francisco Arts Commission's (SFAC) determination to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group of the Pioneer Monument and the Historic Preservation Commission's (HPC) approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness under Article 10 of the Planning Code for such removal; urging the Board of Appeals to hear the rehearing requests of the SFAC and HPC; and directing the Clerk of the Board to transmit this Resolution to the Board of Appeals, Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission upon final passage.

[Supporting the Removal of the Pioneer Monument's "Early Days" Sculpture - Urging the

Board of Appeals to Rehear the Appeal Regarding the Pioneer Monument]

WHEREAS, On October 2, 2017, at a meeting of the full San Francisco Arts Commission (SFAC), Commissioners voted unanimously to pass Resolution No. 1002-17-251, which initiated the review process to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group from the Pioneer Monument, and which is hereby declared to be a part of this resolution as if set forth fully herein; and

WHEREAS, At a hearing of the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) on February 21, 2018, Commissioners voted unanimously to pass Case No. 2017-015491COA, approving the Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the "Early Days" sculptural group from the Pioneer Monument, finding it consistent with Article 10 of the Planning Code, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the General Plan, contingent on placement of a plaque explaining the removal at the site, and which is hereby declared to be a part of this resolution as if set forth fully herein; and

WHEREAS, On March 5, 2018, at a meeting of the full SFAC, Commissioners voted unanimously (12-0) to pass Resolution No. 035-18-057, authorizing the removal and placement in storage of the "Early Days" sculptural group upon determination that removal of

the artwork is appropriate under the Guidelines based on the criteria of "significant adverse public reaction over a consistent and extended period of time"; and

WHEREAS, The SFAC Guidelines define "consistent" as "five years or more", and calls for the removal of the "Early Days" sculpture date back to at least 2007 at the Human Rights Commission, among other formal public policy conversations; and

WHEREAS, The SFAC heard extensive public comment demanding the removal of the "Early Days" sculpture over the course of its public hearings, and is in receipt of a petition to remove signed by over 1,000 San Francisco residents; and

WHEREAS, The "Early Days" sculptural grouping has been a decades' long point of concern for the community, including extensive debates at the Arts Commission, the Planning Commission, and the Library Commission back in 1990-1996 when the Pioneer Monument was relocated to its current site in order to make way for the construction of the new Main Library; and

WHEREAS, Mayor Edwin M. Lee supported the removal the "Early Days" sculptural group in a 2017 KQED interview before his passing, saying, "Certainly on the streets of San Francisco, there ought to be symbols that don't oppress people or remind them of oppression. That symbol continues to be a symbol that bothers [Native Americans], and it bothers all of us if it bothers them"; and

WHEREAS, Frear Stephen Schmid, a Petaluma-based attorney, appealed the Historic Preservation Commission's decision, on the grounds that the decision was inconsistent with the city's standards for removing or altering historic artifacts; and

WHEREAS, On April 18, 2018, at a meeting of the Board of Appeals, the Board Members voted unanimously to uphold Mr. Schmid's appeal, in contravention of the Board's mandate to reverse acts of manifest injustice and uphold just decisions; and

WHEREAS, The SFAC and HPC have filed a request to have the Board of Appeals rehear the appeal of the HPC determination; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco supports the SFAC's determination to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group of the Pioneer Monument, as well as the HPC's approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for such removal under Article 10 of the Planning Code, based on the facts that the removal of the sculpture will not change the Pioneer Monument's historic character and that the general public have demonstrated significant and extended opposition to the offensive nature of the sculpture's representation of Native Americans; and, be it

FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco urges the Board of Appeals to hear the re-hearing requests of the Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission; and, be it

FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors directs the Clerk of the Board to transmit this Resolution to the Board of Appeals, Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission upon final passage.



City and County of San Francisco Tails

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Resolution

File Number: 1

180431

Date Passed: May 01, 2018

Resolution supporting the San Francisco Arts Commission's (SFAC) determination to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group of the Pioneer Monument and the Historic Preservation Commission's (HPC) approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness under Article 10 of the Planning Code for such removal; urging the Board of Appeals to hear the rehearing requests of the SFAC and HPC; and directing the Clerk of the Board to transmit this Resolution to the Board of Appeals, Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission upon final passage.

May 01, 2018 Board of Supervisors - ADOPTED

Ayes: 11 - Breed, Cohen, Fewer, Kim, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Sheehy, Stefani, Tang and Yee

File No. 180431

I hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution was ADOPTED on 5/1/2018 by the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco.

> Angela Calvillo Clerk of the Board

Mark E. Farrell Mayor

Marle 4.

Date Approved

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Rm 244 San Francisco 94102-4689 Tel. No. 554-5184 Fax No. 554-5163 TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

May 18, 2018

Jonas Ionin Commission Secretary, Historic Preservation Commission 401 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 325 San Francisco, CA 94102

Re: Board of Supervisors Resolution No. 135-18

Dear Mr. Ionin,

On May 1, 2018 the Board of Supervisors for the City and County of San Francisco adopted Resolution No. 135-18 (Supporting the Removal of the Pioneer Monument's "Early Days" Sculpture - Urging the Board of Appeals to Rehear the Appeal Regarding the Pioneer Monument), which was enacted on May 9, 2018.

The Board of Supervisors directs the Clerk of the Board to forward the following document to the Historic Preservation Commission's attention:

• One certified copy of Resolution No. 135-18 (File No.180431)

If you have any questions or require additional information, please contact the Office of the Clerk of the Board at (415) 554-5184, or by e-mail: board.of.supervisors@sfgov.org.

Sincerely,

Angela Calvillo
Clerk of the Board

c. Supervisors Aaron Peskin, Jane Kim, Sandra Lee Fewer, and Hillary Ronen John Rahaim, Planning Department Scott Sanchez, Planning Department Lisa Gibson, Planning Department AnMarie Rodgers, Planning Department Tim Frye, Planning Department Andrea Ruiz-Esquide, City Attorney's Office Joy Navarrete, Planning Department Georgia Powell, Planning Department



City and County of San Francisco Certified Copy

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Resolution

180431

[Supporting the Removal of the Pioneer Monument's "Early Days" Sculpture - Urging the Board of Appeals to Rehear the Appeal Regarding the Pioneer Monument]

Sponsors: Peskin; Kim, Fewer and Ronen.

Resolution supporting the San Francisco Arts Commission's (SFAC) determination to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group of the Pioneer Monument and the Historic Preservation Commission's (HPC) approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness under Article 10 of the Planning Code for such removal; urging the Board of Appeals to hear the rehearing requests of the SFAC and HPC; and directing the Clerk of the Board to transmit this Resolution to the Board of Appeals, Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission upon final passage.

5/1/2018 Board of Supervisors - ADOPTED

Ayes: 11 - Breed, Cohen, Fewer, Kim, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Sheehy, Stefani, Tang and Yee

5/9/2018 Mayor - APPROVED

STATE OF CALIFORNIA CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

CLERK'S CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution is a full, true, and correct copy of the original thereof on file in this office.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed the offical seal of the City and County of San Francisco.

May 18, 2018

Date

Angela Caivillo

Clerk of the Board

11

22 23 25 Resolution supporting the San Francisco Arts Commission's (SFAC) determination to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group of the Pioneer Monument and the Historic Preservation Commission's (HPC) approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness under Article 10 of the Planning Code for such removal; urging the Board of Appeals to hear the rehearing requests of the SFAC and HPC; and directing the Clerk of the Board to transmit this Resolution to the Board of Appeals, Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission upon final passage.

[Supporting the Removal of the Pioneer Monument's "Early Days" Sculpture - Urging the

Board of Appeals to Rehear the Appeal Regarding the Pioneer Monument]

WHEREAS, On October 2, 2017, at a meeting of the full San Francisco Arts Commission (SFAC), Commissioners voted unanimously to pass Resolution No. 1002-17-251, which initiated the review process to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group from the Pioneer Monument, and which is hereby declared to be a part of this resolution as if set forth fully herein; and

WHEREAS, At a hearing of the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) on February 21, 2018, Commissioners voted unanimously to pass Case No. 2017-015491COA, approving the Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the "Early Days" sculptural group from the Pioneer Monument, finding it consistent with Article 10 of the Planning Code, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the General Plan, contingent on placement of a plaque explaining the removal at the site, and which is hereby declared to be a part of this resolution as if set forth fully herein; and

WHEREAS, On March 5, 2018, at a meeting of the full SFAC, Commissioners voted unanimously (12-0) to pass Resolution No. 035-18-057, authorizing the removal and placement in storage of the "Early Days" sculptural group upon determination that removal of

the artwork is appropriate under the Guidelines based on the criteria of "significant adverse public reaction over a consistent and extended period of time"; and

WHEREAS, The SFAC Guidelines define "consistent" as "five years or more", and calls for the removal of the "Early Days" sculpture date back to at least 2007 at the Human Rights Commission, among other formal public policy conversations; and

WHEREAS, The SFAC heard extensive public comment demanding the removal of the "Early Days" sculpture over the course of its public hearings, and is in receipt of a petition to remove signed by over 1,000 San Francisco residents; and

WHEREAS, The "Early Days" sculptural grouping has been a decades' long point of concern for the community, including extensive debates at the Arts Commission, the Planning Commission, and the Library Commission back in 1990-1996 when the Pioneer Monument was relocated to its current site in order to make way for the construction of the new Main Library; and

WHEREAS, Mayor Edwin M. Lee supported the removal the "Early Days" sculptural group in a 2017 KQED interview before his passing, saying, "Certainly on the streets of San Francisco, there ought to be symbols that don't oppress people or remind them of oppression. That symbol continues to be a symbol that bothers [Native Americans], and it bothers all of us if it bothers them"; and

WHEREAS, Frear Stephen Schmid, a Petaluma-based attorney, appealed the Historic Preservation Commission's decision, on the grounds that the decision was inconsistent with the city's standards for removing or altering historic artifacts; and

WHEREAS, On April 18, 2018, at a meeting of the Board of Appeals, the Board Members voted unanimously to uphold Mr. Schmid's appeal, in contravention of the Board's mandate to reverse acts of manifest injustice and uphold just decisions; and

WHEREAS, The SFAC and HPC have filed a request to have the Board of Appeals rehear the appeal of the HPC determination; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco supports the SFAC's determination to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group of the Pioneer Monument, as well as the HPC's approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for such removal under Article 10 of the Planning Code, based on the facts that the removal of the sculpture will not change the Pioneer Monument's historic character and that the general public have demonstrated significant and extended opposition to the offensive nature of the sculpture's representation of Native Americans; and, be it

FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco urges the Board of Appeals to hear the re-hearing requests of the Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission; and, be it

FURTHER RESOLVED, That the Board of Supervisors directs the Clerk of the Board to transmit this Resolution to the Board of Appeals, Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission upon final passage.



City and County of San Francisco Tails

City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Resolution

File Number: 1

180431

Date Passed: May 01, 2018

Resolution supporting the San Francisco Arts Commission's (SFAC) determination to remove the "Early Days" sculptural group of the Pioneer Monument and the Historic Preservation Commission's (HPC) approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness under Article 10 of the Planning Code for such removal; urging the Board of Appeals to hear the rehearing requests of the SFAC and HPC; and directing the Clerk of the Board to transmit this Resolution to the Board of Appeals, Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission upon final passage.

May 01, 2018 Board of Supervisors - ADOPTED

Ayes: 11 - Breed, Cohen, Fewer, Kim, Peskin, Ronen, Safai, Sheehy, Stefani, Tang and Yee

File No. 180431

I hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution was ADOPTED on 5/1/2018 by the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco.

> Angela Calvillo Clerk of the Board

Mark E. Farrell Mayor

Marle 4.

Date Approved