

BOARD of SUPERVISORS



City Hall  
Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244  
San Francisco 94102-4689  
Tel. No. 554-5184  
Fax No. 554-5163  
TDD/TTY No. 554-5227

## MEMORANDUM

TO: Ben Rosenfield, City Controller, Office of the Controller

FROM: Victor Young, Assistant Clerk, Rules Committee  
Board of Supervisors

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Victor Young".

DATE: May 26, 2020

SUBJECT: CHARTER AMENDMENT INTRODUCED  
November 3, 2020 Election

---

On June 29, 2020, the Board of Supervisors' Rules Committee amended the following Charter Amendment for the November 3, 2020, Election. This matter is being referred to you in accordance with Rules of Order 2.22.3.

**File No. 200510**

**Charter Amendment (Second Draft) to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to create the Sanitation and Streets Department to succeed to specific duties currently performed by the Department of Public Works; to create a Sanitation and Streets Commission to oversee the Sanitation and Streets Department; to create a Public Works Commission to oversee the Department of Public Works; to require an annual performance audit and cost and waste analysis for both departments; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; at an election to be held on November 3, 2020.**

Please review and prepare a financial analysis of the proposed measure prior to the first Rules Committee hearing.

If you have any questions or concerns, please call me at (415) 554-7723 or email: victor.young@sfgov.org. To submit documentation, please email or forward to me at the Board of Supervisors, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.

c: Todd Rydstrom, Deputy City Controller  
Peg Stevenson, City Performance Director  
Natasha Mihal, City Services Auditor

1 [Charter Amendment - Sanitation and Streets Department, Sanitation and Streets Commission,  
2 and Public Works Commission]

3 **Describing and setting forth a proposal to the voters at an election to be held on November**  
4 **3, 2020, to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to create the**  
5 **Sanitation and Streets Department to succeed to specific duties currently performed by the**  
6 **Department of Public Works; to create a Sanitation and Streets Commission to oversee the**  
7 **Sanitation and Streets Department; to create a Public Works Commission to oversee the**  
8 **Department of Public Works; to require an annual performance audit and cost and waste**  
9 **analysis for both departments; and affirming the Planning Department’s determination**  
10 **under the California Environmental Quality Act.**

11  
12 Section 1. The Planning Department has determined that the actions contemplated in this  
13 proposed Charter Amendment comply with the California Environmental Quality Act (California  
14 Public Resources Code Sections 21000 et seq.). Said determination is on file with the Clerk of  
15 the Board of Supervisors in File No. 200510 and is incorporated herein by reference. The Board  
16 affirms this determination.

17  
18 Section 2. The Board of Supervisors hereby submits to the qualified voters of the City  
19 and County, at an election to be held on November 3, 2020, a proposal to amend the Charter of  
20 the City and County by revising Sections 3.104, 4.130, 16.129, and F1.102, and adding Sections  
21 4.116, 4.138, and 4.139, to read as follows:

22 NOTE: **Unchanged Charter text and uncodified text** are in plain font.  
23 **Additions** are *single-underline italics Times New Roman font*.  
24 **Deletions** are ~~*strike-through italics Times New Roman font*~~.  
25 **Asterisks** (\* \* \* \*) indicate the omission of unchanged Charter subsections.

**LEGISLATIVE DIGEST**

Revised 06/29/20

[Charter Amendment - Sanitation and Streets Department, Sanitation and Streets Commission, and Public Works Commission]

**Describing and setting forth a proposal to the voters at an election to be held on November 3, 2020, to amend the Charter of the City and County of San Francisco to create the Sanitation and Streets Department to succeed to specific duties currently performed by the Department of Public Works; to create a Sanitation and Streets Commission to oversee the Sanitation and Streets Department; to create a Public Works Commission to oversee the Department of Public Works; to require an annual performance audit and cost and waste analysis for both departments; and affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act.**

Existing Law

Under the Charter, the Department of Public Works' responsibilities are determined by the City Administrator and include the responsibility for maintaining and cleaning the public right of way.

Charter section 4.102 provides that a commission of the executive branch has the responsibility to formulate, evaluate and approve goals, set policies, develop Annual Statements of Purpose for the departments under its jurisdiction, and approve departmental budgets.

Charter section F1.102 provides that the City Auditor shall develop quantifiable, measurable, objective standards for street, sidewalk, and park maintenance in consultation with the Department of Public Works.

Amendments to Current Law

This Charter amendment would remove the Department of Public Works from the purview of the City Administrator. The amendment would create a new Public Works Commission which would have oversight over the Department of Public Works. At the same time, the responsibilities for cleaning and maintaining the public right of way, and certain other responsibilities such as the maintenance of street trees in the public right of way would be transferred to a newly created Department of Sanitation and Streets. The new Department would also be responsible for maintaining City buildings. The amendment would also create a Sanitation and Streets Commission which would have oversight responsibilities over the new Department of Sanitation and Streets. The new Department and Commission would have a focus on street cleaning, including measurement of the City's performance using objective metrics. Street cleaning would include the deep cleaning of sidewalks using methods such as

FILE NO. 200510

power washing. The Charter amendment would also require the Controller's office to complete an annual performance audit and cost and waste analysis for both departments.

1  
2           **SEC. 3.104. CITY ADMINISTRATOR.**

3           \* \* \* \*

4           The City Administrator shall have power to:

5                 6. With the concurrence of the Mayor, appoint and remove the directors of the  
6 Departments of Administrative Services, Solid Waste, and Public Guardian/Administrator, ~~and~~  
7 ~~Public Works~~, and such other department heads which are placed under his or her direction;

8           \* \* \* \*

9           **SEC. 4.130. DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS.**

10           Except as otherwise specified in the Charter, including in Section 4.139(b)(6), The duties  
11 ~~and functions~~ of the Department of Public Works shall design, build, and improve the City's  
12 infrastructure and public right of way, and assume any other duties be assigned by the City  
13 ~~Administrator~~, by ordinance or pursuant to Section 4.132. The Department shall be headed by  
14 the Director of Public Works, who shall be qualified by either technical training or management  
15 experience in engineering or architecture.

16           **SEC. 4.116. PUBLIC WORKS COMMISSION.**

17           (a) Purpose. There is hereby established a Public Works Commission. The  
18 Commission shall set policy directives and provide oversight for the Department of Public  
19 Works.

20           (b) Membership and Terms of Office.

21                 (1) The Commission shall consist of five members, appointed as follows:  
22                 Seats 1 and 5 shall be appointed by the Board of Supervisors. Seat 1 shall be held  
23 by a registered professional engineer licensed in the State of California, with a background in  
24 civil, mechanical, or environmental engineering, and program management, and Seat 5 shall be  
25 an at-large position.

1                   Seats 2 and 4 shall be appointed by the Mayor subject to confirmation by the  
2 Board of Supervisors. Each nomination shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within  
3 60 days. If the Board of Supervisors fails to act on a nomination within 60 days of the date the  
4 nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors, the nominee shall be deemed  
5 confirmed. Seat 2 shall be held by a registered architect licensed in the State of California, and  
6 Seat 4 shall be an at-large position.

7                   Seat 3 shall be held by a person with a background in finance with at least 5  
8 years in auditing experience, appointed by the Controller subject to confirmation by the Board of  
9 Supervisors. The nomination shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days. If  
10 the Board of Supervisors fails to act on a nomination within 60 days of the date the nomination is  
11 transmitted to the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors, the nominee shall be deemed confirmed.

12                   (2) Members of the Commission shall serve four-year terms; provided,  
13 however, the term of the initial appointees in Seats 1, 3, and 5 shall be two years.

14                   (3) Commissioners may be removed from office at will by their respective  
15 appointing authority.

16                   **(c) Powers and Duties.**

17                   (1) With regard to the Department of Public Works, beginning on September  
18 1, 2021, the Commission shall exercise all the powers and duties of boards and commissions set  
19 forth in Sections 4.102, 4.103, and 4.104, and may take other actions as prescribed by  
20 ordinance.

21                   (2) The Commission shall oversee the Department's performance, including  
22 evaluation of data collected by the Department, the Controller, and other City agencies.

23                   (3) The Commission shall approve all contracts proposed to be entered into  
24 by the Department, provided that the Commission may delegate this responsibility to the  
25 Director of Public Works, or the Director's designee.

1                   (4) The Commission may require the Director of Public Works, or the  
2 Director's designee, to provide the Commission with proof of adequate performance of any  
3 contract entered into by the Department, based on written documentation including  
4 documentation that work has been inspected and approved by the appropriate City departments  
5 or officers.

6                   (5) The Commission shall perform an annual review on the designation and  
7 filling of Department positions, as exempt, temporary, provisional, part-time, seasonal or  
8 permanent status, the number of positions that are vacant, and at the Commission's discretion,  
9 other data regarding the Department's workforce. This function shall not in any way limit the  
10 roles of the Civil Service Commission or the Department of Human Resources under the  
11 Charter.

12                   (d) Transition provisions.

13                   (1) The Mayor, Board of Supervisors, and Controller shall make initial  
14 appointments to the Commission by no later than noon on June 1, 2021. The Commission shall  
15 come into existence on either June 1, 2021 at noon, or noon of the date that three members of the  
16 Commission have assumed office, whichever is later. The terms of all five members shall  
17 commence at noon on June 1, 2021, regardless of when the Commission comes into existence.

18                   (2) The Commission shall have its inaugural meeting by no later than  
19 September 1, 2021.

20                   (3) The Director of Public Works at the time the Commission comes into  
21 existence shall remain in that position unless removed from it in accordance with the Charter  
22 provisions governing removal of a department head serving under a commission. If a person is  
23 serving in an acting capacity as Director at the time the Commission comes into existence, the  
24 preceding sentence applies, except that the position shall also be considered vacant for purposes  
25 of the next sentence. If the position of Director is vacant for any reason, including removal of

1 the incumbent Director, the position shall be filled in accordance with the Charter provisions  
2 governing appointment of a department head serving under a commission. In that event, a  
3 person removed from the position under the first sentence of this subsection may be considered  
4 for appointment to the position.

5  
6 **SEC. 4.138. SANITATION AND STREETS COMMISSION.**

7 (a) **Purpose.** There is hereby established a Sanitation and Streets Commission. The  
8 Commission shall set policy directives and provide oversight for the Department of Sanitations  
9 and Streets.

10 (b) **Membership and Terms of Office.**

11 (1) The Commission shall consist of five members, appointed as follows:  
12 Seats 1 and 2 shall be appointed by the Mayor subject to confirmation by the  
13 Board of Supervisors. Each nomination shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within  
14 60 days. If the Board of Supervisors fails to act on a nomination within 60 days of the date the  
15 nomination is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors, the nominee shall be deemed  
16 confirmed. Seat 1 shall be held by a person who is a small business owner. Seat 2 shall be held  
17 by a person with experience in project management.

18 Seat 3 shall be appointed by the Controller subject to confirmation by the Board  
19 of Supervisors. The nomination shall be the subject of a public hearing and vote within 60 days.  
20 If the Board of Supervisors fails to act on a nomination within 60 days of the date the nomination  
21 is transmitted to the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors, the nominee shall be deemed confirmed.  
22 Seat 3 shall be held by a person who has a background in finance and audits.

23 Seats 4 and 5 shall be appointed by the Board of Supervisors. Seat 4 shall be held  
24 by a person who has a background in either urban forestry, urban design, or environmental  
25



1 services. Seat 5 shall be held by a person with significant experience in cleaning and  
2 maintaining public spaces.

3 (2) Members of the Commission shall serve four-year terms; provided,  
4 however, the term of the initial appointees in Seats 1 and 4 shall be two years.

5 (3) Members may be removed at will by their respective appointing officer.

6 (c) **Duties.** With regard to the Department of Sanitation and Streets, beginning on  
7 three months after the Transition Date in subsection (d), the Commission shall exercise all the  
8 powers and duties of boards and commissions set forth in Sections 4.102, 4.103, and 4.104, and  
9 may take other actions as prescribed by ordinance. In addition, the Commission shall:

10 (1) review and evaluate data regarding street and sidewalk conditions,  
11 including but not limited to data collected by the Department, and annual reports generated by  
12 the Controller;

13 (2) establish minimum standards of cleanliness for the public right of way,  
14 and set baselines for services to be administered by the Department;

15 (3) approve all contracts proposed to be entered into by the Department,  
16 provided that the Commission may delegate this responsibility to the Director of the Department,  
17 or the Director's designee;

18 (4) perform an annual cost analysis evaluating whether there are  
19 inefficiencies or waste in the Department's administration and operations; and

20 (5) perform an annual review on the designation and filling of Department  
21 positions, as exempt, temporary, provisional, part-time, seasonal or permanent status, the  
22 number of positions that are vacant, and at the Commission's discretion, other data regarding  
23 the Department's workforce. This function shall not in any way limit the roles of the Civil  
24 Service Commission or the Department of Human Resources under the Charter.

25 (d) **Transition provisions.**

1                   (1) The Commission shall come into existence on the Transition Date, which  
2 shall be either July 1, 2022 at noon or an earlier date established by the Board of Supervisors by  
3 written motion adopted no later than January 1, 2022. The Mayor, Board of Supervisors, and  
4 Controller shall make initial appointments to the Commission by no later than three months  
5 before the Transition Date. The terms of all five members shall commence at noon on the  
6 Transition Date.

7                   (2) The Commission shall have its inaugural meeting by no later than 30 days  
8 after three members of the Commission have assumed office.

9                   (3) The Director of Public Works or person serving in an acting capacity as  
10 Director of Public Works, at the time the Commission comes into existence, shall perform the  
11 duties of the Director of the Department of Sanitation and Streets in an acting capacity until the  
12 Commission appoints a new Director in accordance with the Charter provisions governing  
13 appointment of a department head serving under a commission.

14  
15                   **SEC. 4.139. DEPARTMENT OF SANITATION AND STREETS.**

16                   (a) **Establishment.** There shall be a Department of Sanitation and Streets, which  
17 shall come into existence three months after the date the Transition Date for the Sanitation and  
18 Streets Commission in Section 4.138(d). The Department shall be headed by the Director of  
19 Sanitation and Streets, who shall be qualified by either technical training or management  
20 experience in environmental services or the maintenance, sanitation, or cleaning of public  
21 spaces; and shall have a demonstrated knowledge of best practices regarding cleaning and  
22 maintenance of high-traffic or publicly accessible areas. The Department shall assume all  
23 responsibilities previously under the jurisdiction of the Department of Public Works that pertain  
24 to the duties specified in subsection (b).

1           **(b) Duties.** Except as otherwise provided in the Charter or pursuant to Section  
2 4.132, in addition to any other duties assigned by ordinance, the Department shall have the  
3 following duties:

4           (1) efficient and systematic street sweeping, sidewalk cleaning, maintenance  
5 and cleaning of public restrooms in the public right of way, and litter abatement;

6           (2) provision and maintenance of city trash receptacles;

7           (3) removal of illegal dumping and graffiti in the public right of way;

8           (4) maintenance of public medians, and of street trees in the public right of  
9 way pursuant to section 16.129;

10          (5) maintenance of City streets and sidewalks;

11          (6) construction, repair, remodeling, and management services for City-  
12 owned buildings and facilities; and

13          (7) control of pests on City streets and sidewalks.

14          The Board of Supervisors may limit, modify, or eliminate the duties set forth in  
15 subsections (1) through (7), and may transfer any of those duties to the Department of Public  
16 Works or other City departments, by ordinance approved by two-thirds of the Board.

17          **(c) Performance of Work for Other Departments.** No department may enter  
18 agreements with private parties for public works or improvements in City streets, sidewalks, or  
19 City-owned buildings or facilities, unless the department first requests the Department of  
20 Sanitation and Streets to perform the work subject to specifications and timing requirements  
21 determined in the discretion of the requesting department.

22          **(d) Administrative Support.** The Board of Supervisors may by ordinance require the  
23 City Administrator, the Department of Public Works, and/or any other City department to  
24 provide administrative support for the Department, which may include but need not be limited to  
25

1 human resources, performance management, finance, budgeting, technology, emergency  
2 planning, training, and employee safety services.

3 **(e) Transition.**

4 No later than July 1, 2021, the City Administrator shall submit to the Board of  
5 Supervisors a proposed ordinance amending the Municipal Code, including but not limited to the  
6 Public Works Code, to conform to Sections 3.104, 4.116, 4.130, , 4.138, 16.129, F1.102, and this  
7 Section 4.139, as adopted or amended by the voters at the November 3, 2020 election.

8  
9 **SEC. 16.129. STREET TREE MAINTENANCE.**

10 (a) Definitions. For purposes of this Section 16.129:

11 \* \* \* \*

12 “Maintenance” (and its root “Maintain”) shall mean those actions necessary to  
13 promote the life, growth, health, or beauty of a Tree. Maintenance includes both routine  
14 maintenance and major maintenance. Routine maintenance includes adequate watering to ensure  
15 the Tree’s growth and sustainability; weed control; removal of Tree-well trash; staking;  
16 fertilizing; routine adjustment and timely removal of stakes, ties, Tree guards, and Tree grates;  
17 bracing; and Sidewalk repairs related to the Tree’s growth or root system. Major maintenance  
18 includes structural pruning as necessary to maintain public safety and to sustain the health,  
19 safety, and natural growth habit of the Tree; pest and disease-management procedures as needed  
20 and in a manner consistent with public health and ecological diversity; and replacement of dead  
21 or damaged Trees. Pruning practices shall be in compliance with International Society of  
22 Arboriculture Best Management Practices and ANSI Pruning Standards, whichever is more  
23 protective of Tree preservation, or any equivalent standard or standards selected by the Director  
24 of the Department of Sanitation and Streets~~Public Works~~.

25 \* \* \* \*

1 “Street Tree” shall mean any Tree growing within the public right-of-way, including  
2 unimproved public streets and Sidewalks, and any Tree growing on land under the jurisdiction of  
3 the Department of Public Works or the Department of Sanitation and Streets. “Street Tree” does  
4 not include any other forms of landscaping.

5 \* \* \* \*

6 (g) Beginning in fiscal year 2018-2019, the City may suspend growth in the City’s \$19  
7 million contribution to the Fund under subsection (f) of this Section 16.129 if the City’s  
8 projected budget deficit for the upcoming fiscal year at the time of the Joint Report or Update to  
9 the five-year financial plan as prepared jointly by the Controller, the Mayor’s Budget Director,  
10 and the Board of Supervisors’ Budget Analyst exceeds \$200 million adjusted annually by  
11 changes in aggregate discretionary revenues as defined in subsection (f) of this Section 16.129.

12 (h) Administration and Use of the Fund. The Department of Sanitation and  
13 Streets~~Public Works~~ shall administer the Fund. Monies in the Fund shall only be used for the  
14 following purposes:

- 15 (1) Maintenance and Removal of Street Trees;
- 16 (2) Necessary costs of administering the Fund; and
- 17 (3) Making grants totaling up to \$500,000 annually to the San Francisco Unified  
18 School District exclusively to fund Maintenance and Removal of Trees on School District  
19 property.

20 \* \* \* \*

21 (i) Annual Reports. Commencing with a report filed no later than January 1, 2019,  
22 covering the fiscal year ending June 30, 2018, the Department of Sanitation and Streets~~Public~~  
23 ~~Works~~ shall file annually with the Board of Supervisors, by January 1 of each year, a report  
24 containing the amount of monies collected in and expended from the Fund during the prior fiscal  
25 year, and such other information as the Director of the Department of Sanitation and

1 ~~Streets~~~~Public Works~~, in the Director's sole discretion, shall deem relevant to the operation of this  
2 Section 16.129.

3 \* \* \* \*

4 **F1.102. STREET, SIDEWALK, AND PARK CLEANING AND MAINTENANCE.**

5 (a) The Services Audit Unit shall conduct annually a performance audit of the City's  
6 street, sidewalk, and public park maintenance and cleaning operations. The annual audit shall:

7 (1) Include quantifiable, measurable, objective standards for street, sidewalk,  
8 and park maintenance, to be developed in cooperation and consultation with the Department of  
9 Sanitation and Streets, the Department of Public Works, and the Recreation and Park  
10 Department;

11 \* \* \* \*

12 (b) The Services Audit Unit shall conduct annually a cost and waste analysis evaluating  
13 whether there are inefficiencies or waste in the administration and operations of the Department  
14 of Sanitation and Streets, and the Department of Public Works or inefficiencies or waste in the  
15 division of labor between the two departments. The annual audit shall make quantifiable,  
16 measurable recommendations for the elimination of inefficient operations and functions, and  
17 shall include:

18 (1) Consolidation of duplicative and overlapping activities and functions;

19 (2) Integration and standardization of information maintenance systems that  
20 promote interdepartmental sharing of information and resources;

21 (3) Departmental accounting for expenditure of resources in terms of effectiveness  
22 of the service or product delivered;

23 (4) Departmental deployment and utilization of personnel, the City's personnel  
24 procurement system, and reforms to enhance the quality of work performance of public  
25 employees; and

