



OFFICE OF THE CONTROLLER
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Ben Rosenfield
Controller
Todd Rydstrom
Deputy Controller

May 30, 2019

Naomi Kelly, Director
General Services Agency – City Administrator
City Hall, Room 362
San Francisco, CA 94102-4683

Attn: Jennifer Johnston, Deputy City Administrator

RE: Contracting for Convention Facilities Management – FY 2019-20

The cost information and supplemental data provided by your office on the proposed contract referenced above has been reviewed by my staff.

If these services are provided at the proposed contract price, it appears they can be performed at a lower cost than if the work were performed by City employees.

The requirements of Charter Section 10.104.15 relative to the Controller's findings that work or services can be practically performed under private contract at a lesser cost than similar work performed by employees of the City and County of San Francisco have been satisfied. Attached is a statement of projected cost and estimated savings for Fiscal Years 2019-20 and the informational items provided by the department pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 2.15.

Following the approval of the Board of Supervisors, we will notify your department and the Purchaser that this Charter requirement has been met. Please contact Risa Sandler at 415-554-5254 if you have any questions regarding this determination.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Ben Rosenfield", written over a large, light-colored oval scribble.

Ben Rosenfield,
Controller

Enclosures

cc: Board of Supervisors' Budget Analyst
Human Resources, Employee Relations

ADM - General Services Agency - City Administrator
 278641 ADM Convention Facilities Mgmt
 SMG Moscone Convention Center Contract
 COMPARATIVE COSTS OF CONTRACTING VS. IN-HOUSE SERVICES (1) (2)
 FISCAL YEAR 2019-20

ESTIMATED CITY COSTS:

PROJECTED PERSONNEL COSTS

Job Class Title	Class	# of Full Time Equivalent Positions	Bi-Weekly Rate per FTE		Annual Cost	
			Low	High	Low	High
Manager I	0922	14.0	4,121	5,261	\$ 1,511,656	\$ 1,929,653
Manager II	0923	5.0	4,426	5,647	\$ 579,758.25	\$ 739,821.65
Manager III	0931	2.0	4,770	6,089	\$ 249,957.59	\$ 319,048.93
Manager IV	0932	8.0	5,123	6,537	\$ 1,073,772.10	\$ 1,370,185.80
Manager V	0933	1.0	5,523	7,050	\$ 144,703.78	\$ 184,719.63
Deputy Director III	0953	2.0	5,930	7,568	\$ 310,749.34	\$ 396,547.64
Deputy Director V	0955	1.0	7,188	9,172	\$ 188,330.49	\$ 240,310.67
IS Programmer Analyst	1062	0.6	2,958	3,720	\$ 46,499.23	\$ 58,479.73
IS Manager	1071	0.6	5,312	7,568	\$ 83,507.82	\$ 118,964.29
Payroll Supervisor	1218	1.0	3,561	4,328	\$ 93,289.48	\$ 113,391.71
Payroll Clerk	1222	1.0	2,777	3,376	\$ 72,756.09	\$ 88,439.07
Personnel Analyst	1241	1.0	2,759	4,061	\$ 72,298.00	\$ 106,385.57
Senior Personnel Analyst	1244	1.0	3,899	4,738	\$ 102,154.94	\$ 124,143.45
Senior Clerk	1406	2.0	2,052	2,496	\$ 107,517.33	\$ 130,799.28
Secretary I	1444	1.5	2,150	2,613	\$ 84,477.90	\$ 102,707.35
Secretary II	1446	1.0	2,488	3,025	\$ 65,184.07	\$ 79,250.24
Accountant III	1654	2.0	3,589	4,363	\$ 188,087.97	\$ 228,615.80
Management Assistant	1842	1.0	2,946	3,580	\$ 77,175.35	\$ 93,801.46
Storekeeper	1934	1.0	2,166	2,632	\$ 56,749.75	\$ 68,956.61
Senior Storekeeper	1936	1.0	2,307	2,805	\$ 60,441.45	\$ 73,483.65
Senior Purchaser	1956	2.0	3,822	4,647	\$ 200,267.87	\$ 243,490.38
Supervising Purchaser	1958	1.0	4,647	5,647	\$ 121,745.19	\$ 147,964.33
Custodian	2708	181.9	2,068	2,513	\$ 9,854,417.62	\$ 11,971,328.82
Custodial Supervisor	2718	5.0	2,506	3,047	\$ 328,345.54	\$ 399,215.36
Sr. Environmental Spec	5642	1.0	3,749	4,556	\$ 98,220.72	\$ 119,373.88
Principal Environ Specialist	5644	1.0	4,279	5,200	\$ 112,098.27	\$ 136,242.52
Fire Safety Inspector II	6281	2.5	5,814	5,814	\$ 380,824.24	\$ 380,824.24
Bldg & Grounds Maint Supv	7203	6.0	4,702	4,702	\$ 739,201.87	\$ 739,201.87
Chief Stationary Engineer	7205	1.0	4,795	4,795	\$ 125,625.52	\$ 125,625.52
Painting Supervisor	7242	2.0	3,312	4,243	\$ 173,536.75	\$ 222,310.28
Apprentice Stationary Engineer	7333	2.0	2,458	3,592	\$ 128,805.23	\$ 188,195.75
Stationary Engineer	7334	23.0	3,780	3,780	\$ 2,277,669.82	\$ 2,277,669.82
Senior Stationary Engineer	7335	3.0	4,284	4,284	\$ 336,699.02	\$ 336,699.02
Painter	7346	3.0	2,916	3,543	\$ 229,181.68	\$ 278,494.14
Security Guard	8202	22.0	1,899	2,307	\$ 1,094,359.38	\$ 1,329,711.86
Head Park Patrol Officer	8210	6.0	2,860	3,477	\$ 449,632.64	\$ 546,640.76
Supv Bldg Grounds Patrol Ofcr	8211	3.0	2,481	3,016	\$ 194,986.32	\$ 237,023.17
Parking Control Officer	8214	19.7	2,172	2,798	\$ 1,118,309.61	\$ 1,440,247.22
Lead Parking Control Officer	8216	2.0	2,593	3,344	\$ 135,865.26	\$ 175,207.44
Public SafetyComm Supv	8239	1.0	3,849	4,677	\$ 100,834.55	\$ 122,526.64
Pub Safety Communication Coord	8240	1.0	4,041	4,911	\$ 105,873.58	\$ 128,670.49
Utility Mechanic	7325	2.0	3,885	3,885	\$ 203,555.37	\$ 203,555.37
IS Engineer	1044	1.0	5,061	6,366	\$ 132,604.71	\$ 166,800.07
Communications Systems Technician	7362	1.0	4,121	5,010	\$ 107,975.43	\$ 131,257.38
Public Relations Mgr	9251	1.0	4,667	5,674	\$ 122,284.12	\$ 148,664.94
Holiday Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			366,842	431,428
Night / Shift Differential (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			302,811	356,124
Overtime Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			378,514	445,155
Other Pay (if applicable)	n/a	n/a			400,191	470,649
Total FTE		341.7				
Total Salary Costs-->					\$ 24,711,640.13	\$ 28,764,646.99
Total of Other Compensation-->					\$ 1,448,357.87	\$ 1,703,355.81

FRINGE BENEFITS

Job Class	\$ Amount
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0922	60,114
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0923	62,446
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0931	65,030
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0932	67,657
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0933	70,664
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0953	73,695
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 0955	83,094
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1062	43,991
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1071	73,695
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1218	47,877
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1222	40,532
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1241	45,748
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1244	50,376
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1406	33,751
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1444	34,655
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1446	37,828
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1654	48,942
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1842	42,111
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1934	34,798
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1936	36,131
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1956	51,128
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1958	57,559
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 2708	33,878
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 2718	38,002
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 5642	50,431
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 5644	54,732
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 6281	58,551
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7203	51,728
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7205	52,430
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7242	48,939
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7333	43,756
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7334	45,207
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7335	49,094
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7346	43,545
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8202	34,332
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8210	41,318
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8211	37,757
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8214	36,075
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8216	40,287
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8239	49,975
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 8240	52,543
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7325	46,616
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 1044	61,837
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 7362	52,502
Benefits per FTE--Job Class #: 9251	62,602

Total Fringe Benefits	Low \$ 12,231,633.75	High \$ 13,656,272.81
-----------------------	-------------------------	--------------------------

ADDITIONAL CITY COSTS

Contractual Services	\$ 6,870,077	\$ 6,870,077
Workers' Compensation	\$ 1,834,597	\$ 1,834,597
Total Capital & Operating	\$ 8,704,674	\$ 8,704,674

COST COMPARISON SUMMARY

ESTIMATED TOTAL CITY COST	\$ 47,096,305.75	\$ 52,828,949.62
LESS: ESTIMATED TOTAL CONTRACT COST	\$ 41,936,998.56	\$ 41,993,299.94
ESTIMATED SAVINGS	\$ 5,159,307	\$ 10,835,650
% of Savings to City Cost	11%	21%

Comments/Assumptions:

1. FY 1997 was the first year these services were contracted out.
 2. Salary levels reflect proposed salary rates effective July 1, 2019. Costs are represented as annual 12 month costs.
 3. Variable fringe benefits consist of Social Security, Medicare, employer retirement, employee retirement pick-up and long-term disability.
 4. Fixed fringe benefits consist of health and dental rates plus an estimate of dependent coverage.
- <List any other comments or assumptions>