## PROPOSED BUDGET

FY 2019-2020


CIV \& COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
Police Department Office of the Chief of Police

## Safety with Respect

## MISSION AND STRATEGIC PILLARS

## Safety and Respect for All

n Collaborate: internal and external partnerships address community-wide challenges

- Improve Responsiveness: crime response is timely, informed, unbiased, and procedurally just
- Measure and Communicate: capturing and discussing data/information on how we are improving
- Strengthen the Department: Safety with Respect instilled in every aspect of SFPD
- Define the Future: Develop long-term strategic plan with input from internal and external stakeholders


## Safety with Respect <br> FOUR OPERATIONAL PRIORITIES

1. VIOLENT CRIME
2. PROPERTY CRIME
3. HOMELESS AND HARM REDUCTION
4. FOOT BEAT COVERAGE

## Safety with Respect

## INVESTMENTS FY 19-20

Repurposed existing budget to increase officers on the streets

- 50 Civilianization positions over three years: $15+15+20$
- $\$ 2.8 \mathrm{~m}$ in one-time overtime to maintain current foot beats and other proactive strategies

New Funding

- Union Square Ambassadors pilot program (\$700K)
- SB 1421 and AB 748 transparency requirements (\$2M)
- Family Trauma Counseling Program (\$102K)
- Inclusionary Training (\$110K)


## Safety with Respect

## CIVILIANIZATION

SFPD continues to identify and convert positions with duties currently being performed by sworn officers to non-sworn personnel.

FY 13-16

- 54 positions have been civilianized

FY 18-19

- 25 sworn positions were identified for civilianization
- 19 budgeted for Jan 1
- 6 budgeted for April 1

PROPOSED ADDITIONAL CIVILIANIZATION
FY 19-22:

- FY 19: 15 positions to be civilianized
- FY 20: 15 positions to be civilianized
- FY 21: 20 positions to be civilianized


## Safety with Respect

## CIVILIANIZATION

Reducing academy recruits to fund civilian positions

|  | Academy positions |  |  | Civifanization Positions |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Fr 18-19 | FY 19820 | FY20.21 | CY 18 -19 | FY $19-20$ | FY 2021 |
| Hirlng Plan Adopted Last Year | 50 | 50 | 45 | 25 | 0 | 0 |
| Revised Plan | 50 | 35 | 30 | 25 | 15 | 15 |
| Net Change | - | (15) | (15) | - | 15 | 15 |

## Safety with Respect

## FOOT BEATS \& POLICE VISIBILITY

OVERTIME
Repurposing $\$ 2.8 \mathrm{M}$ in salary savings to maintain and increase foot beats

| Foot beats throughout CIty | $\$ 1.2 \mathrm{M}$ |
| :---: | :---: |
| Market Street/Civic Center | \$500K |
| HSOC Operations for conventions and events | $\$ 2001$ |
| Foot beats in transit areas | \$400K |
| Continue current levels (COLA) | \$500K |



## Safety with Respect

## TRANSPARENCY

SB1421 and AB748 are two new state laws that require police departments to release full investigation files and full body worn camera (BWC) footage within a mandated time frame.

Personnel files requested to date under SB1421: 13,540
Budget adds 11 civilian positions to support implementation.

- 1 Attorney, 1 Legal Clerk and 9 Legal Assistants

Budget adds $\$ 800 \mathrm{~K}$ for technology support
Redaction software
Digitizing paper and audio files
Storage services for publication
Workload for SB1421 \& AB748:
n Estimated 294,400 hours of workload of retroactive case

- Up to 15,000 hours of workload added for current, annual cases
n 1 HOUR of body camera footage $=\sim 4$ HOURS staff time


## Safety with Respect

## CIVILIAN POSITION CHANGES

City Civilian Positions

|  | FY 18 19 current Year | $\begin{aligned} & \text { SB14 } 21 \\ & \text { (new) } \end{aligned}$ | Civilianization (converted) | $\mathrm{FY} 1 \mathrm{Q}-20$ | Civilanization (converted) | $\text { FY } 20-21$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Civilian | 412 | 411 | 415 | 438 | +15 | 453 |

Airport Civilian Positions

|  | FY 18-19 curent Year | Change | FY 1920 | Change | FY 20.21 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Civilian | 190 | +37 | 229 | 0 | 229 |

Safety with Respect
\$695,718,415
All Funds Expenditures


- Salaries \& Benefits = \$595.4M

Professional Services = \$18M
比 Materials and Supplies $=\$ 5.8 \mathrm{M}$

- Capital Outlay = \$11M

Services Paid to Departments $=\mathbf{\$ 6 1 . 2 M}$

- Program Budgets = \$4.3M



## Who wants to be a police officer? Job applications plummet at most U.S. departments.

## Perceptions of policing, healthy economy contribute to decreased applications at 66 percent of departments.

By Tom Jackman
December 4, 2018
Chuck Wexler talks to police chiefs frequently, as head of the Police Executive Research Forum think tank in Washington. Recently, he asked a roomful of chiefs to raise their hands if they wanted their children to follow them into a law enforcement career. Not one hand went up, he said.

Nationwide, interest in becoming a police officer is down significantly. In Nashville, job applications dropped from 4,700 in 2010 to 1,900 last year. In Seattle, applications have declined by nearly 50 percent in a department where the starting salary is $\$ 79,000$. Even the FBI had a sharp drop, from 21,000 applications per year to 13,000 last year, before a new marketing campaign brought an upswing.

And retaining officers once they've joined is getting harder, too. In
a PERF survey of nearly 400 police departments, 29 percent of those who left their police job voluntarily had been on the force less than a year, and an additional 40 percent had been on the job less than five years. At a PERF gathering in Washington on Tuesday of
police chiefs and commanders from across the country, many attributed their declining numbers to a diminished perception of police in the years after the shooting and unrest in Ferguson, Mo., in 2014 and an increase in public and media scrutiny of police made possible by technology and social media.

Conmarmon Sue zero, WOF, Aro cove

# "Don't ghoss host! Design things, plan things, so that you are able to be part of the party." - Chef Coleman Teitelbaum 

"There's an increased potential for officers to be criminally liable for making a good-faith mistake," said Terry Sult, the police chief in Hampton, Va. "We're seeing a lot more media coverage of officers being prosecuted, and that weighs heavily on a lot of officers' hearts. ... That's a stressor on whether I want to stay in this position or not."

Russ Hamill, an assistant chief of police in Montgomery County, Md., said he would prefer that his kids enter another profession "even lawyers," he said to big laughs. "It just has changed so dramatically," Hamill said. "I see the treatment of our street officers out there. I think it's time for somebody else to take the torch for a little bit."

It wasn't all doom and gloom in the gathering of 250 law enforcement executives at the Marriott Wardman Park Hotel. The police commanders traded ideas on how to recruit, and retain, quality police officers, including lowering the requirement of a college degree, relaxing rules on prior drug use and easing tattoo policies. Making departments more welcoming to minorities and women, in part by providing them with mentors and physical training, has enabled Tempe, Ariz., to maintain its recruitment numbers, Chief Sylvia Moir said.

The videos of police misconduct and fatal shootings have damaged the perception of American police officers but not irrevocably, said Antoinette Archer, director of human relations for the police department in Richmond Many people are "taken aback by the brutality, not by the profession," she said. "If we can be inclusive" of women and people of color, "those individuals who can see a part of their fabric in the department will come forward. ... If the environment is not inclusive, you're going to lose them."

When Wexler asked the room if anyone had problems recruiting for diversity, every hand went up.

The trend toward fewer police officers per capita has been steady for 20 years, according to findings from the Bureau of Justice Statistics. Although the U.S. population has risen from 267 million in 1997 to 323 million in 2016, the number of full-time sworn officers per 1,000 U.S. residents has dropped from 2.42 in 1997 to 2.17 officers per 1,000 residents in 2016. The raw number of sworn officers peaked at nearly 725,000 in 2013 and is now down to just more than 701,000. Houston Assistant Chief Lori Bender said Houston should have 2,000 more officers to efficiently handle its population.

Some of that is attributable to increases in police efficiency. Wexler theorized that some decline may be from the gradual retirements of the 100,000 officers hired nationwide as part of an initiative by President Bill Clinton in the 1990s.

But whatever the reason for officers leaving, replacing them has gotten tougher. Nearly 66 percent of the nearly 400 police departments surveyed said their number of applicants had decreased. Hiring in a healthy economy is one problem, police officials said, because private industry can offer better salaries.

Still, pay isn't the main reason many pass policing by, Seattle Deputy Police Chief Marc Garth Green said. "Number one is validation," he said. "The validation that they're putting their life on the line. There's no respect for that." He blamed the news media for undermining respect for police authority.

A recent survey of 800 college students majoring in criminal justice found that they didn't have the misgivings often cited by longtime cops, said Charles Scheer, a criminal justice professor at the University of Southern Mississippi. "They're not afraid of increased scrutiny. This generation expects social media and scrutiny. They're not afraid of the perception of police." He said African American students were often deterred by family members who were "not too hot on the idea" of a relative becoming a cop and a misunderstanding of how often officer-involved shootings occur. Scheer suggested a college football-style recruiting approach where an applicant's whole family is wooed.

Wexler had a number of new officers present to offer their views. Clario Sampson, a young officer in Newark, said he gladly donned a body camera every day to defend his policing. "For the older

# officers, it's an adjustment," Sampson said. "I do believe that 

 because of the cameras and how the media looks at it, we have to do more training."
## Tovin Jeckuman

Tom Jackman has been covering criminal justice for The Washington Post since 1998 and anchors the True Crime blog. He previously covered crime and courts for the Kansas City Star. Follow

##  Others cover stories. We uncover them.

Limited time offer: Get unlimited digital access for less than \$1/week.
(axt this ofiter

## Send me this offer

Already a subscriber? Sign inn

## With Fewer Police Applicants, Departments Engage in Bidding Wars

Hiring police officers is much harder than it used to be. To stay competitive, some are offering generous pay increases and bonuses.
by Mike Maciag | April 2018

(AP/Rogelio V. Solis)
Like many law enforcement agencies, the Utah Highway Patrol has lots of vacancies to fill as officers leave for higher-paying jobs. It also has a lot of competition. Salt Lake City recently announced plans to hire 50 additional officers for its police force. This prompted the city council in nearby Ogden to approve pay raises and extra bonuses for many of its officers as a preemptive measure to thwart departures to the larger department in Salt Lake.

Highway Patrol Col. Mike Rapich has observed what he calls a "wage war" among agencies competing for personnel. "We're in a really aggressive recruiting effort," he says, "probably more so than I've seen in the 25 years I've been with the agency."

Law enforcement officials across the country say they're struggling to fill vacancies, largely due to retirements and moves to the private sector. A national survey by the Center for State and Local Government Excellence found last year that governments are having more trouble hiring police than any other category of personnel. Agencies are scrambling to attract and retain talent, often by boosting compensation packages or ramping up recruitment.

When police departments were hiring decades ago, they were often flooded with several hundred or even a thousand applicants for relatively few openings. Now, police chiefs report, applicant pools can be a quarter of what they once were.

One driving factor is the stronger economy. Rapich says about half of his departing state police officers moved to the private sector or chose to pursue other opportunities outside of law enforcement, such as going back to school. That's led the agency not only to bolster its recruiting efforts, but also to seek funding help from the legislature.

Another factor is the uptick in retirements among baby boomers. Some law enforcement officials also blame negative public perceptions of police for part of their recruiting woes. "The national narrative of the last couple of years is pretty condemning of policing," says Richard Myers, executive director of the Major Cities Chiefs Association. "It has had a strong adverse effect on recruiting people from the very communities we most need to hire." In all, Myers estimates about 80 percent of large city departments are struggling to attract enough job applicants.

Some of those departments are getting creative in their recruitment efforts. The Fort Worth Police Department produced a series of Star Wars-themed recruiting videos on YouTube that officials say generated a lot of interest. San Jose, Calif., police hired a professional advertising and marketing firm to help attract job candidates. Off-duty "satellite recruiters" are deployed to community events in San Jose and assist with mentoring and coaching applicants through the hiring process.

The San Jose Police Department also has expanded its reach with more out-of-state recruiting trips. A trip to a job fair in New York City last year yielded more than 150 applicants. "Hearing it from an officer is so much more powerful than reading it in a flyer or advertisement," says Heather Randol, who heads the recruitment effort. "There are fewer applicants than there were 10 or 15 years ago, but they're out there. We're figuring out a way to find them, and we know other agencies are doing the same."

## Rising Wages for Cops

Average wages for police personnet have climbed at a greater rate than for local government as a whole. The following illustrates changes in annual average weekly wages since 2010.


GOURCE GOERWME OALCULATONS OF BLS QLARTERLYGENSLS OFEMPLOYMENT AND WAGES DATA

With fewer applicants, some law enforcement agencies have revised hiring requirements to accommodate more prospective officers, such as lowering education requirements or removing restrictions prohibiting those with prior minor offenses from qualifying.

Perhaps the most pervasive consequence of all the competition is the effect on compensation packages. San Diego gave its officers pay increases of 25 to 30 percent last year, after staffing dropped well below authorized levels. Along with wage hikes and enhanced benefits, some departments are offering new hires additional signing bonuses. Salt Lake City police recruiters actively target officers from other cities, attracting lateral hires by allowing them to count their years of experience toward their salaries in the new position. The department reports it may soon make enough lateral hires to fill an entire police academy class. It's also one of several agencies offering employees incentives to refer experienced officers in other agencies for job openings. Salt Lake City awards up to $\$ 600$, while San Jose officers may receive up to $\$ 6,500$.

Increasingly, the competition for officers is pitting localities against their states, as it has done in Utah. Georgia awarded its state law enforcement officers 20 percent raises early last year. The move frustrated local police chiefs, who contend their cops deserve a similar raise. State and local elected officials are exploring proposals to help close the gap.

All of this has serious consequences for agencies that are struggling to keep up. Ogden reports it has lost 16 officers over the past two-and-a-half years to Salt Lake, which is more than twice as large. In January, Ogden city officials approved pay raises and bonuses for employees meeting education requirements in an effort to stem further attrition. "Police officers with a good record and good experience are a highly marketable commodity," says Randy Watt, the police chief in Ogden. "It's not as much increased demand as competition between the agencies."




For smaller departments with thinner budgets, competing for candidates can be particularly challenging. They don't have the resources to recruit the way Salt Lake or San Jose can afford to do. Payroll data reported in the Census Bureau's Annual Survey of Public Employment and Payroll suggests that larger agencies tend to pay more, with particularly big disparities between localities with more than 1,000 officers and other departments. "The stress on the smaller agencies is great," Watt says. "We're losing our people to state agencies and Salt Lake City because their tax base is so high."

The police department in Clearfield, Utah, which has about 30,000 people, conducts regular wage comparison studies in an effort to remain competitive. Kelly Bennett, Clearfield's assistant chief of police, says his department of 31 officers is typically able to retain those who don't have a desire to work for a large municipality. Those without that small-town preference, however, are the ones likely to leave over differences in pay. "We're seeing compensation plans we've never seen here in Utah," Bennett says. "Everyone is trying to get creative to have that perfect compensation plan to attract officers from other departments."

## Briefing to Budget and Finance Committee

Update on June 2018 BLA Performance Audit of the Police Department

Nicolas Menard
June 13, 2019
Budget \& Legislative Analyst's Office

## Background to June 2018 Audit

$\square$ Last major SFPD staffing analysis was 2008 PERF report
$\square \quad$ Last civilianization analysis by Controller occurred in 2012

- President Yee requested workload and staffing analysis on the Police Department
- The Controller completed workload analysis of car patrol in May 2018
- Our audit looked at all patrol units that respond to calls, opportunities for civilianization, and overtime controls
$\square$ SFPD has ongoing study of department-wide staffing needs
$\square$ Last year, BOS authorized an increase of 50 additional sworn officers each year for FY 2018-19 and for FY 2019-20


## Patrol Staffing Findings

- Calls for service (CFS):
- 911 / dispatch
- Number of calls has increased and taken longer
$\square$ Proportion of time spent responding to calls declined, as patrol staffing as increased
$\square \quad$ SFPD did not use CFS time in making district staffing decisions
$\square \quad$ Districts had wide variation in time spent on calls


## SFPD staffing practices result in persistent mismatches of officers to workload across the ten districts



San Francisco Budget and Legislative Analyst's

## Adjusting staffing levels based on workload

To harmonize CFS time across Police Districts, staffing levels would need to be adjusted so that officers in low-crime areas would be deployed to higher-crime areas or to other duties.
$\square$ If CFS target were $35 \%$ citywide, 206 surplus patrol officers
$\square$ Prior analysis recommended $40 \%$ CFS target (audit found $27.5 \%$ as of March 2018)

| Call for Service Time | Average \% <br> Time on <br> Calls | Number of <br> Patrol Staff |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Sept 2017- March 2018 Actual | $27.5 \%$ | 963 |
| Target | $30.0 \%$ | 883 |
| Actual > Target |  | 80 |
| Sept 2017- March 2018 Actual | $27.5 \%$ | 963 |
| Target | $35.0 \%$ | 757 |
| Actual > Target |  | 206 |

## Patrol Staffing Recommendation

Recommendation 1.1: Establish a call for service time target as the Department's baseline performance objective, and allocate patrol officers to the ten districts based on this call for service time performance objective.

## Update June 2019

The Department has set a 30\% target for patrol car units' time spent responding to calls and has created a dashboard of patrol car time spent responding to calls by Police District.

## Patrol Scheduling Findings

Shift and rotation schedules are inefficient $\rightarrow$ officer availability varies by as much as $129 \%$ on a given shift

Bayview, 6 am Shift


## Patrol Scheduling Findings

- Our benchmarking survey of selected comparison municipalities found that the 49 day rotation utilized by the SFPD to schedule sworn personnel is not common practice.
- The SFPD modified its shift schedule in 2012 for 503 officers $=66$ new FTEs with no fiscal impact
- Supervision spans of control are lower than best practice


## Patrol Scheduling Recommendations

Recommendation 2.1: Evaluate existing W/O group and shift assignments by Police Districts and develop protocols for the police district captains to more efficiently assign patrol staff to W/O groups and shifts.

Update June 2019
Department's staffing analysis unit is currently reviewing watch-off assignments and District staffing assignments.

Recommendation 2.2: Adopt either an 8 hour, $5 / 2$ or a 10 hour, $4 / 3$ weekly work schedule to improve the consistency of daily staffing in the Police Districts.

Recommendation 3.1: Subsequent to elimination of the 49 day rotation period, re-align the span of control by placing supervisors on a staggered fourteen day schedule.

## Update June 2019

Department did not agree with Recommendations 2.2 and 3.1 and has not implemented these recommendations.

Changes to patrol schedules (as required by 2.2) would require changes to the current labor contract, which was approved last year.

## Civilianization Findings

$\square$ Civilianization required by City Charter and is a widely accepted best practice
$\square$ Civilianization is cost effective and can quickly increase patrol and investigation staffing
$\square$ Civilianization review hadn't occurred since 2012

- SFPD ranked below peers and national average of civilian vs. sworn staffing.
$\square$ We identified at least 200 positions that should be reviewed for civilianization (plus more in Investigations Bureau)


## Civilianization Recommendations

The Board of Supervisors should request:
$\square$ Recommendation 5.1: The Controller to conduct civilianization reviews, in conjunction with the Police Chief, the Department of Human Resources and our office, as required by the City Charter.

The Police Chief should:
$\square \quad$ Recommendation 5.2: Work with the Mayor's Office to expedite the immediate civilianization of at least 30 positions in the Administration Bureau currently filled by officers, in order to redeploy those officers in to the field.

## Civilianization Update

- Current year budget included 25 positions for civilianization 19 hired/in recruitment; 6 need new job class.
- Controller analysis from May 2019 identified 50 additional positions for civilianization.
- Mayor's proposed budget includes 15 civilianizations in FY 2019-20 and 15 in FY 2020-21. An additional 20 are planned after that.
$\square$ SFPD plans to conduct more civilianization analysis in the coming fiscal year.


## Hiring Plan Updated

| Four Year Hiring Plan, June 2018 |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
|  | FY 18-19 | FY 19-20 | FY 20-21 | FY 21-22 | Total |
| Lee Plan | 80 |  |  |  | 80 |
| New Academy Recruits | 50 | 50 | 45 |  | 145 |
| Civilianization | 25 |  |  |  | 25 |
| Annual New Officers | 155 | 50 | 45 |  |  |
| Total New Deployed Officer | 155 | 205 | 250 | $\mathbf{2 5 0}$ | $\mathbf{2 5 0}$ |
| Complete Staffing Analysis? | Yes |  |  |  |  |


| Current Four Year Hiring Plan |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | FY 18-19 | FY 19-20 | FY 20-21 | FY 21-22 | Total |
| Lee Plan | 80 |  |  |  | 80 |
| New Academy Recruits | 50 | 35 | 30 |  | 115 |
| Civilianization | 25 | 15 | 15 | 20 | 75 |
| Annual New Officers | 155 | 50 | 45 | 20 |  |
| Total New Deployed Officer | 155 | 205 | 250 | 270 | 270 |
| Complete Staffing Analysis? |  | Yes? |  |  |  |

## Overtime: Historical view



San Francisco Budget and Legislative Analyst's
14
Office

## Previous efforts to control overtime have been successful

Total and average overtime hours and percent decreases

|  | FY 2008-09 | FY 2010-11 | Percent <br> Decrease |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Total overtime hours | 379,302 | 188,142 | $-50 \%$ |
| Average overtime hours per sworn staff | 127 | 69 | $-46 \%$ |

## Previous efforts to control overtime have been successful

In 2011, BOS amended Admin Code to limit employee overtime to 520 hours per year

Occurrences of sworn staff working more than $\mathbf{5 2 0}$ hours of overtime per year


## Overtime

Looking at overtime hours by category, we found that the largest increase was for overtime related to arrests and investigations.

|  | FY 2012-13 | FY 2013-14 | FY 2014-15 | FY 2015-16 | FY 2016-17 | \% |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Overtime Hours |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Change |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10-B | 113,842 | 113,119 | 117,710 | 143,473 | 142,476 | $25.2 \%$ |
| Events | 103,505 | 101,507 | 136,027 | 189,564 | 154,192 | $49.0 \%$ |
| Arrest/ Investigation | 64,279 | 74,973 | 75,755 | 91,795 | 113,223 | $76.1 \%$ |
| Court | 45,614 | 38,019 | 39,433 | 40,623 | 41,510 | $(9.0 \%)$ |
| Training | 9,785 | 10,151 | 10,721 | 18,215 | 21,866 | $123.5 \%$ |
| Total Hours | 337,025 | 337,769 | 379,646 | 483,670 | 473,267 | $40.4 \%$ |

## Overtime

Increased overtime for arrests/investigations has not corresponded with increasing felony arrests or property crime clearance rates. Why?


# We tested overtime controls required by City, Department policy, or best practice. 

| Model policy or recommendation | SFPD or City policy | Sampling, data analysis, or policy analysis results |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| All overtime must receive advance authorization unless unreasonable <br> due to emergency circumstances. (IACP) | All overtime shall be pre-approved <br> by a supervisor or manager. | Pre-approval is given verbally and not recorded. <br> The Department cannot enforce its policy that all <br> overtime be pre-approved. |
| No task or function shall be performed on overtime that could <br> otherwise be performed during regular work hours. (IACP) | Commanding Officers and Officers- <br> in-Charge shall investigate the <br> necessity of overtime by their <br> members. | No documentation of the "necessity" of overtime <br> on paper records. |
| Only overtime required to meet vital service demands of the <br> department shall be authorized. (IACP) | None. |  |
| Managers should assist the immediate supervisors who approve shift <br> extension overtime by providing them with updated and revised <br> guidelines for approval and by reviewing their performance regularly. <br> (NIJ) | No training or criteria provided to first-line <br> supervisors to determine whether the overtime is <br> necessary. |  |
| All tasks and functions that require overtime shall be routinely <br> evaluated in terms of their cost-effectiveness. Alternatives to <br> accomplish these tasks or objectives shall be evaluated and <br> implemented where appropriate. (IACP) | None. |  |
| Individual and summary overtime data shall be compiled and provided <br> to supervisors and command personnel at least monthly. Commanders <br> and supervisors shall monitor reports to identify unusual, unexplained, <br> or disproportionate overtime expenditures. (IACP) | effectiveness of overtime usage. |  |
| Police departments should analyze patterns of overtime expenditure by <br> individuals, by units, and by the nature of the worked performed, and <br> identify unusual payouts to individuals or units. (NIJ) | None. | Regular reports prepared for Command staff <br> include summary overtime data but not individual- <br> level data or data that would identify unusual or <br> unexplained uses of overtime. |

## Overtime

Internal controls need to be improved, for example:
Occurrences of sworn personnel working more than 14 hours per day, FY 2007-08 through FY 2016-17


## Overtime Recommendations

## Recommendation 4.1:

The Chief of Police should develop and implement overtime policies, including (1) written guidelines for Police district captains, lieutenants, and sergeants on approving shift extension overtime, including specific criteria for when approval of shift extension overtime is appropriate; (2) incorporation of compliance with overtime approval guidelines (including enforcement of existing policies on pre-approval and sign-off of overtime on timecards) into captain, lieutenant, and sergeant annual performance evaluations; and (3) required training for captains, lieutenants, and sergeants on implementation of overtime policies and procedures.

## Recommendation 4.2:

The Chief of Police should increase oversight of overtime Department-wide and by Police district and revise biweekly reporting requirements to better identify and correct unusual, unexplained, or disproportionate use of overtime (including high users); and identify and reduce occurrences of overtime that exceed Department and City overtime limits.

## Recommendation 4.3:

The Chief of Police should incorporate analysis of cost-effectiveness of overtime and alternatives to overtime use to accomplish tasks or program objectives into the annual budget.

## Overtime Update

Overtime increased in FY 18-19 by \$1.3 million for 2 one-time enhancements

- $\$ 500,000$ for reform training
- \$530,000 for BART/Civic Center patrol

Implementation of overtime recommendations

- No 4.1, New tracking for 4.2, no 4.3

Budget proposal: $+\$ 2.4$ million (not including $+\$ 626 \mathrm{k}$ for Union Square, +\$1.2m for Mission Bay events, \& +\$376k for SFHA)
FY19-20 New Overtime

- $\$ 547,995$ for 3\% COLA
- $\$ 800,000$ foot beats throughout City
- $\$ 400,000$ foot beats in Transit Areas
- \$500,000 Maintain current Market Street/Civic Center foot beat presence
- $\quad \$ 200,000$ HSOC (Healthy Streets Operations Center) for Conventions and Events (clean streets efforts with DPW)


## Questions?

