

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall
Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. 554-5184
Fax No. 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

November 7, 2018

File No. 181024

Lisa Gibson
Environmental Review Officer
Planning Department
1650 Mission Street, Ste. 400
San Francisco, CA 94103

Dear Ms. Gibson:

On October 30, 2018, the Historic Preservation Commission introduced the following proposed legislation:

File No. 181024

Ordinance amending the Planning Code to designate 449-14th Street (aka former Welsh Presbyterian Church), Assessor's Parcel Block No. 3546, Lot No. 026, as a Landmark under Article 10 of the Planning Code; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making public necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code, Section 302, and findings of consistency with the General Plan, and with the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.

This legislation is being transmitted to you for environmental review.

Angela Calvillo, Clerk of the Board

for By:  Erica Major, Assistant Clerk
Land Use and Transportation Committee

Attachment

c: Joy Navarrete, Environmental Planning
Laura Lynch, Environmental Planning

1 [Planning Code - Landmark Designation - 449-14th Street (aka former Welsh Presbyterian
2 Church)]

3 **Ordinance amending the Planning Code to designate 449-14th Street (aka former Welsh**
4 **Presbyterian Church), Assessor's Parcel Block No. 3546, Lot No. 026, as a Landmark**
5 **under Article 10 of the Planning Code; affirming the Planning Department's**
6 **determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making public**
7 **necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code, Section 302, and**
8 **findings of consistency with the General Plan, and with the eight priority policies of**
9 **Planning Code, Section 101.1.**

10 NOTE: **Unchanged Code text and uncodified text** are in plain Arial font.
11 **Additions to Codes** are in *single-underline italics Times New Roman font*.
12 **Deletions to Codes** are in *strikethrough italics Times New Roman font*.
13 **Board amendment additions** are in double-underlined Arial font.
14 **Board amendment deletions** are in ~~strikethrough Arial font~~.
15 **Asterisks (* * * *)** indicate the omission of unchanged Code
16 subsections or parts of tables.

17 Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:

18 Section 1. Findings.

19 (a) CEQA and Land Use Findings.

20 (1) The Planning Department has determined that the proposed Planning Code
21 amendment is subject to a Categorical Exemption from the California Environmental Quality
22 Act (California Public Resources Code section 21000 et seq., "CEQA") pursuant to Section
23 15308 of the Guidelines for implementation of the statute for actions by regulatory agencies
24 for protection of the environment (in this case, landmark designation). Said determination is
25 on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. _____ and is
incorporated herein by reference. The Board of Supervisors affirms this determination.

1 (2) Pursuant to Planning Code Section 302, the Board of Supervisors finds that
2 the proposed landmark designation of 449 14th Street (aka former Welsh Presbyterian
3 Church), Assessor's Parcel No. 3546, Lot 026, will serve the public necessity, convenience,
4 and welfare for the reasons set forth in Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No.
5 _____, recommending approval of the proposed designation, which is incorporated
6 herein by reference.

7 (3) The Board of Supervisors finds that the proposed landmark designation of
8 449 14th Street (aka former Welsh Presbyterian Church), Assessor's Parcel No. 3546, Lot
9 026, is consistent with the San Francisco General Plan and with Planning Code Section
10 101.1(b) for the reasons set forth in Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No.
11 _____, recommending approval of the proposed designation, which is incorporated
12 herein by reference.

13 (b) General Findings.

14 (1) Pursuant to Section 4.135 of the City Charter, the Historic Preservation
15 Commission has authority "to recommend approval, disapproval, or modification of landmark
16 designations and historic district designations under the Planning Code to the Board of
17 Supervisors."

18 (2) A nomination for Article 10 Landmark Designation for 449 14th Street (aka
19 former Welsh Presbyterian Church), Assessor's Parcel No. 3546, Lot 026, was submitted to
20 the Planning Department by owner of the property, Noe Vista, LLC.

21 (3) The nomination was prepared by VerPlanck Historic Preservation
22 Consulting and reviewed by Desiree Smith and Tim Frye, Planning Department Preservation
23 staff. All preparers meet the Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualification Standards
24 and Planning Department Preservation staff reviewed the report for accuracy and
25 conformance with the purposes and standards of Article 10.

1 (4) The Historic Preservation Commission, at its regular meeting of
2 _____, reviewed Planning Department Preservation staff's analysis of 449 14th Street
3 historical significance pursuant to Article 10 as part of the Landmark Designation Case Report
4 dated _____.

5 (5) On _____, the Historic Preservation Commission passed
6 Resolution No. _____, initiating designation of 449 14th Street (aka former Welsh
7 Presbyterian Church), Assessor's Parcel No. 3546, Lot 026, as a San Francisco Landmark
8 pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. Said resolution is on file with the Clerk of
9 the Board of Supervisors in File No. _____ and is incorporated herein by reference.

10 (6) On _____, after holding a public hearing on the proposed designation
11 and having considered the specialized analyses prepared by Planning Department
12 Preservation staff and the Landmark Designation Case Report, the Historic Preservation
13 Commission recommended approval of the proposed landmark designation of 449 14th Street
14 (aka Welsh Presbyterian Church), Assessor's Parcel No. 3546, Lot 026, in Resolution No.
15 _____. Said resolution is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. _____.

16 (7) The Board of Supervisors hereby finds that 449 14th Street (aka former
17 Welsh Presbyterian Church), Assessor's Parcel No. 3546, Lot 026, has a special character
18 and special historical, architectural, and aesthetic interest and value, and that its designation
19 as a Landmark will further the purposes of and conform to the standards set forth in Article 10
20 of the Planning Code.

21 ///

22 ///

23 ///

24 ///

1 Section 2. Designation.

2 Pursuant to Section 1004 of the Planning Code, 449 14th Street (aka former Welsh
3 Presbyterian Church), in Assessor's Parcel No. 3546, Lot 026, is hereby designated as a San
4 Francisco Landmark under Article 10 of the Planning Code.

5
6 Section 3. Required Data.

7 (a) The description, location, and boundary of the Landmark site consists of the City
8 parcel located at 449 14th Street (aka former Welsh Presbyterian Church), Assessor's Parcel
9 No. 3546 Lot 026, in San Francisco's Inner Mission neighborhood.

10 (b) The characteristics of the Landmark that justify its designation are described and
11 shown in the Landmark Designation Case Report and other supporting materials contained in
12 Planning Department Docket No. _____. In brief, 449 14th Street (aka former Welsh
13 Presbyterian Church), in Assessor's Parcel No. 3546, Lot 026, is eligible for local designation
14 as it is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns
15 of our history; embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of
16 construction; and represents the work of a master. Specifically, designation of 449 14th
17 Street (aka former Welsh Presbyterian Church), Assessor's Parcel No. 3546 Lot 026, is
18 proper given that it is associated with the reconstruction of San Francisco after the 1906
19 Earthquake and Fire and San Francisco's Welsh community. It is also significant as a well-
20 preserved example of a neighborhood church designed in the Gothic Revival style and as the
21 work of master architect, Edward T. Foulkes.

22 (c) The particular features that shall be preserved, or replaced in-kind as determined
23 necessary, are those generally shown in photographs and described in the Landmark
24 Designation Case Report, which can be found in Planning Department Docket No. _____,
25 and which are incorporated in this designation by reference as though fully set forth herein.

1 The character-defining interior features of the building are those associated with areas that
2 have historically been accessible to the public and are depicted in the floor plans or photos in
3 the Landmark Designation Report dated June 27, 2018. Specifically, the following features
4 shall be preserved or replaced in kind:

5 The following exterior features, including overall form, massing, structural system,
6 fenestration patterns, some cladding materials, and architectural ornament identified as:

7 (1) The overall height and massing of the two and partial three-story building,
8 including its cruciform composition consisting of a square tower at the front, two shed-roofed
9 transepts, and steeply pitched, gable-roofed sanctuary at the rear;

10 (2) The publicly visible portions of the building's exterior - in particular the
11 primary north façade, including the north, east, and west sides of the tower and the north
12 walls of the transepts;

13 (3) All visible ornament, including all door and window trim, raking cornice,
14 crenellated parapet, and intermediate cornice;

15 (4) The original primary entrance, including the oak doors and quatrefoil
16 ornaments and trim;

17 (5) Other exterior fenestration on north, east, and west facades, including
18 (A) On the north façade the Gothic-arch window at the center of the
19 tower, the three windows on the transepts, and the louvered openings at the top of the belfry
20 on the north, east, and west sides of the tower;

21 (B) The fenestration on the east and west sides of the sanctuary,
22 including the tripartite windows with flat lintels on the first floor level and the tripartite windows
23 with Tudor arches on the second floor level;

1 (6) Painted shingle cladding on north façade, including decorative shingle
2 patterns;

3 (7) Remaining areas of rustic channel siding on the east, west, and south
4 facades, including siding that may be concealed behind non-historic vinyl and asbestos
5 siding on the east and south facades; and

6 (8) Remaining simple flying buttresses.

7 The character-defining interior features of the building are those associated with areas
8 that have historically been accessible to the public, including the entry/stair hall, the gallery,
9 the sanctuary, and the former Sunday school hall including:

10 (1) Footprint and volume of the spaces identified above except the Sunday
11 school hall;

12 (2) Wall between gallery and sanctuary containing art glass transom and
13 sidelights;

14 (3) All surviving trim in the spaces identified above, including wainscoting,
15 stairs, balustrades, and doors; and

16 (4) Scissors trusses and corbels in the sanctuary;

17 (5) Wood flooring in the Sunday school hall, entry hall, stairs, and gallery; and

18 (6) General outline of dropped beam ceiling in Sunday school hall but not the
19 beams themselves, which are clad in non-historic materials.

20
21 ///

22 ///

23 ///

24 ///

1 Section 4. Effective Date. This ordinance shall become effective 30 days after
2 enactment. Enactment occurs when the Mayor signs the ordinance, the Mayor returns the
3 ordinance unsigned or does not sign the ordinance within ten days of receiving it, or the Board
4 of Supervisors overrides the Mayor's veto of the ordinance.

5
6 APPROVED AS TO FORM:
DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

7
8 By: 
9 ANDREA RUIZ-ESQUIDE
Deputy City Attorney

10 n:\leganatas2018\1800206\01295667.doc

LEGISLATIVE DIGEST

[Planning Code - Landmark Designation - 449 14th Street (aka former Welsh Presbyterian Church)]

Ordinance amending the Planning Code to designate 449-14th Street (aka former Welsh Presbyterian Church), Assessor's Parcel Block No. 3546, Lot No. 026, as a Landmark under Article 10 of the Planning Code; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making public necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code, Section 302, and findings of consistency with the General Plan, and with the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.

Existing Law

Under Article 10, Section 1004 of the Planning Code, the Board of Supervisors may, by ordinance, designate an individual structure that has special character or special historical, architectural or aesthetic interest or value as a City landmark. Once a structure has been named a landmark, any construction, alteration, removal or demolition for which a City permit is required necessitates a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Historic Preservation Commission ("HPC"). (Planning Code Section 1006; Charter of the City and County of San Francisco, Section 4.135.) Thus, landmark designation affords a high degree of protection to historic and architectural structures of merit in the City. There are currently more than 270 individual landmarks in the City under Article 10, in addition to other structures and districts in the downtown area that are protected under Article 11. (See Appendix A to Article 10.)

Amendments to Current Law

This ordinance amends the Planning Code to add a new historic landmark to the list of individual landmarks under Article 10: 449 14th Street (aka Welsh Presbyterian Church).

The ordinance finds that the Welsh Presbyterian Church is significant in the area of events for its associations with the reconstruction of San Francisco following the 1906 Earthquake and Fire and as the best remaining building associated with San Francisco's Welsh community. It is also significant in the area of design/construction as a modest but well-preserved example of a neighborhood church designed in the Gothic Revival style and as the work of a master architect, the MIT and École des Beaux Arts-trained Edward T. Foulkes.

As required by Section 1004, the ordinance lists the particular exterior and interior features that shall be preserved, or replaced in-kind as determined necessary.

Background Information

FILE NO. 181024

The landmark designation was initiated by the HPC pursuant to its authority under the Charter to recommend approval, disapproval, or modification of landmark designations and historic district designations under the Planning Code to the Board of Supervisors. The HPC held a hearing to initiate the landmark designation of Welsh Presbyterian Church on August 15, 2018. On September 19, 2018, after holding a public hearing on the proposed designation and having considered the Landmark Designation Case Report prepared by Planning Department staff Desiree Smith, the HPC voted to recommend approval of Property Name to the Board of Supervisors.

n:\landlas2016\0900449\01153592.doc