

Review and Comment Article 10 Landmark District HEARING DATE: June 7, 2018

Case No.:	2017-010250DES
Project:	Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District
Re:	Initiation of Article 10 Landmark District Designation
Block/Lot:	3787/005,014,015,016,037,040A,044,048,033,
	151, 017, 021, 022, 019, 036, 040, 018, 013, 152-159
Zoning:	SLI-SOMA Service-Light Industrial
Staff Contact:	Frances McMillen – (415) 575-9076
	frances.mcmillen@sfgov.org
Reviewed By:	Tim Frye – (415) 575-6822
	tim.frye@sfgov.org

1650 Mission St. Suite 400 San Francisco, CA 94103-2479

Reception: 415.558.6378

Fax: 415.558.6409

Planning Information: 415.558.6377

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The case before the Planning Commission is to review and provide comment to the San Francisco Board of Supervisors on the Article 10 landmark district designation of the Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District pursuant to Section 1004.2(c) of the Planning Code. The Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District is located in the southeast section of the South of Market neighborhood. The district is comprised of nineteen (19) properties located in Assessor's Parcel No. 3787, Lots 005, 014, 015, 016, 037, 040A, 044, 048, 033, 151, 017, 021, 022, 019, 036, 040, 018, 013, 152-159. Twelve (12) of the properties are contributing resources. Further consideration by the Board of Supervisors will occur at a future public hearing and will be noticed separately for a future date.

PROJECT BACKGROUND

The Planning Department (Department) conducted the SoMa Survey (2007-2010) in order to provide information on the location and distribution of historic resources within the Eastern Neighborhoods SoMa Area Plan and Western SoMa Community Plan for the purposes of long-range policy planning. The purpose of the survey is to identify buildings and structures that appear to be eligible for listing in the National Register of Historical Places and the California Register of Historical Resources, as well as to identify properties for local significance. The survey also provides information for use in permit processing, environmental review, and making recommendations for official nominations to historic registers.

The South of Market Historic Area Historic Context Statement (2009), adopted by the former Landmarks Preservation Advisory board, served as the basis for the evaluations of the SoMa Survey and provided a framework for consistent, informed evaluations of the area's age-eligible properties that had not been previously surveyed or for which survey information was incomplete.

The SoMa Survey determined the boundaries for five new historic districts that appear eligible for the National or California Register, or appear to be locally significant, including the Clyde and Crooks

Warehouse Historic District (formerly referred to as the South End Historic District extension). As part of the Central SoMa Plan effort the Historic Preservation Commission added the designation of the Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District to its Landmark Designation Work Program on August 17, 2016.

- The SoMa Survey area is roughly Mission Street to Townsend Street, between 1st and 13th Streets.
- **The SoMa Survey** resulted in documentation and/or assessment of 2,141 individual properties, of which approximately 1,467 properties constructed in or before 1962 (45 years prior to 2007, when the survey began).
- **Individually Significant Properties** The SoMa survey identified 151 properties of individual significance, both outside and within historic districts.
- **Historic Districts** The findings of the SoMa Survey determined the boundaries for 5 new historic districts that appear eligible for either the National, California Register, or appear to be locally significant. The district are:
 - The Bluxome and Townsend Warehouse Historic District
 - Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District (formerly known as the South End Historic District extension)
 - Sixth Street Lodginghouse Historic District
 - South Park Historic District
 - o West SoMa Light Industrial and Residential Historic District
- The Historic Preservation Commission adopted the SoMa Survey on December 10, 2010.
- **Central SoMa Plan** As part of the Central SoMa Plan effort the Historic Preservation Commission added the designation of the Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District to its Landmark Designation Work Program on August 17, 2016.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW STATUS

The Planning Department has determined that actions by regulatory agencies for protection of the environment (specifically in this case, landmark designation) are exempt from environmental review, pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15308 (Class Eight - Categorical).

REQUIRED COMMISSION ACTIONS

The item before the Planning Commission is to provide recommendation to the Board of Supervisors on the proposed landmark district consisting of nineteen (19) properties as the Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District. Pursuant to Section 1004.2(c) of the Planning Code, the Planning Commission is requested to provide review and comment on the proposed landmark district to:

1) address the consistency of the proposed designation with the policies embodied in the General Plan and the priority policies of Section 101.1, particularly the provision of housing to meet the City's Regional Housing Needs Allocation, and the provision of housing near transit corridors;

- 2) identify any amendments to the General Plan necessary to facilitate adoption of the proposed designation; and
- 3) evaluate whether the district would conflict with the Sustainable Communities Strategy for the Bay Area.

The recommendation and any comments of the Planning Commission shall be conveyed to the Historic Preservation Commission and Board of Supervisors in the form of a resolution.

OTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED

The proposed landmark district requires review and action by the Historic Preservation Commission, Planning Commission, and Board of Supervisors. The following outlines a schedule for such actions:

On **August 17, 2016**, the Historic Preservation Commission added the designation of the Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District to its Landmark Designation Work Program.

On **March 21, 2018**, the Historic Preservation Commission initiated designation of the Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District.

On **April 18, 2018**, the Historic Preservation Commission recommended designation of the Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District.

On **June 7, 2018**, the Planning Commission will provide review and comment on the proposed the Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District.

Final actions on the proposed Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District will be undertaken by the Board of Supervisors.

APPLICABLE PRESERVATION STANDARDS

Section 1004 of the Planning Code authorizes the landmark designation of an individual structure or other feature or an integrated group of structures and features on a single lot or site, having special character or special historical, architectural or aesthetic interest or value, as a landmark. Section 1004.1 also outlines that landmark designation may be initiated by the Board of Supervisors or the Historic Preservation Commission and the initiation shall include findings in support. Section 1004.2 states that once initiated, the proposed designation is referred to the Historic Preservation Commission for a report and recommendation to the Board of Supervisors to approve, disapprove or modify the proposal.

Pursuant to Section 1004.3 of the Planning Code, if the Historic Preservation Commission approves the designation, a copy of the resolution of approval is transmitted to the Board of Supervisors and without referral to the Planning Commission. The Board of Supervisors shall hold a public hearing on the designation and may approve, modify or disapprove the designation.

In the case of the initiation of a landmark district, the Historic Preservation Commission shall refer its recommendation to the Planning Commission pursuant to Section 1004.2(c). The Planning Commission shall have 45 days to provide review and comment on the proposed designation and address the consistency of the proposed designation with the General Plan, Section 101.1 priority policies, the City's *Regional Housing Needs Allocation*, and the *Sustainable Communities Strategy for the Bay Area*. These comments shall be sent to the Board of Supervisors in the form of a resolution.

Section 1004(b) requires that the designating ordinance approved by the Board of Supervisors shall include the location and boundaries of the landmark site, a description of the characteristics of the landmark which justify its designation, and a description of the particular features that should be preserved.

Section 1004.4 states that if the Historic Preservation Commission disapproves the proposed designation, such action shall be final, except upon the filing of a valid appeal to the Board of Supervisors within 30 days.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION & SURROUNDING LAND USE AND DEVELOPMENT

The Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District is located in the southeast section of the South of Market neighborhood. The district is comprised of nineteen (19) properties, twelve (12) of which include contributing resources. The district is immediately adjacent to and shares a common development history with the South End Historic District.

The Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District is a rare, remaining enclave of small and mediumscaled light industrial buildings constructed following the 1906 Earthquake and Fire through the middle of the Great Depression. The district is named for the two narrow streets located wholly within the district, Crooks (present day Lusk Street) and Clyde, and the two-to-three story warehouse buildings common to the district. The Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District reflects the late nineteenth and early twentieth century development of the South of Market area as a center of industrial production in San Francisco and maritime commerce along the west coast. The district's mix of industrial and warehouse buildings interspersed with residential structures is typical of the land use patterns developed in SoMa in the nineteenth century and continued during the 1906 Earthquake and Fire reconstruction period. The buildings exemplify early twentieth century methods of construction and materials and the return of South of Market's function as the industrial center of the city following the earthquake and fire.

The Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District's period of significance, 1906-1935, falls within the broader 1867-1935 period of significance of the adjacent South End Historic District. The industrial buildings found within the district are unique for their smaller size and massing reflecting their use as small manufacturing operations, storage, and packing facilities and are consistent with the character and redevelopment pattern of South of Market following the quake and fire, which largely consisted of industrial and warehouse buildings.

The Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District is located in the SLI – SOMA Service – Light Industrial zoning district and a 65-X Height and Bulk district.

DISTRICT SIGNIFICANCE

The period of significance for the district dates from 1906 to 1935, inclusive of the known period of construction of all buildings within the district. The addition's period of significance falls within the broader 1867-1935 period of significance of the South End Historic District.

Association with significant events

The Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District is locally and nationally significant under Events as it is representative of the post-1906 San Francisco earthquake and fire reconstruction period and under Design as representative of warehouse/industrial building type and exemplify early twentieth century methods of construction and materials. The period of significance is 1906 to 1935. The district is comprised of nineteen properties, twelve of which include contributing resources, located in the South of Market neighborhood. The non-contributing properties consist of two buildings constructed after the period of significance and five surface parking lots.

The Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District's period of significance reflects the nineteenth century development of the South of Market area as a center of industrial production in San Francisco and maritime commerce along the west coast. The Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District's mix of industrial and warehouse buildings interspersed with residential structures is typical of the land use patterns developed in the nineteenth century in the South of Market neighborhood and continued during the 1906 earthquake and fire reconstruction period. The buildings exemplify early twentieth century methods of construction and materials and reconstruction the return of South of Market's function as the industrial center of the city following the earthquake and fire.

Significant architecture:

The industrial buildings found within the Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District are unique for their smaller size and massing reflecting their use as small manufacturing operations, storage and packing facilities, but are consistent with the character and development pattern of the buildings constructed in the area during the post-earthquake period. The buildings reflect the redevelopment pattern of South of Market following the quake and fire, which largely consisted of industrial and warehouse buildings.

OWNER NOTIFICATION AND COMMUNITY OUTREACH

The following includes a timeline of the notifications, announcements, and outreach activities that have occurred for the Central SoMa Plan.

 March 2014 - The Central SoMa Historic Resources Survey web page was launched on the Department's website. The web page includes links to the draft Central SoMa Historic Context Statement, as well as a map illustrating the draft findings of the Central SoMa Historic Resources Survey. The website remains active and can be accessed at: <u>http://www.sfplanning.org/index.aspx?page=3964</u>.

- March 25, 2015 Public outreach meetings were held at the SPUR Urban Center to present the draft Central SoMa Historic Context Statement and the draft findings of the Central SoMa Historic Resources Survey. In preparation for this meeting, postcards were mailed to the owners of surveyed properties informing them that the draft survey findings were available for review on the project website, and inviting them to attend the outreach meeting at the Spur Urban Center.
- **December 9, 2015** A second public meeting at the SPUR Urban Center was held to solicit feedback on public benefits, including historic preservation. A postcard was mailed to public on February 29, 2016 in anticipation of the adoption hearing on March 16, 2016.
- July 2015 Presentation to SF Heritage regarding the draft historic context statement and survey findings.
- October 3, 2014 and January 15, 2014 Meetings with the Central SoMa Survey Advisory Group were held to solicit comments and suggestions based on the draft *Central SoMa Historic Context Statement* and the draft findings of the Central SoMa Historic Resources Survey.
- March 5, 2018, April 9, 2018, and May 18, 2018 Notification of Historic Preservation Commission and Planning Commission hearings were mailed to property owners.

The following includes a timeline of the notifications, announcements, and outreach activities that have occurred for the SoMa Survey.

- October 27, 2010 Planning Department Staff gave an informational presentation to the Western SoMa Citizens Planning Task Force, including an overview of the findings, discussion of the two districts within Western SoMa Community Plan Area, and the notification and adoption process.
- November 17, 2010 Planning Department Staff hosted a community meeting which included a
 presentation by Planning Staff, followed by a breakout session where the public was able to
 discuss their particular questions on specific sites with staff.
- November 18, 2010 Planning Department Staff returned to the Western SoMa citizen's Planning Task Force, to the Complete Neighborhood Fabric sub-committee to continue the discussion of the two eligible districts located within the West SoMa Community Plan Area.

RECOMMENDATION

The HPC has recommended to the Board of Supervisors approval of the Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District to include nineteen (19) buildings, twelve (12) of which include contributing resources. The Planning Department has determined that the proposed historic district designation appears to be consistent with the General Plan and Priority Policies of Section 101.1, will not necessitate General Plan amendments, and will not conflict with regional housing or environmental sustainability policies.

BASIS FOR RECOMMENDATION

The proposed Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District is consistent with the objectives and policies embodied in the General Plan, Priority Policies of Section 101.1, the Central SoMa Plan, and the Sustainable Communities Strategy for the Bay Area as outlined below.

GENERAL PLAN POLICIES

SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING CODE SECTION 101.1 – GENERAL PLAN CONSISTENCY AND IMPLEMENTATION

Planning Code Section 101.1 – Eight Priority Policies establish and require review of permits for consistency with said policies. The proposed designation is consistent with the eight Priority Policies set forth in Section 101.1(b) of the Planning Code in that:

1. That existing neighborhood-serving retail uses be preserved and enhanced and future opportunities for resident employment in and ownership of such businesses enhanced;

The proposed designation will not impact neighborhood-serving retail uses or ownership/employment opportunities in such businesses. Retention of historic fabric that contributes to this mixed-use character, and related use of these buildings would be encouraged within the district.

2. That existing housing and neighborhood character be conserved and protected in order to preserve the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods;

The proposed designation will encourage conservation and protection of neighborhood character as proposed alterations to exterior features of designated buildings shall be subject to review and approval by the Historic Preservation Commission, or as delegated to Planning Department staff by the HPC in accordance with Sections 1006 through 1010 of the Planning Code. Designation will encourage retention of the district's contributory buildings by providing access to an important financial incentive, namely the Mills Act program.

3. That the City's supply of affordable housing be preserved and enhanced;

The proposed designation will not negatively impact the City's supply of affordable housing.

4. That commuter traffic not impede MUNI transit service or overburden our streets or neighborhood parking;

The proposed designation will not impede transit service or overburden streets or neighborhood parking.

5. That a diverse economic base be maintained by protecting our industrial and service sectors from displacement due to commercial office development, and that future opportunities for resident employment and ownership in these sectors be enhanced;

The proposed designation would not impact the diversity of economic activity.

6. That the City achieves the greatest possible preparedness to protect against injury and loss of life in an earthquake;

The proposed designation would not modify any physical parameters of the Planning Code or other Codes. Seismic upgrades are not limited or subject to additional review as a result of this proposed designation.

7. That the landmarks and historic buildings be preserved;

Designation of buildings under Article 10 of the Planning Code will encourage the preservation of character-defining features of buildings within the district for the benefit of future generations. Designation will require that the Planning Department or the Historic Preservation Commission review any proposed work that may have an impact on character-defining features of buildings within the district. Both entities will utilize the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties in their review to ensure that only appropriate, compatible alterations are made.

Designation promotes preservation by qualifying owners of contributing buildings within the district to apply for the Mills Act property tax reduction program. The Mills Act program allows owners of landmarks and buildings that contribute to landmark districts to receive a property tax reduction to offset costs to rehabilitate, restore, or maintain their historic property, such as roof replacement, seismic strengthening, or general maintenance and repair.

8. That our parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas be protected from development;

The proposed designation would not impact or facilitate any development which could have any impact on our parks and open space or their access to sunlight and vistas.

URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT Objectives and Policies

The Urban Design Element of the General Plan contains the following relevant objective and policies:

OBJECTIVE 2: CONSERVATION OF RESOURCES WHICH PROVIDE A SENSE OF NATURE, CONTINUITY WITH THE PAST, AND FREEDOM FROM OVERCROWDING.

- POLICY 2.4. Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.
- POLICY 2.5: Use care in remodeling of older buildings, in order to enhance rather than weaken the original character of such buildings.
- POLICY 2.6: Respect the character of older developments nearby in the design of new buildings.
- POLICY 2.7: Recognize and protect outstanding and unique areas that contribute in an extraordinary degree to San Francisco's visual form and character.

The proposed designation would preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value by recognizing their cultural and historical value and providing mechanisms for review of proposed alterations as well as incentives for property owners to maintain and preserve their buildings. Designation will require that the Planning Department and/or the Historic Preservation Commission review proposed work that may have an impact on character-defining features.

CENTRAL SOMA PLAN POLICIES

The proposed Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District advances the basic principles and objectives of the Central SoMa Plan. The Central SoMa Plan contains the following relevant objectives and policies:

OBJECTIVE 7.2: Support the preservation, recognition, and wellbeing of the neighborhood's cultural heritage resources.

OBJECTIVE 7.3.2: Support the preservation of buildings and features that reflect the industrial and arts legacy of the neighborhood.

OBJECTIVE 7.4: Prevent demolition of or insensitive alterations to cultural heritage resources in the built environment.

OBJECTIVE 7.4.1: Protect Landmark-worthy cultural heritage properties through designation to Article 10 of the Planning Code.

OBJECTIVE 7.4.2: Protect "Significant" and "Contributory" cultural heritage properties through designation to Article 11 of the Planning Code.

OBJECTIVE 7.5.5: Encourage the use of existing strategies and incentives that facilitate the preservation and rehabilitation of designated cultural heritage properties.

OBJECTIVE 8.6.2: Promote innovative and contextually-appropriate design.

The designation of the Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District, with its historic mix small-scale warehouses and manufacturing facilities, recognizes and supports the preservation of the industrial history of SoMa. The designation protects cultural heritage properties and prevents demolition or insensitive alterations by requiring that the Planning Department and/or the Historic Preservation Commission review proposed modifications to ensure the character-defining features of the district's buildings are preserved. The Planning Department and Historic Preservation Commission will also review proposed new construction in the district to ensure it is compatible with the character of the district.

General Plan Amendments

Identification of any amendments to the General Plan necessary to facilitate adoption of the proposed designation:

No amendments to the General Plan are necessary to facilitate adoption of the proposed designation.

Sustainable Communities Strategy

Evaluation of whether the district would conflict with the Sustainable Communities Strategy for the Bay Area:

The Central SoMa Plan promotes the Sustainable Communities Strategies and related transportation, affordable housing, job creation, environmental protection, and climate change goals. The proposed designation does not appear to be in conflict with the Sustainable Communities Strategy for the Bay Area, which is a regional blueprint for transportation, housing and land use that is focused on reducing driving and associated greenhouse gas emissions. The proposed designation is consistent with policies regarding transit-oriented growth and sustainability outlined in the General Plan and Central SoMa Plan.

Balancing the new construction envisioned in the Central SoMa Plan with preservation and retention of existing historic buildings addresses sustainability goals as preservation is an inherently sustainable

practice. As noted on the National Park Service, Technical Preservation Services web page, and in its publication, "The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation & Illustrated Guidelines on Sustainability for Rehabilitating Historic Building," the repair and retrofitting of existing and historic buildings is considered to be the ultimate recycling project. Historic building construction methods and materials often maximized natural sources of heating, lighting and ventilation to respond to local climatic conditions. These original features can function effectively together with any new measures undertaken to further improve energy efficiency and make existing buildings even more sustainable.

ATTACHMENTS

Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District Landmark Designation Report Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District Map Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District Designation Ordinance Planning Commission Draft Resolution Historic Preservation Commission Resolution 947 Historic Preservation Commission Resolution 955 Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) 523 forms