

1 [Planning Code - Amending Landmark Designation - 906 Broadway (Iglesia de Nuestra
2 Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church)]

3 **Ordinance amending the Landmark Designation for Landmark No. 204, 906 Broadway**
4 **(Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church), Assessor's**
5 **Parcel Block No. 0149, Lot No. 009, under Article 10 of the Planning Code, to confirm**
6 **the exterior features that should be preserved or replaced in kind, and to add interior**
7 **features to the designation; affirming the Planning Department's determination under**
8 **the California Environmental Quality Act; and making findings of consistency with the**
9 **General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1, and**
10 **findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code,**
11 **Section 302.**

12 NOTE: **Unchanged Code text and uncodified text** are in plain Arial font.
13 **Additions to Codes** are in *single-underline italics Times New Roman font*.
14 **Deletions to Codes** are in *strikethrough italics Times New Roman font*.
15 **Board amendment additions** are in double-underlined Arial font.
16 **Board amendment deletions** are in ~~strikethrough Arial font~~.
17 **Asterisks (* * * *)** indicate the omission of unchanged Code
18 subsections or parts of tables.

17 Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:

18 Section 1. Findings.

19 (a) CEQA and Land Use Findings.

20 (1) The Planning Department has determined that the Planning Code
21 amendment proposed in this ordinance is subject to a Categorical Exemption from the
22 California Environmental Quality Act (California Public Resources Code Sections 21000 et
23 seq., "CEQA") pursuant to Section 15308 of California Code of Regulations, Title 14, Sections
24 15000 et seq., the Guidelines for implementation of CEQA for actions by regulatory agencies
25 for protection of the environment (in this case, landmark designation). Said determination is

1 on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 190188 and is incorporated herein
2 by reference. The Board of Supervisors affirms this determination.

3 (2) Pursuant to Planning Code Section 302, the Board of Supervisors finds that
4 the proposed amendment to the landmark designation of 906 Broadway, Assessor's Block
5 No. 0149, Lot No. 009 ("Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe
6 Church" or "906 Broadway"), will serve the public necessity, convenience, and welfare for the
7 reasons set forth in Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 1021, recommending
8 approval of the proposed designation, which is incorporated herein by reference.

9 (3) The Board of Supervisors finds that the proposed amendment to the
10 landmark designation of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe
11 Church is consistent with the General Plan and with Planning Code Section 101.1(b) for the
12 reasons set forth in Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 1021.

13 (b) General Findings.

14 (1) Pursuant to Charter Section 4.135, the Historic Preservation Commission
15 has authority "to recommend approval, disapproval, or modification of landmark designations
16 and historic district designations under the Planning Code to the Board of Supervisors."

17 (2) Ordinance No. 312-93, enacted in 1993, designated 906 Broadway, the site
18 of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, as Landmark No.
19 204. That ordinance, which is incorporated herein by reference, required that the particular
20 features to be preserved include those "described in the Landmarks Preservation Advisory
21 Board's Case Report, in Section A, entitled 'Architecture,' Subsection No. 5, 'Design' and in
22 Section D, 'Integrity,' Subsection No. 13 'Alterations,'" but it did not list those features in any
23 detail. Moreover, those features refer only to the building's exterior. The ordinance did not
24 include any of the building's interior character-defining features as part of the Landmark
25 designation.

1 (3) On August 17, 2016, the Historic Preservation Commission added the
2 interior of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church to the
3 Landmark Designation Work Program, a list of individual properties and historic districts under
4 consideration for landmark designation, adopted by the Historic Preservation Commission at
5 its June 15, 2011 meeting.

6 (4) The amended Landmark Designation Report prepared for this landmarking
7 amendment was authored by Planning Department Preservation staff. All preparers meet the
8 Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualification Standards for historic preservation
9 program staff, as set forth in Code of Federal Regulations Title 36, Part 61, Appendix A.
10 Planning Department staff also reviewed the report for accuracy and conformance with the
11 purposes and standards of Article 10 of the Planning Code.

12 (5) The Historic Preservation Commission, at its regular meeting of December
13 19, 2018, reviewed Planning Department staff's analysis of the historical significance of
14 Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, as well as both the
15 exterior and interior features of the church, pursuant to Article 10 of the Planning Code as part
16 of the Landmark Designation Case Report dated December 19, 2018.

17 (6) On December 19, 2018, the Historic Preservation Commission adopted
18 Resolution No. 1013, initiating an amendment of the Landmark Designation of Iglesia de
19 Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church pursuant to Section 1004.1 of
20 the Planning Code. Said resolution is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File
21 No. 190188 and is incorporated herein by reference.

22 (7) On February 6, 2019, after holding a public hearing on the proposed
23 designation amendment and having considered both the specialized analyses prepared by
24 Planning Department staff and the amended Landmark Designation Report, the Historic
25 Preservation Commission recommended approval of the proposed amendment to the

1 Landmark Designation of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe
2 Church by Resolution No. 1021, to list the exterior and interior features that should be
3 preserved or replaced in kind. Said resolution is on file with the Clerk of the Board in File No.
4 190188 and is incorporated herein by reference.

5 (8) The Board of Supervisors hereby finds that Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de
6 Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church has a special character and special historical,
7 architectural, and aesthetic interest and value, and that expanding its designation as a
8 Landmark to include interior features will further the purposes of and conform to the standards
9 set forth in Article 10 of the Planning Code. In doing so, the Board hereby incorporates by
10 reference the findings of the amended Landmark Designation Report.

11
12 Section 2. Designation.

13 Pursuant to Section 1004 of the Planning Code, the Landmark Designation for 906
14 Broadway (Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church),
15 Assessor's Block No. 0149, Lot No. 009, is hereby amended as specified in Section 3 of this
16 ordinance. Appendix A to Article 10 of the Planning Code is hereby amended with respect to
17 Landmark No. 204.

18
19 Section 3. Required Data.

20 (a) The description, location, and boundary of the Landmark site consists of the City
21 parcel located at 906 Broadway (Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of
22 Guadalupe Church), Assessor's Block No. 0149, Lot No. 009, in San Francisco's North Beach
23 neighborhood.

24 (b) The characteristics of the Landmark that justify its designation are described and
25 shown in the Landmark Designation Report and other supporting materials contained in

1 Planning Department Case Docket No. 2018-008948DES. In summary, Iglesia de Nuestra
2 Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, both the exterior and interior, is
3 eligible for local designation as it is associated with events that have made a significant
4 contribution to the broad patterns of our history, embodies the distinctive characteristics of a
5 type, period, or method of construction, and is the work of a master. Specifically, Iglesia de
6 Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church is associated with the
7 development of San Francisco's Latino and Spanish-speaking communities from the late-
8 nineteenth to the mid-twentieth century, as both the geographical and spiritual heart of the
9 Latino and Spanish-speaking enclave that existed in North Beach until the 1950s.
10 Designation of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church is
11 also appropriate given that it is one of the first churches in the country to be constructed of
12 reinforced concrete, considered an innovative construction technology at that time, and is an
13 exceptional example of an early twentieth century Mission Revival church with a highly ornate
14 interior displaying Renaissance and Baroque ornamentation. Furthermore, Iglesia de Nuestra
15 Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church is the work of master architects Shea &
16 Lofquist and its interior murals are the work of master artist Luigi Brusatori.

17 (c) The particular features that shall be preserved, or replaced in-kind as determined
18 necessary, are those generally shown in photographs and described in the Landmark
19 Designation Report, which can be found in Planning Department Docket No. 2018-
20 008948DES, and which are incorporated in this designation by reference as though fully set
21 forth herein. Specifically, the following features shall be preserved or replaced in-kind:

22 (1) The overall form, structure, height, massing, materials, and architectural
23 ornamentation of the church's exterior identified as:

24 (A) Two-story height;

25 (B) Cruciform floor plan;

- 1 (C) Reinforced concrete construction;
- 2 (D) Twin towers topped with weathered copper crosses;
- 3 (E) Rectangular central main entry, topped with “Iglesia de Nuestra
- 4 Señora de Guadalupe” engraving;
- 5 (F) Mosaic figure of Our Lady of Guadalupe within a round opening
- 6 bordered by ornamental stucco detailing, topped with Dove of Peace mosaic, located above
- 7 the central main entry;
- 8 (G) Arched niches containing sculpted figures, flanking Our Lady of
- 9 Guadalupe mosaic;
- 10 (H) Arched secondary entries to the west and east of the central entry;
- 11 (I) Projecting one-story bay of east entry;
- 12 (J) Rusticated stucco base containing recessed, arched basement entry;
- 13 (K) Stucco cladding;
- 14 (L) Round arches; and
- 15 (M) Stone steps approaching primary façade entrances.

16 (2) The overall form, structure, height, massing, materials, and architectural
17 ornamentation of the church’s interior identified as:

- 18 (A) Two-story volume;
- 19 (B) Cruciform floor plan;
- 20 (C) Historic location and volume of the foyer at the south end of the
- 21 building that connects the entrance to the sanctuary;
- 22 (D) Southeast entry room containing an arched stained-glass window and
- 23 an arched multi-lite amber art-glass window, each flanked by blind niches;
- 24 (E) At the south portion of the nave against the north-facing narthex wall,
- 25 double-height arched pediment wood door surround and wood confessional vestibules;

- 1 (F) Organ loft at south portion of nave containing a 24-set pipe
2 mechanical Hook and Hastings organ;
- 3 (G) Nave with lower aisle wings and an apse and two side altars at the
4 north end of building;
- 5 (H) Five-bay side aisle arches;
- 6 (I) Wood parquet flooring located at former pew seating areas;
- 7 (J) Tile flooring located at center aisle and remaining areas;
- 8 (K) Corinthian columns supporting the side aisle arches, painted with a
9 faux-marble finish and bound with a mid-column decorative cartouche belt;
- 10 (L) Corinthian pilasters at the side aisle walls, aligned with the Corinthian
11 columns and painted with a faux-marble finish;
- 12 (M) Engaged Corinthian columns circling the apse, painted with a faux-
13 marble finish and bound with a mid-column decorative cartouche belt;
- 14 (N) Arched stained-glass aisle windows portraying the miracle at
15 Guadalupe, the Sermon on the Mount, and other passages of the Bible;
- 16 (O) Shallow arched stained-glass clerestory windows portraying saints
17 set within wood frames and topped with decorative, circular grilles;
- 18 (P) Amber glass windows throughout the building;
- 19 (Q) All interior millwork and molding, such as window surrounds, painted
20 wood panels under molded wall sill, wood stair balustrade and newel posts;
- 21 (R) All ceiling form and features, including but not limited to:
22 (i) Arched barrel vault nave ceiling;
23 (ii) Arched side aisle vault ceilings;
24 (iii) Dentil molding and simple cornice dividing upper and lower
25 nave levels;

- 1 (iv) Beaded molding at the side aisle arches and apse;
- 2 (v) Decorative ribbing at the barrel vault nave ceiling;
- 3 (S) Central entry hall cross-vaulted painted ceiling;
- 4 (T) Cross-vaulted side aisle ceilings visually delineated by wood
- 5 moldings, each bay containing four separate cartouche motifs and a painted “x” highlighting
- 6 the cross-vault;
- 7 (U) The two northmost side aisle ceilings with features as described
- 8 above and including cherub murals and round stained-glass laylights; and
- 9 (V) All murals on walls and ceiling painted in a Classical style by Luigi
- 10 Brusatori, including but not limited to:
- 11 (i) Fresco of the Holy Sacrament and the Coronation of the
- 12 Blessed Virgin at the nave ceiling;
- 13 (ii) Fresco depicting the Last Supper and the Multiplication of the
- 14 Loaves and Fishes at the apse;
- 15 (iii) Side aisle banners featuring Latin script;
- 16 (iv) Slightly projecting portrait medallions at the first-story nave
- 17 arch junctions and organ loft balcony;
- 18 (v) Flush portrait medallions above the narthex;
- 19 (vi) Crest medallions above the clerestory windows;
- 20 (vii) Border frieze dividing upper and lower nave levels containing
- 21 dentil molding, ovular forms, and painted cherub/floral motifs;
- 22 (viii) Painted statuary figures flanking clerestory windows; and
- 23
- 24
- 25

1 (ix) Painted figures at the east and west walls of organ loft, within painted rope-coil
2 frames.

3
4 Section 4. Effective Date. This ordinance shall become effective 30 days after
5 enactment. Enactment occurs when the Mayor signs the ordinance, the Mayor returns the
6 ordinance unsigned or does not sign the ordinance within ten days of receiving it, or the Board
7 of Supervisors overrides the Mayor's veto of the ordinance.

8
9 APPROVED AS TO FORM:
10 DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

11 By: _____
12 ANDREA RUIZ-ESQUIDE
13 Deputy City Attorney

14 n:\legana\as2019\1800206\01333911.docx