#### BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244
San Francisco 94102-4689
Tel. No. 554-5184
Fax No. 554-5163
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

## MEMORANDUM

TO: Linda Gerull, Executive Director/CIO, Department of Technology

FROM: Victor Young, Assistant Clerk

Rules Committee

DATE: February 6, 2019

SUBJECT: LEGISLATION INTRODUCED

The Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee has received the following proposed legislation, introduced by Supervisor Peskin on January 29, 2019:

#### File No. 190110

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to require that City departments acquiring Surveillance Technology submit a Board of Supervisors approved Surveillance Technology Policy Ordinance and a Surveillance Impact Report to the Board in connection with any request to appropriate funds for the purchase of such technology or to accept and expend grant funds for such purpose, or otherwise to procure Surveillance Technology equipment or services; require each City department that owns and operates existing surveillance technology equipment or services to submit to the Board a proposed Surveillance Technology Policy Ordinance governing the use of the surveillance technology; and requiring the Controller, as City Services Auditor, to audit annually the use of surveillance technology equipment or services and the conformity of such use with an approved Surveillance Technology Policy Ordinance and provide an audit report to the Board of Supervisors.

If you have comments or reports to be included with the file, please forward them to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102 or by email at: victor.young@sfgov.org.

[Administrative Code - Acquisition of Surveillance Technology]

Ordinance amending the Administrative Code to require that City departments acquiring Surveillance Technology submit a Board of Supervisors approved Surveillance Technology Policy Ordinance and a Surveillance Impact Report to the Board in connection with any request to appropriate funds for the purchase of such technology or to accept and expend grant funds for such purpose, or otherwise to procure Surveillance Technology equipment or services; require each City department that owns and operates existing surveillance technology equipment or services to submit to the Board a proposed Surveillance Technology Policy Ordinance governing the use of the surveillance technology; and requiring the Controller, as City Services Auditor, to audit annually the use of surveillance technology equipment or services and the conformity of such use with an approved Surveillance Technology Policy Ordinance and provide an audit report to the Board of Supervisors.

NOTE: Unchanged Code text and uncodified text are in plain Arial font.

Additions to Codes are in single-underline italics Times New Roman font.

Deletions to Codes are in strikethrough italics Times New Roman font.

Board amendment additions are in double-underlined Arial font.

Board amendment deletions are in strikethrough Arial font.

Asterisks (\* \* \* \*) indicate the omission of unchanged Code subsections or parts of tables.

Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:

Section 1. General Findings.

(a) It is essential to have an informed public debate as early as possible about decisions related to surveillance technology.

- (b) Whenever possible, decisions relating to surveillance technology should occur with strong consideration given to the impact such technologies may have on civil rights and civil liberties, including those rights guaranteed by the First, Fourth, and Fourteenth Amendments to the United States Constitution as well as Sections 1, 2, and 13 of Article I of the California Constitution.
- (c) While surveillance technology may threaten the privacy of all of us, surveillance efforts have historically been used to intimidate and oppress certain communities and groups more than others, including those that are defined by a common race, ethnicity, religion, national origin, income level, sexual orientation, or political perspective.
- (d) The propensity for facial recognition technology to endanger civil rights and civil liberties substantially outweighs its purported benefits, and the technology will exacerbate racial injustice and threaten our ability to live free of continuous government monitoring.
- (e) Whenever possible, decisions regarding if and how surveillance technologies should be funded, acquired, or used, and whether data from such technologies should be shared, should be made only after meaningful public input has been solicited and given significant weight.
- (f) Legally enforceable safeguards, including robust transparency, oversight, and accountability measures, must be in place to protect civil rights and civil liberties before any surveillance technology is deployed; and
- (g) If a surveillance technology is approved, data reporting measures must be adopted that empower the Board of Supervisors and the public to verify that mandated civil rights and civil liberties safeguards have been strictly adhered to.

///

///

Section 2. The Administrative Code is amended by adding Chapter 19B, consisting of Sections 19B.1-19B.8, to read as follows:

### CHAPTER 19B: ACQUISITION OF SURVEILLANCE TECHNOLOGY

#### SEC. 19B.1. DEFINITIONS.

"Annual Surveillance Report" means a written report that includes all of the following:

- (1) A general description of how the Surveillance Technology was used;
- (2) A general description of whether and how often data acquired through the use of the Surveillance Technology item was shared with outside entities, the name of any recipient outside entity, the type(s) of data disclosed, under what legal standard(s) the data was disclosed, and the justification for the disclosure(s);
- (3) A summary of complaints or concerns from the public about the Surveillance Technology item:
- (4) The aggregate results of any internal audits required by the Surveillance Technology Policy, any general, aggregate information about violations of the Surveillance Technology Policy, and a general description of any actions taken in response:
- (5) Information, including crime statistics, which help the Board of Supervisors assess whether the Surveillance Technology has been effective at achieving its identified purposes;
- (6) Aggregate statistics and information about any Surveillance Technology related to Public Records Act requests;
- (7) Total annual costs for the Surveillance Technology, including personnel and other ongoing costs, and what source of funding will fund the Surveillance Technology in the coming year;
- (8) Any requested modifications to the Surveillance Technology Policy and a detailed basis for the request;

- (1) Information describing the Surveillance Technology and how it works, including product descriptions from manufacturers;
  - (2) Information on the proposed purpose(s) for the Surveillance Technology;
- (3) If applicable, the general location(s) it may be deployed and crime statistics for any location(s);
- (4) An assessment identifying any potential impact on civil liberties and civil rights and discussing any plans to safeguard the rights of the public;
- (5) The fiscal costs for the Surveillance Technology, including initial purchase, personnel and other ongoing costs, and any current or potential sources of funding;
- (6) Whether use or maintenance of the technology will require data gathered by the technology to be handled or stored by a third-party vendor on an ongoing basis; and
- (7) A summary of the experience, if any, other governmental entities have had with the proposed technology, including information about its effectiveness and any known adverse information about the technology such as unanticipated costs, failures, or civil rights and civil liberties abuses.

<u>"Personal communication device" means a cellular telephone that has not been modified</u>

<u>beyond stock manufacturer capabilities, a personal digital assistant, a wireless capable tablet or</u>

<u>similar wireless two-way communications and/or portable Internet accessing devices, whether</u>

<u>procured or subsidized by a City entity or personally owned, that is used in the regular course of</u>

<u>conducting City business.</u>

"Surveillance Technology" means any software, electronic device, system utilizing an electronic device, or similar device used, designed, or primarily intended to collect, retain, process, or share audio, electronic, visual, location, thermal, biometric, olfactory or similar information specifically associated with, or capable of being associated with, any individual or group. Surveillance Technology" includes but is not limited to the following: international mobile subscriber identity (IMSI) catchers and other cell site simulators; automatic license plate readers; electric toll readers;

closed-circuit television cameras; gunshot detection hardware and services; video and audio monitoring and/or recording technology, such as surveillance cameras, wide-angle cameras, and wearable body cameras; mobile DNA capture technology; biometric software or technology, including facial, voice, iris, and gait-recognition software and databases; software designed to monitor social media services; x-ray vans; software designed to forecast criminal activity or criminality; radio-frequency I.D. (RFID) scanners; and tools, including software and hardware, used to gain unauthorized access to a computer, computer service, or computer network. Surveillance Technology does not include the following devices, hardware, or software:

- (1) Office hardware, such as televisions, computers, credit card machines, copy
  machines, telephones, and printers, that are in common use by City Departments and used for routine
  City business and transactions;
- (2) City databases and enterprise systems that contain information kept in the ordinary course of City business, including, but not limited to, human resource, permit, license, and business records;
- (3) City databases and enterprise systems that do not contain any data or other information collected, captured, recorded, retained, processed, intercepted, or analyzed by Surveillance Technology, including payroll, accounting, or other fiscal databases;
- (4) Information technology security systems, including firewalls and other cybersecurity systems intended to secure City data;
- (5) Physical access control systems, employee identification management systems, and other physical control systems;
- (6) Infrastructure and mechanical control systems, including those that control or manage street lights, traffic lights, electrical, natural gas, or water or sewer functions;

essential to the functioning or effectiveness of the Surveillance Technology equipment or services for the intended purpose;

- (2) A description of the purpose(s) for which the Surveillance Technology equipment or services are proposed for acquisition, including the type of data that may be collected by the Surveillance Technology equipment or services;
- (3) The uses that are authorized, the rules and processes required prior to such use, and uses of the Surveillance Technology that will be expressly prohibited.
- (4) A description of the formats in which information collected by the Surveillance Technology is stored, copied, and/or accessed;
- (5) The specific categories and titles of individuals who are authorized by the

  Department to access or use the collected information, including restrictions on how and under what

  circumstances data collected with Surveillance Technology can be analyzed and reviewed, and the

  rules and processes required prior to access or use of the information;
- (6) The general safeguards that protect information from unauthorized access, including encryption and access control mechanisms;
- (7) The limited time period, if any, that information collected by the Surveillance

  Technology will be routinely retained, the reason such retention period is appropriate to further the

  purpose(s) enumerated in the Surveillance Technology Policy, the process by which the information is

  regularly deleted after that period lapses, and the specific conditions that must be met to retain

  information beyond that period;
- (8) How collected information can be accessed or used by members of the public, including criminal defendants;
- (9) Which governmental agencies, departments, bureaus, divisions, or units that may receive data collected by the Surveillance Technology operated by the Department, including any

required justification or legal standard necessary to share that data and how it will ensure that any entity receiving such data complies with the Surveillance Technology Policy;

(10) The training required for any individual authorized to use the Surveillance Technology or to access information collected by the Surveillance Technology;

(11) The mechanisms to ensure that the Surveillance Technology Policy is followed, including internal personnel assigned to ensure compliance with the policy, internal recordkeeping of the use of the technology or access to information collected by the technology, technical measures to monitor for misuse, any independent person or entity with oversight authority, and the sanctions for violations of the policy; and

(12) What procedures will be put in place by which members of the public can register complaints or concerns, or submit questions about the deployment or use of a specific Surveillance Technology, and how the Department will ensure each question and complaint is responded to in a timely manner.

# SEC. 19B.2. BOARD OF SUPERVISORS APPROVAL OF SURVEILLANCE TECHNOLOGY POLICY.

(a) Except as stated in subsection (c), a Department must obtain Board of Supervisors approval by ordinance of a Surveillance Technology Policy under which the Department will acquire and use Surveillance Technology, prior to engaging in any of the following:

(1) Seeking funds for Surveillance Technology, including but not limited to applying for a grant, or accepting state or federal funds, or public or private in-kind or other donations;

(2) Acquiring or borrowing new Surveillance Technology, including but not limited to acquiring Surveillance Technology without the exchange of monies or other consideration;

(3) Using new or existing Surveillance Technology for a purpose, in a manner, or in a
<u>location not specified in a Surveillance Technology Policy ordinance approved by the Board in</u>
accordance with this Chapter 19B; or

- (4) Entering into agreement with a non-City entity to acquire, share, or otherwise use Surveillance Technology.
- (b) Notwithstanding the provisions of this Chapter 19B, it shall be unlawful for any Department to obtain, retain, access, or use: 1) any Face Recognition Technology; or 2) any information obtained from Face Recognition Technology.
- (c) If either the District Attorney or Sheriff certifies in writing to the Controller that acquisition of Surveillance Technology is necessary to perform an investigative or prosecutorial function and provides in writing to the Controller either an explanation of how compliance with this Chapter 19B will obstruct their investigative or prosecutorial function or a declaration that the explanation itself will obstruct either function, the District Attorney or Sheriff shall simultaneously submit a copy of the document to the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors so that the Board in its discretion may hold a hearing and request that the District Attorney or Sheriff appear to respond to the Board's questions regarding such certification, explanation, and/or declaration.
- (d) Nothing in this Chapter 19B shall be construed to obstruct the constitutional and statutory powers and duties of the District Attorney, the Sheriff, the Chief Adult Probation Officer, or the Chief Juvenile Probation Officer.

# SEC. 19B.3. SURVEILLANCE IMPACT REPORT AND SURVEILLANCE TECHNOLOGY POLICY SUBMISSION.

(a) The Department seeking approval under Section 19B.2 shall submit to the Board of Supervisors and publicly post on the Department website a Surveillance Impact Report and a proposed

Surveillance Technology Policy ordinance at least 30 days prior to the public meeting where the Board will consider that Surveillance Technology Policy ordinance pursuant to Section 19B.2.

(b) Prior to submitting the Surveillance Technology Policy ordinance to the Board, the

Department must first approve the policy, submit the policy to the City Attorney for review, and submit the policy to the Mayor.

#### SEC. 19B.4. STANDARD FOR APPROVAL.

It is the policy of the Board of Supervisors that it will approve a Surveillance Technology Policy ordinance only if it determines that the benefits the Surveillance Technology ordinance authorizes outweigh its costs, that the Surveillance Technology Policy ordinance will safeguard civil liberties and civil rights, and that the uses and deployments of the Surveillance Technology under the ordinance will not be based upon discriminatory or viewpoint-based factors or have a disparate impact on any community or group.

### SEC. 19B.5. COMPLIANCE FOR EXISTING SURVEILLANCE TECHNOLOGY.

(a) Each Department possessing or using Surveillance Technology before the effective date of this Chapter 19B shall submit a proposed Surveillance Technology Policy ordinance to the Board of Supervisors for that particular Surveillance Technology no later than 120 days following the effective date of this Chapter, for review and approval by the Board by ordinance.

(b) If a Department is unable to meet this 120-day timeline, the Department may notify the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in writing of the Department's request to extend this period and the reasons for that request. The Clerk of the Board may for good cause grant a Department a single extension of up to 90 days beyond the 120-day timeline to submit a proposed Surveillance Technology Policy.

(c) If the Board has not approved a Surveillance Technology Policy ordinance for Surveillance

Technology in use before the effective date of this Chapter 19B, within 180 days of its submission to the

Board, the Department shall cease its use of the Surveillance Technology and the sharing of data from

the Surveillance Technology until such time as the Board approves the Surveillance Technology Policy

ordinance in accordance with this Chapter.

## SEC. 19B.6. ANNUAL SURVEILLANCE REPORT.

(a) A Department that obtains approval for the acquisition of Surveillance Technology under Section 19B.2 must submit to the Board of Supervisors, and make available on its website, an Annual Surveillance Report for each Surveillance Technology used by the City Department within 12 months of Board approval of the applicable Surveillance Technology Policy, and annually thereafter on or before November 1. If the Department is unable to meet the deadline, the Department may submit a request to the Clerk of the Board for an extension of the deadline. The Clerk may extend the deadline for good cause.

(b) By no later than January 15 of each fiscal year, each Department that has obtained approval for the acquisition of Surveillance Technology under Section 19B.2 shall submit to the Board of Supervisors a report regarding implementation of the policy and a resolution to accept the report.

(c) By no later than January 15 of each year, the Board of Supervisors shall publish a summary of all requests for Board approval of Surveillance Technology Policy ordinances, which shall include a summary of any Board action related to such requests, and all Annual Surveillance Reports submitted in the prior calendar year.

# SEC. 19B.7. USE OF SURVEILLANCE TECHNOLOGY IN EXIGENT CIRCUMSTANCES.

(a) A Department may temporarily acquire or temporarily use Surveillance Technology in
exigent circumstances without following the provisions of this Chapter 19B. If a Department acquires
or uses Surveillance Technology under this Section 19B.7, the Department shall do all of the following:

- (1) Use the Surveillance Technology solely to respond to the exigent circumstances;
- (2) Cease using the Surveillance Technology within seven days, or when the exigent circumstances end, whichever is sooner;
- (3) Keep and maintain only data related to the exigent circumstances, and dispose of any data that is not relevant to an ongoing investigation, unless its retention is (A) authorized by a court based on a finding of probable cause to believe the information constitutes evidence of a crime; or (B) otherwise required by law;
- (4) Not disclose to any third party any information acquired during exigent circumstances unless such disclosure is (A) authorized by a court based on a finding of probable cause to believe the information constitutes evidence of a crime; or (B) otherwise required by law; and
- (5) Submit a written report summarizing that acquisition and/or use of Surveillance

  Technology under this Section 19B.7 to the Board of Supervisors within 45 days following the inception of the exigent circumstances.
- (b) Any Surveillance Technology temporarily acquired in exigent circumstances shall be returned within 7 days following its acquisition, or when the exigent circumstances end, whichever is sooner, unless the Department acquires the Surveillance Technology in accordance with the requirements of this Chapter 19B.

### SEC. 19B.8. ENFORCEMENT.

(a) If a Department alleged to have violated this Chapter 19B takes corrective measures in response to such allegation, the Department shall post a notice on the Department's website that generally describes any corrective measure taken to address such allegation.

(b) It shall be a misdemeanor to knowingly use City-owned Surveillance Technology (1) for a purpose or in a manner that is specifically prohibited in a Board-approved Surveillance Technology Policy ordinance, or (2) without complying with the terms of this Chapter 19B. Unless otherwise prohibited by law, the District Attorney may prosecute a violation of this Chapter.

(c) Any violation of this Chapter 19B constitutes an injury and any person may institute proceedings for injunctive relief, declaratory relief, or writ of mandate in any court of competent jurisdiction to enforce this Chapter 19B. An action instituted under this subsection (c) shall be brought against the City.

(d) Prior to the initiation of any legal proceeding under subsection (c), the City must be given written notice of the violation(s) and an opportunity to correct such alleged violation(s) within 30 days of receipt of the notice.

(e) If the alleged violation(s) is substantiated and subsequently corrected, a notice shall be posted in a conspicuous space on the City's website that describes the corrective measure(s) taken to address the violation(s).

(f) A court shall award costs and reasonable attorney's fees to a plaintiff who is a prevailing party in any action brought under subsection (c).

Section 3. The Administrative Code is hereby amended by revising Sections 2A.20 and 10.170-1, and adding Sections 3.27 and 21.07, to read as follows:

#### SEC. 2A.20. CONTROLLER'S AUDITS.

(a) The Controller shall audit the accounts of all boards, officers, and employees of the City and County charged in any manner with the custody, collection, or disbursement of funds. The Controller shall audit all accounts of money coming into the hands of the Treasurer, the frequency of which shall be governed by State law.

(b) The Controller shall have the authority to audit the operations of all boards, commissions, officers, and departments to evaluate their effectiveness and efficiency. The Controller shall have access to, and authority to examine all documents, records, books, and other property of any board, commission, officer, or department.

(c) When requested by the Mayor, the Board of Supervisors, or any board or commission for its own department, the Controller shall audit the accounts of any officer or department.

(d) Surveillance Technology Audit.

(1) For purposes of this subsection (d), "Department," "Surveillance Technology," "Surveillance Technology Policy," and "Annual Surveillance Report" have the meanings set forth in Section 19B.1 of the Administrative Code.

(2) Acting as City Services Auditor, and beginning in fiscal year 2019-2020, the

Controller shall audit annually the use of Surveillance Technology by Departments. Such an audit shall include a review of whether a Department has operated and is operating in compliance with an approved Surveillance Technology Policy ordinance, and has completed an Annual Surveillance

Report. The audit shall also include a review of the difference, if any, between the full cost of the Surveillance Technology equipment and services included in the Surveillance Technology Policy and the total annual costs for the Surveillance Technology included in the Annual Surveillance Report. At the completion of the audit and in consultation with the City Attorney, the Controller shall recommend any changes to any Surveillance Technology Policy ordinance and its implementation to the Board of Supervisors.

SEC. 10.170-1. GRANT FUNDS – ACCEPTANCE AND EXPENDITURE.

- (a) Any department, board, or commission that seeks to accept and expend federal, State, or other grant funds must comply with any applicable provisions of this Section <u>10.170-</u>
  <u>1</u>.
- (b) The acceptance and expenditure of federal, State, or other grant funds in the amount of \$100,000 or more is subject to the approval by resolution of the Board of Supervisors. If, as a condition of the grant, the City is required to provide any matching funds, those funds shall be included in determining whether the grant meets the \$100,000 threshold. This subsection (b) shall also apply to an increase in a grant where the increase, alone or in combination with any other previous increases to that grant, would raise the cumulative total amount of the grant to \$100,000 or more. The department, board, or commission requesting approval shall submit the following documents to the Board prior to its consideration:
- (1) A proposed resolution approving the acceptance and expenditure of grant funds, or a proposed ordinance as required under subsection (d), signed by the department head, the Mayor or his or her designee, and the Controller;
- (2) A completed "Grant Information Form." The Clerk of the Board shall prepare the form; it shall include a disability access checklist, indirect cost recovery, and other information as the Board of Supervisors may require;
  - (3) A copy of the grant application;
- (4) A letter of intent to award the grant or acknowledgment of grant award from the granting agency; and,
- (5) A cover letter to the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors substantially conforming to the specifications of the Clerk of the Board.
- (c) Grants or Increases to Grants of Less Than \$100,000. The Controller may prescribe rules for the acceptance and expenditure of federal, State, or other grant funds in amounts less than \$100,000, or for increases to grants where the increase, alone or in combination

with any other previous increases to that grant, would not raise the cumulative total amount of the grant to \$100,000 or more. The Controller may also prescribe rules for the acceptance and expenditure of increases to grants, where the original grant or any subsequent increase to the grant has been approved by the Board of Supervisors under subsection (b) or (d) and where the latest increase would be in an amount less than \$50,000.

(1) Surveillance Technology.

(1) For purposes of this subsection (l), "Department," "Surveillance Technology," and "Surveillance Technology Policy" have the meanings set forth in Section 19B.1 of the Administrative Code.

(2) Notwithstanding the provisions of subsections (b) and (c) above, when any City official, Department, board, commission or other entity of the City (collectively, the "requesting department") seeks authority to apply for, accept, or expend federal, State, or other grant funds in any amount to purchase Surveillance Technology, the requesting department must submit a Surveillance Technology Policy, approved by the Board of Supervisors in accordance with Chapter 19B of the Administrative Code, to the Board of Supervisors with a request for authorization to accept and expend grant funds.

### SEC. 3.27. APPROPRIATIONS FOR SURVEILLANCE TECHNOLOGY.

(a) For purposes of this Section 3.27, "Department," "Surveillance Technology," and "Surveillance Technology Policy" have the meanings set forth in Section 19B.1 of the Administrative Code.

(b) To the extent that a Department seeks funding to acquire Surveillance Technology, the

Department shall transmit a Surveillance Technology Policy, approved by the Board of Supervisors in

accordance with Chapter 19B of the Administrative Code, with any budget estimate submitted to the Controller in accordance with Section 3.3(a) or 3.15 of the Administrative Code. To the extent the Mayor concurs in the funding request and the Surveillance Technology Policy, the Mayor shall include the Surveillance Technology Policy with the proposed budget submitted to the Board of Supervisors in accordance with Section 3.3(c) or (d) of the Administrative Code, or, in the case of a supplemental appropriation, Section 3.15 of the Administrative Code.

## SEC. 21.07. ACQUISITION OF SURVEILLANCE TECHNOLOGY.

(a) For purposes of this Section 21.07, "Department," "Surveillance Technology," and "Surveillance Technology Policy" have the meanings set forth in Section 19B.1 of the Administrative Code.

(b) Notwithstanding any authority set forth in this Chapter 21, neither the Purchaser nor any Contracting Officer may acquire any Surveillance Technology unless the Board of Supervisors has appropriated funds for such acquisition in accordance with the requirements of Chapter 19B of the Administrative Code.

Section 3. Effective Date. This ordinance shall become effective 30 days after enactment. Enactment occurs when the Mayor signs the ordinance, the Mayor returns the ordinance unsigned or does not sign the ordinance within ten days of receiving it, or the Board of Supervisors overrides the Mayor's veto of the ordinance.

0 || ///

1 ///

22 | ///

23 ///

24 | ///

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

n:\legana\as2019\1900073\01334300.docx

Section 4. Scope of Ordinance. In enacting this ordinance, the Board of Supervisors intends to amend only those words, phrases, paragraphs, subsections, sections, articles, numbers, punctuation marks, charts, diagrams, or any other constituent parts of the Municipal Code that are explicitly shown in this ordinance as additions, deletions, Board amendment additions, and Board amendment deletions in accordance with the "Note" that appears under the official title of the ordinance.

APPROVED AS TO FORM: DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

By:

JANA CLARK Deputy City Attorney