

MEMO

To: President Norman Yee; District 7 Supervisor and President of the Board of Supervisors

CC: San Francisco Board of Supervisors;

From: Chris Corgas; OEWD Senior Program Manager, Community Benefit Districts

RE: Ocean Avenue Community Benefit District

Date: June 2, 2020

This is a memo summarizing the accomplishments of the Ocean Avenue Community Benefit District (“Ocean Avenue CBD” or “CBD”) and an analysis of its financial statements (based on their audit) for the period between July 1, 2018, and June 30, 2019.

Each year, the CBD is required to submit a mid-year report, an annual report and a CPA financial review or audit. Ocean Avenue CBD has complied with the submission of all these requirements. OEWD staff, with assistance from the Controller’s Office, reviewed these financial documents to monitor and report on whether they have complied with the rules per the Property and Business Improvement District Law of 1994, California Streets and Highways Code Sections 36600 Et Seq.; San Francisco’s Business and Tax Regulations Code Article 15; the Ocean Avenue CBD management contract with the City; and their Management Plan approved by the Board of Supervisors in 2010.

Also attached to this memo are the following documents:

1. Annual Reports
 - a. FY 2018-2019
2. CPA Financial Review Reports
 - a. FY 2018-2019
3. Draft resolution from the Office of Economic and Workforce Development



Background

The Ocean Avenue CBD includes both privately- and publicly-owned properties. The district covers 12 blocks and includes approximately 151 parcels.

- December 14, 2010: the Board of Supervisors approved the resolution that established the Ocean Avenue Community Benefit District for 15 years (Resolution # 587-10).
- May 24, 2011: the Board of Supervisors approved the contract for the administration and management of the Ocean Avenue Community Benefit District (Resolution #221-11).
- April 19, 2016: the Board of Supervisors approved the annual report for the Ocean Avenue Community Benefit District for FY 2014 – 2015 (Resolution # 141-16).
- March 21, 2017: the Board of Supervisors approved the annual report for the Ocean Avenue Community Benefit District for FY 2015 – 2016 (Resolution # 097-17).
- September 25, 2018: the Board of Supervisors approved the annual report for the Ocean Avenue Community Benefit District for FY 2016 – 2017 (Resolution # 314-18).
- September 17, 2019: the Board of Supervisors approved the annual report for the Ocean Avenue Community Benefit District for FY 2017 – 2018 (Resolution # 401-19).

Basic Information about the Ocean Avenue Community Benefit District:

Year Established	December 2010
Assessment Collection Period	FY 2010-2011 to FY 2024-2025 (July 1, 2010 to June 30, 2025)
Services Start and End Date	July 1, 2011 – December 31, 2025
Initial Estimated Annual Budget	\$239,578
FY 2018-19 Assessment Submission	\$320,436
Fiscal Year	July 1 – June 30
Executive Director	Daniel Weaver
Name of Nonprofit Owners’ Entity	Ocean Avenue Association (“OAA”)

The current CBD website www.oceanavenueassociation.org includes all the pertinent information about the organization and their programs, a calendar of events, their Management Plan, Mid-Year Report, Annual Report and meeting schedules.

Summary of Program Areas

Cleaning, Maintenance, and Safety

The Ocean Avenue Management Plan calls for approximately 52% of the budget to be spent on Cleaning, Safety, and Maintenance. OAA contracts with CleanScapes to provide cleaning and maintenance. Two workers are employed who clean and maintain the public realm six days a week. These services include sweeping and steam cleaning sidewalks and Muni boarding islands; removing graffiti within 24 hours; topping off city trash cans; spot pressure washing; reporting and monitoring of illegal dumping of small and large items in the public right-of-way; wiping down furniture; removing weeds from tree wells; removing posted notices on city poles and other street furniture; and painting city poles.

Marketing, Streetscape Improvements, and Beautification

Approximately 18% of the annual budget is allocated for public space development and streetscape improvements. This program area includes but is not limited to promoting the district through a website that includes information about their purpose and accomplishments, sponsoring special events such as holiday events and monthly concerts, and developing marketing activities that support efforts to recruit and retain businesses.

Management & Operations

The Ocean Avenue CBD is staffed by a full-time Executive Director who (1) performs the day-to-day management of the organization, (2) serves at the focal point person for the district, (3) advocates for city funds and services and (4) ensures that the organization is in compliance with their Management Plan and City contract. The CBD Management Plan calls for approximately 26% of the budget to be spent on management and operations.

The Ocean Avenue CBD board has ten (10) members represented by residents, property owners, community organizations, non-profit arts organizations, government and educational institutions and businesses. The Board shall include no less than five and no more than eleven members, and be composed of at least 50% of property owners, or property owners' designated representatives, who are paying the CBD assessment. In addition to the property owners, at least 20 percent of the Board shall be representatives of non-property-owning businesses within the CBD boundaries. The Board also includes representatives from neighborhood organizations. Currently, the board structure complies with Article 15 of the San Francisco Business and Tax Regulations Code. The full board meets monthly. The committees are detailed below:

- **Executive Committee** – oversees central operations of the organization and ensures the functioning of key areas: staff and contracts; corporate finances; insurance; grants; development of budget; board agendas and meetings; correspondence; outreach; bylaws and policies; public relations; and newsletters.
- **Street Life Committee** – composed of corridor business representatives.
- **Business Committee** – composed of corridor business representatives.
- **Public Safety Committee** – works with San Francisco Safe to address safety issues impacting businesses within the district and continued the formation work for an Ocean Avenue Business Watch.

Summary of Accomplishments, Challenges, and Delivery of Services

FY 2018-2019

Cleaning, Maintenance, and Safety

- Removed graffiti within 24 hours of notification
- Scheduled regular steam cleaning of sidewalks and Muni boarding islands
- Painted city light poles
- Topped off city trash cans
- Weeded tree wells, sidewalk gardens and sidewalks

- Watered newly planted trees and landscaping
- Painted city poles
- Removed illegally posted notices on poles and other street furniture
- Wiped down street furniture
- Removed feces and needles from the public right of way

Marketing, Streetscape Improvements, and Beautification

- Continued to work with SF Public Works for maintenance of its open space property, newspaper rack problems, sidewalk maintenance
- Continued to work with the Planning Department on rezoning the Ocean Avenue Corridor Study Implementation
- Worked with a core group of neighborhood-based volunteers and Lick-Wilmerding and Lowell High School students to hang and remove holiday decorations on the Ocean Avenue palm trees
- Partnered with San Francisco Arts Commission, OMI Cultural Participation Project, Lick-Wilmerding High School to begin a monthly event series at Unity Plaza, called the Ocean Avenue Arts Bazaar
- Continued Arts Alive Ingleside Banner project for corridor marketing of the retail district

Management & Operations

- Ensured functioning of CBD and compliance with City contract and management plan requirements.
- Applied for grants to bring additional resources to the CBD
- Continued to recruit a variety of board members representing Ocean Avenue property owners, businesses and community members
- Communicated with residential and other community organizations to address issues in the community and raise awareness about Ocean Avenue
- Continued with promotion and marketing program with free events at Unity Plaza and at Ocean Avenue businesses
- Continued to actively participate in the San Francisco CBD/BID consortium
- Ensure compliance with the California Brown Act
- Monitor contracts and services. Assist contractors in problem solving as necessary
- Increased and improved upon communication between CBD Board and property owners
- Published Mid-Year and Annual Reports.
- Supported all working committees of the Board of Directors including: Street Life, Business, Public Safety committees, and Board Development

Ocean Avenue CBD Annual Budget Analysis

OEWD's staff reviewed the following budget related benchmarks for the Ocean Avenue CBD:

- **BENCHMARK 1:** Whether the variance between the budget amounts for each service category was within 10 percentage points from the budget identified in the Management Plan (*Agreement for the Administration of the "Ocean Avenue Community Benefit District", Section 3.9 – Budget*)

- **BENCHMARK 2:** Whether one percent (1%) of actuals came from sources other than assessment revenue (*CA Streets & Highways Code, Section 36650(B)(6); Agreement for the Administration of the “Ocean Avenue Community Benefit District”, Section A - Annual Reports*)
- **BENCHMARK 3:** Whether the variance between the budget amount and actual expenses within a fiscal year was within 10 percent (*Agreement for the Administration of the “Ocean Avenue Community Benefit District”, Section 3.9 – Budget*).
- **BENCHMARK 4:** Whether the Ocean Avenue CBD is indicating the amount of any surplus or deficit revenues to be carried forward into the next fiscal year and designating the projects to be funded by any surplus revenues (*CA Streets & Highways Code, Section 36650(B)(5)*).

FY 2018-2019

BENCHMARK 1: Whether the variance between the budget amounts for each service category was within 10 percentage points from the budget identified in the Management Plan

ANALYSIS: *The Ocean Avenue CBD met this requirement. See table below.*

Service Category	Management Plan Budget	% of Budget	FY 2018-2019 Budget	% of Budget	Variance Percentage Points
Cleaning, Maintenance, and Safety	\$125,000.00	51.65%	\$188,936.91	52.98%	+1.33%
Marketing, Streetscape Improvements, and Beautification	\$43,658.00	18.04%	\$48,914.09	13.72%	-4.32%
Management and Operations	\$63,000.00	26.03%	\$103,757.27	29.10%	+3.06%
Contingency and Reserves	\$10,340.00	4.27%	\$15,000.00	4.21%	-0.07%
Total	\$241,998.00	100.00%	\$356,608.27	100.00%	

BENCHMARK 2: Whether one percent (1%) of actuals came from sources other than assessment revenue

ANALYSIS: *The Ocean Avenue CBD met this requirement. Assessment revenue was \$320,927.00 or 81.69% of actuals and non-assessment revenue was \$71,923.00 or 18.31% of actuals. See table below.*

Revenue Sources	FY 2018-2019 Actuals	% of Actuals
Special Benefit Assessments	\$320,927.00	
Total assessment revenue	\$320,927.00	81.69%

Grants	\$57,865.00	14.73%
Donations	\$10,834.00	2.76%
Interest Earned	\$949.00	0.24%
Other	\$2,275.00	0.58%
Total non-assessment revenue	\$71,923.00	18.31%
Total	\$392,850.00	100%

BENCHMARK 3: Whether the variance between the budget amount and actual expenses within a fiscal year was within 10 percentage points

ANALYSIS: *The Ocean Avenue CBD met this requirement. See Table below.*

Service Category	FY 2018-2019 Budget	% of Budget	FY 2018-2019 Actuals	% of Actuals	Variance Percentage Points
Cleaning, Maintenance, and Safety	\$188,936.91	52.98%	\$193,584.59	52.89%	-0.09%
Marketing, Streetscape Improvements, and Beautification	\$48,914.09	13.72%	\$59,696.72	16.31%	2.59%
Management and Operations	\$103,757.27	29.10%	\$112,714.31	30.80%	1.70%
Contingency Reserve	\$15,000.00	4.21%	\$0.00	0%	-4.21%
TOTAL	\$356,608.27	100.00%	\$365,995.62	100%	

BENCHMARK 4: Whether the Ocean Avenue CBD is indicating the amount of any surplus or deficit revenues to be carried forward into the next fiscal year and designating the projects to be funded by any surplus revenues

ANALYSIS: *The Ocean Avenue CBD met this requirement. Please note: There is a period between when the City collects assessment payment and when the City disburses the funds to the CBD. As a result, a CBD typically has a fund balance at the end of the fiscal year that is equal to about 6 months of their annual budget. See table below.*

FY 2018-19 Carryover Disbursement	\$115,715.00
Designated Projects for 2019-2020	

Cleaning, Maintenance and Safety	\$60,174.00
Marketing, Streetscape Improvements and Beautification	\$20,828.00
Management and Operations	\$30,085.00
Contingency and Reserves	\$4,628.00
Total Designated Amount for Future Years	\$115,715.00

Findings and Recommendations

The Ocean Avenue CBD met all benchmarks as defined on pages 4 and 5 of this memo. For the year in review, the Ocean Avenue CBD has well exceeded its general benefit requirement of one percent (1%) by raising approximately 18% in general benefit dollars. The CBD has acquired a significant amount of funding in the form of grant dollars, in-kind services, and volunteer services.

Ocean Avenue CBD has implemented all OEWD recommendations from the FY 17-18 annual report.

Ocean Avenue reached out to OEWD in FY 18-19 to begin discussing an early renewal and expansion of the District. The current iteration of the CBD will sunset on December 31, 2025.

In February 2019, the Ocean Avenue Association, thanks to the leadership and partnership of District 7 Supervisor and Board of Supervisors President Norman Yee, hosted the first annual Ocean Avenue Lunar New Year Celebration. The event saw lion dancing along the Ocean Avenue corridor until a rain storm forced an early cancellation of the dance. The rest of the event was primarily held in the Ingleside Presbyterian Church and was a resounding success. OEWD encourages the CBD to continue building on this effort as a way to bring people out to the Ocean Avenue business corridor. The event was held again February 2020.

As the CBD prepares for an early renewal and expansion campaign OEWD recommends that the CBD fully explore expansion areas down, including up to Ocean Avenue’s intersection with Junipero Serra Boulevard. The Ocean Avenue corridor is incredibly diverse, including a large number of Cantonese speaking businesses. Although the CBD should be commended for increased efforts to provide outreach to monolingual communities, it should continue to build on this especially in respect to a renewal and expansion campaign.

Mr. Weaver has been the executive director of the Ocean Avenue CBD since shortly after its formation in 2010. Although Mr. Weaver has done a good job of steering the organization, OEWD believes the CBD could benefit from an in-depth CBD review to evaluate the overall effectiveness of the organization to ensure it is operating at its highest possible capacity and conduct robust stakeholder outreach to determine the direction of the organization should it be renewed. OEWD believes the organization should develop a strategic plan that will look at short term, mid-term, and long term needs of the district and focus on: 1) ensuring the management structure of the district is effective and what management structure would be the most effective including relating to board/staff relationships, 2) gauging the overall effectiveness of core CBD programs and provide recommendations on how they could be improved, 3)

improving the CBD's overall effectiveness and respect in the broader Ocean Avenue community, 4) identify strategies to ensure the long-term financial stability of the organization, especially related to non-assessment resource sources. This strategic plan would be incredibly helpful to the organization as it works with its property owners, business owners, and other stakeholders on a renewal and expansion to ensure the next iteration of the district is well placed to succeed over its next duration. OEWD will provide support and guidance to the CBD through this process.

Conclusion

The Ocean Avenue CBD has performed well in implementing its service plan. The CBD has done a great job in partnering with community stakeholders and numerous municipal agencies for small business technical assistance, business attraction, and façade improvement along the commercial corridor. The CBD has increased its efforts aimed at monolingual speakers within their district and adding new cultural celebration to the area. The Ocean Avenue Association is a well-run organization with active board and committee members that will continue to successfully carry out its mission in managing the Community Benefit District.